

The alchemy of love:

**Recent graduates' lived experiences of psychotherapy training:
A hermeneutic study**

Marilyn Morgan

**Thesis submitted to Auckland University of Technology
in partial fulfillment of the degree of Master of Health Science**

February 2007

CONTENTS

Page i.	Attestation of ownership
Page ii.	Acknowledgements
Page iii.	Abstract
Page 1.	Chapter One: Introduction <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Reasons for choosing this topic• Preunderstandings• Definitions• Context<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ <i>History</i>○ <i>The need for personal growth</i>○ <i>Personal therapy and group therapy</i>• Choice of methodology• Conclusion
Page 13.	Chapter Two: Literature review <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Introduction• Baskets of Knowledge
Page 14.	The First Basket of Knowledge: Philosophy <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Studying human experience<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ <i>Phenomenology</i>○ <i>A convergence</i>
Page 16.	The Second Basket of Knowledge: Psychological Theory <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Growth and development, and human change processes<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ <i>Mindfulness and growth</i>○ <i>Pain in the process of growth</i>○ <i>Higher levels of adult development</i>○ <i>Personal growth and developmental stage for psychotherapists</i>○ Table 1. The developmental theory of Rowan, with associated psychotherapies○ Table 2. The developmental theory of Rowan and Kegan compared• Prescriptions for the nature, and outcomes, of the personal growth dimension of the education process<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ <i>Tradition</i>○ <i>Complex issues</i>○ <i>Criticisms</i>○ <i>Effectiveness of personal therapy</i>○ <i>Levels of development for the psychotherapist</i>○ <i>Personal growth specific to modality being learned</i>○ <i>Personal growth in training is often painful</i>

- Cultural and gender perspectives on personal growth and psychotherapy

Page 32. **The Third Basket of Knowledge: Scientific Understandings**

- Neurophysiologic underpinnings of relationship, psychological change and integration
 - *Grounded in science*
 - *Changing the brain*
 - *Inborn limitations for psychotherapy practice*
 - *Bringing back the body*
 - *Watch this space*
- Complexity and 'health' of complex systems

Page 37. **The Fourth Basket of Knowledge: Personal Experience**

- Psychotherapy journeys of growth and change: personal accounts, and reports of outcomes
 - *Change in therapy*
- Unfolding described from a spiritual perspective
- Maori concepts and experiences related to psychotherapy, personal well-being, and personal growth.
- The experience of personal growth for the trainee
 - *A journey*
 - *Stress and distress*
 - *Personal change processes*
- The nature and impact of the students' personal development on the tutors and psychotherapy programme leaders
 - *A complex task*
 - *Personal stories of trainers*

Page 45. **The Fifth Basket of Knowledge: Love**

- Love, relationship and attachment, and how to develop the capacity to love
 - *Love: the latest topic of interest*
 - *Love and change: vulnerability*
 - *Capacity to relate*
 - Table 3: Greenberg's analysis of congruence in the therapeutic relationship
 - *Fostering relationship ability in training*
 - *Naming love*
- What is not included in the literature?
- Summary and Conclusion

Page 53. **Chapter Three: Methodology**

- Introduction
- The hermeneutic process
- Research design
- Methods
 - *Sampling*
 - *Data Collection*
 - *Data Analysis*
 - *Rigour*
 - *Credibility*
 - *Transferability*
 - *Dependability*
 - *Confirmability*
 - *Ethical Issues*
 - *Te Tiriti o Waitangi*
 - *Do No Harm*
 - *Voluntary Participation/ Informed Consent*
 - *Truthful Practice*
 - *Confidentiality*
 - *Transparent Data Analysis*
- Conclusion

Page 69. **Chapter Four: The Journey**

- Introduction
- The contour of the journey
- Being lost
- Setting out: innocence and dreams
 - *Innocence*
 - *Ideals*
 - *Disappointments*
 - *The prophet's wisdom*
- The sacred fire of love
 - *Love and psychotherapy*
 - *The meaning of love*
 - *Free to talk of love?*
 - *Participants' experiences of love during training*
 - *The hard face of love*
 - *Once subjected there is no escape*
- Falling, drowning, burning
 - *Heartbreak*
 - *The world turned upside down*
 - *Bleeding willingly and joyfully*
 - *The roots of the tree are shaken*
 - *Pain and pleasure*
 - *Uncertainty*
 - *Is there an easier path?*
- Baggage carried: wounded healers

- *Wounded Healers*
- *Wounds: body and emotion*
- *Shame*
- *Pleasing others and failing*
- *Wounds of the heart; cultural perspectives*
- Keeping on walking; calling on resources
 - *The practice of psychotherapy is challenging.*
 - *That which sustains us*
- Conclusion

Page 97. **Chapter Five: The Landscape**

- Introduction: the terrain traversed
 - Table 4: map of 'the journey'
- Safety, belonging, being welcome
 - *Safety*
 - *A place to belong*
 - *The marae and belonging*
- Guides: love and relationship (*graduates' experiences*)
 - *Teachers and therapists*
 - *The group*
 - *Relationship and longing*
 - *Love says no*
 - *The pain of the no*
 - *Unfinished business*
 - *Programme differences*
- Guides: love and relationship (*trainers' experiences*)
 - *We don't talk of love*
 - *Transference or love*
 - *Love for students*
 - *Misuse of love*
 - *Loving presence*
- Holding
 - *Hard to hold*
 - *A need to be held*
 - *A physical home*
- Course structure
- Conclusion

Page 117. **Chapter Six: Leaving Home, Coming Home**

- Introduction
 - *What does it all mean?*
 - *It was good*
- The mixed experience of leaving
- Winds of change.
 - *Sense of self*

- *Embodied*
- *Gift of the present*
- *Changes affirmed by others*
- *Behaviour changes*
- *Ripples of change*
- *Beyond self*
- Gratitude
- Telling stories around the fire.
- Moving inwards and outwards with love.
 - *Love for self and love for others; cultural perspectives*
 - *From the love of the teacher*
 - *Love as a magic gift*
- Passport to a life
- Conclusion

Page 133.

Chapter Seven: Discussion of Results

- Introduction
- Experiences of personal growth during psychotherapy education
 - *They did grow*
 - *Participants became converts*
 - *Love was the key*
- The nature of love
 - *Elusive to definition*
 - *Aroha and love*
 - *The place of love in psychotherapy education*
 - *You its only seed*
 - *The unexpected perspective*
 - *Why not be open about love?*
 - *Uncomfortable ground*
 - *Love and work*
 - *Gender influences*
- Implications and recommendations for psychotherapy training
 - *Personal development happens, and is needed*
 - *Love and relationship as catalyst for growth*
 - *The pain involved in growth*
 - *Rituals, structures and environment*
 - *Mindfulness*
 - *Preparation and support of teachers*
 - *The hard face of love, boundaries.*
- Possibilities for further research
- Strengths and limitations
- Conclusion

Page 148.

References

Page 165. **Appendices**

Attestation of Authorship

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person nor material which to a substantial extent has been accepted for the qualification of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning, except where due acknowledgement is made in the acknowledgements.

Signed:

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Marilyn Morgan". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looping initial 'M'.

Date: **02/02/07**

Acknowledgements

Firstly I wish to acknowledge the psychotherapy graduates who shared their experiences so willingly, also the trainers who responded to my questions and conversations with openness and enthusiasm.

I deeply appreciate the patient, engaged, stimulating support from my supervisor, Margot Solomon, who 'held' me on the journey of this thesis; travelling alongside me all the way, encouraging, and sharing her experience, knowledge and wisdom.

I also want to thank Mary, my partner, for her tolerance of a long process that was somewhat mysterious to her.

In addition I acknowledge:

Financial assistance and support from:

New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists

Eastern Institute of Technology

Proof reading:

Mandy Pentecost

Ethics Approval:

Approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee on 19.05.05 AUTEK Reference number: 04/202

ABSTRACT

Most of the research related to psychotherapy is about modality, treatments and therapeutic outcomes. There is little research on the psychotherapists themselves; their subjective experiences, their preparation or personal development. Personal growth, which leads to a developmental level permitting self-reflection and relational ability, is considered by the psychotherapy profession to be an important aspect of the psychotherapist's education. This hermeneutic study focuses on students' experience of personal growth during a formal psychotherapy educational programme. The core of the thesis is the presentation of the students' lived experience during training. Recent graduates of psychotherapy programmes were interviewed and their accounts include the process of personal growth, in what ways the developmental journey was felt to be supportive and containing, ways graduates feel changed, the impact on their lives during and after the training, and the meanings they ascribe to the experience. The particular growth experiences of Maori graduates are to some degree explored, as are the experiences of psychotherapy teachers who facilitate personal development. Themes emerged from data analysis; personal growth did happen, was felt to be positive, and took place as a journey. The growth process was turbulent, painful, yet resulted in positive outcomes for the graduates. Love and relationship were experienced as the most significant catalyst in promoting growth towards key outcomes. It was felt that bicultural learning activities enhanced and supported growth for Maori and non-Maori. The nature and complexity of love is discussed; including the place of love in personal change, psychotherapy and psychotherapy training. The discomfort commonly experienced in the profession around describing the therapeutic relationship as one involving love is highlighted. Possible reasons are given for this, for not using the word *love* in psychotherapy. Implications for psychotherapy education arising from the research are presented; with questions about, and recommendations for, facilitating personal growth, and the utilisation of love in a more open and conscious manner as a part of psychotherapy training. Currently most preparation of psychotherapists occurs in mainstream academic institutions, with a movement in the profession towards more formal qualifications. It is a challenge for educators and students alike to continue to include in traditional academic structures and processes what is felt to be the essence of psychotherapy; *love and relationship*, the practice of which requires high levels of personal development.

Chapter One: Introduction

I began this research with the question; how do recent psychotherapy graduates describe their lived experience of personal growth during psychotherapy education. As I immersed myself in the stories of my participants, my curiosity on fire, I found myself wandering down pathways of enquiry into literature and poetry, and what had seemed a simple quest kept expanding into the vast, mystery of love. Each time I pulled myself in to look at a smaller, more manageable theme the question kept dissolving once again, and I arrived at the same serene spacious place of not knowing, but somehow glimpsing the essence of what it is to be human. It is as Mary Oliver (2005, p.72) writes in her poem, *Bone*:

I believe I will never quite know.
Though I play at the edges of knowing,
truly I know
our part is not knowing,
but looking, and touching, and loving,
which is the way I walked on,
softly,
through the pale-pink morning light.

It has been my inspiration from a young age to deeply understand people. The method I chose for this quest is hermeneutics, the word itself echoing mercurial Hermes, the Greek god of perceptive leaps and inspired intelligence, which enables one to pursue a less certain, but fuller appreciation of people. Hermeneutics allows for the possibility of not gripping a mercurial essence in a tight fist, but lets one just be with the experience.

Qualitative research is exciting and important. It is a highly rewarding activity because it engages us with things that matter, in ways that matter (Mason, 2002, p.1).

My own personal growth journey has been fueled by wanting to really *know*, then allowing myself to both know and to not know. I have wandered, gaining experience, through the domains of hospitals as a nurse, sociology as a university student, parenting as a mother, and psychotherapy as a client, student and teacher. Psychotherapy has helped me to come home to myself. Like psychotherapy, this research journey has taken me on some unexpected twists and turns along the way, with novel territories stumbled upon, yielding unforeseen insights.

In recent times in New Zealand the training of psychotherapists has moved from an apprentice-type model, with training also provided by various private psychotherapy institutes, to preparation within the academic system. Nowadays there is a growing expectation within counselling and psychotherapy professions for

graduates to have academic qualifications. A university or polytechnic psychotherapy training provides the student with such a qualification, and degree programmes enable a choice of experiential and academic topics that are not usually provided in private psychotherapy programmes. However, difficulties may arise in academic institutions that interfere with the particular nature of the learning experience that is generally considered vital for preparing the psychotherapy practitioner. As Lewis et al (2001) point out, corporations are not based on the values of human relating and mutuality, as psychotherapy is. Formal academic institutions have developed an increasingly bureaucratic and conservative value structure which can impact negatively on training programmes, as the feminist writer, Starhawk (1982, p.19) wrote:

Structure, not content, determines how energy will flow ... a hierarchical structure can convey only the consciousness of estrangement, regardless of what teachings or deep inspirations are at its root.

With an increasing proliferation of modalities in counselling and psychotherapy, I believe there has been a lack of clarity within training institutions, and within the profession of psychotherapy, around the exact nature of psychotherapy, counselling (or the differences between these), and therefore what is needed in preparation for a psychotherapy career. New discourse is emerging around this topic. The publication of John Rowan's (2005) book, "*The future of training in psychotherapy and counselling*" is timely. The content is provocative and explores the complexity of training issues with an integration of developmental theory and psychotherapy modalities. It is possible that not all methods of counselling or psychotherapy require or emphasise the same need for personal growth of the practitioner. However, many within the psychotherapy profession assume that the personal capacities of the psychotherapist are vital for safe and effective practice, and that development of these capacities should be facilitated within training and supervision.

The requirement to emotionally grow and also meet intellectual learning objectives may be challenging for the student, and the simultaneous nurturing and evaluation of personal qualities fraught for both the student and the tutor. This complex experience has been described as 'a mission impossible' on 'a long and winding road to qualification' (Karter, 2002). It is tempting to make the link here between psychotherapy training and psychotherapy itself, which was described by Freud as 'the impossible profession'.

Reasons for choosing this topic

My true love is called Life. ... Come near and tell me who you are, what you are. (Kahlil Gibran, 1995, p.45)

I have been involved, for over 20 years, first as a student, then as a teacher, in psychotherapy education. Education, in its broadest sense has always been of interest to me, firstly when I was a nursing tutor, and more recently when I was involved in developing a psychotherapy programme at Eastern Institute of Technology in Hawkes Bay. I am also intimately involved in the training of students in Hakomi

Psychotherapy. The preparation for this specialist method of psychotherapy emphasises inner exploration and the development of relevant personal qualities. I have always believed that for a profession where the use of the 'self' and the ability to empathically relate are essential, there is an obvious need for the practitioner to embody characteristics that have been shown to be therapeutic.

In spite of general acceptance in psychotherapy that personal growth is necessary and important in training, there is a paucity of research in the area of personal growth in the education of psychotherapists (Halgin & Murphy, 1995). The study of psychotherapies has been favoured over the study of psychotherapists themselves, and their attributes (Orlinsky & Rønnestad, 2005). I found even less in research literature, or texts on psychotherapy education that addresses the issue from the student's perspective. An exception is a recent book by John Karter (2002), a graduate of the Metanoia Institute in London, and a practising psychotherapist, where the experiences of both trainers and students are given voice. The student who has just completed a psychotherapy course is likely to have rich and detailed stories that support existing writings on the topic, or highlight previously unacknowledged dimensions of this complex experience. There are specific questions that arise here in Aotearoa¹. Is the experience of personal growth for Maori psychotherapists similar to that of Pakeha²? Do psychotherapy trainings nurture personal development in a way that works for Maori?

For this study I set out to explore personal growth as directly experienced by psychotherapy students, the value they place on this aspect of their education, and the impact of the journey on themselves personally, their relationships, and their ability to do the work of psychotherapy. I am also interested in the implications of this lived experience for trainers and training programmes, and ultimately for the profession of psychotherapy. As the research progressed I became captured by the place of *love* in personal development, a theme that presented itself again and again in the accounts of the participants, and in my reading.

Preunderstandings

Facts are hard to establish, and capable of being given many meanings. Reality is built on our own prejudices, gullibility and ignorance, as well as on knowledge and analysis. Salman Rushdie (1981)

¹ Aotearoa — New Zealand

² Pakeha — non-Maori, white-skinned person

I bring my own life experience to this research. There is much that I have read, learned from others, and experienced over many years. Some of my perspectives I am conscious of, and other more unconscious imprints will colour my interpretation bringing unintentional bias.

My making meaning of my experience and that of the human condition has been shaped by an interest in neurophysiology. This began when I was teaching nurses over 30 years ago. Much has been discovered since then about early brain wiring, neural plasticity, limbic function, and implicit memory. I may have been also influenced by having a mother with Asperger's Syndrome and a father with a frontal lobe head injury after a motorcycle accident. Understanding brain function and the relevance to psychology has helped me understand people better, and to be more tolerant and compassionate.

The neurological social engagement system described by Stephen Porges (2001) illuminates the impact on human relating from trauma and lack of safety. This physical understanding confirms earlier psychological knowledge that Winnicott (1965) espoused on the importance of a *holding environment* for child development, as well as for psychological growth and healing later in life. Daniel Siegel (1999) affirms that the human brain and nervous system is the most complex system in the known universe. Knowing about complex systems has influenced my appreciation of change processes in human individuals and groups, and helped me realise that finding certainty, and simple cause and effect explanations for human behaviour, will always elude us.

Discovering attachment theory (Bowlby, 1969) was exciting as it gave me a perspective to understand influences from my own childhood, and my early avoidant way of relating. I know from my own experience that early relationship templates can be changed, as Schore (1994) and Siegel (2003) assert, and this gives me realistic hope for many of the changes my clients and psychotherapy trainees are working towards. Attachment theory naturally links with brain development and relationship function, as well as the character styles described by Reich, Lowen (1975) and others (Glikauf-Hughes & Wells, 1997; Kurtz, 2004; Pierrakos, 1990) which I have found to be useful maps to assist with understanding people.

Since I began studying psychology in my early twenties, and later as a result of my explorations into psychotherapy theory and practice I have been influenced by many perspectives on the human mind, and how one person can facilitate change in another. I had the commonly experienced mixed reactions to reading Freud, but was always attracted to the depth of the psychodynamic approach. I experienced psychotherapies such as Bioenergetics and Gestalt, and a whole emotional richness and somatic aliveness

opened up. Later I went to Zurich to train with Arnold Mindell (1992) and experienced his neo-Jungian Process Work. This gave me a wider perspective, which brought in the social world, without any loss of depth and mystery. My earlier studies in sociology, and my feminism were congruent with Process Work, and I often moved out of my comfort zone with this vibrant, challenging, wild method. I appreciated how I was encouraged by Arny and his colleagues into more expressiveness and vitality, but my more natural introverted nature was still seeking a modality I felt more personally suited to.

Fifteen years ago I found Hakomi which was like a coming home for me. Hakomi, developed by Ron Kurtz (1990) is an integrative psychotherapy modality that incorporates the body, the unconscious, developmental character maps, and which uses mindfulness, present moment awareness and the conscious practice of loving presence in therapy. The incorporation of an Eastern philosophy and spiritual dimension was appealing to me.

I also did some courses with Michael White in Australia on the Narrative approach which satisfied again my interest in social justice. A lot of my early psychotherapy practice was with traumatised people and I have pursued much training on the effects and healing of trauma. Creative approaches to self-exploration and change have always had appeal. I completed several ten day retreats participating in a Buddhist ‘Unfolding through Art’ experiential learning programme. I have lived many years, but my curiosity, as expressed in this poem by Rilke, remains unabated:

You have not grown old, and it is not too late
to dive into your increasing depths
where life calmly gives out its own secret. Rainer Maria Rilke

I have never been able to be narrow or confined in my own personal and professional journeying, and this attitude has seeped into my research project.

Definitions

For this research *-psychotherapy* covers a complex range of related activities. Some of the writers quoted use the terms counselling and psychotherapy interchangeably. In contexts where there is felt to be a difference psychotherapy and counselling, there is nearly always an overlap. The accepted terminology may differ according to the country and culture. In this study I refer to *psychotherapy*, as defined below, but some of the authors quoted are calling the same process *counselling*. Experts in the field were asked (Mahoney, 1995) to define ‘psychotherapy’ and it was found that “they held widely ranging views on the nature of psychotherapy. For this research I adopt Mahoney’s (1995, p.477) own definition of psychotherapy:

Psychotherapy is a culturally relative special *relationship* between a professional helper and individual or group of clients. Working from a *theoretical rationale* that includes basic assumptions about human nature and the processes of psychological *development*, the psychotherapist works with the client to create a safe, stable and caring alliance in and from which the client can explore — often via ritualized techniques — past, present and possible ways of experiencing self, world, and their dynamic relationships.

Recent psychotherapy graduates are those who have successfully completed a psychotherapy education programme offered through a university or technical institute, and of at least three years' duration. I am excluding students who withdrew from their courses, or who did not graduate with a formal qualification in psychotherapy, counselling or psychology. Throughout this study I will refer to the graduates as *participants*.

Personal growth is defined to be the process of a person developing self capacity which enables them to: show compassion and empathy for another, even when negatively impacted by the other, be aware of, articulate and self-regulate a wide range of cognitive, emotional and somatic states, and utilise these therapeutically, tolerate and manage anxiety, ambiguity, strong emotional states, distress and personal pain in self and in another, in an immediate way, sufficiently resolve traumatic or developmental 'injuries' resulting from their own life experiences so that these do not create negative biases in the therapy, or lead to debilitating states for themselves. (Dryden & Thorne, 1991b; Halgin & Murphy, 1995; Symington, 1995; Woskit, 1999) Personal growth also includes the subjective evaluation of positive personal change, where a person comes to feel more settled, increasingly at peace with themselves and the world, and able to relate and live in a vital, embodied way with a sense of purpose. (Eulert, 2003; Ferruci, 1982; Frankl, 1984; Fromm, 1983; C. K. Germer, 2006; Hendricks & Hendricks, 1993; Kabat-Zinn, 2005; Schellenbaum, 1988; Daniel J. Siegel, 1999; Trungpa, 1983; Whyte, 2001)

Context

The path through training demands self-knowledge and exposes the soul. (Bowden, 2001, p.180)

There has not been much research on the effectiveness of personal growth during psychotherapy trainings; and which personal development components of courses do in fact lead to the development of expected capacities. One of the reasons for this maybe the complexity of the factors involved. Another possible reason is the intuitively strongly-held conviction that personal growth is a good thing and necessary for a psychotherapist. It just needs to be there, like the background water for the fish, and therefore may not be examined or questioned. Supporting personal development becomes a tradition like teaching languages for high school pupils and is passed on from one generation to the next. The New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists expects those applying for membership to demonstrate self-awareness and an understanding

of their own psychological processes (NZAP, 2006). Most educational institutions in New Zealand that offer counselling or psychotherapy training require or recommend personal therapy.

History

Freud required analysts to explore their own inner worlds through their own analysis, and thus 'clear' themselves of personal issues that could interfere with effectiveness.

If the doctor is to be in a position to use his unconscious in this way as an instrument in the analysis, he must himself fulfil one psychological condition to a high degree. ... It is not enough for this that he himself should be an approximately normal person. It may be insisted, rather, that he should have undergone a psycho-analytic purification and have become aware of those complexes of his own which would be apt to interfere with his grasp of what the patient tells him.(Freud, 1912, p.360)

Historically, however, the expressed need for psychotherapists to undergo personal development took some time to develop. Wilhelm Reich studied medicine, took up psychiatry and at 22 years old in 1918 became a member of the Vienna Psychoanalytic Society and a practising psychoanalyst. His biographer, Charles Rycroft says :

To anyone familiar with the contemporary psychoanalytic scene it seems almost incredible that a medical student still in his early twenties should have been allowed to treat patients.... But the psychoanalytic movement was very different then. (Rycroft, 1971, p.6).

That such a young, inexperienced person should start doing therapy with clients would these days be met with shock. It is now recognised that a certain level of personal development and training is necessary for effective psychotherapy practice (Rowan, 2005).

The need for personal growth

It is only through having learned effective ways of recognising and dealing with their own anxieties – through their personal analysis and long training – that psychotherapists can be effective in helping their patients... (Dale, p.22)

From the time of Freud onwards in disparate modalities such as Transactional Analysis (Dusay, 1971), Gestalt (Perls, 1975), Bioenergetics (Lowen, 1975) and Rogerian therapy (Rogers, 1951), there has been a widely held assumption that self development is a necessary part of a psychotherapist's education.

The ability to have a positive presence and to establish a therapeutic alliance is generally seen as vital in psychotherapy (Petruska Clarkson, 1995; Greenberg, 2002; Kurtz, 1990; Rogers, 1951). As the inspirational writer, John O'Donohue says:

Human presence is never neutral. It always has an effect. Human presence strikes a resonance. (1998, p.84)

The therapeutic relationship allows for emotional limbic resonance to occur, for safety which permits exploration and vulnerability in the session, and for the client to have the often missing experience of being compassionately understood by another. The psychotherapist needs to be able to show acceptance and

empathy (Lewis et al., 2001), even when the state of the client makes this challenging. Asay and Lambert note (2002), in reviewing the research on factors that lead to successful therapy that client variables have the most impact on outcome, closely followed by the quality of the therapeutic relationship. They say, in making recommendations for training of psychotherapists:

Training in relationship skills is crucial for beginning therapists because they are the foundation on which all other skills and techniques are built. (p.43)

The student therapist is encouraged to develop emotional intelligence with resulting capacity for, and self-regulation of, a wide range of emotional states. Leslie Greenberg (2002) details the capacities needed to be what others might call a psychotherapist, but what he calls an 'emotion coach'; helping others process and regulate emotional memories and states. Asay & Lambert (2002) recommend changing the emphasis in graduate training toward the development of the therapist as a person who prizes others. They argue that giving this personal development prominence can only make psychotherapy more valuable, meaningful and effective.

Personal therapy and group therapy

Many psychotherapy courses require or recommend students to undergo their own psychotherapy as one means of stimulating their personal growth. Students have the opportunity to explore issues in a more contained way in their therapy, and can explore personal and interpersonal capacities within a group. However, openness and emotional processing is also usually expected within the training setting. In personal therapy and in an experiential group students can feel what it is like to be a client and this can shape their own practice, using their therapist, and group facilitator as models. In therapy the student can open up, and deeply explore more unconscious and vulnerable aspects of their own personality. John Karter (2002), is clearly behind the need for personal growth and healing. He says that therapists who do not attempt to deal with their own pathology, especially their psychic blocks, will have trouble offering their clients the most basic preconditions for good therapy.

It is clear that some students need personal growth and support more than others. Attachment research has shown that having experienced as a child a *secure attachment* allows for better management of emotions and more warmth in relating in adult life. Some people have the good fortune to be well nurtured in early life and to develop a secure attachment virtually unconsciously. Others have attachment styles that do not help them to create therapeutic relationships. However it is asserted that secure attachment can be 'earned' (Siegel, 1999). How this is to be achieved is an important consideration for teachers of psychotherapy.

I was upset after yesterday's class. I couldn't sleep last night. I thought we would be studying other peoples' emotions, not our own! (Suzie — first year student)

Students are often surprised or shocked by the emotional impact of the course. Experiential groups can be harrowing, and may be deeply confusing at the outset. Skills practice where students work with each other frequently accesses personal material. The subject matter of many didactic topics can trigger unresolved emotional memories. There is often not space, time, nor safety to adequately explore these reactions in class, so students use group or personal therapy to address triggered material. They may try to deal with it in less 'healthy ways'. Family and social life can become disrupted. Intimate relationships may end. Some students do withdraw, and we don't know the impact the training process has had on them.

Choice of methodology

... meaning can be understood by those who employ the right kind of intelligence to understand it. This is an intelligence characterised by the dynamics of the gods Eros and Hermes. (Cowie et al., 1998, p.227)

Personal growth is a complex concept, as discussed above, and trajectories of self development vary from individual to individual (Halgin & Murphy, 1995; Amy Mindell, 1995; Symington, 1995). However, it is possible there are similarities shared by many psychotherapy students in their experience of the education process. Their stories illuminate dimensions of personal growth from the perspective of those who have recently journeyed through psychotherapy education. The lived experience of the personal growth dimension of psychotherapy training, as communicated by recent graduates, gives us windows into the potential for living into the questions yet to be explored, let alone answered.

Phenomenology is "a philosophy, an approach, or perspective to living, learning and doing research" (Munhall, 1994), p.3). Hermeneutic phenomenology includes the unfolding of meaning, interpretation, from experience (Bergum, 1989). In this study hermeneutics is the approach most likely to produce information about the lived experience of the student therapist, and the meanings made of this experience. Hermeneutics is particularly appropriate where little is known about the topic from previous research, or when the topic is complex (Opie, 1999; B. A. Smith, 1998).

I feel that the hermeneutic approach is appropriate for researching psychotherapy issues. Hermeneutics involves gaining a deeper understanding of the nature and meaning of our everyday experiences (van Manen, 1990). It is the study of 'what is', the essences of phenomena (van Manen, 1990). Many aspects of personal growth can only be really understood subjectively. Hermeneutics is based on a belief that the world is

knowable only through the subjectivity of being in the world (Munhall, 1994). Participants are likely to describe existential meanings to a degree of depth and richness (van Manen, 1990).

Hermeneutics involves a search for what it means to be human (van Manen, 1990). I imagine that psychotherapy students are on this search, as are many psychotherapists and their clients. The experiences of the students will have been lived and embodied, where through consciousness they are aware of being in the world, and through the body gain conscious access to that world (Munhall, 1994). The telling of the experiences, while recorded verbally, will also come from embodied, implicit and explicit knowledge, expressed through emotional and somatic channels. The focus will involve understanding rather than abstract ideas, or problem-solving (van Manen, 1990).

The above dimensions of hermeneutic inquiry are also key aspects of psychotherapy, as is:

a minding, a heeding, a caring attunement, a wondering about the project of living, of what it means to live a life (van Manen, 1990, p.12).

As in psychotherapy, the researcher, with his/her own subjectivity and pre-understandings, is intimately involved in the conversation and subsequent interpretation. This is expressed by Cowie and her colleagues (1998) who say that we can ask the question. 'Are you willing to disclose yourself?' and can therefore enter dialogue with the interiority of another human being, from our own interiority.

There are parallels, named above, between psychotherapy and phenomenological research. However, the purposes and techniques differ. Hermeneutic reflection is always retrospective, not introspective, being a reflection on experience that has already been lived through. Hermeneutic research uses particular modes of questioning, reflecting, focusing and intuiting, reading, writing and re-writing; studying the context and form of texts describing lived human experience (van Manen, 1990).

Conclusion

During the research project, questions kept arising; ideas, ponderings, insights, images sat continually at the back of my consciousness and invaded my dreaming sleep. Conversations with many people in places as scattered as Canada, America, Australia and New Zealand, stimulated new meanings, new uncertainties. Some questions I wanted to explore more, others I was happy to let sit there, tantalizing, intriguing and holding mystery. A poem came to mind:

I want to beg you as much as I can to be patient
Toward all that's unsolved in your heart,
And to learn to love the questions themselves.
Like locked rooms.
Or like books that are written in a foreign tongue.

Do not seek the answers that cannot be given to you,
Because you would not be able to live them,
And the point is to live everything.

Live the questions now,
Perhaps you will then gradually,
Without noticing it,
Live along some distant day,
Into the answer.

Rainer Maria Rilke (Bly, 1981)

In spite of not having definitive answers, I did make discoveries and deepen my understandings about personal growth in psychotherapy training, which I will present in this thesis. Participants described the nature of their developmental journey with all its fullness. I present what was significant, what was joyful, what was painful. In the analysis of the data I have extracted influences from the educational environment that were supporting, and aspects that made growth more challenging. The participants speak of outcomes of their personal growth and give the meanings they make of this dimension of their training. I looked through the eyes and hearts of teachers as well as former students, and explored the particular nature of growth experiences within psychotherapy training here in Aotearoa.

Arising from from the data was the overarching theme of *love*. I therefore entitled my study, 'The Alchemy of Love' to capture that hard to define 'something', deeply known by those I spoke with, yet mysterious too; that ingredient that motivated, held and transformed the students on their personal growth journey. As quoted earlier, Mason (2002, p.1) said that qualitative research engages us with things that matter, in ways that matter. Love matters.

Chapter Two: Literature review

Introduction

To do justice to the depth, richness and complexity of the experiences presented I have decided to include, alongside literature of psychotherapy and education, other relevant writings from developmental psychology, attachment research, spirituality, neurology, and complexity theory. I have also tapped into the depth of wisdom to be found in poetry, biography and fiction. There are many themes running through this research that have pertinent bodies of literature attached to them and the ongoing challenge was to manage the vast

possibilities that kept unfolding before me, and to keep focus on the question. I have also endeavoured to avoid becoming blinkered by artificial constraints, thus neglecting the rich complexity that will influence understandings that flow from my research.

Baskets of Knowledge

He aha tem ea nui o tea o? Maaku e kii atu he tangata, he tangata! (Shirres, 1997, p.18)

(What is the greatest reality of the world? I say the human person, the human person!)

Maori legend (Shirres, 1997, pp.16-19) describes three baskets of knowledge; *te kete³ aronui⁴*; direct sensory information, *te kete tuauri⁵*; knowledge of world and human being as complex patterns of energy, structure and growth, and *te kete tuaatea⁶*; spiritual knowledge which is beyond space and time. For this review I have searched within my own baskets of knowledge, five in number, that have the potential to yield many treasures; *philosophy, psychological theory, scientific understandings, accounts of personal experience* including creative expression, and the *nature of love*.

The philosophy of studying human experience is of significance, with the need to choose a methodology that best suits the nature of this enquiry, and which will yield valid results. Included in psychological theory is the nature of human psychological change; developmental perspectives on psychological growth, and formation of the self, with particular emphasis on adult stages of growth and development. These theories give background maps illustrating the human process I am studying.

Theories of psychotherapy and psychotherapy education, which include the capacities needed to be a psychotherapist, and prescriptions for the nature and outcomes of personal growth during the psychotherapy education process, are of consequence. In the area of science, recent neurophysiology findings that underpin relationship, psychological change and integration, complemented psychological theory, as did writings on complexity and 'health' of complex systems. As this research is about studying human subjective experience the traditions, and personal accounts, of growth and healing in psychotherapy journeys and the similar unfolding described from a spiritual perspective were pertinent. Experiences of teachers and the impact of the students' personal development on the tutors rounded out the picture. As the theme of *love* emerged,

³ *kete* - basket

⁴ *aronui* – that before us

⁵ *tuauri* – beyond, in the dark

⁶ *tuaatea* – infinite, eternal world

the large quantity of literature on love, relationship and attachment, and how people develop the capacity to love, captured my attention.

The myriad of the interrelated themes summarised above do not stand separately but are intricately woven together in the lived experiences of psychotherapy students, and within growth accounts told by human beings of all ages and cultures.

The First Basket of Knowledge: Philosophy

Na te kune te pupuke, na te pupuke te hiriri, na te hiriri te mahara, na te mahara te hinengaro, na te hinengaro te manako (Shirres, 1997, pp.24-25).

(First the conception, then a time of growth; the evolving of a thought, consciousness, into full daylight)

Studying human experience

The phenomenologist is committed to understanding social phenomena from the actor's own perspective. He or she examines how the world is experienced. The important reality is what people perceive it to be. (S. J. Taylor & Bogdan, 1984, p.3)

To give meaning to the themes running through the personal growth experiences, as recollected by recent psychotherapy graduates, I have drawn on the philosophic traditions of hermeneutics and phenomenology. Human beings are complex systems. Studying human experience requires methods of inquiry suited to this complexity. The way we experience, understand, gain and accept knowledge is largely defined by our philosophical beliefs.

We do not have direct access to another's experience. We deal with ambiguous representations of it – talk, text, interaction and interpretation. (Reissman, 1993, p.8)

Phenomenology

The phenomenological perspective used is based on the work of the European philosophers, Gadamer, Heidegger, Husserl, and Merleau-Ponty, and a number of the writings about qualitative research (Coyle, 1998; Creswell, 1998; Holloway & Jefferson, 2000; Mason, 2002; Patton, 1980; S. J. Taylor & Bogdan, 1984; Tolich & Davidson, 1999; van Manen, 1990). I was particularly inspired by Helen Cowie and Annemarie Salm, who with their colleagues used what they call a *New Paradigm* approach to their qualitative research, relating their study of learning experiences of counsellors in training to a Greek way of understanding. They say (1998, p.223):

The ancient Greeks had an integrative vision of the entire universe. Their ontology recognised three interpenetrating kinds of realities, 'spirit', 'soul' and 'body'; ... 'the Mysterious', 'the Intelligible' and 'the Sensible'. Of the Mysterious one can have experience, lived experience, but not knowledge in any procedural sense ... The Mysterious cannot be researched. The Sensible ... is predictable and regular because it is external ... a kind of baseline. It grounds

meaning. ... The Intelligible is ... *inspired* by the Mysterious, and it is *confronted* by the Sensible. The Intelligible is the order of meaning *sui generis*, as a reality of its own kind.

The three realities of the Greek world-view are strikingly similar to the three baskets of knowledge of the Maori. The developmental levels formulated by Rowan (2005) (discussed later in this chapter), and linked to different modalities of psychotherapy, also are resonant with the Greek categories. According to Rowan, the *instrumental self* is more practical and concrete, as is the *Sensible* or *te kete aronui*, where one uses problem-solving modalities such as Cognitive Behaviour Therapy, the *authentic self* is concerned with relationship and inner experience, the domain of the *Intelligible* or *te kete tuauri*, where one is interested in depth psychotherapies, and the *transpersonal self* explores the spiritual reality of the *Mysterious* or *te kete tuaatea*.

A convergence

Exploring the literature on the philosophy behind qualitative research and Maori world-views, developmental psychology, as well as training for differing psychotherapy modalities highlighted some congruence. When different strands come together like this, a phenomenon that Daniel Siegel (1999) calls *concilience*, it feels exciting, like some deep layer of truth is being uncovered. The philosophy that forms the foundation for my research is detailed by Max Van Manen (1990). His writing not only converges with the themes of love that emerged, the practice of psychotherapy itself, and the focus on the *Intelligible*, as described above, but also honours the knowledge contained in poetry. He says (p.5):

In doing research we question the world's very secrets and intimacies which are constitutive of the world, and which bring the world as world into being for us and in us. The research is a caring act: we want to know that which is most essential to being. To care is to serve and to share our being with the one we love. We desire to truly know our loved one's very nature. And if our love is strong enough, we will not only learn much about life, we will also come face to face with its mystery.

The Second Basket of Knowledge: Psychological Theory

He puawaitanga no te harakeke; he rito whakaki i nga wharuarua

(The flax flowers; new shoots fill the empty gaps. Even in maturity flax bush and whanau go on growing and changing (Metge, 1995, p.290).)

Growth and development, and human change processes

Compared to other areas of psychology, optimum development of personality has generated relatively little research. (Pfaffenberger, 2005, p.279)

There are numerous theories on change, growth and development, and it is beyond the scope of this study to review them all. However, it is relevant to consider theoretical frameworks speaking to the developmental

'stage' exhibited by psychotherapy students and the growth processes that may be needed to support their ability to be effective psychotherapists.

Mindfulness and growth

According to some research a necessary precursor for change to occur in psychotherapy is that people speak directly from their experience, as it is occurring (Tomblinson & Hart, 1962; Walker, Rablen, & Rogers, 1959). Eugene Gendlin (1986) re-asserted this, and developed a method of teaching people to focus in on the felt sense of experience in the present moment. We could wonder if this attention to the present moment is an important factor in change occurring outside psychotherapy as well. Spiritual traditions such as Zen and mindfulness practices believe mindful attention to present experience is crucial for developmental unfolding leading to greater self capacity and well-being (Austen, 2001; Welwood, 1983). David Brandon (1983, p.144), head of Division of Applied Social Studies at Preston Polytechnic in England, says:

In Western society we are constantly encouraged to take our minds away from the present. We are afraid of boredom. ... We feel best when busy.

If this is so, then an important part of both psychotherapy and psychotherapy education will be training the therapist in mindful attention to the present moment. Brandon calls this therapeutic attention, *nowness*. Diane Shainberg (1983), a faculty member of the National Institute for Psychotherapies in New York, details some of the training process involved in her chapter, "*Teaching therapists how to be with their clients.*" She concludes by saying:

There is key transformation in the supervisee when he is open to observing his patient as is, letting his patient be... (p.175).

Freud (1912) admonished psychoanalysts to listen with an evenly suspended attention; during which the critical faculty is suspended, allowing for an impartial attention to everything there is to observe. Christopher Germer (2005, p.27) agrees on the usefulness of mindfulness in psychotherapy:

To have psychological techniques at our disposal, drawn from a 2500-year old tradition, which appear to change the brain, shape our behaviour for the better, and offer intuitive insights about how to live life more fully, is an opportunity that may be difficult for psychotherapists to ignore.

Personal development in adulthood leads to increasing ability to self-reflect (Kegan, 1982; Rowan, 2005). There is a connection between being able to pay attention to experience in the moment and the ability to be consciously empathic, congruent and loving. Austen (2001), quoting research by Lesh (1970), says that meditation training for counseling students increased their capacity for empathy. Daniel Stern (2004) suggests that there is great clinical value in maintaining a lingering interest in the present moment. He

concludes that the result is a greater appreciation of experience, and a less hurried rush to interpretation. Ken Wilber (2000) likewise extols the value of mindfulness, which involves developing the Witness state, in promoting both personal and transpersonal change. Greg Johanson (2006), senior Hakomi psychotherapy trainer, wrote an overview of the value of mindfulness in psychotherapy, emphasising that there is growing literature supporting the value of mindfulness in psychotherapy.

Pain in the process of growth

A question also arises as to whether pain and discomfort are necessary stimulants to growth. It is a popular belief that there is 'no gain without pain'. A senior psychotherapist once said to me, "The purpose of psychotherapy is to disturb". Does this mean that we as psychotherapy trainers should deliberately disturb our trainees in order to promote their personal development? Leslie Greenberg (2002) believes that facing unresolved painful material is vital for growth and the development of empathy towards self. In the introduction to "*Man's search for meaning*" by Victor Frankl (1984), Gordon W. Allport says that to live is to suffer, and to survive is to find meaning in the suffering. However, it is probable that all growth does not include pain and disturbance. Later on in his book, Frankl (1984) comments that suffering is not indispensable to the discovery of meaning.

The ability to tolerate emotional pain, however, seems an important aspect of growth in general, and for those becoming psychotherapists in particular. Allan Schore (1994) describes how an infant develops the capacity to deal with disappointment through the 'wiring up' of certain limbic-frontal circuits, a process that results from a particular parenting style that balances empathy and comfort with limit setting. Some students may not have had the early experiences that allow them to sit with their own pain and pain in others. Welwood (1983) refers to pain being inherent in having an open heart. Whether or not pain is necessary to stimulate growth, or self-capacity is increased through the experience of hurt, it is clear that discomfort and pain are part of many developmental and change processes. Kegan (1994, pp.258-260) argues that moving from a third order level of consciousness to a fourth order frequently allows painful vulnerabilities to surface, which the person now has the capacity to address, thus potentially relieving chronic suffering.

Higher levels of adult development

In moving beyond childhood stages of development, Abraham Maslow (1954) introduced the well known pyramid with self-actualisation as the end point. John Welwood (1983, p.51), the director of the East/West

Psychology programme at the California Institute of Integral Studies, takes development even further when he comments:

One of the most important contributions of the East to Western psychology has been in helping us extend our vision of the whole range of human development beyond the normal aims of psychological adjustment. Beyond the desire for self-actualisation ... we seem to have a need to go beyond ourselves, to step outside our familiar safe boundaries and taste life on a larger scale.

Welwood (op.cit.) says that personal fulfilment does not prepare us for issues such as death and aloneness. Eng-Kong Tan (2001) believes that most personal growth that occurs in psychotherapy is about building the self, and further growth then takes us into spiritual development where the self is dissolved and connection with a higher source occurs.

Eastern descriptions of human growth include spiritual development as part of human unfolding. Self or 'ego' is surrendered, transcended. However, John Welwood (1983) points out that Eastern teachings assume that a person already has a healthy self structure. He sees the domain of psychotherapy as helping people solve life problems, develop a functional sense of self, deepen feelings and their inner life, and begin to break the protective shell that surrounds the heart, so they can let the world in and meet others more fully. Together Western and Eastern theories of development encompass a full spectrum which seems most significant for psychotherapists to be cognisant of as their clients will also be at varying stages of development (Kegan, 1994; Rowan, 2005; Tan, 2001; Wilber, 1981).

A literature review by Pfaffenberger (2005) outlined the factors that facilitate development to higher stages of growth in adult life. Her study concluded that advanced development is promoted by certain stable personality characteristics and by meaningful engagement with challenging life events. The research she cited supported the conclusion that meditation and specifically targeted educational interventions furthered adult development. She also notes that there are few studies on what factors facilitate development at higher stages. She states (Pfaffenberger, 2005, p.298):

We also have to consider that the process of self-actualisation may be idiosyncratic. Achievement of advanced stages of development may require a departure from social norms and be facilitated through a deeply personal exploration. Emphasising the commonalities in personality characteristics and life events may obscure this fact and hinder a deeper understanding of the phenomenon.

Maybe we would hope that all psychotherapists would have achieved more advanced stages of growth, at least for those who practice modalities such as the 'depth psychotherapies'. The prescriptions for training advocated by Frankl and Symington, cited later in this review, are more in line with what is needed to facilitate personal development for therapists who are moving into 'higher' levels of maturity. Kegan (1982) would agree. He also describes how people are working with the pull of opposite tensions — to be a

separate individual and to be included. At different stages of growth one or other of these opposite forces is more dominant. He describes how therapists can gain from understanding what is needed at each stage with regard to holding and containing, stimulating growth, and providing continuity through unstabilising transition periods.

Significant study on the highest stages of adult development has been done by Cook-Greuter (1994). She suggests that only a small percentage of the population reaches what she terms a *postautonomous* level of development, which is usually achieved by midlife.

The first stage of this she calls *construct-aware*, where individuals become involved in meaning making. As self-awareness increases, they explore alternative ways of knowing. Transpersonal episodes, such as peak experiences, become more common, and people are drawn to meditation, intuition, and the witnessing of the internal process. At the following, *unitive stage*, individuals can achieve an openness to experience that is fluid and without struggle. They are now able to make use of transpersonal experiences free from 'ego clinging'. Cook-Greuter (1999, 2000) suggests that this is an end point in ego development and only transpersonal theories of development can suggest further stages.

If we want psychotherapy students to have achieved a postautonomous stage of development, where they are able to be intuitive and self-reflect, then there is only a small proportion, 1% according to Cook-Greuter, to choose from. Very few adults reach the transpersonal stages. Kegan (1994, p.317) states that:

although we are told we are living in a 'postmodern age', the best empirical evidence shows that very few of us have actually reached this threshold and even then never before midlife.

Kegan believes that the majority of adults are at the juncture of third and fourth levels of consciousness and only a minority are at the fifth level of consciousness which is necessary to be fully functional in the postmodern approach to life and thinking.

Personal growth and developmental stage for psychotherapists

I use Kegan's (1982; 1994) constructive-developmental model of human change over the life span, which is a phenomenological approach, influenced by a number of psychotherapy theories (Guntrip, 1968; Mahler, Pine, & Bergman, 1975; Maslow, 1954; Rogers, 1951; Winnicott, 1965). Kegan's work has direct bearing on psychotherapy training and his model of human development links well with the work of John Rowan. Rowan (2005) has worked to bring clarity around the relationship between adult developmental stages, which are inspired by Ken Wilber (2000), psychotherapies, and appropriate training for psychotherapists. Rowan also addresses what the different psychotherapy modalities offer clients and require from practitioners in the way

of skills. In the following pages I have summarised concepts from Rowan (2005) (Table 1), and followed this with another chart (Table 2.) that brings together ideas from both Rowan and Kegan (1982; 1994).

<i>DIMENSIONS of STAGE</i>	STAGES of DEVELOPMENT: ROWAN			
<i>Level – Rowan title</i>	Instrumental self	Authentic self	Transpersonal self (1)	Transpersonal self (2)
<i>Wilber equivalent</i>	Mental ego (<i>Wilber</i>)	Centaur (<i>Wilber</i>)	Subtle (<i>Wilber</i>)	Unity (<i>Wilber</i>)
<i>Favours inclusion or independence</i>	I am defined by others (moves towards independence)	I define who I am (moves towards independence, then inclusion)	I am defined by others (moves towards interdependence)	I am not defined
<i>Process for ego</i>	Healing Ego building	Development Ego extending	Opening Ego reduction	Enlightenment Ego dissolving
<i>Questions that arise</i>	What is the best method, technique?	What is the best relationship?	How far can we go together?	Can you face the loss of all your words?
<i>The challenge of the stage</i>	Dare you face the challenge of the unconscious?	Dare you face the challenge of freedom?	Dare you face the loss of your boundaries?	Dare you face the loss of all your symbols?
<i>Appropriate modalities</i>	Freudian (sometimes) CBT, Behaviour modification Some TA Brief therapy NLP	Freudian, Jungian Gestalt, Hakomi Rogerian Winnicott TA (sometimes)	Psychoynthesis Grof Hillman Transpersonal Hakomi (sometimes)	Christian mysticism Sufi Epstein Almass Amy Mindell
<i>Appropriate research methods</i>	Quantitative/qualitative	Colloborative	Mindful	None
<i>'Therapy' issues</i>	Adjustment Being accepted Language important Wants love and work Tastes of compassion Symptom removal Goals, problems Need to know Believe in self	Crisis and loss Who is the real me Self-reflection Being authentic Body-mind unity Making the unconscious conscious Death and rebirth I create my world Growing intuition Peak experiences Reliable compassion, self-love	Spiritual experiences Being present Higher self Creativity, imagery Being open Deep compassion, intimacy, love Strongly intuitive Beginner's mind Not knowing	Being fully present Wisdom Mysticism Devotion commitment Steady compassion silence Knowing/ not knowing

Table 1. The developmental theory of Rowan, with associated psychotherapies (2005)

<i>DIMENSIONS of STAGE</i>	STAGES of DEVELOPMENT: ROWAN and KEGAN COMPARED				
	Instrumental self	Authentic self		Transpersonal self (1)	Transpersonal self (2)
<i>Rowan level</i>					
<i>Kegan: stage (1982)</i>	Imperial (early adolescence)	Interpersonal (Late adolescence, adult)	Institutional	Interindividual	
<i>Kegan: holding environment; Culture of embeddedness</i>	Role-recognising (peers, school, family) acknowledge competence, role, self-reliance	Mutuality in one-to-one relationships Share moods, collaborative self- sacrifice	Identity in love and work Allow ambition, authority, freedom, achievement	Intimacy in love and work Interdependent environments, allows processing, openness	
<i>Kegan: – to stimulate growth, and transition to next level</i>	Demand mutual consideration, trustworthiness	Hold responsible for own initiatives and preferences	Demand intimacy, openness		
<i>Kegan: – risk factors at transition to next level</i>	Family relocation during this time	Intimate partners leave at time of emergence	Job loss or loss of group identifications		
<i>Kegan: – to assist during unstable transition to next level</i>	A chum. Family and school step back, but still there	Time limited participation in institution with times of return to family	Joining religious or political movement, love affair with unavailable partner		
<i>Kegan: order of consciousness (1994)</i>	Two	Three (Traditionalism)	Four (Modernism)	Five (Postmodernism)	
<i>Kegan: Characteristics of order of consciousness</i>	Tit-for-tat Concrete Cause and effect Can study impulses, perceptions	Mutual reciprocity Self-consciousness Inner states are self Can study self, needs and preferences	Self-regulation Create inner states Multiple roles are self Can study inner states, subjectivity	Paradox, contradictions Interpenetration of self and other is self Can study ideology, multiple roles, relationship forms, self-formation, self-regulation	
<i>Rowan – therapy Keywords</i>	Contracts, questionnaires, formal assessment, treatment goals, empirically based treatments, techniques, homework.	Authenticity, personhood, being in the world, intimacy, openness, presence, body-mind unity	Interbeing, linking, transcendental empathy, communion, dual unity	(maybe spiritual discipline rather than therapy) Surrender, salvation, enlightenment, devotion	

Table 2. The developmental theory of Rowan (2005) and Kegan (1994, 1982) compared.

Dividing the complex process of human unfolding into neat categories is bound to be a blunt instrument, which will miss individual aspects of development, as Pfaffenberger (2005) asserted. However, I believe, in relation to growth and psychotherapy training both perspectives shown in the charts above have some value. Kegan (1982) details stages of adult development, and the conditions that support, encourage, and challenge development. His discussion on the *cultures of embeddedness*, those conditions that 'hold' a particular developmental stage, is useful for thinking about the best training environment. Factors that assist with moving individuals into the next stage, and supporting them when they are in a frightening transition period, are also of direct relevance to psychotherapy and psychotherapy training. Kegan's orders of consciousness, discussed in his later work (1994), provide pertinent information on what can be expected from students, as well as challenges for psychotherapists, trainers, and educators generally.

Rowan's descriptions are less detailed on the levels of development, and the growth of consciousness. However, his work is complementary to that of Kegan, in that he directly applies developmental stage to psychotherapy and psychotherapy training. Rowan does not address the developmental level of the trainer, but infers it by stating what should be included in training for the varying stages. He believes that personal growth is not required for the practitioner of *instrumental* stage therapies. I wonder about this, as virtually all therapies involve relationship, and being unconscious of relationship dynamics is risky in all therapy. Rowan himself says (p.76):

A therapist who is still engaged in a personal search for the beloved can be a menace to all and sundry.

Rowan's list of modalities is a guide only, I believe, as the *way* the modality is practiced will influence the developmental level reached. Some modalities, such as Hakomi, (which I have added to Rowan's lists), do not fit neatly into stages, and can be helpful for clients at a range of stages from *authentic* to *transpersonal* levels. Other modalities are likely to also be usefully employed across stages. It could be the development of the practitioner that is more important than the techniques, which would fit with research that shows the person of the therapist is more influential in therapy outcome than methodology (Mahoney, 1991).

Prescriptions for the nature, and outcomes, of the personal growth dimension of the education process

Training, if it is to be effective, must involve a high degree of exploration on the part of the trainees with the aim of increasing their self-awareness and self-knowledge. (Dryden & Thorne, 1991b, p.3)

As discussed in the introduction, many texts on psychotherapy assert the need for psychotherapists to have undergone significant personal growth. I did not find many, comparatively speaking, accounts in psychotherapy literature that gave detailed expectations for the quality and nature of personal growth as part of psychotherapy education. There was discussion on personal therapy, whether or not it should be part of training, criticisms of personal growth within formal education, and descriptions of the level of growth that needs to be achieved. Many referrals to personal growth of the psychotherapists did not specifically state training prescriptions, but were allusions of a general nature, or it was assumed that a certain psychological development had taken place in the therapist prior to training.

Tradition

The difficulties of teaching the practice of psychoanalysis, which are particularly great, and are often to blame for the present dissension among psychoanalysts, already made themselves felt in this Viennese private psychoanalytic society. ... The self-reliance of mental workers, their early independence of the teacher, is always gratifying psychologically, but a scientific gain only results when certain, not too frequently occurring, personal conditions are also fulfilled in the workers. For psychoanalysis in particular a long and severe discipline and training in self-control is really necessary (Freud, 1938, p.947).

From the beginning Freud recognised the complexity of the profession and the need for a long training. Personal therapy as a requirement has a long history dating from when Freud required analysts to undergo their own therapy before beginning practice. He believed it would enable analysts to reduce their *countertransference* responses. Countertransference, arising from the unconscious, was seen as interference in the therapist's ability to be objective, and a block to the therapeutic relationship. Freud believed that no one can go beyond their blind spots and that the analyst's responsibility was to recognise and overcome countertransference through a personal experience of psychoanalysis (Etchegoyen, 1991). The resulting personal growth is inferred as 'a successful analysis' which became a tradition in the psychoanalytic field and has influenced psychotherapy to this day.

Over the years it continued to be expected that the practice of psychotherapy involved a long, initiatory preparation period. Michael Franz Basch (1988), in, "*Understanding psychotherapy*" recommends personal therapy as preparation for the role of psychotherapist. He says:

In later life, the consequences of having been significantly, often traumatically, misunderstood in infancy and childhood may lead some people into psychotherapy, others into becoming psychotherapists. In the latter case, the fear of committing oneself affectively lest one be again hurt or disappointed creates a barrier to the therapist's effective functioning. ... For that reason, it has been accepted, almost from the beginning of the Freudian era of depth psychology, that a therapist must be treated before he or she can treat others (p.149).

These days, it seems to me, students of psychotherapy are not expecting Freud's *long and severe discipline and training*, but, in keeping with the ethos and speed of the modern world, want to learn to be

psychotherapists rather more rapidly, with a minimum of cost and little pain or uncertainty. However, given the complexity of the psychotherapeutic endeavour, the personal capacities needed to practice effectively, and the frequency with which aspiring therapists come into training with personal pain and limitation deriving from troubled backgrounds, an extended period of personal exploration is to be expected. This view is supported by a number of writers.

Alice Miller (2005) is adamant that therapists address and resolve their defended childhood feelings towards their parents before they work with clients. Otherwise, she believes, they collude with their clients in maintaining an inauthentic love towards their parents, and allow these clients to engage in repetitive cruel parenting with their own children. She asserts (p.159):

If therapy is to be successful, the species of morality implicit in the Fourth Commandment, something inculcated into us at a very early stage in our upbringing, has to be dethroned. In far too many therapies, the morality of poisonous pedagogy either rules triumphant from the outset, or else rears its head in the later course of events because the therapist has not been able to shake off these constraints.

Cozolini (2004), clinical psychologist and psychotherapist, addressed the issue of the time it takes to become a therapist. He calculated that he had done 6000 hours of supervised practice and he still felt like a beginner. He says (p.xix):

It is difficult and costly to train therapists properly. It is far easier to provide a series of classes and leave the personal, more difficult components of therapeutic training to others. ... The unconscious mind is like a wild lion. We can never overpower our unconscious, only learn about it and hope to gain its cooperation. Taming the unconscious requires getting to know it well.

As Freud recognised, *taming the unconscious takes* time and commitment, and the journey to becoming a psychotherapist is not a quick or simple one.

Complex issues

Facilitation of personal growth and provision of personal therapy involve thorny issues for training programmes. Some of these were addressed by Elman and Forrest (2004) who interviewed psychotherapy programme directors concerning therapy for students. They were focusing on the role of therapy as remediation for students' personal problems. They identified some of the complexity around this issue in training programmes, including how confidential should the therapy be, what outcomes should be expected, and how much to monitor the selection and expertise of the treating therapists. These questions, while being named, were not resolved. Echoing the dilemma of other writers reviewed, they say (p.129):

The challenge is to provide developmentally appropriate educational experiences for trainees in a safe learning environment while protecting the public by graduating competent professionals.

Group therapy has the potential to be helpful in facilitating personal development (Woskit, 1999). Anita Bracey (2002), writing from her own experience, recommended time in a therapeutic community group environment as particularly useful, although it was painful and challenging. She said the group accessed would-be therapists' vulnerabilities, and allowed for self-exploration and personal growth. Psychology students studied by Nathan and Poulsen (2004) agreed that participation in group analysis was beneficial both for personal growth and skills learning, although they found that having fellow students as co-participants was constraining on their self-disclosure. Within training programmes, group facilitators may have conflicting roles when they also assess students. Decisions about confidentiality can be difficult as the students' sense of personal safety, and the responsibility of the trainers to monitor developing self-capacity, is balanced (Dryden & Thorne, 1991a).

Criticisms

A number of writers reviewed criticised formal training programmes for their inadequate attention to personal growth. When reading the literature it needs to be kept in mind that the nature of university psychotherapy training varies from country to country. Carl Rogers strongly criticised graduate education methods in general, and argued for a different education for psychology. He wrote "*Freedom to Learn*" in 1969, which included a chapter, *A Revolutionary Program for Graduate Education*. Rogers (1969) recommended giving strong attention to the interpersonal dimension in education. He was passionate about this, writing a paper in 1963 for *The American Psychologist*, which was turned down for publication. He said (Kirschenbaum, 1979) that If the day comes when psychology wishes to make an appraisal of its methods of professional preparation, it would, he believed, throw out most of its current assumptions and procedures.

It is possible that training programmes could evade the complex task of directly including personal development in the curriculum by sending students to therapy (Woskit, 1999). This is the sense that Rowan (2005) gives, emphasising personal therapy for therapists' growth, and not mentioning development occurring as an integral part of training. Bugental, (1987) hints at this in his discussion of the preparation of students for the artistry of psychotherapy. He argues (p.270):

These preconditions for preparation make it evident that a very different sort of program is required to guide and support the subjective growth of the would-be therapists. Currently, we know far too little about preparing the subjective, so we usually dodge the attempt, although most would give lip service to its importance. The requirement of personal therapy has been the most pertinent recognition. Astonishingly, there are those who question its pertinence.

Victor Frankl, a psychiatrist who endured years in concentration camps, was not convinced that training analyses or education of an academic nature adequately prepared therapists. He argued for a psychotherapy training that facilitated the development of faith and meaning in students, saying ((Frankl, 1984, p.177):

In principle training is indispensable, but if so, therapists should see their task in immunising the trainee against nihilism rather than inoculating him with the cynicism that is a defence mechanism against their own nihilism. ... My interest does not lie in raising parrots that just rehash their 'master's voice', but rather in passing the torch to 'independent and inventive, innovative and creative spirits.

Some writers, recognising how growth processes can be extremely individual, recommend doing away with any formal, regulated facilitation of personal growth. I have some concerns myself around psychotherapy training becoming more formal and more academic, resonating with wanting to preserve educating for creativity and heartfulness in psychotherapy practitioners. Yet, the total openness and freedom advocated by Symington makes me a little nervous. In speaking of training for a psychotherapist, Neville Symington (1995, p.15) declares:

If his learning is academic knowledge alone, it will be valueless and have no functional significance in his work as a psychotherapist.

He goes on to argue that most effective preparation of the psychotherapist involves allowing students to be guided by their inner emotional signals in their pursuit of relevant knowledge and learning experiences. He does say, however (p.20):

If we adopt this proposal, it is clearly a headache for those who are responsible for the education of psychotherapists. Symington believes that would-be psychotherapists should seek learning experiences as they are ready, using their intuitive knowledge as a guide. While Symington has a point, he assumes that students would take responsibility for their growth, assess their development accurately, and know how to access the appropriate experiences for self development. According to Kegan (1994), a certain level of self-development would have already been reached to permit this *self-directed* growth. In a review of the literature on therapist effectiveness, Charman (2005) notes that therapists can overestimate their effectiveness. That also goes for students, with some having a more positive belief in their attributes than is warranted. Narcissism in a student can interfere in the growth and training process, create difficulties in hearing feedback, and lead to ineffective or exploitative therapy (Rowan, 2005, p.187).

Effectiveness of personal therapy

A number of empirical research studies (Clark, 1986; Garfield, 1977; Strupp, 1973), indicate that having undergone personal therapy is not correlated with competence in psychotherapists. This, of course, is a complex area to research involving many variables, such as the type and length of the therapy, the nature of 'issues' to be addressed, the measures of therapist effectiveness, the modality of psychotherapy and client

factors. In spite of the above assertion there are many who support personal therapy for psychotherapy students (Norcross & Prochaska, 1982; Rachelson & Clance, 1980; Ralph, 1980). In a discussion of the research, Halgin and Murphy (1995, p.446) say:

Although there is no compelling empirical support for the correlation between personal therapy experience and proficiency as a psychotherapist, there remains a consensus that this experience must have some educational value. . . . Perhaps the most salient rationale for recommending personal therapy to trainees is their need for personal growth and problem resolution.

Levels of development for the psychotherapist

Rowan, (2005), taking a step on from Kegan (1982; 1994), begins the process which has the potential to bring a new clarity and precision into psychotherapy training, showing how different levels of development of the psychotherapist, and certain modalities of therapy, are needed for the different stages the client is in. Rowan also suggests that different research methods are required for exploration of the differing stages of development and their associated psychotherapies. (See chart earlier in this chapter that details and compares Rowan's concepts with those of Kegan). Kennedy & Charles (1990, p.29) would seem to be advocating for the therapist to have reached Rowan's *transpersonal self (1)* or Kegan's *interindividual stage*, when they say:

(The therapist needs to be) a separate individual who can move unafraid into an intimate relationship.

Personal growth specific to modality being learned

Unlike Rowan (2005) I would argue, as stated earlier, that a high level of self-capacity and ability to relate to others is needed for *all* types of counselling and therapy. It is often said that the therapist cannot guide somebody to a place where he or she has not been. Rowan (2005, p.44) says that no-one can bring another person to the authentic level if they have not reached it themselves. This is echoed by Robert Schwartz (2005, p.20) who says that in order to help clients to move towards intimacy:

The therapist must be at that level as well, or else the intersubjective exchange will be warped and out of balance. This would be akin to asking a client to create a self-portrait in vivid, stark colours and then handing him or her a palette of black and white paints.

However, as Rowan (2005) and Wilber (2000) discuss in detail, it is plausible that there needs to be a correlation between the level of development required in the psychotherapist, and the modality to be practised. Different modalities of psychotherapy may call for greater levels of personal development in the practitioner. Rowan (2005) says that the deepest and most important role of personal therapy for the practitioner is to raise the consciousness of the would-be therapist to the appropriate level for the kind of work that has to be done.

This assertion by Rowan has far-reaching implications for psychotherapy education, from accepting students on to the programme, to designing the personal development components, the specific curriculum, and assessment criteria. To achieve this presupposes that educators clearly understand adult development of consciousness, and from the research and literature so far available this does not always appear to be the case. However, Petruska Clarkson, in, *'The Therapeutic Relationship'* (1995, p.283), expects that psychotherapy trainees will attend to personal growth and acknowledges that each trainee needs to grow in a unique and individual way. Clarkson also links personal therapy to the proposed modality, saying that the trainee should usually experience a personal psychotherapy of the kind, intensity and duration which they intend to practice.

Personal growth in training is often painful

The degree of self-awareness required to be a psychotherapist may prove to be hard-earned, causing much distress in the acquisition:

There are few days when I am not feeling human pain, my own or another's. ... How can I keep my heart open and not go under?" (Ram-Dass & Gorman, 1985, p.11)

The student-therapist works with clients who are in all kinds of dysfunctional and distressing states. When this occurs students must be able to tolerate and appropriately manage upset and personal pain in themselves, and in the client, in a very immediate way. Cozolino (2004, p.5) comments that a frequent response of students is:

How can I do this when I have so many problems of my own?

I found my own development a mixed blessing, as working through my personal issues was tender and it was hard to feel both skilful and suitable for the profession at the same time. I have observed this distress many times in students. As one of the graduates, Linda, said:

I know I can achieve academically but it's different about your self (points to her heart area) and it took me a very long time. It was quite disturbing for me in lots of ways.

When the psychotherapy student is suffering emotionally it may be difficult for staff within an educational institution, especially those not directly teaching the student, to understand, contain and value this distress. Students who are dealing with personal issues may find it very difficult to apply themselves to the more logical activities such as essay writing and examinations. It may be unrealistic to expect the student to make

the necessary degree of personal change within a two or three year time frame (P. Clarkson & Gilbert, 1991).

Life-experience; personal growth outside the training context

Even when personal development is believed to be important for the psychotherapist, there have been suggestions that this should occur outside the education programme, and be the responsibility of the student, not the training course. Sheldon Kopp (1971), in “*Metaphors from a psychotherapist guru*”, has given up on the possibility that professional trainings are facilitating personal growth. He believes they actually impart unhelpful attitudes that will limit the graduates’ capacity to fulfil the helping role. Kopp instead argues that psychotherapists’ personal development will result from life challenges, personal therapy and supervision, rather than within training. At the end of his life Carl Rogers was becoming disillusioned with professional training for therapists. He said:

I have slowly come to the conclusion that if we did away with the expert, the certified professional, the licensed psychologist, we might open our profession to a breath of fresh air, to a surge of creativity, such as it has not known for years. (Kirschenbaum, 1979, p.151)

I am not convinced that psychotherapists would attend to the development required or be able to achieve the necessary standard if there was not some facilitation, overseeing; indeed supervisory relationship from a training programme. Bugental (1987, p.270) supports the inclusion of personal growth in training, even when educating for the subjective is difficult. He goes on to suggest that training should include extensive and intensive personal therapy, including group therapy, at least three years of life experience earning a living outside of the mental health field, experience in hospitals and schools, academic study of human psychology, sociology, medical and ethical perspectives, extensive reading of fiction and non-fiction books, and internships for personal and skill development. There are many potential research projects needed to investigate these assertions.

Other writers on psychotherapy assume the capacity of the therapist, and do not address the ways in which this capacity is developed. Christopher Dare (1997) details the attributes expected of a psychotherapist, saying that the psychotherapist; “has to strive to be truly altruistic”, “has to treat with suspicion his normal social reactions”, “has to take up a position that has many of the qualities of an intense closeness ...”, and “has to both be an emotionally present and empathically effective presence for the patient but also has to preserve a distance.” How the psychotherapist develops these abilities is not addressed by Dare. In order to graduate as a psychotherapist with the admirable qualities Dare lists, the student needs to either present

for training already demonstrating them, or show potential for learning the qualities before acceptance onto the course. In the latter instance the capacities need to be deliberately fostered within the training. In my experience this is the more normal scenario, with the training having a role in fostering personal development.

These expected capacities detailed in the literature point to a need for personal development in psychotherapists. Generally, in New Zealand, it is expected that training programmes will foster this development, and professional organisations such as the New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists will monitor standards of practice.

Cultural and gender perspectives on personal growth and psychotherapy

Many Eastern cultures use the word 'I' to refer to a collectivity of people of which one is a part. (Kegan, 1982, p.208)

Indigenous people have always combined the fields of psychology, physics, group work, and bodywork in shamanism or what today some call aboriginal science. Shamanism was — and still is — used to heal individuals and couples ... (Arnold Mindell, 2000, p.27)

Our psychotherapy student groups are composed of men and women, Maori and non-Maori, and include people from a variety of cultural backgrounds. Kegan (1982) points out that developmental psychologists from Freud through to Rogers emphasise growth as an increasing of personal autonomy. He notes that the longing to belong and feel included tends to be demeaned in Western culture as an 'immature attachment'. He goes on to argue, however, that there is a single context that is shared across cultures; the motion of life itself, and the common activity of meaning-making (p.209).

E. Fuller Torrey (1986) asserts that 'psychotherapists' across the world generally have similar personal characteristics, and tend to be mature and stable individuals, although they are selected and prepared for their role in very different ways. He believes that similar processes occur cross culturally that lead to change for 'clients' (a therapist with warmth and concern, clients with positive expectations and emotional arousal, naming processes arising from a shared world-view, and empowering a sense of mastery in the client). He does, however, assert that incompetent practitioners exist in every culture and appropriate training and evaluation is needed everywhere in the world to prevent harm to clients.

The Third Basket of Knowledge: Scientific Understandings

Ko te kai rapu, ko ia te kite; Ko ia kahore nei I rapu, te kitea.

He who seeks finds; He who does not seek finds not (Hemara, 2000, p.29).

Neurophysiologic underpinnings of relationship, psychological change and integration

When people use the expression “I feel your pain,” they may not realise how literally it could be true. (Ramachandran & Oberman, 2006, p.40)

To a surprising extent, then, our relationships mould not just our experience but our biology. (Goleman, 2006, p.5)

Each brain system is associated with different feelings and behaviours; each is associated with a different (and dynamic) constellation of neural correlates; each evolved to direct a different aspect of reproduction; and each interacts with the other two in myriad combinations to produce a range of emotions, motivations, and behaviours associated with all types of love.” (Fisher, 2006, p.90)

Grounded in science

Knowledge of the neurological function of relating and change processes has much relevance to personal growth changes in psychotherapy. It would seem that investigation into such complex and deeply subjective issues as love, personal growth, and therapy for the mind would need to be principally subjective in nature. Indeed it is logical that qualitative inquiry would yield the rich and relevant material required to deepen our understanding of the field. Yet, surprisingly, understanding about, and support for, personal growth in psychotherapy education has also come from science. Cozolino (2006b, p.7) thinks that we need both:

The social construction of the brain and the role of attachment relationships are particularly important in interpersonal neurobiology, as the application of scientific data to parenting, psychotherapy and education.

We now know more about what happens neurologically in states such as empathy (Goleman, 2006; Rizzolatti, Fogassi, & Gallese, 2006), how early experiences affect self-capacity (Siegel, 1999), and how to access and change patterns coded in neural networks that operate below everyday consciousness (Schoore, 2003). There are interesting studies (Goleman, 2006; Rizzolatti et al., 2006) on the relationship between mirror neurons in the brain and learning, as well as their role in the facilitation of empathic responses. A door is opening to let us examine some of these intuitive and emotional experiences more scientifically.

Allan Schoore (2003) describes in great detail the scientific research supporting the importance of the therapist’s role in right-brain to right-brain affective communication that allows for development, in the client, of the ability to tolerate and manage emotional states. Schoore is supporting both academic and intuitive learning when he says:

A psycho-neurobiological model of the attachment communications between patient and therapist indicates that in order to create an optimal working alliance, the therapist must access, in a timely fashion, both his/her own subjective, unconscious, intuitive, implicit responses, as well as his/her objective, conscious, rational, theory-based explicit knowledge in the work (p.56).

Changing the brain

Neuroscientists (Cozolino, 2002; Schore, 1994; Siegel, 1999) stress that the development of neural circuitry, although influenced by genetic constraints, is predominately experience-dependent. The optimum time for positive attachment templates to be wired in is during the first few years of life, but corrective experiences later in adult life can bring about significant change. We now know that the brain is more plastic than previously thought (Hannaford, 1995; Zull, 2002), and this brings hope for education, parenting, psychotherapy and psychotherapy training. Daniel Siegel (2006) says that when parents who have had childhood trauma develop a compassionate understanding of themselves they are able to provide the emotionally sensitive, contingent communication that children need. The same could be true for psychotherapists facilitating reparative experiences for clients. Schore (2003, p.56) advocates personal therapy for therapists, saying:

This range of affect tolerance is very much a product of our own unique history of indelibly imprinted emotionally charged attachment dialogues, since it is these primordial interactive experiences that profoundly influence the origin of self. For this reason, I believe personal psychotherapy is a prerequisite for anyone entering the field.

Inborn limitations for psychotherapy practice

It is possible that some people just may not have the neural capacity for empathy (Ramachandran & Oberman, 2006). To be able to assess this deficit could be important in selection processes for psychotherapy programmes. The fictional therapist, Philip, described by Yalom (2005), in his novel, "*The Schopenhauer cure*" was assessed by the protagonist, Julius, as not having the capacities to be a therapist because of his inability to feel love, and to relate:

Philip a therapist? Unbelievable — a therapist sans empathy, sensitivity, caring. ...he does not have it to give. (Yalom, 2005, p.37)

Was Philip, like his hero, Schopenhauer, suffering from early deprivation of love, leading to a schizoid character (as Yalom suggests), or had he a genetic defect that caused autism spectrum disorder? It is possible that both factors interrelate. Neuroscientists like Porges (2006) suggest that the attachment system is latent, but intact, even in autism where there are genetic factors, and can be activated by appropriate interventions that recruit neural circuits regulating social behaviour. This information is potentially useful for parents, teachers, and psychotherapists, but it is unlikely that sufficient remedial action could be provided for an aspiring psychotherapist, like the fictional Philip, within the time-limited context of psychotherapy training. It could be like trying to train an anorexic model to become an All Black!

Orlinsky & Ronnestad (2005) recommend that psychotherapy students be selected on the basis of already possessing good relationship ability. Through years of experience as a trainer of psychotherapists, Ernesto Spinelli (Sullivan, 2005), would probably agree with Yalom about the fictional Philip, and has come to (almost) believe that the necessary raw material has to be present in an aspiring psychotherapist before training can be effective. He says of an academically competent person, who does not demonstrate relating ability:

What can you do from a remedial standpoint? You can try, but most of the time my guess is the person just isn't cut out to be a therapist or counsellor (p.65).

Bringing back the body

In keeping with the scientific and medical thinking of the time, which was based on Cartesian dualism, Freud believed that the ego, or reason, should be in charge, and over the years psychotherapy has continued, in the main, to work with the mind, leaving the body to the medical profession (Rowan, 2005). Trauma literature (Levine, 1997; Ogden, 1997; Rothschild, 2000; Scaer, 2001; Siegel, 2003a; Teicher, 2002; Terr, 1990; van der Kolk, 1994) has reinforced the bringing back of *body* into psychotherapy, and contributed to our understanding of body states and physiological influence on our emotions, behaviour, learning and development. When a person feels under threat a primitive freeze response occurs in an involuntary manner, which inhibits relating and learning (Porges, 2001; Scaer, 2001). Knowing more about this automatic reaction can inform decisions about providing the safe 'holding' environment that students need to facilitate personal development. Being *embodied* is a natural state for a child who has secure attachment experiences (Karen, 1994), and becoming embodied is a characteristic of personal growth and 'repair' (Kegan, 1982; Rowan, 2005; Wilber, 2000). The body is the vehicle for intuitive knowing (Gladwell, 2005), accessing unresolved implicit memory (Kurtz, 2004; Perry, 1999), and experiencing love, empathy and a full sense of being alive (Welwood, 2006).

Watch this space

There are some emerging areas within neuroscience that are still very new, in places being received with scepticism, that could potentially further inform our understanding and interventions around personal growth and psychotherapy. The neurological connection between the heart and brain is one example. Paul Pearsall (1996) suggested these circuits, and the presence of distinctive 'heart energy' in "*The heart's code*." Joseph Chilton Pearce (2002, p.66) more recently writes of heart-brain circuitry:

The heart's intelligence is not verbal or linear or digital, as is the intellect in our head, but rather is a holistic capacity that responds in the interest of well-being and continuity, sending to the brain's emotional system an intuitive prompt for appropriate behaviour.

Whereas Pearsall's book was more anecdotal and 'popular' in style, Pearce (2002) refers to credible research throughout "*The biology of transcendence*". His book I found to be a strange mixture of science and religion, but was intrigued with his discussion of energy fields, the power of compassion, and increased frontal lobe development both in children who have had exceptionally good nurturing, and in higher stages of growth. I believe that interpersonal neurobiology, as Daniel Siegel terms it, will continue to offer us useful and intriguing insights related to love, growth and our human condition in general. The field has come a long way since Freud's wish to establish a science of the unconscious based on neurology.

Complexity and 'health' of complex systems

What are the organising principles of this (self-organising) mind? This question lies, perhaps, at the very basis of theoretical physics; it is the core of theology and basic to psychology as well ((Arnold Mindell, 2000, p.246).

The areas of personal therapy, personal growth, and in fact psychotherapy itself, are as complex as the human brain and psyche that are both the subject and object of these endeavours. This area also has implications for psychotherapy research, as complex systems cannot be understood, or influenced, by traditional linear, cause and effect scientific processes. (Mindell, 2000; Prigogine, 1980; Siegel, 2003a) Complexity theory (Prigogine, 1980; Siegel, 1999) addresses the nature of self-organising, complex systems, emphasising that a small input into such a system can over time have a large, unpredictable effect. Linear relationships between variables either don't exist, or only give a fraction of the story. The brain is a complex system and research into neural functioning requires, as neuroscientist and psychiatrist Eric Kandel (2006) says, 'a major conceptual shift' in thinking. In a similar way it is difficult to simply define or quantitatively measure personal growth, which is also a complex concept, within a training situation that exerts so many influences on the student. Empirical research that could support a beneficial effect for personal therapy on psychotherapy practice, does not seem to have been carried out, has not used appropriate methodology, or has not addressed the relevant and complex questions in a meaningful way. Rosemary Dinnage (1988), who interviewed psychotherapy clients post-therapy, acknowledges the complexity of the therapeutic relationship when she says:

What, according to these interviews, makes for success, what makes for failure in therapy? The factors involved must be so many, so tightly knit that it is doubtful if they could ever be unravelled (p.15).

The Fourth Basket of Knowledge: Personal Experience

Don't worry she says in her calm and weaving way
Just go out there and tell the world *your* words in *your* own way
My cousin of course always always has just the right thing to say⁷.

⁷ italics in original

Psychotherapy journeys of growth and change: personal accounts, and reports of outcomes

He who has a *why* to live can bear with almost any *how*. (Nietzsche)

Anyone who can swim knows that the experience of depth and the verbal description of the depth in terms of numbers are very different. ... The quantitative and experiential views of the river are two descriptions of one nature. (Arnold Mindell, 2000, p.23)

Change in therapy

Therapists reflect on psychotherapy outcomes. The kind of change psychotherapists might hope for with their clients is also the kind of change and growth that teachers could aim for with their psychotherapy students. Erich Fromm (1983, p.80) describes outcomes of psychoanalysis in an inspiring way (full quote in Appendix D):

He gets more deeply in touch with humanity; ... then he may experience for the first time how he sees colours, how he sees a ball roll, how his ears are suddenly open to music; ... he will experience the futility of seeking the answer to life by having himself, rather than by being and becoming himself.

Carl Rogers links successful outcomes in psychotherapy to qualities in the therapist. He said, in 1956 (Kirschenbaum, 1979), that if the therapist provides a relationship in which he is genuine, internally consistent, accepting, prizing the client, empathically understanding the client's private world; then the client becomes more realistic in his self-perceptions, more confident, more positively self-valuing, less likely to repress elements of his experience, more mature, and more healthy, integrated, and well-functioning.

What of the voices of psychotherapy clients? How do they make meaning of their experience of growth and the process of psychotherapy? In keeping with the very human complexity of this topic, and therefore the choice of research methodology, the lived experiences of psychotherapy participants should be included in the literature search. There are many books where people reflect on their experience of psychotherapy. I select a sample. Irvin Yalom (1974) includes reflections by both himself and his client, Ginny. She writes to him at the completion of her therapy:

All the time I was not really searching for change but for a man whom I could talk to as I did to you, who would question and understand me, have your patience and yet be separate from me. (p.242) ... I was happy just for your company (which was always natural and giving) but I was scared to live like other people. I didn't really want a therapist's office, but a nest; I tried to pull you down into my hibernation and helpless calm. ... When your art succeeded you revived us both. (p.244)

The clients interviewed by Dinnage (1988) pondered on their experience of therapy. Some excerpts show their sensitivity to underlying relationship dynamics:

I think from the moment I met him I felt an antipathy toward (the psychotherapist). And I always had the feeling that he did not like me. ... I tried to talk to him about it ... "I am making no progress here". He would sort of sit back and say, "Well it all depends what you mean by progress (p.25)! (Helen)

I think without my (therapy) I would have always been a nice and sensible person, who could be useful, who could carry on my role in society ... there would always have been a part of me, cut off from me. ... It would have been a poor life, an impoverished one (p.83). (Veronique)

He wasn't afraid of holding and hugging you when you were in pain. ... I didn't feel threatened by him infringing any boundaries. ... I knew there was a ruthlessness in him. ... Somehow I almost felt he was going to destroy the thing he had created (p.178). (Sarah)

For Jacqueline Spring (1987, p.165) an outcome of her psychotherapy was:

To cease struggling and relax long enough to feel, in that sudden stillness, the constant rhythm of life flowing through my veins.

Studying the subjective accounts of what works in therapy from the clients' and the therapists' perspectives can bring surprises, and can potentially teach us much about personal development and our practice as psychotherapists and trainers of psychotherapists. To go more fully into this area is beyond the scope of this study.

Unfolding described from a spiritual perspective

Our self is constantly on a pilgrimage to the Holy City. (Kahlil Gibran, 1995, p.95)

Human experiences of growth captured in centuries of spiritual tradition, and recounted biographically by those reflecting on their personal journeys of unfolding contain much of interest for this research. I was aware of the parallels in these accounts with the stories told by my participants. It is not possible to review all such accounts within the boundaries of this study, so I have selected some representative writing.

Tweedie (1979) describes her spiritual growth in her autobiography, "*The chasm of fire*." Spiritual growth, under the direction of a guru, is detailed by Kriyananda (1979), an American man who undertakes a yogic pilgrimage in India. He emphasises the central role of love, quoting Swami Sri Yukteswar:

Love alone determines a person's fitness for the spiritual path. ... It is impossible for a man to advance a step towards salvation without it. ... An unfeeling heart is even admired by many, as evidence of a 'scientific outlook'. But the truth is that without love no one can penetrate deeply into the heart of things. (p.223)

The spiritual journey described by Paramahansa Yogananda (1979) in the classic book, "*Autobiography of a yogi*" has *love* as a central theme. M. Scott Peck (1978) details the spiritual journey of growth in "*The road less travelled*." He writes of love and psychotherapy, stages of unfolding, and explores dimensions of love in

general, emphasising, “*Love is as love does* (p.87)”. In his sequel Peck (1993) describes stages of faith or spiritual growth. Desmond Tutu, writing in *The New Scientist* (2006, p.48), believes that compassion is a form of love that transcends empathy, and like Scott Peck, speaks of compassion’s active, dynamic quality. He also says that spirituality is not a lonely journey. Through practices of compassion, Tutu believes, we grow to be in relationship with each other, community, and become intimate with God.

Maori concepts and experiences related to psychotherapy, personal well-being, and personal growth.

If the link between the individual and the collective is so formally embodied in Maori tradition, thinking, belief and behaviour, how is it that an identity crisis figures so predominately in writings both of and about Maori? ... Are we to assume this crisis of identity has its beginning in the acts of separation between Maori and their land, Maori and their language, Maori and their religion, Maori and their customs, in other words, the legacy of colonialism (Penetito, 2000, p.53).

Makereti (1986), writing on Maori development in the late nineteenth century, described Maori as a culture “that put the people before the self” (Macfarlane, 2000b). The practice of dividing human growth into defined age-stages that is common in Western developmental theory is not so easily translated into Maori perspectives. Status and responsibility, within the community, is defined and changes over time, but is not usually linked to particular ages (Bird & Drewery, 2000; Macfarlane, 2000a). Roles within the whanau⁸, hapu⁹ and iwi¹⁰ assume more importance than defined ages. “The Durie (1997) study shows that being considered a kaumatua¹¹ is more about role and function than age (Macfarlane, 2000a, p.231).”

Western concepts of self-esteem, may be similar in some ways to that of *mana*. Metge (1986) says that mana is closely tied up with personality, and is related to both external factors (mana being bestowed) and internal factors of self-exploration (p.70). In reading Metge’s discussion on mana, I was struck by how closely the larger cultural and family fabric is woven tightly together with the individual personality dynamics. This interrelationship, though definitely present, seems less entwined in Western discussions of personality. Personal accounts quoted by Metge (1986), such as the following by Rangimarie Pere (p.70), however, sound similar to that which could be said by Pakeha¹²:

Remember your own mana¹³, the mana of the individual. Everyone is very special. We must be prepared to let a person explore the dimensions of his mana.. ... I was encouraged to explore myself, the total thing that was me.

The dialogue, around psychotherapy within Maori culture, and the Western perspective of psychotherapy, is just beginning. At the next New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists conference in March 2007, there will

⁸ *whanau* - family

⁹ *hapu* – ancestral group

¹⁰ *iwi* - tribe

¹¹ *kaumatua* – elder knowledgeable in Maori culture

¹² *Pakeha* – non-Maori, white-skinned person

¹³ *mana* – spiritual power, prestige, status, pride

be a Maori caucus (Maori members of NZAP, and other Maori who are interested), who will engage conversations about the nature of psychotherapy within their cultural group, and with the larger organisation. There are few Maori members in NZAP, and our psychotherapy trainings in Aotearoa¹⁴, like our professional organisation, are based on Western concepts of education, development, the self, and psychotherapy.

The experience of personal growth for the trainee

Who are we to know any better than the participants when it is, after all, their lives? (Reissman, 1993, p.8)

What do their experiences tell about counselling training in general and how can I adequately, satisfactorily extract the essence of their accounts, and translate it into something that is meaningful, stimulating, telling others about? (Cowie et al., 1998, p.192)

The enormous impact the course made on my life both in my relationships and in my understanding of myself. (Battye, 1991, p.75)

There is not much writing on this topic. There have been a few studies where trainees have been asked of their experiences during training, and I found some accounts, chapters in books mainly (Alred, 2006; Battye, 1991), written from the student perspective. Helen Cowie and her colleagues (1998) researched the training process as a whole from the students' perspectives as they were engaged in training. In psychotherapy we have come to value the perspective of the client. It would therefore seem to be worthwhile to hear what our trainees have to say about training, and the personal growth component of their education.

A journey

The theme of *journey* was apparent in the stories told by the participants in this research. This theme also occurs in the literature. John Karter (2002) talks of training as a long and winding road. Geof Alred (2006) says that most trainees experience training as a journey. Goldberg's book (1988) on becoming a psychotherapist is shaped around the idea of the learning process being a journey.

The emotional ups and downs of self-exploration may be felt to be a kind of initiation process, a journey that is more like a pilgrimage. Ellen Baker (2003) acknowledges that therapy processes in training may not be comfortable. Alred (2006) would agree, also saying that it is common, perhaps essential, to regress when learning as a trainee.

Stress and distress

¹⁴ Aotearoa – New Zealand

Gopelrud (1980) studied a group of American psychology graduate students and found they experienced severe life stress due to many of the changes associated with their training. Cushway (1997) writes about stress in clinical psychology trainees. Her research (1992) showed that these students experienced a higher level of distress than was reported by medical students. She also notes (1997, p.28) that a conflict for students is likely to occur during training:

On one hand the trainees are expected to become more self-aware and to expose their frailties as towards greater client sensitivity. On the other hand, they are selected because of their personal, as well as their academic, qualities and they therefore have to live up to this in training and display no weakness. Thus it is possible that, for some trainees, training may present seemingly irresolvable dilemmas.

Alred (2006) in his chapter on being a psychotherapy trainee discusses coping with the uncertainty, being a member of an experiential group, and learning through relationships. He says:

Relationships other than adult to adult will develop, ebbing and flowing throughout the course (p.292).

Alred goes on to speak of the tension trainees experienced when starting to work with clients, issues of confidence and competence, and stress involved in dealing with *the harsh world of clients' pain*. He talks of the impact on personal relationships, and outcomes of professional and personal growth (2006, p.295):

Outcomes include greater self-knowledge and awareness; a commitment to authentic living; the realisation that corners have been turned and there is no going back, and the creativity and resolve to live with the consequences; a heightened sense of the relationship between one's inner world and social world; and the ability to talk about all of this with clarity and conviction, as new members of the professional community of therapeutic helpers.

Personal change processes

John Karter (2002) explores psychotherapy training from the student's perspective in, "*On training to be a therapist.*" Karter gives students' perspectives on personal change outcomes, survival and coping, perfectionism and uncertainty, and supervision relationships. He includes the voices of the trainees themselves.

Motivation for choosing to start training was one area explored:

I wanted to train as a therapist because it offers me the opportunity to experience myself as an authentic human being... (Natalie, p.22)

The nature of personal change processes are covered, both negative and positive experiences being set out:

At times the change process has been extremely difficult for me. (Rita, p.31)

Training made me more dissatisfied with my life ... I lost out in terms of time and money, and it made my relationships more difficult and distant. (Brett, p.31)

Another theme explored by Karter (op.cit) was concerned with feelings of incompetency and 'trying to get it right' I have observed this often in training situations. One of Karter's trainees, Riann said:

I failed all my essays and case studies ... and wasn't given any written feedback as to why I had failed or how I could re-write them. ... (T)he shadow of those failed essays caused me a lot more pain and anguish than I would have believed possible; I've had panic attacks and felt very weepy and hopeless (p.70).

The trainees' experiences are congruent with observations of psychotherapists and trainers quoted earlier. Trainees generally report positive outcomes of the personal growth process.

The nature and impact of the students' personal development on the tutors and psychotherapy programme leaders

At the start I was wary of being too giving, and resisted Earth Mother role — these were self-managed adult learners after all and had to find their own way. (Proctor, 1991, p.65)

This is an area where there is very little writing or research. The challenge of being a trainer is encapsulated in the quote below:

When all is said and done, however, the chief resource for every trainee remains the trainer. It is the person who by his or her integrity and skill will enable the trainee to move from timorous beginnings to the humble confidence of the fledgling counsellor. Perhaps in the last analysis the key issue which surpasses all others in importance is the nature of the man or woman who is bold enough to undertake a task where success ultimately depends not simply on knowledge or even on experience but on a quality of being which can continue to offer support at those moments when the trainee is on the point of abandoning the struggle to enter so impossible a profession. (Thorne & Dryden, 1991, pp.13-14)

There is a somewhat resounding silence regarding how teachers are prepared for, and supported in, the role where they facilitate personal development in their students (P. Clarkson & Gilbert, 1991; Proctor, 1991).

A complex task

Trainers in psychotherapy are managing exceedingly complex situations. They need to assess students for their suitability for the profession, contain and support the trainees as they personally grow and develop, teach skills, and impart knowledge in a discipline where uncertainty reigns (P. Clarkson & Gilbert, 1991). They also 'wear' powerful emotional reactions directed towards them by their students, make heartrending decisions related to pass or fail, need to be emotionally mature and available, model the personhood expected by the profession, and walk the balance between nurturing and boundary setting. Clarkson & Gilbert (1991) address some of these issues giving specifics on the requirements for being a trainer, ideas around preparation and suitability for the task, and the challenges, including the nature and variation of relationships that trainers need to manage and utilise constructively:

(T)his (I-Thou) relationship is a powerful factor in helping trainees to develop self-esteem and self-respect. (p.157)

The trainer/supervisor needs to be alert to the high likelihood that the trainee will be unconsciously experiencing them as they did their teachers in childhood. (p.157)

Another type of relationship of central importance in training is the developmentally needed relationship. ... In our experience, the trainer/supervisor frequently needs to fill the developmental gaps which resulted from earlier inadequate learning experiences ... on the part of their teachers or parents. (p.157)

There is very little in the literature about how trainers are prepared for this role, the impact on them personally, and the qualities needed to carry the responsibility of groups of students undergoing often turbulent learning processes.

Campbell Purton (1991), in his chapter on selection and assessment notes the issue of uncertainty. He says that assessment must involve elements of intuition and personal judgement which may not always be easy to back up with argument. Purton does not address the potential stress of this for the trainer who may need to satisfy criteria from within the academic institution alongside trying to remain true to the realities of the psychotherapy situation. Students receiving feedback not to their liking may want concrete proof which is not easy to give. There is also the question of the personal growth level of the trainer, who needs to be able to sit with uncertainty, self reflect, manage emotional reactions, be compassionate and at the same time firm and challenging. Clarkson & Gilbert (1991, p.168) reinforce the qualities indicating the maturity that trainers need to have developed. They also emphasise the need to model 'health':

Mostly, it is important to keep the instrument — the 'self' of the trainer or supervisor — in good form and to set an example of self-care by a good quality of life, relationship and recreation as well as continuing professional enhancement.

To display these attributes the trainer should have at least reached Kegan's (1982) *institutional* stage, or more suitably the *interindividual* level. This would equate with Rowan's (2005) *authentic self*, moving towards the first *transpersonal* level. (see references below, and chart of stages in appendix)

Personal stories of trainers

Brigid Proctor (1991) has written a personal account of her experiences as a trainer. She discusses her own journey, her stages of growth and some of the challenges involved. She looks at the different layers of relationships trainers make with students; adult-adult, parent-adult, and parent-child, and acknowledges the impact (Proctor, 1991, p.67):

So as trainers we sometimes felt incredibly powerful — expanded as it were, by the archetypal roles into which we were cast, and by the hopes, fears and expectations beamed on us by the collective community Child.

Further dialogue, oral and written among trainers is likely to be very helpful in developing this field, including questions of motivation, how to thrive in the role, and how to best manage the complexities of relationships.

The Fifth Basket of Knowledge: Love

Te kete uruura matua; the kit of the knowledge of peace, of all goodness, of love.
(Shirres, 1997, p.16)

Love, relationship and attachment, and how to develop the capacity to love

During the 70's and even into the 80's, in the halls of academic psychology, love was no more than a disreputable four-letter word, and the subject of 'emotion' wasn't regarded with any more favour. (Johnson, 2006, p.43)

Love: the latest topic of interest

Love and relationship is of perennial interest to us as humans, and there is a wide range of literature on these topics, including perspectives from psychology, neuroscience, biography, spirituality, psychotherapy, fiction and poetry. I have sampled from this range to illuminate emerging themes of the importance of love and relationship as the crucible for personal change. This enormous resource within the literature, the size and breadth of it surely speaks of the ever-present human interest in love. I have come to wonder whether the exploration of *love* is the latest topic of interest arising at the forefront of psychology and psychotherapy. "*The psychology of love*" (Sternberg & Barnes) was written in 1988, and a new updated edition (Sternberg & Weis, 2006), has recently been published. Eng-Kong Tan (1991) was ahead of his time in speaking to psychotherapist colleagues about love. Thomas Lewis (2001) and his colleagues focused on 'love' in their book, "*A general theory of love.*" On a recent visit to a large Melbourne bookshop I noted a number of texts in the psychology section with 'love' in the title. A recent edition of '*Psychotherapy Networker*', a popular psychotherapy journal in United States of America, has articles directly addressing the nature of *love* (Butler, 2006; Johnson, 2006).

Recently Robert Langs, a psychodynamic psychotherapist and psychiatrist, published a book about love in psychotherapy. He found that there was little to guide therapists on this very important subject, and he set out to explore and clinically research the topic in depth. Langs concludes that our conscious minds can easily lead us astray when differentiating how to truly love in the psychotherapy relationship, and giving unhelpful *false love*, which relieves anxiety about death. He believes therapists need to be able to access deep unconscious wisdom as the ultimate barometer. He says (Langs, 2006, p.181):

Being a truly loving parent to an infant or child is a natural biological process, but being a loving psychotherapist to an emotionally ill patient who is suffering from inordinate amounts of death anxiety is, by contrast, an unnatural

pursuit. ... The deep unconscious wisdom subsystems of their patients — and themselves — offer the only reliable guidelines as to how therapists ... can be truly loving and caring for their patients. Given that the core of this wisdom is linked with death and our most dreaded death anxieties, this is no easy task.

Langs' (op.cit.) position reinforces the need for a high level of personal development, and the resolution of early 'wounds', in the psychotherapist. How else is the therapist to recognise the deep unconscious in themselves and their clients? The processes that Langs describes where clients long for love, express love, and ask for love, in mainly indirect ways, will occur in most therapy relationships, certainly longer-term ones, regardless of the modality practised.

Robert Kegan (1994) is likely to be supportive of Langs in that he postulates that a high degree of development, his *fourth level of consciousness*, is needed to achieve most of the tasks expected of the parent, and the psychotherapist. Kegan emphasises how powerful the love bonds are for the child, and how loosening identification with these bonds, during the transition from the third to the fourth level, brings up, as Langs (2006) says, *primal fears of death*.

...devotional bonds from which it would be difficult or impossible to separate without having to contend with the ontological guilt of disappointing our Maker, or the ontological dread of standing alone in the universe without the protection of the Light. (Kegan, 1994, p.269)

By inference, psychotherapy teachers should have at least reached Kegan's fourth level, and be able to shepherd students from the third to fourth levels. However, this is not a task for the faint hearted as it involves periods of deep disorientation and anxiety for students.

Love and change: vulnerability

Personal growth processes and developing greater capacities to relate inevitably leads to vulnerability. Psychotherapy students often enter their training feeling confident and pretty much in charge of themselves. During developmental transition unanticipated defencelessness emerges, as the psychotherapy graduates report. Kegan (1994, pp.258-9) comments about this vulnerability:

To an extent that we may not sufficiently realise, the circumstances surrounding the need to move from the third order may cause a variety of long-standing psychological vulnerabilities that do not appear earlier to surface. ... Resourceful, well-functioning resilient people ... often deal with the most painful features of their early life experience by using their increasing power to control their lives to shape a personal world that banishes those situations most likely to reevoke such painful feelings.

Two other books that are of relevance to the subject of love, and love in psychotherapy, are John Welwood's (2006) "*Perfect love, imperfect relationships: Healing the wound of the heart*" and Rush Dozier's (2002) "*Why we hate: Understanding, curbing, and eliminating hate in ourselves and our world*". Welwood argues that relationship difficulties arise out of the core belief, acquired in early childhood, of not feeling lovable just as we are. He describes how this wounding can manifest in a lack of trust, a desperate longing to be

loved, yet the inability to give or receive love in a satisfying way, and a pervasive mood of *unlove*, including holding on to grievances. Like Welwood, Dozier (op.cit.) links the inability to fully feel love, acceptance and empathy with early childhood experiences. These experiences are likely to be triggered as students undergo training.

Capacity to relate

Psychotherapy is about relationship. Much research points out that the quality of the client-therapist relationship is ultimately what affects outcome in therapy rather than any particular theory or set of techniques. (Mahoney, 1991; Orlinsky & Howard, 1986; Orlinsky & Ronnestad, 2005; Whiston & Sexton, 1993). Aponte & Winter (1987, p.85) put it clearly:

There is one element, however, common to every training model: therapy is conducted by people. In addition, the vehicle for therapeutic change is a social relationship. Consequently, at bottom, the only instrument each training model actually possesses is the 'person' of the therapist in a relationship with the client.

Orlinsky and Ronnestad (2005) in a study of nearly 5000 psychotherapists found that those that felt satisfied and successful in their work, and in their personal relationships and life generally, reported what the researchers summarised as a *Healing Involvement* with their clients. We can surmise that this *Healing Involvement* is indicative of Rogerian qualities; with an excellent capacity to love and relate.

As we have seen, the psychotherapist needs to be able to attune to, empathise with, and show real compassion and positive regard for the client. (Lewis et al., 2001; Rogers, 1969). Greenberg (2002) details the complex components of the congruence that Rogers advocates, maybe giving us a very practical outline of the components *love* as it manifests therapeutically. The following table summarises Greenberg's discussion (pp.100-103):

CHARACTERISTIC of CONGRUENCE	DIMENSIONS	EFFECT ON THERAPEUTIC RELATIONSHIP
The ability to be aware of one's internal experience	Sensitive to one's momentary experience including bodily experience	Less discrepancy between verbal and non-verbal with increased safety and less anxiety for client, who can therefore explore his or her process more deeply.
	Being fully immersed in present moment	
	Aware of vital information generated in relationship	
	Taking time to be with experience and reflect on it	
	Managing, and containing if necessary,	

	one's own emotional reactions	
Transparency — willingness to communicate one's inner experience to client	Attitude that is non-judgemental, non-blaming and affirmative of client	Client feels affirmed, accepted, can explore the impact of his or her relationship patterns, have a new relationship experience, gain increased self-awareness including bodily awareness, and learn to self-regulate and self-soothe.
	Communications are for client's benefit, one is able to be clear about intention	
	Sensitive to timing of disclosure	
	Expressing central aspect of one's experience, and metacommunicating about what is felt in relation to this	
	Communicating one's somatic experience	
	Feelings are linked to relationship dynamics and communicated	
	Self-disclosure of past experience, an image, or thought may be included	

Table 3: Greenberg's analysis of congruence in the therapeutic relationship (Greenberg, 2002)

Fostering relationship ability in training

Those people with a history that fosters a secure attachment style are more likely to come into training with the requisite relationship capacities. However, many people are attracted to the psychotherapy profession as a result of difficult and traumatic childhoods. Some have begun the process of 'healing' prior to starting training. Others need to develop the ability to be empathic, to love and relate during their training process in order to be effective in therapeutic relationships. There are writings on the development of relationship ability in psychotherapy (Bugental, 1987; Goleman, 2006; Guntrip, 1968; Lewis et al., 2001; Rizzolatti et al., 2006), and it might be reasonable to expect that the same processes will develop that capacity in the student. There is however not much research or discussion on the specifics involved. Truax & Carkhuff (1967) argue that the students' experiencing of high levels of warmth, regard, understanding, and genuineness from their trainers allows them to develop high therapeutic functioning themselves. Pagell, Carkhuff & Berenson (1967) found that the ability to maintain an empathic relationship needs to be learned experientially. Austen (2001), as mentioned earlier, quotes research where meditation practice develops empathy in counselling students. Stuart Tremlow (2001; 2001b) details specifics, derived from Zen practice, for the training of attributes of mind, including the development of capacity for compassion. Greenberg & Goldman (1988) assert that the ability to be accurately empathic is acquired through experience, which requires time and personal growth.

As previously stated, there is also the very likely possibility that personal growth itself involves development of the capacities of love (Anderson, 2000; Harvey, 1995; Hendrix, 1988; Kurtz, 1990; Lesh, 1970; S. Levine & Levine, 1984; Levy & Orlans, 1988; Lewis et al., 2001; Tremlow, 2001b; Weiss, 1995). Others assert that growth leads us to an unfolding into universal love, the love of God, or 'spiritual love'. Teilhard de Chardin

(1955) sees universal love as part of our core, which resonates with teachings that our core, like the sun is always there behind the clouds waiting to be reconnected with (Welwood, 2006).

Naming love

What literature is there directly speaking of love in relation to psychotherapy? Carl Rogers spoke of, 'unconditional positive regard', and 'prizing' the patient. The terms *empathy* and *attunement* are found in texts on counselling, psychotherapy and attachment. Perhaps these words are more professionally acceptable descriptors for the many facets of what is more commonly spoken of as *love*? Jacquelyn Small (1981), in "*Becoming naturally therapeutic*", uses the 'Rogerian' terms of *empathy*, *genuineness* and *warmth*, avoiding speaking directly of *love*. She does, however emphasise that a counsellor should 'come from the heart' (p.15). Leslie Greenberg (2002), in his book, "*Emotion-focused therapy*", has 72 index references to *anger*, six for *empathy*, and none for *love*. Russell Mears (2000, p.72) acknowledges:

The 'tender emotions' so fundamental to human existence, have for a long time, been excluded from the discourse of psychology, psychiatry, and psychoanalysis as scientific disciplines.

It seems that change is coming in this regard and maybe the research that I am undertaking is part of a new groundswell of interest in not only empathy, but the wider and more complex question of *love*. Certainly the enthusiasm and interest I noticed whenever I mentioned the topic with students, graduates and colleagues would point in this direction.

Those affirming personal relationships as a growth and healing path (Anderson, 2000; Button, 1985; Harvey, 1995; Hendrix, 1988; Kast, 1986; Keyes, 1979; S. Levine & Levine, 1984; Montgomery & Evans, 1983), and writers on the journeys of spiritual transformation (Kornfield, 1993; Linn, Emerson, Linn, & Linn, 1999; Mondo, 2000; Peck, 1978; Trungpa, 1983; Williamson, 2004), speak unashamedly of *love*. For this reason I expanded my research to explore the experiences of students and graduates, as well as current teachers in a variety of psychotherapy programmes, concerning *love*.

What is not included in the literature?

Most research on psychotherapy has been addressed towards psychotherapies and not to the nature or experiences of psychotherapists themselves, there being an underlying assumption that the effectiveness of psychotherapy is in the method or technique. As Orlinsky & Ronnestad (2005, p.5) state:

As a rule, the study of psychotherapies has been favoured over the study of psychotherapists — as if therapists, when properly trained, are more or less interchangeable.

This assumption is in direct contradiction to the research that shows that the personal qualities of the therapist have an influential and direct bearing on outcomes in psychotherapy (Asay & Lambert, 2002).

Many questions arise concerning psychotherapy education experiences that have yet to be adequately researched. How do you educate for emotional intelligence? How do you assess personal growth? What kind of support is needed? How long does the development take? What about education for individual student learning processes taking heed of Goldberg's (1998) advice that psychotherapy training should be approached with a flexible attitude that encourages individual variation.

There are aspects of personal growth experiences as told by trainees or graduates that are not well covered in the literature. There is little linking of experience to type of training or modality of psychotherapy. Trainees have not spoken, except very briefly, of the impact of trainer *holding* or compassion on their development. No-one spoke of *love* as a force for change within their training or personal therapy, a few mentioned having more love in their lives as a personal development outcome. They did not discuss types of love, or their own growing capacity to give and receive love as an aspect of developmental change.

Other areas of curiosity arise that are only touched upon, or not addressed at all in the literature. These include the selection process for trainers for different modalities of psychotherapy and different types of education programmes, the expected personal development level of trainers, the support and training facilities for trainers, expectations around how much personal growth trainers should be consciously facilitating with education programmes

The nature of psychotherapy for Maori, stages of personal development, and facilitation of this development were not well represented in the literature. I found few resources in this area, and none relating to a Maori perspective on development and training for a psychotherapist.

Training of psychotherapists is still an emerging field. There is little research and writing on the nature of personal growth experiences for trainee therapists, and the impact this growth process has on their teachers, sparse agreement on what is desirable and expected as personal development outcomes in psychotherapy training, and very little on how training establishments and teachers can best facilitate personal growth. The emotional predicaments faced by therapists around experiences of love in psychotherapy are not well explored. The topic of *love* in the training of psychotherapists is like a shy child peeking out from the shadows, there, ready and waiting to be seen, but uncertain of the reception she will receive.

Summary and Conclusion

The baskets of knowledge from which I have sampled have given up many stimulating treasures, providing background and understanding for the focus of the research; lived experience of personal growth by the psychotherapy student. From the time of Freud, it has been expected that psychotherapists will develop their personal capacities in order to be effective. There is considerable discussion and argument on this in the literature. Generally there is consensus that personal growth is necessary for a psychotherapist, but some disagreement on how and where they should develop this. Much more research on the different positions expressed could be helpful in guiding modern psychotherapy training programmes.

There is considerable discussion and agreement in the literature of the capacities expected from psychotherapists. The practicalities of how to assess for these capacities or foster them is much more sparsely represented however. Research on the importance of these capacities for therapeutic effectiveness is challenging, but is an area where potential expansion has much potential for the field.

Many books have been written about stages of human development, from popular self-help guides to scholarly texts dating back to Freud. There is less writing on stages of adult development, however some developmental theories potentially useful for psychotherapy training have been written, including texts by Kegan (1982; 1994) and Rowan (Rowan, 2005). These are likely to increase clarity around the personal development process, and relevant education, necessary for psychotherapists.

Only the surface layer of the basket containing scientific understandings has been explored. There is much future potential for subjective and scientific literature to complement each other in a synergistic way. The *kete*¹⁵ containing personal stories has room for more experiential accounts. The lived experience of development, as experienced by psychotherapy trainees, is not well represented in the literature. The experience of personal growth by psychotherapy clients, and by people in general, appears to be better described by biographical accounts, fiction and poetry. The experience of trainers as they facilitate development in their students is barely present in the books and journals reviewed. In psychotherapy we talk of the importance of *parallel process*, where each layer of relationship impacts on the next. Understanding the worlds of the teachers is therefore likely to help us know how it is for trainees, and ultimately for their clients.

¹⁵ kete - basket

Even though the knowledge *kete* on love and *aroha*¹⁶ is overflowing, there is much that remains unexplored, and there will always be, within love, the dimension of *mystery*. In the next chapters I will present the experiences of the research participants for the purpose of contributing to our understanding of their lived experiences of personal growth during psychotherapy education. I will also include some perspectives from psychotherapy teachers. Hopefully the explorations to come will add to the body of knowledge that informs psychotherapy and psychotherapy training. I am interested as a trainer of psychotherapists in how education programmes can provide an optimum ‘holding’ environment that will create conditions for the personal development of students in ways that are loving, compassionate, and result in desired outcomes.

Chapter Three: Methodology

The goal of constructivist/ interpretivist approaches is understanding the complex world of lived experience from the point of view of those who live it (Schwandt, 1994, p.118)

Introduction

For this research I have chosen to use hermeneutic phenomenology. I believe hermeneutics is the most suitable methodology because I want to explore and understand the experiences and views of psychotherapy graduates related to their experience of personal growth during training. I want to investigate, with them, their lived experience of growth, the nature and context of that experience, and the meaning that they make of their experiences. I have chosen to write in the first person which more clearly represents my personal involvement with the study. I resonate with arguments against using third person terms, such as ‘researcher’, in qualitative research because of the way this language has a distancing effect. (Krieger, 1991; Richards, 1990; Swanson-Kauffman, 1986; Thompson, 2001).

The lens and frame of hermeneutic phenomenology is appropriate to study the experiences of psychotherapy trainees’ personal growth while they are learning the uncertain and complex discipline of psychotherapy. I believe there is some resonance between the two fields; hermeneutics and psychotherapy. A concept that keeps appearing in both disciplines is ‘holism’. One reason for using qualitative research is to include awareness of the whole. Patton, a qualitative researcher, (1980) affirms that the holistic approach is based on the assumption that the whole is a complex system greater than the sum of its parts. Holloway & Jefferson (2000, p.69) remind us of correspondences:

This capacity to hold the whole in mind (when analysing data) has parallels in the writings of clinical psychoanalysis, and recent connectionist neuropsychology is stressing a similarly Gestalt-type principle as the basis of thinking.

¹⁶ aroha — love, care

I have used psychotherapy and phenomenology knowledge bases to inform my research at every stage. Psychotherapy literature is full of reference to the aim of 'knowing the other', and 'knowing oneself'. Psychotherapists help their clients with their search for personal meaning. Hermeneutic phenomenological reflection is 'to try to grasp the essential meaning of something' (van Manen, 1990, p.77). One woman, Kim Chernin (1995), in reflecting on the meaning of her own analysis, reacts to stinging criticism of Freud, where the father of psychoanalysis is deemed unscientific, even psychotic. She says:

Who cares if psychoanalysis is scientific? ... I can't imagine how a message from the underworld could have been brought back by a scientific search party that does not recognise its existence. ... I guess it is a pity (Freud) felt constrained to translate his wild, sombre gleanings into the scientific currency of his day. ... He must have been looking for a cage in which to trap his demons, some rigorous, cognitive act of definition that would forever confine them. Of course he failed, the underworld prefers poets and their evocations, it is a bit too slippery for theoretical proclamations (p.207).

Phenomenology, like psychotherapy, is about more fully knowing a person's lived experience, in contrast to research methods that, in the effort to be more scientific and objective, come up with 'thin' descriptions. As Holloway and Jefferson (2000, p.3) say:

Research is only a more formalised and systematic way of knowing about people, but in the process it seems to have lost much of the subtlety and complexity that we use, often as a matter of course, in everyday knowing. We need to bring some of this everyday subtlety into the research process.

According to Van Manen (1997) hermeneutic phenomenology addresses the *phenomenological descriptive methodology*, because things can speak for themselves and show themselves as they appear, and the *interpretive methodology*, because there is a tenet that there is no such thing as uninterpreted phenomena in our awareness. He states that (1997, p.180):

The 'facts' of the lived experience need to be captured in language and this by its nature is interpretive.

I intend to present experience as articulated by graduates reflecting on their personal growth, extract themes and meaning from my perspective, and relate all this to the existing literature concerned with growth and change, and psychotherapy education. In choosing hermeneutics I am not just seeking to present graduates' articulated experiences, and the meaning they make of these, but to look more fully at the process of personal growth in the context of training the psychotherapist.

Max van Manen (1990) summarises hermeneutic phenomenology as a poetising activity that is a human scientific study of phenomena, where the researcher immerses herself in the lived experience. The thirteenth century poet Rumi (Moyné & Barks, 1986) expressed, in a similar vein, the exploring of meaning through poetry, when he said:

Listen to presences inside poems.
Let them take you where they will.

Hermeneutics is also a search for what it means to be human; a study of lived experience and essences, involving the attentive practice of thoughtfulness. There is explication of conscious phenomena, leading to the description of essences of lived experiential meanings. Van Manen (1990, p.xv) acknowledged that the notion of essence is highly complex, and went on to say:

Essence is not a single, fixed property by which we know something; rather, it is meaning constituted by a complex array of aspects, properties and qualities — some of which are incidental and some of which are more critical to the being of things.

There are parallels, as explained, between psychotherapy and phenomenological research. However, the purposes and techniques differ. Hermeneutic reflection is retrospective, not introspective, being a reflection on experience that has already been lived through. Hermeneutic research uses particular modes of questioning, reflecting, focusing and intuiting, reading, writing and re-writing; studying the context and form of texts describing lived human experience (van Manen, 1990). Psychotherapy focuses on relationship, empathic resonance, the unfolding of inner experience in the moment, and bringing the unconscious into awareness. Even though research and psychotherapy are two different activities, with differing aims and practices, there is a resonance between the two; thus hermeneutics seems a fitting method for studying questions related to psychotherapy (for a definition of psychotherapy see the introductory chapter), and in particular, students' lived experience of aspects of their psychotherapy education.

The hermeneutic process

The process of hermeneutic phenomenological research, as van Manen (1990, pp.30-34) describes it, may be seen as a dynamic interplay among six research activities.

1. Turning to a phenomenon which interests us.

So phenomenological research is a being-given-over to some quest, a true task, a deep questioning of something that restores an original sense of what it means to be a thinker, a researcher, a theorist (van Manen, 1990, p.31).

In the first chapter I expressed my curiosity and passion about the subject of this research. Personal growth is the essence of what it means to be alive, to be human, is the currency of psychotherapy, and is one expressed aim of psychotherapy education. As the research took shape I turned to the phenomenon of *love*, and links between personal growth and love.

2. *Investigating experience as we live it rather than as we conceptualise it.*

(It) requires of the researcher that he or she stands in the fullness of life... (van Manen, 1990, p.32)

For the recent graduates, their psychotherapy education still feels *experience-near*. In conducting the interviews I encouraged the participants to describe actual lived experiences as they remembered them before sharing any interpretations of these experiences. I also reflected on my own lived experience, and found reverberating descriptions in poetry, biography and literature.

3. *Reflecting on the essential themes which characterize the phenomenon.*

What is it that constitutes the nature of this lived experience? (van Manen, 1990, p.32)

A theme is not a collection of facts, or repeated statements. A theme captures the essence of the phenomenon in a manner that crystallizes it, similar to a poet's expression. The poet David Whyte (1997, p.3) succinctly portrays a theme of home, with essences of love, belonging and aloneness:

This the bright home where I live
this is where I ask my friends to come
this where I want
to love all the things
it has taken me so long to learn to love.
This is the temple of my adult aloneness
and I belong to that aloneness
as I belong to my life.
There is no house
like the house of belonging.

As I worked with the data I began to intuit the presence of 'essence'; the intrinsic nature of something synthesising and true in amongst and around the details of language. There emerged themes of: *journey, love, pain and struggle, holding, gratitude, and coming home.*

4. *Describing the phenomenon through the art of writing and rewriting.*

When I speak I discover what it is I wished to say. Merleau-Ponty (van Manen, 1990, p.32)

Writing becomes the method. Van Manen (1990) suggests that writing acts to ground our thoughts. It becomes the application of language and thoughtfulness to lived experience. I found that as I wrote, and read what I had written, there grew an emerging awareness of the nature of what I was studying, which further influenced my ongoing reading, discussions, and writing.

5. *Maintaining a strong, oriented relation to the phenomenon.*

We are animated by the object in a full and human sense. To be strong in our orientation means that we will not settle for superficialities and falsities. (van Manen, 1990, p.33)

I was often tempted into side-tracks, enchanted by phenomena less relevant to my question. Reference books of all kinds stacked high around me. I sometimes felt dwarfed and taken over by mountains of interesting pathways opening up. I endeavoured to hold discipline and focus without rigidity.

6. *Balancing the research context by considering parts and whole.*

It is easy to get so buried in writing that one no longer knows where to go, what to do next, and how to get out of the hole one has dug. (van Manen, 1990, p.33)

Streams of words are sucked into the black hole in my head; fierce words with all the power and energy of far off suns. (Horsfall, 2001, p.81)

Writing and rewriting became the process described as the *hermeneutic circle*. This involved moving from the details and specifics of the participants' experiences to looking at the bigger picture; addressing, then re-addressing the research question and the themes that the experiences engendered. I found it easy to write, get lost in, and be fascinated by, exciting streams of words. It was through my continually coming back to the experience specifics and then expanding out to the essence and themes that I kept myself grounded, and the reflective process was able to be enriched and enlivened.

Heidegger and Gadamer acknowledge that we of necessity bring our own pre-understandings to our interpretation of phenomena. We therefore need to make this as explicit as possible. I explored my preunderstandings through discussion with colleagues and in journal writing. I reflected on how my presuppositions have influenced the data gathering and the interpretative process. Gadamer speaks of the 'fusion of horizons' (1982). In this he is referring to the process of the bringing together both the experience and the understanding of the researcher and the participants to create meaning that holds true for both. I found this to be descriptive of my own process and I was very aware that both the questions I formulated and my analysis were influenced by my own conclusions related to the participants' shared experiences. I then endeavoured to absorb myself in their understandings and finally created new meanings by bringing these perspectives together.

Research design

I employed a qualitative, emergent research design using hermeneutic phenomenology. The task was to elicit descriptions of psychotherapy graduates' experiences of personal growth over the course of their education,

followed by interpretation, as a way to uncover, or show the essence, of the personal development process. There is a certain flexibility and openness needed around method so that the authentic, real-life experiences of the participants can be described and analysed with depth. As stated by Bergum (1989, p.610):

The phenomenological method attempts to push off method for method sake, to push off sureness and become unsure, to resist conceptual analysis with the view to explain.

The method becomes more like an attitude, or perspective, with one working to return as fully as possible to the nature of the experience itself. Interestingly, in light of themes emerging in this study, Helen Cowie and her research colleagues (1998, p.224), describe *eros*, inspired by the Greek God of love and desire, as the energetic force behind hermeneutic research:

(The Greeks) say what motivates our interest in knowing the interior of things is that this interior gives the exterior its beauty. This is not 'curiosity', but what the Greeks call 'eros'. Eros is the quality that animates things from the inside: when we see things through eros, we do not just see them outwardly, but we see the life, the passion, the imagination, the intuition, that indwells them and radiates outwardly.

In my research a parallel of thematic outcome and method occurred, when the theme of *love* emerged as integral to both the process and endpoint of personal growth as experienced by the participants.

Methods

Sampling

The sampling method was *purposive* which is used in phenomenological studies in order to:

Choose participants who are experiencing the circumstance and selected events and incidents related to the social process under investigation (Beanland, Schneider, LoBiondo, & Haber, 1999, p.250).

All of my volunteers had lots to say about their experience of personal growth Janice Morse (1998) says that the sample must be biased, and that we should seek participants that have the most experience, who can well represent the phenomenon of interest. Morse (1994, p.124) also states:

Good informants must be willing and able to critically examine the experience and their response to the situation.

Psychotherapy graduates, as part of their training, have developed skills in self-reflection and are therefore very able to reflect upon and describe their experiences.

I originally selected seven participants who met the criteria in that they were currently living in Hawkes Bay or Auckland, had graduated within the last two years from an education programme in psychotherapy of at least three year's duration, and were willing to talk about their experiences of personal growth. I asked for volunteers through personal networking within the psychotherapy community. To some extent I used the

'snowballing' technique (Tolich and Davidson, 1999), as I had originally planned, where one participant suggests another possible person, although I had no shortage of volunteers. I did also endeavour to use a 'relevant range' (Mason, 2002) of participants. This may make it more likely, that across this small sample, there will be some representative diversity of experience. Six of the original participants were women of differing ages, there was one man, and one of the women was Maori. Five were from Hawkes Bay and two from Auckland. Although it would have been more convenient to sample from only Hawkes Bay, I included one Auckland graduate early in the research process, and one later; the reason was that having been a tutor in the Hawkes Bay psychotherapy programmes I have a personal history with local participants. I accepted volunteers in the order they presented, given they met the criteria discussed above. This I felt somewhat lessened the chance that I would select people with particular experiences based on my prior knowledge of them.

After interviewing the one Maori woman, I became curious about the different perspective on personal growth that might be related to Maori world view. I therefore asked another Maori graduate of psychotherapy if she would be willing to participate, and she agreed. I interviewed her along with her colleague who had trained in counselling through both polytechnic and Maori programmes.

Themes emerged further into my research, as I read, re-read and wrote about the data I had received. To enrich these themes I asked some specific questions of other psychotherapy graduates, some of whom had trained in Nelson, and one graduate of a clinical psychology masters in Sydney. I also interviewed, by e-mail, a selection of psychotherapy teachers from NZ and overseas to further expand my themes. (For a participant list see Appendix G, and a teacher list see Appendix H.)

Data Collection

Quality qualitative research relies on quality interviewing (Opie, 1999, p.245).

Participants were interviewed using a loosely structured interview process. This did not, I believe, mean a lack of rigour, as pointed out by Mason (2002, p.67):

It is a much more complex and exhausting task to plan and carry out a qualitative interview than ... to develop and use a structured questionnaire for asking a set of predetermined questions. In that sense the informal and conversational style of this form of interviewing belies a much more rigorous set of activities.

Careful planning for interviewing is necessary (Mason, 2002) to ensure relevant data is obtained. To this end, I used an interview guide and adapted this as I went along (refer to Appendix C). The original guide was

generated from my assumptions around personal growth experiences of students (Tolich & Davidson, 1999) and did alter as the research progressed. I also went back to the early participants with some extra questions. I began the interviews with some introductory questions to start the conversation, and then listened to responses as they emerged. I used open prompts, such as 'tell me more about that', to encourage the participant to talk, and to obtain further depth and breadth of story.

To maximise the chance of relaxed and open conversation, interviews took place in a setting of the participants' choice. Interviews were generally ninety minutes in length. With the permission of participants interviews were recorded. Later data was received via e-mail in response to follow up questions. I also made notes concerning non-verbal aspects of the conversation, and wrote my own reflections (Tolich & Davidson, 1999).

Data Analysis

The researcher and the research are intertwined (Byrne-Armstrong, Higgs, & Horsfall, 2001, p.5).

The interviews were transcribed, and analysis of the first interview was begun before I went on to conduct the second, and so on. I transcribed the first two interviews myself which allowed me to really immerse myself in the data. I was thus able to absorb the stories of these participants, and gain insights as to embryonic themes. Later interviews were transcribed by a professional transcriber. Working with the data between interviews allowed for following interviews to be enriched and continually modified. I am aware that my own meaning making from the early interviews also influenced the direction taken later. The emerging meaning-making of the participants' experiences was to some extent a co-creation, a tapestry woven by myself and the participants as we conversed in a backwards and forwards manner. This involvement of the researcher is acknowledged by Holloway and Jefferson (2000, p.3):

If we wish to do justice to the complexity of our subjects an interpretative approach is unavoidable. It can also be fair, democratic and non-patronising, as long as this approach to knowing people through their accounts is applied to the researcher as well as the researched; as long as researchers are not seen as neutral vehicles for representing knowledge in an uncontaminated way (sometimes called the 'God's eye view', or the 'view from nowhere'.

I worked with the data, until I came to know it intimately and intuitively, editing the stories, bringing implicit meaning forth, writing and re-writing to take out distracting details, in order to highlight what I felt was essence and theme. My experience was congruent with Horsfall's (2001, p.82) observation:

Slowly, almost imperceptibly, thoughts began to weave themselves together. Turning around and around they gather energy and speed.

The transcripts were returned to the participants so they could alter any part. Some did come back with changes. As researcher I moved back and forward from the part to the whole in my growing understanding and interpretation, moving within Heidegger's '*hermeneutic circle*' (Koch, 1996). Lindy McAllister describes the process of working with the data a little differently:

The researcher is engaged in a dance with the data, moving between using his or her experience to help interpret the data (being subjective) and a desire to let the data tell its own stories (being objective) (Higgs & McAllister, 2001, p.38).

I have used van Manen's (1990) process of theme development and analysis. He gives three approaches to discovering thematic aspects of a phenomenon in text.

1. The holistic or sentient approach

The researcher using this approach reads and re-reads, reflecting on the meaning of the phenomena that have been described by the participant. It involves intuiting the significance, and coming up with a word or a phrase to capture this essence, which can have a poetic quality. (van Manen, 1990). I wrote down my impressions of the interviews after reading the transcriptions, and allowed the material to 'cook on the back burner' in a similar way that that described by Horsfall (2001, p.85).

The 'cooking process'... is inseparable from the bodily act of writing. The ingredients need to be found, prepared and thrown into the pot until ready to eat. We read, we think, we collect fragments of conversation. We mull over our ... transcripts. ... We talk with others ... Only when we have reached saturation point ... is the stew finally cooked.

2. The selective highlighting approach

I began to organise the phenomena. I reflected on the essences of the grouped data, and associations with poetry and literature, as well as my own experiences. Curiosity sparked and I kept meandering back through the transcripts. After some time it was with excitement that I started to map general themes that had grown.

3. The detailed line-by-line approach

I examined the highlighted statements of the participants, feeling into what the particular part of the text revealed about the phenomena. Once I had selected statements that reflected phenomena of interest I went looking for the essence of the experience. I wanted to keep my focus to themes that seemed essential and not those more incidental to the phenomena being studied. At this stage emerging themes were influencing my analysis process, and comparison to the literature had me going back to look again at the selected data,

and the whole interview transcripts. I did a lot of reflecting, which allowed me to further discern meanings (van Manen, 1997).

A theme, according to van Manen (1990, p.88) is the means to get at the notion, gives shape to the shapeless, describes the content of the notion, and is always a reduction of the notion itself. I was aware of the importance of deciding on a system for thematic analysis:

Theme is the sense we are able to make of something. ... Theme is the process of insightful invention, discovery, disclosure (van Manen, 1990, p.88).

Heidegger's analysis as detailed by van Manen (1990) is where experience is divided into four *lifeworlds*: lived time, lived body, lived space and lived other. The emergent themes did, to some extent line themselves with the lifeworlds described above, particularly *lived time* and *lived other*. However, I have organised the material according to my own metaphors of *journey* and *love*. Of necessity there was much pruning as there was sufficient material to fill several research projects.

In my analysis I reflected on experiences that tend to be silenced around personal growth in psychotherapy education. I was curious to uncover the unexpected, the unpopular perspective, and new possibilities for understanding the educational preparation of the psychotherapist. For me Horsfall's (2001, p.86) comment applies:

I am one of the readers for whom I write.

The emergence of a central theme of 'love' both surprised, and delighted me.

Rigour

Rigour or merit are as critical to a phenomenologist as they are to an experimental researcher (Munhall, 1994, p.188).

The design of the research needs to be appropriate for answering the research question (Brockopp & Hastings-Tolsma, 1995). As stated earlier I believe that the choice of a qualitative approach, hermeneutics in particular, is particularly apt because procedurally and philosophically it is similar to psychotherapy, and it is the complex, lived experiences of the graduates that are being explored.

All research needs to address questions of reliability and validity. In contrast to the controls and measurements of quantitative methods, qualitative research has different processes to ensure credibility. As a researcher using hermeneutic methodology as pioneered by Heidegger and Gadamer I do not believe I can

'bracket' my own subjectivity (Koch, 1996; Munhall, 1994; van Manen, 1990). Therefore the process of reflexivity or critical self-scrutiny will be important, as is stated by Mason (2002, p.7):

This is based on the belief that a researcher cannot be neutral, or objective, or detached, from the knowledge and evidence they are generating. Instead, they should seek to understand their role in that process. Indeed the very act of asking oneself difficult questions in the research process is part of the activity of reflexivity.

Reflexivity is a key process for this style of research. It was important to consider the identified themes, and ensure as much as I could that they were valid themes emerging from the research data itself, and not prematurely chosen, and therefore having the potential to exert a limiting and constraining effect on the ongoing analysis. Mason (2002) says:

Reflexivity ... means thinking critically about what you are doing and why, confronting and often challenging your own assumptions, and recognising the extent to which your thoughts, actions and decisions shape how you research and what you see (p.5).

However, as Holloway and Jefferson (2000, p.67) point out, reflexivity is not a substitute for using relevant theory.

Munhall (1994) gives a framework for evaluating rigour. She outlines ten 'R's. I hope to achieve *resonancy* when my interpretations ring true for the participants. A carefully thought out rationale at each stage will meet *reasonableness*. I trust that the stories from the diverse participants will show *representativeness* of the various dimensions of the lived experience of the students. When people read the study they should hopefully *respond* to it, *recognise* aspects of the experience, and develop a *raised consciousness* of the phenomena. I intend for the study to be *readable*, *relevant*, and full of *rich* data. I expect there will be *revelations*, and I intend to be ethically *responsible*. Measures of trustworthiness can be also grouped under four headings (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Tolich & Davidson, 1999) and I will further discuss the rigour of my research under these headings: credibility (or internal validity), transferability (or external validity), dependability (or reliability), and confirmability (neutrality).

Credibility

Credibility occurs when it can be seen that the analysis and interpretation are 'true' or valid, and relate to the data obtained. Validity is strengthened by triangulation which refers to using of multiple sources of information (Tolich and Davidson, 1999). Participants were recruited from several programmes and different geographical areas. Transparent documentation of each step of the research process has occurred (Mason, 2002). The analysis of data took place in a variety of ways. Most participants accepted the opportunity to review their stories for accuracy of content and meaning. The links between the data and interpretation have

been made explicit, and excerpts from the participants' stories are included throughout to illustrate these links. I had regular discussions and debriefings with colleagues concerning process and the emerging sense being made of the participants' stories.

I compared data with literature in the area and consulted with teacher colleagues and my supervisor who is experienced in psychotherapy education. This was part of a 'collaborative analysis' to further develop insights and understandings involving hermeneutic conversations on the emerging themes (van Manen, 1997). When I spoke of my research themes to colleagues there was immediate engagement and interest. van Manen (1990) said that an adequate elucidation of some aspect of the lifeworld resonates with our sense of lived life. This recognition of valid life experience has been termed by Buytendijk, a phenomenologist, as the *phenomenological nod*.

Transferability

Background contextual information has been given so that readers can compare the results to similar situations. The sampling is purposive, enabling a small but diverse group of people to share their experiences. I have endeavoured to use a 'relevant range' (Mason, 2002) so that the sample is in relation to the composition of the student group, which is predominantly women with a few men and a few Maori students. Generalisations are based on typical cases (Tolich and Davidson, 1999). The selecting of graduates from a number of educational programmes has increased the generalisability of the findings.

Dependability

I endeavoured to ensure that my data generation and analysis was "thorough, careful, honest and accurate" (Mason, 2002, p.188). I made a log of all sessions concerned with collection and interpretation of data, and kept track of any coding systems used to decide on themes. Reflexivity, as discussed above, was used.

Confirmability

In hermeneutics, it is taken that the subjectivity of the researcher is present in the research from the outset (Koch, 1996; Munhall, 1994; van Manen, 1990). My assumptions and interests have been made explicit. To minimise inappropriate bias I interviewed some graduates with whom I had no prior relationship.

Ethical Issues

Rigour and ethical issues are related. Over the years research has sometimes been conducted in a manner that hurts others, reinforces existing power structures, produces spurious results, and is deceptive and disrespectful (Snook, 1999). Because research may involve vulnerability for the participants it is good to consider that the possible benefits will outweigh potential risks. This study is likely to have a general benefit for the profession of psychotherapy, and psychotherapy education, because I believe that it will increase our understanding of the process of personal growth experienced by students, and therefore potentially contribute to developing more effective education programmes. I also believe it could be of benefit to the wider community of psychotherapists in deepening understanding of psychological change processes for clients. The research did seem to benefit the participants because it, according to them, enabled further integration of their learning journey.

In Aotearoa/New Zealand ethical consideration includes obligations to Te Tiriti o Waitangi (The Treaty of Waitangi). I will discuss the ethical implications of this study including issues regarding the Treaty, and under the principles given by Tolich and Davidson (1999). These principles align with the ethical principles governing the practice of psychotherapy (Bond, 1993; Koocher, 1995; K. Taylor, 1995).

Te Tiriti o Waitangi

The tenets of Te Tiriti o Waitangi must be considered when planning research in Aotearoa/New Zealand (AucklandUniversityofTechnology, 2004). The principles of participation, protection and partnership need to be honoured. Before commencing my study I approached Awhina Services in Hastings for consultation and discussion. Awhina Services provides psychotherapy to Maori, and several associates have been students on psychotherapy education courses locally. As the research proceeded I discussed the inclusion of Maori participation in the research, and included Maori colleagues in discussion of the data analysis.

Do No Harm

The safety for participants is an important consideration. I arranged interviews at venues that were of the participants' choosing. I endeavoured to be spacious, allowing time for reflection, and discussion. I felt that I was empathic, interested and respectful (Mason, 2002). During the interviews emotional experiences were at times relived. Sharing these reflections was felt by a number of participants as a positive, therapeutic experience. None of the participants reported feeling upset after the interview, although one was not entirely happy with the content of her interview (Tolich and Davidson, 1999). I did follow-up participants and no one needed support.

Voluntary Participation/ Informed Consent

Participants volunteered to take part. There was no pressure, and no payment. An information sheet was given prior to the person agreeing to be interviewed so the potential participant was informed about what was involved (Tolich and Davidson, 1999). The process was transparent at all times, and informed consent obtained. Further consent was requested for follow up questions, use of direct quotes, and use of name or pseudonym. No participants chose to withdraw from the study.

Truthful Practice

As stated earlier, participants had an opportunity to read interview transcripts. Questions about the research were answered honestly. Sometimes the process did take participants into areas they did not expect, but they reported this as positive (Tolich and Davidson, 1999).

Confidentiality

Confidentiality is important for safety of participants, and to respect their right to privacy. Anonymity was not promised because I was meeting the participants in person. It is possible that in a small community stories may be recognised, as in some ways Aotearoa/New Zealand is a small town (Tolich and Davidson, 1999). This was explained to participants. The following measures have been taken to ensure confidentiality: where requested, pseudonyms of the participant's choice have been used, identifying details have been edited out of, or changed in, written accounts of participants' stories, all material has been stored in a secure filing cabinet, or on the computer which is password protected, identifying details have not been shared with colleagues, other participants or consultants, and the transcriber signed a confidentiality agreement

Transparent Data Analysis

The methods used have been explicitly stated. An audit trail is possible for anyone interested in tracking the details of the research from planning until final analysis and publication of this study.

Conclusion

My choice of methodology has allowed me to do what I intended to do, and more. I wanted stay close to the experiences of the graduates of psychotherapy training and to construct possible interpretations, thus gaining a deeper understanding of their experiences of personal growth during their training to be psychotherapists.

Van Manen (1990) asked:

Can phenomenology, if we concern ourselves deeply with it, do something with us?

Having a phenomenological perspective in my research has changed me, and greatly enriched my learning. It has indeed 'done something with me', in accordance with van Manen's provocative question quoted above.

Chapter Four: The Journey

If the Fool is that impulse deep in the unconscious that sets us on the quest, then the Magician might symbolise a factor in us that directs this energy and helps humanise it. His magic wand connects him with his ancestor, Hermes, the god of revelations. Like the alchemical Mercurius ... the Magician can initiate the process of self-realisation that Jung called individuation (p.45). (Nichols, 1980)

Introduction

My personal growth journey has taken me to *me*. (Bonnie)

My journey has been one of compassion, devotion and empathy for myself and my place in the whanau¹⁷. The difference is acceptance instead of birthright. (J.B.)

Within the participants' accounts the idea of *journey* was evident. Many accounts of psychological growth in the literature used the metaphor of a person undergoing a journey. Biographies of change are frequently portrayed as a journey. Louise Wisechild, (1988), writing in the introduction to her story of recovery from childhood incest, says:

As an adult, coming to a new wholeness within myself has been both a healing and a creative journey.

Psychotherapy is often depicted as a journey of some kind, maybe a journey towards self-awareness, a different level of consciousness, a journey into the 'underworld' of the unconscious, or off the edge of the known world:

The early voyagers, from their perspective, risked their very lives when they sailed near to what they regarded as the edge of the universe. Neither the world as they knew it nor *their very way of knowing it*¹⁸ would be the same after the voyage as before it. ... The therapist's effort to provide good company for a client's travels in therapy needs a way — when those travels include the travels of consciousness — to understand the inner experience of a voyage that can seem to put at risk one's very life. (Kegan, 1994, p.266)

Kim Chernin (1995, p.207), in writing of her experience of years of psychoanalysis, says of Freud himself:

For me, Freud is western culture's most dramatic shaman, repeating the great archaic journey to other worlds in his own staid Victorian person.

It makes sense that the personal process in training to be a psychotherapist involves a parallel kind of journey. A pilgrimage or spiritual journey also has characteristics in common with the journeys my participants described. M. Scott Peck (1978) captures the concept in the title of his popular book, '*The road less travelled*'. He also reminds us (p.10):

The journey of spiritual growth is a long one.

¹⁷ Whanau - family

¹⁸ Italics in original

However, Eng–Kong Tan (2001), a Buddhist psychiatrist and psychotherapist, points out that spiritual journey may begin where the therapy journey ends.

The contour of the journey

I could feel myself literally growing and developing and emerging and coming into my own. (Huia)

The shape my participants gave to the journey was strikingly resonant of journeys expressed in other contexts. Participants described stages similar to those illustrated in archetypal, psychotherapeutic and spiritual voyaging. It became evident that travelling along the journey path is not a linear progression, nor are the stages necessarily sequential. The journey often involves looping back again and again, the traveller revisiting earlier stages. Current life circumstances, the students’ prior experiences and the training environment impacts upon both the voyager, and the nature of the journey. The following table summarises *the journey* ; this chapter covering the journey up to ‘keeping on walking’, with the next two chapters exploring ‘the landscape’ and the destination.

INFLUENCING FACTORS	The JOURNEY: stages	CHARACTERISTICS
BEING LOST		Deep sense of disconnection, longing, restlessness, life change or transition.
	SETTING OUT: innocence and dreams.	Some kind of inner drive, intuitive trust, maybe even naivety. Hopes and dreams – personal, family, cultural, spiritual. Natural growth process, drive towards complexity.
	THE SACRED FIRE OF LOVE	Compassion, acceptance, support, containing, holding - as a longing, for healing, and for safety, for learning new patterns. The hard face of love, no escape from the fire.
	BURNING, FALLING, DROWNING,	Overwhelm, shattering, taken to pieces, pain, vulnerability, memories, feelings, disillusionment, powerful longings, needs, regression, roots of tree shaken, uncertainty.
BAGGAGE CARRIED		Wounded healers, cultural pain, self-capacity, shame, bodily pain
	KEEPING ON WALKING	Calling on resources, survival, finding ways of keeping going, organicity, and survival.
THE LANDSCAPE		Support, guides, love, holding, culture, expectations, pressures, traps, attacks
THE DESTINATION	LEAVING HOME/COMING HOME: telling stories around the fire.	Pain, relief on leaving. Winds of change. Reflection, integration, gratitude. What does it all mean? Moving inwards, outwards with love, passport to a life.

Table 4: map of ‘the journey’

Being lost

A man travels the world over in search of what he needs and returns home to find it.

George Moore 1852-1933 (Moore, 2002)

Personal growth in psychotherapy training is a holographic piece in the larger life journey, with its predictable and unpredictable growth paths, including both psychological and spiritual unfolding. The metaphor of being disconnected and lost frequently arises. Welwood (2006) says that having a wounded heart is like being lost in the clouds, unable to experience the sun. He goes on to say that one can spend a lifetime being lost, separated from one's own inner, divine source of love, which leads to being unable to receive love from others. Judy, a graduate of degree and Hakomi programmes, talked of initially being lost:

I felt lost, shamed, unsafe and didn't want 'to get it wrong' in my first years of training.

Bonnie, who completed the psychotherapy diploma and degree programme, reports:

I was lost spiritually before I started training and therapy. I had a desire for a spiritual aspect in my life but conventional religion did not work for me anymore. ... I feel like I will revisit (my experiences) over and over as I continue my personal journey. I am grateful for being freer of projections in order to be a therapist and parent. And I am also grateful to be able to experience fully some of the world's simple pleasures, and to be present with them rather than lost in my inner world. I was rescued.

Marama, a graduate of a Maori counseling programme, also spoke of being lost at the outset:

I can relate to (others) looking for a 'belonging'. I had become a lost person, and my journey was to find myself again and my own sense of belonging. I was a lost soul.

Cowie and her colleagues (1998) comment that the decision to train may take place in the context of life-change and a search for self-fulfillment. This was true for a number of my participants:

I was laid off from my job. I thought long and hard about what my future could hold, and what aspects of my life gave me personal satisfaction. (Judy)

I had to move from being a consumer to turn that around, to becoming a professional. (Marama)

I only went to the course because I wasn't sure what I was going to do. We came here because we weren't very happy in the UK. I saw the advert in the paper, and the course has a foundation year. I thought that would suit me very well, I would do that for a year, it would help me settle into NZ, and give me something to do. I didn't think I would be a psychotherapist, I didn't really know much about it. (Linda)

Cowie et al (op.cit.) point out that students who begin training at a time of life uncertainty may perceive and enter into personal growth components of the course differently from students who come with more pragmatic goals, such as learning techniques and achieving a qualification. A more practical reason was also given by some participants:

I thought it fitted with my Buddhist way of being and would provide me with a livelihood that was congruent with my personal philosophy. (David)

Participants, following varying conscious and unconscious desires, began their journeys in what could be described as a state of innocence, not realising what lay ahead for them in the personal growth journey of their training.

Setting out: innocence and dreams

I have spread my dreams under your feet;
Tread softly because you tread on my dreams.

William Butler Yeats (2005, p.12)

When I started the training I was scared as hell. I was as nervous as hell. I didn't know what I was going into. But I just had that sense that this was it— this was the next phase of my healing and there was that trust there. (Maree – Graduate of Hakomi Diploma)

Innocence

As participants described how they had little idea of what was in store for them, I recollected the archetype of *The Fool*, that pilgrim depicted in the Tarot who innocently set out on a journey, full of hope and dreams, with only a hazy notion of what lay ahead on the path. The ancient Tarot deck is itself a symbolic tale of journeying. As Sallie Nichols (1980, p.1), says:

A journey through the Tarot cards is primarily a journey into our own depths.

The Fool is the first card, representing intuition, impulse, fire, freedom, youth, risk-taking, and self. Bonnie, reflecting on beginning her diploma course, said:

When we started the tutors warned me of the changes to come. I just couldn't conceive of the reality of it until I went through it. They said to us, 'it's hard on your relationships, it's hard on this, and it's hard on that'. But you can't conceive. It was not something that I could possibly conceive of.

Several participants doubted if anyone could have prepared them ahead of time about what was likely to come. Linda was asked if she could have been forewarned. She replied:

I wonder. I wonder if I would have heard it. My defences are quite high and I don't think I would have, I would have thought, oh yeah, others might have difficulties, but not me! I would have been in huge denial.

Marama, who trained in a Maori based programme, spoke of the importance of having dreams; dreams that were common to her fellow students:

In the Maori programme we are all sharing the same dream. That is a wonderful experience. People were coming from all over the country, all with one dream, one kaupapa¹⁹.

Ideals

Often the reasons stated by graduates for choosing a career in psychotherapy were idealistic and altruistic in nature. A number were motivated to heal pain, in themselves and others. As the poet Emily Dickinson (2005, p.56) writes:

If I can ease one life the aching,
Or cool one pain,
Or help one lonely person

¹⁹ kaupapa – task, project, agenda

Into happiness again
I shall not have lived in vain.

Maree was clear about her motivation, which was personal and humanitarian:

First you save yourself then you save the world.

Similarly, another of the research participants, J.B., spoke of her personal need as well as her relationship to her whanau²⁰. She said she did her psychotherapy training for:

My own healing, to heal my own pain and trauma, and in the process, to help heal others in my whanau. It was not solely for self-development....I literally "leapt" into Hakomi for two main reasons; to find a greater sense of who am I in the world and to understand why I think and feel differently from other members of my whanau!

John Karter (2002) comments that a good few square metres of rainforest have been wiped out by writers exploring the subject of therapist motivation. He believes from his interviewing of psychotherapy graduates that people often enter training to move towards a more meaningful and enlightened way of living. He says a few may want to increase control and power in their lives. Karter quotes Francis Dale (1997), who lists a number of commonly expressed 'positive' motivations which include: the challenge of the unknown and intellectual curiosity, a love of truth, interest in people, and being compassionate. The participants quoted above expressed these aims. Other less positive, or more personal reasons, can be a making of reparation, and guilt for past actions, displacement, a desire for omnipotent control, sadism, as well as vicarious healing, and vicarious living (Dale, op.cit.).

As noted earlier some begin training at a time of life-change and uncertainty. Others expressed a mix of practical and altruistic motivational factors for starting out:

I always wanted a degree, I knew my marriage was ending and I wanted to retrain, and I was also curious in why people did what they did. (Bonnie)

I did clinical masters. When I went into that training I tossed up between clinical and counseling. Almost everybody I spoke to said do clinical as it will take you much further. However, I wanted to come out at the other end and be able to sit in a room and be with people. (Isobel)

Disappointments

It is possible that students could end up in a programme that is not suited to their goals, or does not teach the modalities of psychotherapy they wish to learn and practice. Rowan (2005) believes that different levels of development are needed for practitioners of different psychotherapies. According to Rowan, more cognitive approaches, such as CBT, do not require the same ability in the therapist to self-reflect that depth psychotherapies like self-psychology or Hakomi do. Training programmes may not be clear about having

²⁰ *Whanau* – family, extended family

different requirements, or present these varying levels to prospective students. Isobel, the graduate of the clinical psychology masters programme, felt that this had happened to her:

On hindsight it seems like a whole lot of academic work and not much practice. And definitely nothing about whom you are as a therapist. The work that I was doing with clients wasn't very rewarding either. It really led to a time of questioning for me. I stood in a dilemma. I thought this not what I thought this was going to be. When I finished the degree I thought, "Where do I go to learn the real stuff?"

The prophet's wisdom

The Prophet, by Kahlil Gibran, (2003) speaks of *love*. In my reading of Gibran's poetry I felt one could substitute the words '*personal growth in psychotherapy training*, for '*subject to love*', and the experience would be analogous. In fact in my reading of the research data, *love* in all its facets emerged as a key; a key for change, personal growth and for development of the capacity needed to be a psychotherapist. Lewis et al (2001) say that *love* is the destination and also the means for getting there. Joy Cowley poet (1996, p.81) voices the same thing:

I was aware there was something inside me
Cramped up waiting to be unfurled,
And I could feel against my heart
A need that was deeper than instinct,
To fly above my own questions.
But my wings were well hidden.
They needed Love to release them,
The breath of Love to shake them free of fear,
And that took time.

The growth accorded by experiences of love is often described as a kind of *baptism by fire*.

The sacred fire of love

And then he assigns you to his sacred fire,
that you may become sacred bread for God's sacred feast. Gibran (2003, p.11)

Love and psychotherapy

Love is a potent force, often described as fiery. Maybe it is felt to be too dangerous, too passionate, even for psychotherapy. We speak of the importance of relationship in psychotherapy, but tend to be cautious about using the word, *love*, as discussed in the literature review. As Eng-Kong Tan (1991) begins in his address to the NZAP conference:

Let me say at the very outset that psychotherapists generally assiduously avoid saying the word 'love'.

One teacher in a psychotherapy degree programme mused:

It's funny, but the word love doesn't get used much. It's as if you have to be a bit of a rebel to talk openly about love.

In spite of the fact that the word *love* does not commonly appear in psychology and psychotherapy circles, Petruska Clarkson (1995) directly addresses the place of love in psychotherapeutic change. She acknowledges that it could be the lurking presence of *eros* (as sexual love) that scares. Tan (1991) says that *love* is a word that can so easily be misused. Ron Kurtz, the founder of Hakomi psychotherapy, in a personal communication, says:

We're dealing with a word that's got such a large range of meanings. It's both a noun and a verb. In one dictionary I examined, there were 11 meanings for the noun; five included either the word *romantic* or *affectionate*. Two others included *God*, and another, *tennis*. Of the five verbs, one had *sexual desire* and a second, *sexual intercourse*.

Welwood (2006) writes about the difference between *perfect love*, that we may long for, and *relative love* that occurs in most human relationships. His writing is of direct relevance to psychotherapy, as the *good-enough* (Winnicott, 1980) loving experienced by the child greatly impacts on his or her ability to give and receive love in adult life, and consequently on life satisfaction. Welwood (op.cit.) says that we generally receive our biggest dose of near perfect love, unconditional love, in childhood. Later in life the best that relationships usually offer is reciprocal, imperfect love. Longings for the missing experiences of perfect love, and difficulties in finding purpose and meaning in life are often what impel a person to seek psychotherapy. If it is so, as Lewis et al (2001) assert, that a loving relationship is required to heal love deficits; legacy from early life, and the pain and difficulties that ensue, then the capacity to be a psychotherapist and provide this loving relationship also depends on resolving the *wounding of the heart*. Welwood (2006, p.21) advocates using both psychological and spiritual healing approaches for this *wounding*.

Addressing your psychological wounding and learning to access great love — will help you relate to yourself, others, and all of life with a more generous open heart.

Academic psychotherapy programmes tend not to explicitly address *love*, both in teaching about psychotherapy, and related to the teachers' facilitation of personal growth in their students. (I will further discuss the experiences of psychotherapy teachers around having love for their students in the following chapter.) As a trainer in Hakomi psychotherapy from Canada put it:

I think this is great research to do. It raises the question of why we don't call a spade a spade. Love is love.

Psychologists receive a more academic training than psychotherapists, with little focus on personal growth. It would be therefore expected that *love* is not likely to be acknowledged in any way. Isobel, the graduate from the Clinical Psychology Masters degree said, not surprisingly, of her experience:

You can't *love* your clients; you are not there to love your clients. You are there to give them unconditional positive regard. (Even that was only mentioned in passing). Then I came to my very first Hakomi introduction workshop and everything about it appealed to me. I thought this is about loving people. And I thought, am I allowed to think that? Is this correct? It is definitely not about love in the psychological world.

The meaning of love

There are varied manifestations of love, frequently differentiated in the literature as attachment, caring and sex (Goleman, 2006; Shaver & Mikulincer, 2006). All of these expressions of love have psychobiological roots going back to infancy (Leckman, Hrdy, Keverne, & Carter, 2006), which is of absolute relevance to the practice of psychotherapy. One of the teachers of psychotherapy, Joan, who I questioned, wondered:

I have recently been thinking about the erotic transference in relation to the undifferentiated child, whose experience of love is TOTAL²¹, erotic and sensate; undifferentiated. My wonderings have been how it may be that the deficit needs at this stage in an individual's life may be restimulated as they meet a *virtuous other*²².

Love can be a positive, euphoric *feeling*, emotional and physical in nature, warm and expansive, and passionate. Love can be responsive *action*, a concern for and a helping of another, love can express itself through work, touch, words, creativity, nurturing, commitment, love can be appreciation and gratitude, or a merging with another, with nature, or with the divine. One can love oneself, a partner, a child, things, a country, culture, or beauty. Love is life energy, longing, desire, romance (Hendrick & Hendrick, 2006), frustration, satisfaction, intimacy, security, belonging, companionship, giving and receiving (Welwood, 2006). Love incorporates attunement (Goleman, 2006) and empathy, understanding, acceptance, and compassion. Love involves hormones, neurotransmitters, neural circuits, brain areas and body states (Fisher, 2006). Love can have a dark side too, showing up as deep pain, jealousy, possessiveness, rage, and obsession. Frustrated and blocked love can transform into *hate*.

It is so painful to be regularly reminded in our work as a psychotherapist of our own need to be dependent. It is also very easy to slip into becoming contemptuous of our patients, indeed to *hate* our patients for their same neediness of us. We have to watch – guard over ourselves in this serious business of loving. (Tan, 1991, p.6)

Themes of the many facets of love are ubiquitously present in creative writing; fiction, poetry and biography. Katherine Mansfield (1957) writes of filial love between friends -

Like two open cities in the midst of some vast plain their two minds lay open to each other.

- and conflicted love:

I love my mother as I love nobody else in the world – nobody and nothing! Do you think it is impossible to love one's tragedy?

Keri Hulme (2003) writes passionately of love for a child and makes the link to the physical heart (p.79):

I'll charge you with so much love

²¹ capitals in original

²² italics in original

that you'll laugh
and cry real tears
and I will hear your heartbeat
ticking away like a small cicada
at night.

In “*The bone people*” Hulme (1983, p.386) speaks of the longing for connection:

He watches, his hope never quite dead, for them to enter. In time, says his heart. Wait, says his heart. They'll come, says his heart. They don't.

The word *love* while embodying many shades of meaning is an experience-near word. Love is fundamental to the human experience, and human experience is the raw material for personal growth, in psychotherapy and psychotherapy training.

Free to talk of love?

In parenting texts, and in fictional and biographical stories of parents with their children, freely emotional descriptions of love abound:

She loved Little B. so much ... that all her feeling of bliss came back again (Mansfield, 1957).

Mother love results in a heightened sensitivity to the infant (A. Smith, 1988).

My godfather opened his eyes and looked at me. I remember how blue his eyes were and how warm. ... My godfather's eyes and his smile were full of a great love and appreciation. For the first time I felt a deep sense of being welcome, of mattering to someone (Remen, 1994).

Katie had a flash of contempt for the weak child she had borne a year ago. ... She knew it wasn't the little girl's fault. "I must watch myself carefully," she thought. "I'm going to love this boy more than the girl, but I mustn't ever let her know. It's wrong to love one child more than the other, but this is something that I cannot help" (B. Smith, 1986).

We can experience love, and name it as such, for children, seemingly without fear of crossing the sexual boundary, although we know that such boundaries do get violated in all kinds of violent ways involving harmful distortions of love. Yet in psychology, and also in psychotherapy, it is more common to use experience-distant words such as *unconditional positive regard*. The teachers I communicated with said in response to the question, “*Are you supported to include love in your curriculum and/or assessment?*”

Only if it is called compassion or empathy. Not love explicitly.

In the curriculum the language of love would have been softened into *countertransference* responses.

Love in general terms is much more personal and complex As it involves character needs and limitations. As this kind of love is not part of psychotherapy it is not addressed in any systematic way.

Love no, aroha²³ yes.

²³ *aroha* – Maori word for love – see appendix for discussion

It is not built into the curriculum, and it is not given official space, but it comes up.

One teacher in a degree psychotherapy programme said:

Don't be silly. Love is counter-transference, isn't it?

Other psychotherapy trainers have come, often through their own experiences and choice, rather than as part of an approved curriculum, to consciously include love in their support for students, and as part of their teaching about psychotherapy:

I talk very explicitly about love. I talk about loving the client and train students in how to cultivate this capacity in themselves.

While the answer is YES²⁴ to the deliberate part of preparing students for their role as psychotherapists, for me it was implicit not explicit. Yes, it was conscious, but never stated in written documents.

Participants' experiences of love during training

As one would expect, participants in this research tended to use the language of their training. During the initial interviews the participants spoke of *empathy*, *acceptance*, and so on, but did not speak directly of *love*. A partial exception is for those participants who had completed Hakomi psychotherapy training where the experience of *loving presence* is explicitly taught and seen as an integral part of psychotherapy. Even there some see loving presence as different from love. Whenever I discussed the theme of love with colleagues and groups of psychotherapy students there was an immediate interest. So I went back and asked my participants directly about their experiences regarding *love* during training. Linda replied:

We read a great deal about love, I'm not sure we talked enough about our own experiences or understanding of love.

Other participants said:

I was shown tolerance, support, understanding, compassion, humour, and guidance. I was given time and was valued, I was allowed to awaken at my own pace; if this isn't love then I don't fully understand it yet. (Bonnie)

I loved before my training, but did not have any love for myself. This in turn tainted my love for others. (Judy)

I think love is (related to my psychotherapy training) but it was not my experience at the time. (David)

In a similar way Kerry, a graduate of a diploma programme, said, when asked what it was that supported her personal development:

The moment I heard your question I knew that for me, it's been the tutors' un- wavering and generous unconditional positive regard, for me as a person; who I was then, and who I became.

²⁴ capitals in original

Another psychotherapy graduate, Sarah, said that she had had a dream where her personal therapist (during her training) had told her that he loved her. With some trepidation she told him of her dream. After a thoughtful pause, he replied, “*You are very easy to love*”. The use of the word *love* by her therapist had a huge impact for Sarah. She said:

This was like one of those life-changing moments.....in that moment I totally believed him. No doubt. No doubt at all. Like a truth had just been spoken.

I often go back to that moment, as a resource when I am feeling unloved by others, particularly my mother. This enables me to hold onto myself and separate the unloving behaviour from myself. If he said I was easy to have love for, then it must be true!!!! What a revelation that was. A gift that I now pass onto my own clients.

Would the impact have gone as deep for Sarah if the therapist had said, “*I have empathy for you*”, or “*You are easy to accept*”? The graduate of the clinical psychology programme, Isobel, said, in reflecting on her learning experience with a particular teacher who was more open relationally than most:

All my pores would open up and I would soak up his presence. I couldn't wait to go back, and I didn't want to leave. He was a real contrast to the other tutors.

Spiritual teachers seem less afraid of expressing love for their disciples, and receiving love from them in return. The Yogi, Paramahansa Yogananda (1979, p.106) describes this exchange:

His eyes held unfathomable tenderness. “I give you my unconditional love,” Precious words! A quarter-century elapsed before I had another auricular proof of his love. “Will you give me the same unconditional love?” He gazed at me with child-like trust. “I will love you eternally, Gurudeva!”

Kriyananda (1979, p.308) describes the conscious use of love by the Yogi Master.

(A)nother disciple, Rev. Michael, who, feeling deep love for the Master, would often repeat the words mentally, “I love you, Guru”. One day, to his joy, the Master responded to his silent offering. With a gaze of deep tenderness, The Guru said, “I love you too.” Master responded instantly to sincere love.

Tweedie (1979) traveled from England to India to make a spiritual journey. She kept a journal, writing of her path to liberation through an intense relationship with a Sufi Master, who tended to both offer love, and withhold it. She says near the end of her book, (p.201):

Never will I forget the love that I felt then.

Love for, and from, her guru was pivotal in Irina Tweedie's spiritual unfolding.

The hard face of love

Love is not always soft and receptive, but has a hard face too. To be truly compassionate, and hold another's well-being uppermost, one sometimes needs to set boundaries and refuse to give, or to nurture. For the recipient, this function of love, as children well know, can feel like rejection, leading to hurt and anger. John Welwood (2006), a Buddhist psychotherapist, talks about our search for *perfect love*, which may occur with some desperation when we have not received enough unconditional love as a child. When

relationships deliver the imperfect, *relative love* that is more normal in adult life, then this love may be disregarded as not sufficient, or it may trigger emotional pain and resentment. As a result, a person may hang out in a *mood of grievance*, which blocks giving and receiving love. Rush Dozier (2002) describes how feeling trapped and frustrated can activate the primitive neural system, and lead to destructive feelings of separation and *hate*. These difficult feelings are experienced by students who can feel confused and immobilised by them.

Once subjected there is no escape

Love encompasses the warming fires of comfort and passion, and also the injurious flames of hell. From the participants' accounts it appeared that once the personal growth journey has begun love will have its way with the traveller, conjuring its alchemical magic. Maybe the poets express it more vividly:

How much burning, burning will you feel,
Be friendly with the fire, enough for me.
Light up the fire of love inside,
And blaze the thoughts away. (Rumi, 1994, p.30)

Hell lies not in torture.
Hell lies in an empty heart. (Kahlil Gibran, 1995, p.61)

The motivation and commitment of the student is as instrumental in the growth process as the training itself. Complexity theory tells us that there is a natural drive in complex systems towards greater complexity, and greater health. In Hakomi we talk of this as the *organicity principle*, speaking of how, given the right circumstances, growth unfolds from within, in its own unique and often unpredictable way. Rumi (S. Levine & Levine, 1984, p.110) writes of fire, as pain, and water as pleasure, and Mercury, the trickster; invoked as we approach the powerful forces of love:

Whoever walks into the fire appears suddenly in the stream.
A head goes under the water's surface, that head pokes out of the fire.
Most people guard against going into the fire, and so end up in it,
Those who love the water of pleasure and make it their devotion are cheated with this reversal.
The trickery goes further.
The voice in the fire tells the truth, saying I am not fire
I am fountainhead. Come into me and don't mind the sparks.
Somehow each gives the appearance of the other.
To those eyes you have now what looks like water burns.
What looks like fire is a great relief to be inside.

Falling, drowning, burning

Love's voice may shatter your dreams as the north wind lays waste the garden.
(Kahlil Gibran, 2003, p.10)

Tonight sisters, I hear your pain

feeling it calling, calling, calling
across the crested wave
Te Moana nui a Kiwa
it's an old pain
long many moons old

Hinewirangi Kohu, (Wendt et al., 2003, p.108)

Heartbreak

Imperfect love, lack of love, real love, soft and hard, longing for love, and growth through all these dimensions of love, involves turbulence, pain, and heartbreak. As Oscar Wilde so movingly expresses it, heartbreak is an opening that can free the most tormented murderer, and lead him to a spiritual homecoming. Wilde writes from the depths of his own heart, in "*The Ballad of Reading Goal*" (1993, p.838):

Ah! Happy those whose heart can break
And peace of pardon win!
How else can man make straight his plan
And cleanse his soul from Sin?
How else but through a broken heart
May Lord Christ enter in?

It would seem that for the participants the painful, disturbing dimensions of relationship and love had begun their alchemical magic soon after psychotherapy training commenced. Graduates spoke of disturbance in terms very similar to Gibran's (2003) words in '*The Prophet*'. There was a sense from most participants that their world had been turned upside down by the personal growth process. Vulnerability (Kegan, 1994) and primal death anxiety (Langs, 2006), accessed by the presence of love, and the transition to a new level of development begins to undermine personal stability. Participants spoke of upheaval and pain, overwhelm and disturbance, echoing Gibran's sentiment (2003, p.10):

His ways are hard and steep.

A similar destabilising upset can occur in all relationships, especially romantic liaisons. Falling in love tends to provide a sense of perfect love being abundant at long last, with accompanying exhilaration, but it cannot be sustained. When it is realised that the less perfect, relative love is on offer, anger and grief can emerge (Welwood, 2006). Susan Anderson (2000) talks of the traumatic state; a shattering, often with suicidal thoughts, that occurs when there is abandonment by an intimate partner. Kegan (1994) says that fear and insecurity also arises when one partner is entering a new stage of development, which becomes threatening to the other. Lauren Bacall, (2000, p.232) the actress said:

How in the hell can you handle love without turning your life upside down? That's what love does, it changes everything.

The world turned upside down

Most of the participants spoke of their personal turbulence especially early in the training, some describing this in strong, somatic language. Intense words were used; *relentless*, too *much*, *threatening*, *frightening*, *shattering*. Graduates said:

It did turn my whole world upside down. (Judy)

I was so fragile (Linda)

In the first year they pull your skin off, so you are all open, like this, vulnerable, and then you can't go like this to your work, and see clients. I don't think I really understood what was going on. (Anna)

My whole place in the world, it was all shook up. (Maree)

There was a lot of floundering going on and I sometimes felt very confused and adrift. I did feel very overwhelmed and flooded and I couldn't get away. (Linda)

In my personal experience, it was devastating. (Anna)

It was absolutely devastating, a huge narcissistic wound for me. (Linda)

It was all vulnerable, it was risking, it was being in relationship. (Bonnie)

Linda expressed similar feelings, linking the upheaval to early life experience:

The first year was quite shattering really... What happened a lot in the first year was getting really overwhelmed. And not knowing what to do with it, how to find the words. I think a lot of the feelings that came up for me were very early feelings.

The descriptions given by the participants are strikingly similar to those found in research (Bolger, 1999) on pain arising in therapy. People talked about being broken, bleeding, shattered, the body ruptured. Greenberg (2002, p.146), believes that experiencing this kind of pain is the first step in the process of change. Tweedie (1979) says that at one point of her spiritual journey nothing remained except the pain in the heart. She described how she went home and cried for a long time without being able to stop. Tweedie felt that her endlessly crying, without apparent reason, was a traumatic state.

Schiffman (1971, p.4), in training with Perls, wrote that all week she used her own self therapy techniques just to survive, as she could neither eat nor sleep. Judy Grahn (1978, p.142), poet, expresses the discomfort that can be generated by love:

Wherever I turn for peace of mind
There is the Love dog scratching
At the door of my lonesomeness,
Beating her tail against the leg
Of my heart
& panting all night with red breath
in my dreams.

Bleeding willingly and joyfully

Even though graduates remembered, sometimes emotionally, the pain that accompanied their early immersion into the programme, they indicated that somewhere they found the process good, even enjoyable. In the words of the participants, as they reflected:

The whole experience is a good thing. Not easy but a good thing. I enjoyed it so much. I used to love going, even though I cried so much. In the third year I didn't know I could cry that often. (Anna)

That first year was the beginning of letting go. The floodgates really opened. It didn't matter where I turned, it was there. It didn't matter what class I was in. It all came out. The grief and the pain. It was good. (Linda)

Linda, who completed a degree programme, also said,

It was very hard to be present. I often ended up crying. Actually I had a fantastic experience, when I look back now.

Ella Wheeler Wilcox (2005, p.58) puts this mixture of sorrow and delight poetically:

We find the sea of sorrow. Black as night
The sullen surface meets our frightened gaze.
As down we sink to darkness and despair.
But at the depths! Such beauty, such delight!
Such flowers as never grew in pleasure's ways.

Those subjected to love, according to Gibran (2003, p.15), are willing *to bleed willingly and joyfully*.

The roots of the tree are shaken

As students set out on their training, core material from the roots of the tree begins to emerge, as Gibran (2003, p.11) writes,

So shall (love) descend to your roots and shake them in their clinging to the earth.

Our relationship, and love experiences as adults are shaped by early childhood attachment. Relationship templates are 'wired' into the growing brain, and form, according to Cozolino (2002), *a memory of the future*. In Hakomi psychotherapy it is said that associated emotions, beliefs and behaviour patterns are clustered deep in the largely unconscious, implicit memory system, and are termed, *core material* (Kurtz, 2004).

The metaphor of a tree is used in Hakomi to represent the history and expression of the self (Morgan, 2006), with the core material in the roots (grown early in life), influencing the flowering and branching of the mature tree. The tree symbol also appears in poetry and art²⁵²⁶.

The human being resembles a tree; its root is a covenant with God:
that root must be cherished with all one's might.

²⁵ In art therapy the symbol of the tree is termed the 'tree of life' or *arbor vitae*, a journey of life symbol. (Furth, 1988)

²⁶ Cohen and Cox (Cohen & Cox, 1995) say, "The tree is probably the most frequent non-human image drawn to represent the self in the art of individuals with MPD." (p.35)

A weak covenant is a rotten root, without grace or fruit.
Though the boughs and leaves of the date palm are green,
greenness brings no benefit if the root is corrupt.
If a branch is without green leaves, yet has a good root,
a hundred leaves will put forth their hands in the end. (Rumi, 1994, p42)

In the words of a contemporary poet, Michael Leunig (1990, p.4):

The tree sends its roots beneath the surface, seeking nourishment in the dark soil. ... Thus held and nourished, the tree grows upwards into the light ... expressing its truth. The tree changes as it grows. It is torn by wind and lightning, scarred by frost and fire. Branches die and new ones emerge. The drama of existence has its way with the tree but it still grows; still its roots reach down into the darkness; still its branches flow with sap and reach upward and outward into the world.

The symbols related to self that are used in traditional Maoridom are more collective in nature, than the lone tree. Maori traditionally use the metaphor of the flax bush which encompasses individual identity within the embrace of the outer leaves; one bush representing a family unit of parents and children, or whanau²⁷. With flax, the roots of neighbouring flax bushes are intricately intertwined, and this is the connection between families in the extended family or wider whanau (Metge, 1995). The tree metaphor can also represent a family tree, or a merging of individual and family identity, as is expressed by Apirana Taylor in the poem *Whakapapa*²⁸ (2005, p.98):

I was am and, will be
Alive, growing, bearing fruit
Living, dying, in you, and me,
I am the family tree

J.B., a Maori graduate of Hakomi says:

My personal growth journey is multi-dimensional. The tree metaphor in Hakomi for me represents *whakapapa*²⁹ and the connectiveness / separateness between *Ranginui* (Skyfather), *Papatuanuku* (Earthmother) and *tupuna*; the map makers. On a social awareness level, this also represents acknowledgement of each and every other person's *whakapapa* that I'm privileged to work with. Their *whakapapa* and my *whakapapa* are laid down.

J.B. expands the metaphor of the tree from just representing individual psychology to also including the ancestors and social collectivity in which the individual self, for her, is inextricably embedded.

Pain and pleasure

Nature requires that we form a relationship between our joy and our despair, that they not remain divided or hidden from one another. (Leunig, 1990, p.2)

As noted previously, a frequent theme that occurs in texts and creative writing is that growth, and the developing capacity for giving and receiving love, involves pain. Pain and joy are linked together. Every human heart that breaks, according to Oscar Wilde in 'The ballad of Reading Goal' (1993), is a way of

²⁷ *whanau* - family

²⁸ *whakapapa* – ancestry, lineage

²⁹ *whakapapa* – lineage, ancestry

achieving spiritual union, as well as finding redemption. M. Scott Peck (1993) says that consciousness brings more pain, but it also brings more joy. A poem written by a German woman, Frieda Jung (1925, p.2), links joy, pain and the breaking of the heart as a way to spiritual growth:

Joy and sorrow, I bow my head,
I welcome you, my soul believes —
Believes that through you —
Though I might stumble,
I will fulfil my destiny.
Mould and break my heart, it will submit.
It laughs and cries itself into God.

For students, as the roots of the tree were shaken, old emotional history being was triggered, and grief surfaced. Pain can be a motivator to start the journey as Nicholas Evans poetically expresses:

Sometimes what seems like surrender isn't surrender at all.
It's about what's going on in our hearts.
About seeing clearly the way life is and accepting it and being true to it,
whatever the pain,
because the pain of not being true to it is far greater.
(Nicholas Evans- The Horse Whisperer)

In a similar vein, graduates from all types of training programmes described their experiences of pain and grief:

I was in a foetal position on the bed, with a teddy, absolute rocking." (Judy)

Sometimes I felt I just needed to lay in a coma for a week. Oh! No more! It was intense. ... Thank goodness for my reptilian brain that kept me breathing and my heart pumping and it was like the rug was pulled out from under me. (Bonnie)

I was upset in class, sometimes spontaneously crying, and it was hard to concentrate on the content. The whole matter (of being triggered) had a big impact on me. (David)

I got extremely upset, and I did not know how to release it. (Huia)

I did feel very overwhelmed and flooded and I couldn't get away. (Linda)

The thought came again, is there no growth without pain? Perls (1975, p.12) believed that psychological growth was painful:

Maturation cannot be achieved for (the person); he has to go through the painful process of growing up by himself.

It seems, from a neuroscience perspective that *unconsolidated material*, or *unfinished business*, as Perls (1970) terms it, would activate the limbic system. Stored along with these implicit, buried memories is emotion; often painful, primitive emotion. This pain accompanies resolution of old wounds, and is part and parcel of this dimension of the growth process.

Uncertainty

Let us step out of character into the unknown, to struggle and love and do what we will. (Leunig, 1990, p.14)

Familiar patterns, ways of being in the world, were disturbed. Stable worlds became uncertain. This impacted the students personally, and rippled out into their family and friendship networks. They commented:

It was scary, having to question everything. (Bonnie)

I cut off a lot of my friends because I realised they weren't actually friends. (Judy)

Linda talked of how she took her distress home to her family:

I was very pre-occupied and stressed and very emotional when I came home. Lots of nights I phoned people from the course.

J.B. questioned her personal reality:

I heard the word 'authentic'. I asked myself, "What on earth does that mean?" I questioned my whole 30 years. I wondered, "Have I been a fraud all that time?" Was I wearing a mask, or was I dumb, deaf and blind? It brought everything about my life into question, tipped it over on its head.

Bonnie, a mother of young children, doubted her parenting skills:

It was full on. And all the people around me were all having crises and dropping into things. And as a parent... I was sure I had done great damage to my children by that stage. I thought, Oh God, I did this and I did this! It was shocking!

The question comes up as to whether all the pain and distress experienced by psychotherapy students is necessary? This distress, not only impacted on the students personally, but spread out into family networks; friends, children, partners.

Is there an easier path?

As personal processes were activated, students often longed for what Clarkson (1995) terms the *reparative relationship*. Teachers are imperfect, stressed and generally can only offer what Welwood calls *relative love*. Sometimes it may not even be that. To the student, searching for missing experiences of *perfect love*, what is available may feel woefully lacking. Trainers and personal therapists, who are in a position of power, are not always wise in their relationships with students, and may provoke considerable pain, as is evident from the participants' stories quoted above, and in the next chapter. The participants related experiences that showed turbulence often comes from emerging core material which they brought with them into the journey; often childhood trauma and neglect. When regression occurs, longing for love and acceptance can become a powerful need, and then the student is more vulnerable to relationship influences within personal therapy and in the training situation.

Baggage carried: wounded healers

My basic training as a therapist was in my home of origin. (Bowden, 2001, p.34)

The early experiences that I had were of trauma; quite traumatic and quite harsh, even coming into the world. My boundaries had been quite quickly and harshly invaded. (Maree)

Wounded Healers

As previously noted, students of psychotherapy tend to have experienced difficult or traumatic childhoods. This may be, in fact, what attracts them to choosing psychotherapy as a career. The *baggage* carried can prove to be cumbersome and heavy, and may slow down or seriously challenge the progress of the student:

As a therapist ... unresolved personal issues hamper the treatment as powerfully As if a doctor who was scared of the sight of blood had to be on duty permanently in casualty." (Sinason, 1997)

(The course) brought up childhood experiences that I hadn't faced. (Maree)

In my course, it was writing about myself. That was so difficult, writing about my life. It was hard to go right back and write about it all. It exposed traumatic things. We were told, "If you can't get through this, you need to look at what you are doing here." We were facing our demons again. Some things I had forgotten were coming up again. It was great that tears were accepted." (Marama)

This *baggage* is raw material for the alchemical process. Participants, like many of the writers reviewed in Chapter Two, emphasised that personal issues need to be brought to awareness, and integrated for psychotherapeutic effectiveness and safety.

Wounds: body and emotion

The 'roots of the tree' shelter unresolved, implicit memory, which is emotional, including the memory of shock, and this memory is always also somatic in nature. Early in his training David was very upset and vulnerable after a conflict with his therapist, experiencing distressing body reactions. The anger he observed in the therapist was a trauma trigger for him, related to a past experience of a relative trying to strangle him. Reclaiming of, and transforming the relationship with the body was an important dimension of growth that participants related. Judy felt something was missing within:

There was a part of me that was really empty. I couldn't give it shape, I couldn't give it texture, I couldn't give it colour; it was just that black emptiness. It used to actually nauseate me as well.

J.B. described how her *wounding* involved the virtual absence of pain, with a resulting disconnection from bodily experience:

The somatic aspect to my personal growth has come from the integration of self awareness around the absence of pain. At a very young age, I've always known I've had a very high tolerance to pain — actually felt no pain whatsoever during and after domestic violence, several motorbike accidents and giving birth to two children. What this means for me now is connecting my outer (bodily) self with my inner self and listening to them both. The relationship between the two has slowly created a stronger sense of being.

Tweedie(1979) also wrote of powerful body manifestations during her journey. She talked of burning up, knees giving way, her body trembling, being nauseated. As noted earlier, many of the words participants used to describe their upheavals on the journey related to body experience. Even the word *wounding* has a somatic correlate.

Shame

A feeling of exposure, vulnerability and shame associated with growing consciousness of early *woundings*, and their disclosure, made it hard to keep on going sometimes. Tweedie (1979, p.68) wrote of her personal distress at emerging memories:

I had an awful struggle with it, digging out the old skeletons from the dusty corners of my memory; to dig out things I thought I had forgotten, of which I was ashamed.

Participants remembered:

You are always bringing up your stuff. I had no idea the impact that would have. I couldn't stop crying. I felt so humiliated. (Huia)

That stuff about my father (abusing me), it actually wasn't triggered by class material, it was triggered by one of my fellow students actually. ... Had I not been contained,I was on so many edges. (Bonnie)

(The class) used to bring up a lot for me, my own family at home. I felt quite fragile at times. (Linda)

I carried the shame of a whole core of introjects from my grandmother that because I was adopted I had bad blood. Bad things happened to bad people. So there was an acceptance that all the bad things that had happened in my life — well bad things happened to bad people. Bad blood, bad — and to this day, even though I've got a not common blood group I still won't donate blood. So I know I will have got rid of my grandmother the day I go and donate blood. (Judy)

Shame can be a difficult emotion to bear, especially in a group situation. This was true for the participants; for them emerging shame was one of the most challenging aspects of the growth process.

Pleasing others and failing

Shame may date back to early school experiences that can impact in psychotherapy training situations. Trying to please others, do the right thing; the adaptive self arising from early shaming and criticism, tended to hinder the students or prevent nourishing input being received:

I was still insecure, and needed to be a good girl, needed to be the perfect me, except I didn't even realise that that was what I was trying to be. (Judy)

I know I used to look at the tutors and think that I'm sure you guys could see something, that you could see things in me that I didn't know myself and that was scary. That was a real threat, really scary. (Bonnie)

My biggest fear was getting things wrong. Seeming dumb. (Marama)

For me failure has always had more consequences than being successful. (J.B.)

I didn't know why I was being slowed down. And part of me understood that. I had never ever given time to myself. ... It was just an embarrassment — I won't say an unfair judgment, but that's how I felt at the time. Because I had been living a life of shame and feeling judged - and overload. (Judy)

The skills learning was hard As I have a perfectionist streak and I don't like to make mistakes. I didn't know that about myself in the first year of skills training. It was a shameful thing. I didn't know what to do. (Linda)

The academic tutors modelled this (love) ... but to a lesser degree, or more truthfully, my seeking approval and passes got in the way of receiving this. (Kerry)

Performance anxiety, involving needing to know the answers, or the right way of doing something is particularly hard for students of psychotherapy. Much psychotherapy practice depends on the ability to sit with uncertainty, and intervene according to a blend of knowledge and intuitive sense. The tension of maintaining an acceptable front prevents the inner awareness needed to be intuitive and truly empathic.

Wounds of the heart; cultural perspectives

My contact with Pakeha, was bringing up those feelings I had had inside of me since I was little. We were the Maori family among Europeans. Pepper potting I think they called it. We were made to feel we were second class. It all came back in that classroom. I was able to identify that and work through it. It helped me grow.

The overriding thing for me was always the cultural difference. I am Maori, what does it mean to me? I had to define that for myself. It was the biggest challenge in my personal development. (Huia)

We were unacknowledged and unvalidated (on the Polytechnic counseling course). (Marama)

Some of our students in psychotherapy programmes are Maori. Many Maori have the added *wounding* that results from colonisation and ongoing racism. They have significant experiences of culturally based *unlove* during growing up that become intertwined with the wounding that happens in family relationships. According to Welwood (2006), *unlove* is experiencing being not accepted and nurtured for *being who you are*. Maori participants reported additional distress and loneliness that was related to these particular hurts being accessed in classes, some on counselling courses done earlier, where there was inadequate understanding and or holding:

It became evident early in the course that our stories as Maori were different from Pakeha³⁰. (Huia on psychotherapy course)

I didn't enjoy my social studies in class. We lived it as kids, I experienced it all as a child. In the class we talked about labeling. Someone said to me, "If you say you are Maori you are labeling!" That put a fire in my belly. I said, "I don't like you telling me what I am or I am not! I am a Maori that is how I identify myself! It is not a label." I have been brought up around that kind of attitude. The tutor didn't say anything. After that I didn't feel like I had a say. I was enjoying it before that. (Marama — on Polytechnic counseling course)

³⁰ *Pakeha* — non-Maori, white-skinned person

My own sister, if she could change her skin to white she would. ... I went into my training and these are the sorts of things I went in with. (Huia on psychotherapy course)

I was told that all those things happened years ago. I said the effects are right here with me today. I was told "Why don't you just move on?" I felt "You don't know what you are talking about." I said I wanted to help my people — and I was told, "You are racist". I had just shared my heart, my passion. I wanted to help my people move out of being down and out. They were looking down their noses at me. It was quite a learning about people's attitudes, and their fear. (Marama — on Polytechnic counseling course)

It wouldn't have been easier with more Maori. There was only one other Maori person on the course. (Huia on Polytechnic social services course)

We had a week at the marae and studied the treaty. I would offer my viewpoint, then after the marae it was as if they knew all about our culture. I was horrified with the comments that came out. I didn't feel like the tutor was very supportive. My other mates said we don't bother to speak or we end up with headaches. So we just sat there. That class I didn't enjoy. (Marama — on Polytechnic counseling course)

The treaty paper really had an effect on our class. There were such different views. I can understand why one class for Maori and one for Pakeha are better sometimes. They weren't so aware on those days. We were just sitting there listening to this stuff. Pakeha were saying, "They are savages" and that we were saved by them. The tutor tried to stay as neutral as she could — but we thought, why is she allowing this? I was the most affected by it all. (Huia on Polytechnic social services course)

When another student said to the whole group, "What do the other Maori's think about this?" I felt, "Who are you to expect me to say something just because I am Maori." I felt I was on the back foot. That issue belonged to another person. To expect me to say something just because I was Maori! I felt offended by that. I'm still figuring that out for myself. Where do I stand as a Maori in the community. (Huia on psychotherapy course)

J.B. felt conflict at times between her Maori values, and family training, and the requirements of the course:

I let my whanau down. My moko³¹ had died in Taupo. He was cremated, which is very bad for Maori. His spirit is supposed to go home. Here was J.B. being selfish not wanting to leave Hakomi, and that whanau I had started to feel I belonged to. I had neglected my duty. It would have been OK if I had had an aunty or if my father had been alive to do that. But they were gone. It was only me. So I had to leave and do that. That was hard. You see, when you come onto a marae you are supposed to stay there. So I had seek permission from the hosts. I was allowed to go but it weighed very heavily on me. But it was very important. That event told me I can do both which is why I kept going. Otherwise I would have left the course.

It is possible that this culturally based hurt cannot be adequately attended to in programmes that are predominantly Western in orientation, thus compounding the sense of disconnection and loneliness that Maori graduates reported.

Given the degree of turbulence, pain, and need to processing early wounds, that all the participants described, how did they cope? What was it within them that kept them on the journey?

Keeping on walking; calling on resources

³¹ *moko* - grandchild

How many of us keep on walking, how many of us stay true to what we know our lives are crying out for...
(Houdsen, 2003, p.16)

But I hear the call of my tupuna³²
The strongest karanga³³ I know
I bow my head with respect for them
And from them I draw strength
They walk with me
As I take my first steps
Toward all that is theirs

from *Powhiri*³⁴ by Jacq Carter (Wendt et al., 2003, p.45)

The practice of psychotherapy is challenging.

To *want* to work with individuals who are suffering, who are angry, depressed, emotionally cut off, suicidal, dependent, distrusting, immature, and sometimes rejecting and hateful – and to be able to *do* so in a way that is beneficial to oneself and one's clients – requires, and sometimes demands, certain characteristics of temperament, mental functioning and emotional stability³⁵ (Dale, 1997, p.16).

Feelings of incompetence and failure, as described earlier, can make it hard for the trainee to keep on walking. Cozolino (2004, p.206) gives advice on this aspect to therapists in training:

Therapists are people looking for answers. Don't settle on only finding answers for your clients; find your own along the way. ...Therapists can easily feel like frauds when there is a wide chasm between what they preach to clients and how they live their own life. ... The experience of personal failure is an essential part of development.

Anna struggled with the experience of failure and felt defeated:

Many times I felt like leaving the whole thing, giving up, many times I felt I was failing, I can't do it, I was blaming myself, thinking I was not good enough.

At times it was hard for students to keep going, to hang in with the process. The journey sometimes felt relentless. Participants seemed to feel, as Rilke (Bly, 1981) put it, *It is possible that I am pushing through solid rock*:

The thing about the course was that it never stopped. It would feel too much to bear." I was stretched to the very limit. My rubber band was this tight, before it was going to break quite a few times. (Bonnie).

A couple of times it would have been very easy just to walk away. (Judy)

Once (the tutor) had to come and rescue me. I ran away and hid. (J.B.)

Gibran's (2003, p.11) *Prophet* addresses the impulse to give up:

But if in your fear you would seek only love's peace and love's pleasure,
then it is better for you that you cover your nakedness and pass out of love's threshing floor.

Tweedie (1979, p.133) often felt that her journey was too hard, writing that she felt she could not go on anymore, because there was nothing left. Schiffman (1971) had to gather strength before she could continue her learning with Perls, saying that she dared not return to another one of Fritz's Gestalt workshops until

³² *tupuna, tipuna* - ancestors

³³ *karanga* – a chanted calling, as when visitors are called on to the marae

³⁴ *powhiri* – welcome, welcome ceremony

³⁵ italics in original

three years later. These times of discouragement were very difficult for the participants, but they were able to access resources.

That which sustains us

Maori students found connecting with the traditions and roles of their culture a valuable resource, as well as an essential part of personal growth:

Once I found my whakapapa³⁶ again, and my wairua³⁷ I wasn't lost any more. I found what that means to be me. We can walk on our own, but our wairua tells us we are not alone. We stand with our tipuna³⁸. Being an individual on your own does not apply in the Maori world view. People who have passed on are there in a spiritual sense. We come with that. I had to go back to my Maori people. My wairua. (Marama)

If my father had been alive I could have asked him for direction. At the end of the day I'm not really old enough to take this role. There are four sisters, but it's me that my father gave it to. It is connected to the land. Whoever is the kaitiaki³⁹ for the land has to do it. And that person has to make all the decisions. Sometimes it is lonely, and sometimes it's good. My father taught me that way. He was not a man who went out in the front. He led his whanau⁴⁰ from the back, and often the side. I have been training to be the same as him. (J.B.)

Connection with other Maori students and whanau were important also:

It was very good to have the other Maori women there. I felt they were stabilising the waka⁴¹, especially around protection, etiquette and protocol. When things got rocky I was part of that team – and that reinforced my place there. (J.B.)

I was going back to my Mum as she is wise, she just has the understanding. She could talk with me and we understood each other. (Marama)

Western people tend to be more self-reliant, and use individual resources before seeking outer support. Leunig (2003, p.25) gives poetic advice on keeping going with resolve, which reminds me of conditioning derived from my Scottish background:

Keep going towards the horizon.
Sit down and have a rest every now and again,
But keep on going, just keep on with it.
Keep on going as far as you can.
That's how you get there.

Tweedie (1979, p.62) in a similar way, tapped into her inner determination:

I must bear everything. I must. Even if it should break me.

Participants spoke of utilising their own determination to persevere. Bonnie says:

³⁶ *whakapapa* - descent line - lineage

³⁷ *wairua* – spirituality, spirit

³⁸ *tipuna* - ancestors

³⁹ *kaitiaki* – one who guards or cares for somebody or something

⁴⁰ *whanau* - family

⁴¹ *waka* - canoe

It reminds me, getting through things. It reminds me that when I was tramping up a hill one day and my pack was incredibly heavy, and I looked up, and wondered how I would get my bum up there, so I decided not to look up, and I looked ahead. I put one foot in front of the other. You know. Get up the next morning and go to class.

When other relationship support did not seem available, Judy used her connection with her pets as a resource:

My dogs became extremely important. They kept me — when I was upside down and that mixed up — they loved me no matter what. And I needed, very much needed their cuddles and licks and their excitement to see me.

All the graduates that I interviewed did keep going, did survive the journey of their psychotherapy training. They all felt that they had grown in some positive way. However, a good number who commence psychotherapy courses do give up. I spoke to one student who had withdrawn after two years in the degree programme. She said that too much traumatic material had been triggered for her, and she did not consider that she was in any state to be a psychotherapist. When I asked her why she had started the course, she said she now realised that it was for her own healing. She was satisfied that she had begun a healing journey for herself which she would continue in psychotherapy as a client. Others may give up because it is too hard, and there isn't sufficient holding or support available.

Conclusion

The descriptions that the participants gave illustrated the disturbing power of undertaking personal growth; how entering into a commitment to the training journey, and being in new relationship to self and other, began to shake and disturb fixed, familiar ways of being. This was frightening, as they stepped into unknown territory. Kegan (1982) describes this fear as an inevitable part of the transition from one developmental stage to another. The alchemy of love; the willingness to fall, be vulnerable and face pain and change can only happen if there is safety and a holding environment. In this journey of unfolding it could be said that *love* stimulated the undoing, *love* supported and held them as they continued on, at least some of the time, and increased *love* for self and other was one of the outcomes the participants reported.

The dreams, intuitive knowing, and determination involved in undertaking such a journey are captured powerfully in Mary Oliver's (1986, p.38) poem:

One day you finally knew
what you had to do, and began,
though the voices around you
kept shouting their bad advice —

though the whole house began to tremble
and you felt the old tug at your ankles.
“Mend my life!” each voice cried.
But you didn’t stop.
You knew what you had to do,
though the wind pried with its stiff fingers
at the very foundations,
though their melancholy was terrible.
It was already late
enough, and a wild night,
and the road full of fallen
branches and stones.
But little by little,
As you left their voices behind,
the stars began to burn
through the sheets of clouds,
and there was a new voice
which you slowly recognized as your own,
that kept you company
as you strode deeper and deeper
into the world.
determined to do
the only thing you could do —
determined to save
the only life you could save.

Questions arise for me around the turbulence and challenge of the personal growth in the trainee psychotherapist’s journey. Do those students that do stride *deeper and deeper*, survive, and end up *saving the only life they could save*, have particular personality traits, motivation, level of maturation and capacity to begin with? Or do they survive and grow because they are held and loved sufficiently during the painful parts of the journey, both within the training and in their own support networks? If the ‘successful’ psychotherapy trainee’s journey is like that of a psychotherapy client who achieves a positive outcome, then it will be intrinsic characteristics that are of prime significance, followed in importance by the holding, loving relationships along the way (Asay & Lambert, 2002). Are the stages and challenges of the journey well enough understood by trainers and students? This brings me to the next section; *the landscape* through which students travel, and how that impacts on students’ ability to sustain themselves and develop.

Chapter Five: The Landscape

The lesson of compassion is best learned in a compassionate household. (Rubin, 1975, p.135)

Introduction: the terrain traversed

I have crossed your plains and climbed your mountains; I have gone down into your valleys and entered your caves. And in the valleys I have observed your tranquility; among the rocks I have felt your firmness; in the caves I have touched your mysteries.

from 'Earth' by Kahlil Gibran (1995, p.98)

In the previous chapter I looked at reasons for setting out, the characteristics of the journey, and 'baggage' carried. The landscape through which the students travel impacts on the nature of their journeying. For a reminder of the data organization around *the journey* theme, see the table below, which was presented in the previous chapter:

INFLUENCING FACTORS	The JOURNEY: stages	CHARACTERISTICS
BEING LOST		Deep sense of disconnection, longing, restlessness, life change or transition.
	SETTING OUT: innocence and dreams.	Some kind of inner drive, intuitive trust, maybe even naivety. Hopes and dreams – personal, family, cultural, spiritual. Natural growth process, drive towards complexity.
	THE SACRED FIRE OF LOVE	Compassion, acceptance, support, containing, holding - as a longing, for healing, and for safety, for learning new patterns. The hard face of love, no escape from the fire.
	BURNING, FALLING, DROWNING,	Overwhelm, shattering, taken to pieces, pain, vulnerability, memories, feelings, disillusionment, powerful longings, needs, regression, roots of tree shaken, uncertainty.
BAGGAGE CARRIED		Wounded healers, cultural pain, self-capacity, shame, bodily pain
	KEEPING ON WALKING	Calling on resources, survival, finding ways of keeping going, organicity, and survival.
THE LANDSCAPE		Support, guides, love, holding, culture, expectations, pressures, traps, attacks
THE DESTINATION	LEAVING HOME/COMING HOME: telling stories around the fire.	Pain, relief on leaving. Winds of change. Reflection, integration, gratitude. What does it all mean? Moving inwards, outwards with love, passport to a life.

Table 4: map of 'the journey'

Even though personal growth occurring during psychotherapy training is only a segment of a larger, life-long developmental unfolding, the very nature of psychotherapy education is likely to stimulate, or even require, accelerated growth. The 'territory' of the programme is often similar for each student, but what they bring may be very different. As students move along on their journey they bring with them their own strengths and *woundings*. Sufficient safety appears to be critical to growth. A feeling of being accepted and *belonging* may itself start the growth process; the developmental potential being like a dormant seed that starts to sprout when put in good soil, given the warmth of sunlight, and watered well, as expressed in '*The Rose*'.

Just remember in the winter, far beneath the bitter snows
Lies the seed that with the sun's love, in the spring becomes the rose.
from "The Rose" by Amanda McBroom (1979)

Safety, belonging, being welcome

The feeling of belonging cannot be adequately expressed in words. The customs and respect for the customs, and the values reinforced by the *wairua*⁴² of the *marae*⁴³, give strength. ... There is an awareness of one's heritage; an awareness that one is accepted. It is a place of security and comfort . (Tauroa & Tauroa, 1986, p.20)

Learning anything positive including love, requires freedom from fear. ... If we learn *not*⁴⁴ to fear in early relationships, we will enter subsequent relationships assuming that others are trustworthy, caring and dependable. If early relationships are problematic, we connect with others in a tentative way, anticipating that what has occurred will happen again (Cozolino, 2006a, p.332).

Safety

A number of writers like Cozolino, cited above, affirm that the environment that best supports the personal growth journey is one where the person feels accepted and sufficiently safe in order to experience the vulnerability involved in re-experiencing painful memories, and making personal changes (Mahoney, 1991; Quadrio, 2004). Bruce Lipton (2005), a cellular biologist, argues that it is not possible for the human organism, and every cell within it, to be in defensive mode and growth mode at the same time. Leslie Greenberg (2002, p.61) says that the environment helps a person regulate emotion and eventually learn to self-soothe:

The provision of a safe, supportive, empathic environment helps soothe automatically generated under-regulated distress.

A place to belong

⁴² *Wairua* – spirit or spirituality

⁴³ *Marae* – Traditional Maori communal space for ceremony, learning and gathering.

⁴⁴ Italics in original

To find a place of belonging is like finding a new family; one where you can be accepted for who you are, warts and all. Welwood (2006) believes that having the experience of being loved *for who you are* forms a critical foundation for self-love, and the later ability to give and receive love. The teachers and peer group of the training, or 'replacement' family, as it is sometimes perceived, can be reparative, especially when a student's family of origin was not so accepting. In that early situation defensive patterns were set in place, as of necessity, to enable psychological, or even physical, survival. Several participants spoke of the importance of feeling welcome and accepted:

My therapist helped me with learning to trust. You guys were so important to me and over the years I learned to trust you too, and got the warm, compassionate part of relationship, which is not about judging. I started to feel that inside too. I guess through my therapist I got to feeling stronger in myself, not feeling so vulnerable. More accepting of my defences in myself, so they weren't so threatening. And it was my relationship with you guys, it grew and developed. (Bonnie)

For me it was the kind of thing they said all through the course. Like you are going to be a psychotherapist, so we are not saying you can't get depressed, and so on. I was supported in being who I was and what I was experiencing, yes. It was taking what felt like a negative experience into how can you use it, putting a positive view on it. I never felt judged for how I was, or for what I wrote. (Anna)

The whole (Hakomi) training for me is about my expressive self, and just who I am — about that being welcomed. And yeah, just feeling welcomed as a human being, and having something to offer. Having these parts of myself; my sensitivities, my gentle, receptive nature, being honoured and made welcome. That I do have something to offer really makes me feel good about myself. (*Do you know what specifically helped that?*) Tutors and trainers just *being* — holding that, and the whole container that allowed it. I was really supported and completely affirmed for who I am, and that what I have to bring is unique, and it's me. That was held in a really loving way. I was not judged even if others did have a problem with me; it was never really a confrontational thing. I was accepted. Yes, that acceptance was huge for me. (Maree)

I found it a lot easier to share the cultural things by the end of the three years. Even if we were different it didn't really matter anymore. We all accepted each other. We had our Maori stories, and they had wonderful stories too, and I appreciated it. We were all showing more compassion by then and we all were the same. (Huia)

The marae and belonging

(Learning on the marae) provides a connection from the ancestors, a belonging. It brings what has been passed down to us, a strength. This is wairua, or a spiritual experience, and our whakapapa, it is who we are. (Marama)

Marae⁴⁵ experiences, which are part of the psychotherapy education process in New Zealand, were experienced as very compelling by almost all the participants, Maori and Pakeha⁴⁶ alike. It feels to me that the traditional emphasis on community, connections to ancestors and the land, warmth and hospitality that is so evident in Maori culture has its own provocative and potentially healing power:

To enter the meeting house is ... to be re-born into the kin group, into the family. (Shirres, 1997, p.54)

A high value is placed on manaakitanga (hospitality). ... the visitors become guests who must be cared for and looked after. (Mead, 2003, p.120)

⁴⁵ *Marae* — Traditional Maori communal space for ceremony, learning and gathering.

⁴⁶ *Pakeha* — non-Maori person, person of fair skin

Haere mai ra, nga manuhiri tuarangi e, Haeremai haeremai.

(Come forward, visitors from afar, welcome, welcome.) (Tauroa & Tauroa, 1986, p.49)

Living together in the communal marae sometimes accessed early experiences of disconnection and not belonging, either to a family, or to a community with ancestral roots. For Maori the marae is important for a sense of identity and belonging, and this time-honoured feeling impacted on the students who went there.

As Linda said:

When I went to the marae I was a mess the whole day. I fell apart from the word go. I come from Scotland, and my family is Scottish. I think that we have a tribal background. When I look at my family tree, there is a lot in there about losing that. When I went to the marae it felt very holding, and it also felt very sad. Feeling the unity and looking at my family, and knowing that my family is very fragmented, it all came up for me at the marae.

The warmth and welcoming atmosphere, and the traditional cultural rituals of a nine day residential experience on the marae were significant for Maree:

I found to have the marae experiences and to experience the culture – for me was like in some ways I've been robbed of it through my life. I live in Aotearoa⁴⁷ and I didn't know much about the culture at all. It helped me to connect with my roots and cultural aspects as well. I just loved having Maori and marae experiences – the whole cultural experience. It gave me a deeper appreciation and compassion towards Maori culture and myself as well. The only way I can explain it is – by embracing and learning more about the Maori culture and being a part of it, I was helped to connect to my own roots. We have a lot to learn from Maori – you know their whole ancestral history and if we could embrace that, and bring it more into our trainings it would be brilliant.

Other participants spoke of how the marae stay gave a sense of equality and safety that encouraged intimacy, connection, and belonging:

The marae brings everyone together; they are all on the same footing. Yet each person brings their own uniqueness, their own specialness. (Marama)

On the marae you are sharing sleeping, physically taking your clothes off, it is like baring yourself in front of others, showing who you really are. There are opportunities to share in a way that you wouldn't have if you were in separate rooms. Because of the marae environment you know it is OK. You would never do this normally out in the ordinary world. It is really intimate. Everyone is on an equal footing. It gets rid of other stuff, removes the external side of people, the image they show. (Huia)

It made a difference being together for the ten days, really close. Even if we are not on the marae we are still held by the whanau⁴⁸ (of Hakomi). (J.B.)

My cultural awareness has been expanded dramatically. I gained knowledge and spiritual connection through *Noho Marae*⁴⁹ and learning *Te Reo*⁵⁰. (Judy)

I thought how am I going to manage? How would I get my space? But it actually was really great. I sung everyday and there was something special out there on the marae that just allowed me to bring myself forward more. I felt healthier and felt loved and a lot of healing happened there for me. And it was a very enjoyable time. EIT, that kind of institution, is great with all the facilities and everything, but for me personally I found the marae a nicer place to be in. To have healing and to have that kind of environment was special. I felt more connected with people, too. (Maree)

⁴⁷ Aotearoa – Maori name for New Zealand

⁴⁸ Whanau - family

⁴⁹ Noho Marae - staying over on the Marae

⁵⁰ Te Reo – the Maori language

Relationships contributed in an essential way to the safety and belonging in the training environment, and at times were also sources of confusion, stress and pain. It is through the relationships that the students have with those who guide them that the required transformation can happen, as stated by Stephen and Ondrea Levine (1984, p.ix):

Few recognize the enormous power of relationship as a vehicle for mutual healing – physical, emotional and spiritual.

Guides: love and relationship (*graduates' experiences*)

It is the task of the Teacher to set the heart aflame with an unquenchable fire of longing; it is his duty to keep it burning until it is reduced to ashes. For only a heart which has burned itself empty is capable of love. (Tweedie, 1979, p.169)

Teachers and therapists

The presence of teachers is central for students as they travel the landscape of their growth journeys. Participants described the shepherding and loving that teachers provided along the way; speaking of how this guidance was expressed; holding and containing during transition and upset, giving support and challenge, and showing acceptance and encouragement. Previous relationship experiences, especially during childhood, obviously impact on the way students perceive their teachers. However, students in psychotherapy trainings have significant relationships with their teachers and personal therapists, which I would argue is not solely *transferential* in nature. Participants report:

That's one of things about individual therapy; you get to show and to risk. It's safe and just the two of us and it's all enclosed and I could risk being myself. And then I could take that piece of growth, and take it into the group, and then risk that. And so I could test it out, expecting to be judged, and of course we had such a diverse range of people. That was really amazing, I'm grateful that I got to do that. (Bonnie)

So then I started going to my therapist and she was an absolute gift. She gave so much to me by just *being* who she was. (Judy)

The programme coordinator was like a mother hen who gathered us all around her in a warm and supportive way. (Sarah)

In revisiting my journey through psychotherapy I very much appreciate one of my tutors for being such an influential part of my journey. I do not have the words to honour her for all she taught me, and saying thank you seems so insignificant, but it would come from my heart. (Judy)

In my experience as a teacher of psychotherapy the emotional responses of students towards myself and other teachers have often been more intense than those I have experienced from clients in the more contained environment of psychotherapy practice. Relationships with peers are also an influential part of the journey.

The group

Many participants spontaneously spoke of the experiential group (a part of most training programmes) as being particularly formative:

It was overwhelming sometimes hearing people's stories. I looked forward to going and I dreaded it too. It was all right when I got there. People's real sharing, them crying their eyes out. I didn't feel so alone. (Huia)

I remember asking in group one day, "where is the love in this place?" I expressed my need and my emotions and was met by a sense of almost repulsion. Great learning in all of this for me, though it didn't feel like it at the time! (Sarah)

I hold specifically the two group facilitators dear in my heart. (Kerry)

It was it really scary, the first few weeks in group, it was horrendous. I would go home and I would go over everything that everyone said. In that first year group I was stressed and felt threatened, and I think I was frozen and I couldn't speak when I wanted to speak. It took a while until I found my voice then I didn't shut up! I can say group was just fundamental in my personal growth. (Bonnie)

Group therapy helped as well – it had to be from a Maori perspective though. Empathy and understanding and *aroha*⁵¹ were there. (Marama)

I know I came up absolute loggerheads with a male group member, and I felt quite okay with that. And that was a good interchange. I was able to hold my own and say what I wanted and he was able to sit back and didn't take it personally. (Judy)

Yes, group was a good experience. I think it is a necessary experience. A good facilitator helps. If you stop the group therapy you make things far too easy for the people who are not working on themselves. I think it is good. (Anna)

I think the value of group depends a lot on the facilitators' skills. Some facilitators did not intervene enough, and more challenge would have been helpful. I found group frustrating at times. I also felt that there was a lack of introduction or induction to assist peoples' understanding of what 'group' is or how the process could be utilised better, things were left to "happen" and not followed up on appropriately. (David)

I was always really conscious of being too much.... being too forward in the group. And I think it was being able to voice things that has been incredibly important, being able to speak out. It's been healing for me to be able to express myself, because when I've done that something's happened within me. (Maree)

Relationship and longing

The level of relationship offered by teachers can be emotionally accessing and destabilising for the student.

Bonnie said that the intimacy was a challenge:

I think just the contact, the level of contact and having to look at myself.

Judy commented:

It was a real shock meeting sensitive people, meeting emotionally intelligent people – because I'd never been introduced to those people before.

The evocation of old longings can be an ache. Gibran (2003, p.12) describes it thus:

To know the pain of too much tenderness.

⁵¹ *aroha* -love, for a discussion on the meaning of *aroha* in relation to *love* see Appendix J

Psychotherapy teaching staff tend to be less provocative than Tweedie's (1979) guru, whom she described as using 'violent reproof, even aggression', but are possibly not as purposeful around the power of love as a catalyst for change and growth. Fritz Perls, however, offered psychotherapy training in his earlier days that was deliberately provocative in a similar way to that described by Tweedie. Schiffman (1971, p.4), a student of Perls, comments:

I longed for his love which he consistently withheld.

Schiffman writes that even Fritz acknowledged that he gone too far and been too cruel. People can grow, like Schiffman, from experiences of 'unlove', but can also be left with wounds that keep them immobilized, and which inhibit growth processes. Being deliberately unkind can so easily serve the narcissistic needs of the person in power, rather than being truly intended for the well-being of the recipient.

Love says no

As discussed in the previous chapter, the harder face of love often does not feel loving at all, as every parent knows. The *no*, given with loving intention may not be experienced as love, in contrast to the softer surrender of the *yes*, which usually feels much more pleasurable and caring. When the parent, or the psychotherapy teacher, is wise, and truly has the well-being of the child, or student, in mind, it is sometimes necessary to set a boundary, to turn down a request, and to refuse nurture or the soothing of pain. Providing nurturing or challenging interventions will be more effective if they are within the 'zone of development' as described by Lev Vygotsky (1986), where what is possible in the way of growth is stimulated by the interaction with a more experienced person. Leslie Greenberg (2002) explains it his way:

If one makes suggestions that are too far ahead of what people can do, those people cannot use the input. However, if one makes suggestions in a zone close to, but just ahead of, people's current state, the suggestion provides a scaffold of possibility that gives those people a structure to facilitate forward movement (p.xi).

Kegan (1982), similarly, claimed that for facilitation of optimum development, there needs to be sufficient holding, which could be seen as the accepting, feminine, nature of love, along with a carefully timed challenging of, even demanding that, the person show a new or different behaviour. This is the more forceful, masculine demonstration of love. Teachers are not acting in the best interest of the students; being truly loving of them, if they encourage idealisation, turning their trainees into 'clones' of themselves, dependent and lacking in creativity and confidence to express their own unique style. As John Karter (2002, p.16) says:

The whole of training could be summarized as a constant balancing act between the opinions, teachings and demands of tutors and supervisors, and the need to maintain a core self. In other words, allowing as little as possible of our

personal qualities, attributes, and spontaneity to be gradually eroded like the drip-drip process of water wearing away stone.

Participants were sensitive to this dimension of the education process, speaking about times when they felt undermined, and occasions when they were encouraged to be themselves:

This therapist at times instead offered “expert” opinions which I did not find particularly helpful, as I felt that I was not being listened to, and also it felt a little disempowering. (David)

I had a lot of trust in my tutor. She was a very experienced therapist. She was gentle with me. She kept herself quite well back and let me do what I needed to do. (Linda)

A senior teacher of psychotherapy I interviewed, Joan, ponders this issue:

(The teacher) who became the idealised, transference object, was one who gave focused attention, loved unconditionally, and could offer understanding and validation. As well (he or she needed to) ensure the other had self efficacy, peership, and enough adversarial experiences, which in turn enabled individuation. Maybe this is the ultimate expression of LOVE⁵²; (to assist someone to) be individuated yet interdependent with another.

Scott Peck (1978) explores the art of loving in confrontation and leadership. He details the balance of self-searching, humility, risk and courage involved, and comments that most teachers are not sufficiently self-aware to lovingly guide their students. He says (p.165):

When we confront or criticize someone it is because we want to change the course of the person's life. ... (One) must concern themselves with this art ... if one desires to nurture another's spiritual growth. ... To confront someone with something he or she cannot handle will at best be a waste of time, and likely will have a deleterious effect. If we are to be heard we must speak in a language the listener can understand ... Only out of the humility of love can humans dare to be God.

The pain of the no

Gibran's *Prophet* (2003, p.11) speaks of the vulnerability and pain that can result from this harder function of love:

For even as love crowns you so shall he crucify you. Even as he is for your growth so is he for your pruning...He threshes you to make you naked.

Tweedie (1979, p.104), on her spiritual pilgrimage, begs her guru for care, love, and he refuses to give it, challenging her instead:

“Please help me! I am so confused!” “Why should I?” He looked straight at me. “If I begin to help you will ask again and again for help: how will you cross the stream? You must do it yourself, I will not help. ... My harsh words help you, my sweetness never will.” ... I could not conceal my disappointment; how disheartened it made me feel.

Unfinished business

Some of the painful relationship difficulties that occur for students in trainings could be a result of this tough function of love. There may have been a truly loving facilitation of growth by trainers, even when

⁵² capitals in original communication

students haven't experienced it this way. It is also possible, however, that teachers will respond to students defensively, confrontations arising out of their own unresolved 'wounds', in what would usually be called *negative counter-transference*. In the interviews participants described at length experiences that still carried strong emotional charge for them:

I had a bad experience with my first therapist at the start of my psychotherapy training. I felt that I asked the therapist some reasonable questions, and he became really angry. I tried to address the matter without much success. Later the therapist told the teaching staff that I was unsuitable to train in psychotherapy. This was extremely upsetting to me. The anger I saw in the therapist was a trauma trigger for me, related to my experience of someone trying to strangle me. I did try to talk to the psychotherapy tutors about it, but I felt not really believed. I was not validated at all. I was told, "We hear what you are saying" as though my perspective was not a true one. (David)

The tutor tried to stay as neutral as she could – but we thought, why is she allowing this? (Huia)

My first therapist was not the best person for me. She used to write notes, and she used to get up make herself a cup of tea in the middle of the session, and never offer one to me – so I felt a bit weird. She would say things to me like – you've obviously had a lot of trauma in your life – and I've dealt with trauma that is far worse than yours, and she would start to get graphic. And then she told me that I made very bad choices with men in my life – namely my husband and my son. (Judy)

I had to write an assignment about the story of my life. What I realise now is that I thought I would be able to write the story and hide a lot of things. Luckily for me I had one tutor in particular, who said, "You've written a lovely story. Now go and write the real story!" It was absolutely devastating, a huge narcissistic wound for me. But I was very grateful that she could see I had a huge adaptive self, that I did what I thought was expected. That was very painful, but I did go away and I did write the real story. (Linda)

I had to repeat a year. The night before I was told I had spoken to the tutor, because two weeks earlier, intuitively I felt that I wasn't going to get through, and she said, "Well, what indications do you have of that?" And I said, "None, I just know". The night before my interview I said to the group facilitator, "Have I got anything to worry about tomorrow?" She said "Judy, if you've got anything to worry about we would have told you". That was what pushed me into the foetal position; it was the fact that once again people weren't honest with me. Not because of being slowed down, but because of the manner in which it was done. What it did teach me, and what I've worked with a lot since, is to trust that intuition, that gut feeling of what is happening. It just seemed like another one of those 'bad things happen to bad people' kind of experiences. (Judy)

Programme differences

Training staff operate under less clearly defined boundaries than do therapists, and are perhaps less consistent, and less deliberately loving with their students, than a psychotherapist is with clients. Traditionally psychotherapists have clear guidelines around the boundaries which provide a containing frame for the therapy. As Carolyn Quadrio (2004, p.28) says:

The *affective hold*⁵³ creates a holding environment, the secure and reliable relationship with the therapist which, when framed in a particular way, becomes a source of security for the patient who is free to express whatever thoughts or feelings as she wishes. It is clearly distinguished from social relationships.

⁵³ italics in original

The 'affective hold' in training will be less secure than in therapy. However, it is clear from my experience, and the responses of the participants, that personal growth does occur within the training environment, as well as a result of concurrent personal therapy. Some training programmes provide a more intense container and more consistent personal relationships between teachers and students than others. Participants commented:

Hakomi training models away of being with another. Trainers, teachers and tutors hold the group in a very warm attentive and loving way, which creates a culture that models the therapeutic relationship. (Sarah)

Personal development support is built into Maori courses. (Huia)

My main learning in my Maori course was about respect, empathy. There was so much nurturing, embracing, hospitality, all that supportive stuff. (Marama)

I'm horrified that the course has changed in manner in which it has (from the more personal and contained diploma to a degree). I don't feel the degree programme was supportive enough — maybe the Hakomi course was because it was a more holding environment. (Judy)

If you are asked to be so open and trusting of the process, the programme should be structured in such a way that they constantly have to give you support. It's not the student's position to say you are not giving me enough support. I think it should be in place. It's like, in my experience, it was not sufficiently there. (Anna)

The Psychotherapy Diploma, some Maori courses, and Hakomi, have been experienced as more containing by students and teachers, compared to psychotherapy or clinical psychology degree courses. (Some of the interviewees experienced a number of programmes, and others have completed psychotherapy degree courses, and/or Hakomi, and/or Maori trainings.)

Guides: love and relationship (*trainers' experiences*)

In my personal relations with students, in training groups and workshops, once this (loving presence) field is energized and made present, everything else comes alive with pleasure and accomplishment. Whenever a teacher brings this force into being and it spreads through the group and is shared between participants, learning and growth are very much enhanced. (Ron Kurtz, founder of Hakomi Psychotherapy — personal communication)

Given that the role of teachers is seen by students as so important in guiding and containing personal growth along the way, it would seem that they require their own preparation, personal development and support to carry this function. As the poet Rilke (Bly, 1981) says:

For one human being to love another being: that is perhaps the most difficult task that has been entrusted to us, the ultimate task, the final test and proof, the work for which all other work is preparation.

We don't talk of love

As discussed in the last chapter, teachers said that the word *love* is seldom used in their training environments. A number, when directly questioned about love, chose to respond using the more commonly used terminology:

No, that word (love) would not come to mind for me. When thinking about my feelings for certain students, I have care, empathy, supportive feelings for some more than others. I think that the students want to be special and can have a transference relationship with the tutors like clients can have with their therapist. This could be described as love or on a continuum of love. The training programme covers the different transference feelings in the training and in supervision. (Pamela⁵⁴ – Psychotherapy trainer – private institute)

Transference, counter-transference and projection have been part of my trainings, along with maintaining safe, ethical and professional boundaries. (Anihana - teacher in degree and Hakomi programmes)

Transference or love

In keeping with the accepted parlance, psychotherapy teachers feeling love from, and for, their students might think in terms of idealising transference, as described by the teacher, Joan, cited earlier, which then elicits a corresponding *countertransference* response. However as Joan expressed it, managing the idealisation, accepting the transference aspect, and moving beyond it into the domain of *love*, is maybe what is called forth from a wise, compassionate trainer in psychotherapy. Reduction of the process into *transference* could be way of attempting to package and control a deep and mysterious feeling/relationship into something more tidy and professional. The use of this ‘professional’ language has a distancing effect. Joan recognised the intimacy involved in teacher-student relating, and describes it in experience-near language when she says:

My experience of loving students is that I "hold" them in my being, think of them often, reflect on their struggles, think of how I may be alongside them; it is much the same way that I "hold" my children and loved ones. I enjoy their joys and feel their struggles as if they are my own, while paradoxically holding in tension that they are separate beings from me. I experience them connected to me, and I to them, in the Buber way of I/Thou; both of us involved in a common human struggle. I know now, because they have told me so, that they too held me within their being.

In this sense then of course LOVE⁵⁵ will assist any student with their personal growth and me with mine. In the intersubjective field both of us are transformed.

Love for students

Nearly all teachers I interviewed felt some kind of love for their students. They talked of this *love* experience, and attempted to describe it in words:

I think of my feelings for my students as love. It is a particular form of love...intimate and similar and significantly different from the intimacy of a sexual relationship. More like transpersonal love with a personal flavor. (Cedar – USA Hakomi Trainer)

I ‘love being with’ students and I’m touched often by their experiences of the teaching, their learning, the stories they bring, their relationships with each other, with myself and the training team. I would not have considered saying I ‘love’ any particular student though. Again though, saying I *love* them is not something I would actually have considered. So I’m wondering about that now? (Anihana - teacher in degree and Hakomi programmes)

⁵⁴ pseudonym

⁵⁵ capitals in original communication

I often feel that we are participating in each other's lives in some profound and awesome way. Mind you, there are days when I don't like them very much - days when I tire of the pain of transference; of not being seen for who I am...However, the experience is a privilege. It keeps me humble. Somewhere along the way I realized I was in for the long haul with my students - that I was committed to the joy and the pain of walking with them on this leg of their journey. (Verona – teacher in degree programme)

Yes I do love my students. It goes beyond the personal. It has a timeless, sweet and nourishing quality. I am not going home with them, which makes it easier. (Daniel⁵⁶ – USA Hakomi trainer)

I love the students with whom I worked. It has been a painful, difficult, conflicting, joyful and a life enhancing experience for me. (Joan – teacher in degree programme)

It is an impersonal kind of love. It is close to really seeing and knowing someone so you can understand them in a compassionate way. This can be extended to almost anyone. (This love) is very nourishing and heartwarming for me. I feel at home. This love feels very wide, fulfilling, rewarding, and without personal needs. (Halko – Germany Hakomi Trainer)

Another teacher, in contrast, said:

Whilst I care for all of my students, and care deeply for some of them, I wouldn't describe this as love. For me love has to come from the heart and be much more personal than the loving presence that teachers give students. ... Love includes a personal and passionate caring for another, a caring that is not predicated on a financial relationship, and that calls forth the willingness to sacrifice self to some extent for the other. I've not witnessed this love between teachers and students in any of the trainings I've participated in. (Neil – teacher in university programme and Hakomi)

Teachers were asked if they had been trained or adequately prepared for their role in managing the complexity of the many dimensions of love in the education of psychotherapists. Mostly they did not think so:

I was not officially taught, or officially prepared for love as part of training people. I do feel prepared, by my life's experience, and my own experiences of love from teachers, mentors etc in my past, to deal with the feelings that come up in students. (Beth – Canada Hakomi Trainer)

When I was going through my training program as a graduate student, no way. This is one of the reasons that I train my students in it; in how to cultivate this love, and how to manage it, and how to discern romantic love from therapeutic love. (Manuela – San Francisco - trainer in Hakomi and teacher in university psychotherapy programme)

I was not at all prepared. (Cedar – USA Hakomi Trainer)

Not so much, but I have not found it hard to manage. It is a gift. (Daniel⁵⁷ – USA Hakomi trainer)

I have now been prepared by my own experience. I wasn't well prepared. (Joan – teacher in degree programme)

One teacher, Verona, cited an important experience that formed part of her preparation:

Yes I was prepared, and I have never forgotten it - It has been invaluable to my work. One experience in particular comes to mind: I was asking a supervision-type question of one of my teachers. I named an attraction I felt for one of my clients. She invited me to see him in my mind's eye; to feel all that I felt for him and think of all the things I loved about him. And then she asked me to just love him, right then and there, feel my love for him. Well, the room got all bright and my heart felt warm and she said, "What is it you want from him?" My answer was,

⁵⁶ pseudonym

⁵⁷ pseudonym

"Nothing" and in that moment I felt released from my fears and worries and expectations and guilt. And the next time I saw him I knew that I just loved him and enjoyed the truth of that.

Even though teachers talked of experiencing love for their students, they also expressed some cautions, speaking of ethical issues, the particular nature of the educational relationship, and the need for boundaries.

Misuse of love

Psychotherapy trainers were aware of the multifaceted nature of love, and the potential for students to be harmed by distorted expressions of love, including the misuse of power in the training setting:

The word can be highly charged with lots of different expectations, emotional baggage, etc. (Verona — teacher in degree programme)

There is the power differential between therapist and client yet both are incredibly vulnerable to the LOVE⁵⁸ implicit between them; the therapist is limited in what s/he may articulate about the experience of loving so that the relationship doesn't collapse into a mutual *social* love relationship. ... Some of my trainers were abusive of love in their inability to articulate and manage its expression within training programmes of which I was once part. I was hurt. (Joan — teacher in degree programme)

I am also careful about a boundary of this teacher-love as I don't feel it should serve my needs so to speak. The love I feel for the students is more a deep appreciation for their struggles and learning and magic of their transformation. In that regard I am very protective of that space for them and me. I feel that I have to be mindful of my love and care for the students as this territory can evoke jealousies projections etc. (Manuela — San Francisco - trainer in Hakomi and teacher in university psychotherapy programme)

I understand how easy it is for charismatic leaders to get love confused and make serious ethical mistakes. ... I feel wariness about using the term *love* because it can be so easily misunderstood. I used to feel wary about feeling it for my students, but I don't any more. I am so clear about how I use love and how I'm tracking for responses from my students, and how I handle their confusion if it comes up, that I know my students are safe with my love and their love for me. (Cedar — USA Hakomi Trainer)

Loving presence

Even when love is not written specifically into the curriculum for psychotherapy education, the teachers and graduates of psychotherapy programmes that I spoke with overwhelmingly agreed on the importance of loving relationships for facilitating the personal development of psychotherapists. Ron Kurtz in his current training programmes, focuses on fostering the ability of students to be in loving presence with another. He describes what he means by *loving presence*:

Being with a person who is experienced as both present and caring would seem to me to be a completely natural and effective context for learning to occur. I talk about loving presence this way: it would not be far from the truth to say it is a field — a field of emotional energy, carried perhaps by pheromones, a gentle touch, or the limbic system resonances generated by the body, face and voice of another, or even by the electromagnetic waves passing from one

⁵⁸ capitals in original communication

heart and mind to another. Loving presence places a field around the other, a field that holds the pure intention to protect, to care for, and to help with another's healing. I didn't say it originally, but I might just as well have, *to help with another's growth*. (personal communication)

Halko Weiss, senior Hakomi trainer talks of loving presence as it is taught in Hakomi trainings:

The term "feelings of love" is not the same as "loving presence" which is part of a state of being that we are trying to teach students. This is supported by a very deliberate and elaborate curriculum. Students are encouraged to find, and taught to know, a state that is similar to loving someone. This state of being is a core piece of the curriculum. It is a learned state, just like every other state a human has available. We seek and find it mostly through indirect pathways, like learning certain techniques that only work from that space. Almost all of our students find that state of loving presence easy to identify and know once they have experienced it. It is very rare that someone gets confused about it.

In Hakomi teaching students to be in loving presence with clients occurs in the context of trainers aiming to be in loving presence with students. Contributing to safety and the provision of a developmentally appropriate, loving relationship that facilitates growth is what Winnicott (1965) called a facilitating environment, or *holding*. This is vital for healthy development in infants, and according to Kegan (1982), the need for a holding environment continues into adult life.

Holding

For many years I have been studying the processes of growth, how we can evolve, have better relations with others, free ourselves of our blocks, enjoy beauty. I have concluded that we cannot grow deliberately. It happens by itself, like a flower that opens, or a seed that sprouts. However, the right conditions must be there. (Ferruci, 2002, p.161)

In my personal case I was without family, no family here, I was by myself. (Anna)

People are born into relationships, and develop in them. (Greenberg, 2002, p.73)

Hard to hold

Winnicott (Rappaport, 1999, pp.195-196) identified the elements that a mother provides when she creates a holding environment; allowing safe exploration, standing by while also participating, fostering relaxed separateness within the relationship, coming to terms with her own frustrations and hatred, and resiliently surviving the child's aggression. These attributes can be translated into the holding environment of psychotherapy and psychotherapy training. However, the holding function within psychotherapy training is, I believe, not easy to maintain, particularly in degree programmes. The student group is not the same for all classes, as students take a variety of papers. The institution as a whole is more focused on academic achievement than on personal growth.

For holding to occur in a 'good-enough' manner there need to be consistent, supportive relationships between students and teachers that allow for an intimate knowledge by the staff of the growth processes of each student, as well as trust from the students towards their teachers. This holding is in a blurry domain, somewhere between that of a psychotherapy relationship and a collegial social relationship. With larger classes, and high work-load demands on teaching staff, providing the developmentally correct degree of holding, with compassion and love, is likely to be difficult. The trainers in psychotherapy I spoke with were aware of this difficulty. One teacher who had taught in the smaller, more personal diploma programme before it transitioned to a degree said:

My experience was that a heart-based approach was, at one time, more openly and directly supported by the institution I work for. I had the sense of working in a valued and supported Psychotherapy Diploma programme that felt like a tightly woven basket; one that held the students in the tension of personal discovery and growth and the acquisition of theory and skills. This has changed as the institution has become less tolerant of a more 'heart-based' approach existing within its profit/competition-based approach. Currently, hiring decisions, administrative, educational decisions seem based on competition and increased profit versus anything resembling love. It is my sense that that idea would be scoffed at and ridiculed.

A need to be held

A number of the graduates interviewed spoke specifically about safety and holding. J.B. said in response to a question about what helped her in her journey:

The whole container, feeling, knowing that there were people in the group I could trust; trust that they were going to hold us all. There was a sense of safety; trust and safety. I had trust in competency of the teachers. There were some rocky times though. There is not the same sense of safety in the degree programme. There are supportive tutors, but it's not the same (as in Hakomi).

The first year was a very protective stage, everyone being very concerned. (Anna)

Some participants talked about wanting more 'holding' and found it hard to ask for this:

I did not feel supported, at times, through this distress by some tutors and felt a discomfort at requesting personal interview times to discuss any issues which arose. (Judy)

I think a lot of people get a lot of support if they are struggling. I don't allow myself to struggle so I didn't get much help. It was very competitive around getting your needs met. We were like five year olds. It was hard to get your own needs met. I did have good friends, and a therapist, but I would have liked the course to have held something. I don't think the course did that very well. Basically it is expected that you find your own way. I think I probably needed a lot of parenting. But I don't come across like that. I would not have asked for it. I would have liked someone to notice, see if they could take care of me, and ask me what I needed. I shouldn't have had to ask for it. That is what I would have liked. I think you need more mentoring; someone to tell me that I was doing OK. (Linda)

I didn't receive as much support as others were receiving I thought. I didn't have the courage to ask for it. I was hoping it would be noticed. I didn't go to (a particular tutor) for support when she was a tutor on my training, as she was there for everyone. At times I needed support with her especially (because she was Maori). I did find some support from the other tutors. One time I asked for it and didn't get it. That was hard. Other people got lots it seemed to me. It was really difficult to ask for help. People were too busy. That put me off. I got resentful towards the end. (Huia)

I didn't feel there was any kind of holding when we'd do experiential exercises and they would be very triggering. And whether it was just my experience that I'm used to stuffing so I would stuff it, and I would be absolutely thrown by it, and think of it as my own small limits of competency rather than the content of the course that was affecting me. (Judy)

It is clear from the participants' responses that being held within the training is important for them. How much support is actually needed for development, in contrast to being wanted, is a consideration. Sometimes students who are regressed and vulnerable may want more holding than is feasible. At times it could be beneficial for them to have more support than can be realistically provided, and at other times growth comes from finding their own resources. It can be a hard call for trainers to assess the real need, as well as to balance their own well-being with what can be given out to students.

A physical home

As noted earlier the marae was experienced as a safe, holding environment. The physical environment as a contributor to the safety and holding was significant for the participants. I noticed in my teaching on the psychotherapy diploma course that when we went from using scattered classrooms that 'belonged' to other programmes, to having our own specialist suite of rooms the students seemed more settled, and frequently expressed their appreciation of having a 'home'. One participant, Anna, found it very hard when her course changed locations on the campus:

We were in one block in the first year and then when we moved to another block at the very end of the whole campus. I didn't like it. The place looked abandoned. It was very dirty. All the cupboards were falling apart. I think it was a reflection of how I was feeling. If I was feeling better I probably wouldn't have minded so much about the place. That bit was very hard. The whole thing about changing blocks for me was for me a huge issue. I could never get over that. We had a welcome in the old block. That was my very first experience of anything Maori. The very first day of class they were calling us in. And so I got into that first year feeling that this was a special place, and then suddenly everything changed.

As well as relationships, the structure of the course; topics taught, formation of classes, continuity of teachers and peer groups all contribute to forming the landscape through which the student traverses.

Course structure

While essays and case studies are arguably less demanding than dissertations, many fellow students I encountered during my own training seemed to approach them with as much relish as they would having to climb the north face of the Eiger without crampons. (Karter, 2002, p.71)

Along with personal growth facilitation, psychotherapy training involves the more academic teaching of theory, and skills training. As discussed in the literature review, some decry the increasing emphasis on

theoretical subjects and techniques. Tom Lewis, psychiatrist, psychotherapist, and author on the topic of love, said (personal communication) that in the United States psychiatry interns are educated with an emphasis on intellectual knowledge, and are actively encouraged not to be empathic with their patients.

The participant, Isobel, who completed a clinical psychology degree, said that the majority of the teaching was theoretical, and the most important outcome was your academic grade. She said of her experience:

On hindsight it seems like a whole lot of academic work and not much practice. And definitely nothing about who you are as a therapist. You have to have objective measures. You have to have a battery of questionnaires. It was not about the person, it was about their anxiety disorder, or depression. What do you do for OCD? Go to this book, follow these steps. It was very much like a person had a physical problem — a broken leg — this is what you do to fix it.

However, in the experience of the participants on psychotherapy training programmes, personal development *was* emphasized as important:

One of the other things I liked about the training was the lovely way in which it embraced and held those parts that aren't verbal; the real sensitivity around the non-intellectual. I loved all the lectures, all the information. I love knowledge. I love information, but the actual work for me happened in those non-verbal moments, in those spaces when there weren't any words; in that silent place. (Maree)

The varying strands of the curriculum, skills, theory, and personal development were not perceived to be discrete. A theory class can stimulate painful material; in fact it may be designed to do so. Participants found personal issues frequently arose from class exercises:

Once I done the first few weeks of the programme there was drawing the genogram, and doing the human development essay. ... How much they brought up for me. How ill-equipped I felt to deal with what was coming up! (Linda)

New things every day it would be, things like family systems therapy. I used to think about families and I had blamed lots of things on myself. I had never seen the bigger picture for a lot of things. Things like social constructionism, and seeing myself in context, seeing myself in a social context, especially with my eating disorder. Seeing myself in context, being socially influenced, and I had been thinking of myself as a free-willed independent person making all these choices by myself. (Bonnie)

I had quite a strong reaction to doing a dynamic formulation on people; putting people into boxes and categories. It used to bring up a lot for me, related to my own family at home. I felt quite fragile at times. (Linda)

Participants sometimes discovered that the more academic part of the programme provided a welcome relief from personal exploration, as it restored a sense of competence and self-esteem.

I wanted to understand why I was affected so much. All of that was in my dissertation which I started in the second year. And I liked that, the academic challenge of it. And it was a distraction for me. It helped me feel more grown-up, because I was quite regressed in therapy as a client. (Linda)

Others valued the components of the course that were more practical or academic:

After doing Hakomi and not knowing what was being talked about at times, I did the degree to get the whole different language. (J.B.)

We also learned about computers etc, things that are relevant to today's world. (Marama)

In contrast to the other participants, Anna felt that there wasn't enough theory:

I think that now I have finished the whole course I do not have enough theory. I don't think I have learned enough from the theoretical point of view. Well I came from a very strict academic framework previously, where you have to do loads of written assignments and exams that we didn't have in this course. So it was easier in some ways. I didn't find it that demanding but yes, sometimes, I was emotionally all over the place, and then having to sit down and concentrate was hard. That was very hard because to be in the right frame of mind. But, I couldn't suggest that there should be less.

Bonnie, in common with others, felt that all the classes worked together for learning, healing and integration:

The classes trigger off your personal stuff; my personal therapy helped me contain that, make sense of it, access and deepen it. The group therapy helped me do that as well, and bring what I had learned back into my life, like how I belong. I couldn't initially make sense of my own stuff. The theory triggered and accessed some material and then I was able to understand it. In a bigger picture sense, it is especially important for my work with clients to have a theoretical base. My own experience and my own therapy helped cement the theory. When I get there I see it, and I know that I know it, that I have my own experience of it.

As Bonnie says, the experiential dimension is like 'cement'. Levine & Levine (1984, p.42) also express this similarly:

In ancient Chinese the ideogram for heart and mind is the same. Relationship is the practice of not only knowing but directly experiencing this truth. Understanding is not enough. It is only the beginning. Relationship takes our understanding to the solid ground of being.

Conclusion

For the participants in this study, loving relationships in the training environment, including personal therapy and experiential group, and the effects of these relationships, were seen as instrumental in allowing the somewhat tumultuous journey of personal growth to proceed. Porges' work (2006) on the social engagement system shows that to self-reflect, be vulnerable, relate openly, and empathise, one has to be in a calm behavioural state, and feel safe. If *love* is indeed the alchemical factor in stimulating personal growth, then it would appear that there is a certain lack of clarity, and lack of courage maybe, in building *love* as a *process* into course structure, and as a *topic* within the curriculum. Loving guidance required at different developmental stages would need to be expressed differently which requires awareness of adult developmental stages and their relationship to psychotherapy modalities and practice. Teachers I spoke with were generally excited by the questions concerning love and personal growth, and had many experiences and opinions to

share. However, a number declared that the institutions where the trainings occurred do not, or would not, support including *love* as a deliberately named educational process or topic.

From reading the responses of the participants, and developmental theory, I wonder whether or not the education process and environment can realistically be fashioned particular to the individual student's needs? Can the *learning territory* for psychotherapy trainees be made both safe and challenging, so that it is not too rough, or smooth, in order for the student to successfully deal with *baggage* carried? Do psychotherapy programmes provide appropriate support for individual students at differing levels of development, from within the programme itself, as well as encouraging students to use outside support? Does the education process give sufficiently 'good-enough' holding, therefore providing the developmentally correct 'culture of embeddedness' (Kegan, 1982) that facilitates growth?

However, in spite of the potential difficulties and confusion around the topic, psychotherapy programmes are doing something that is perceived to be working well. Participants overwhelmingly described their personal growth journeys as positive, with a sense of *coming home* to increased personal and professional capacity and well-being.

Love is the cure,
for your pain will keep giving birth to more pain
until your eyes constantly exhale love
as effortlessly as your body yields its scent.
(Ladinsky, 2002)⁵⁹

Chapter Six: Leaving Home, Coming Home

⁵⁹ poem from personal collection, reference not known

Kia hora te marino, kia whakapapa pounamu te moana, kia tere te kārohirohi I mua i Ō koutou huarahi

(May the calm be widespread, may the sea be as the smooth surface of the greenstone and may the rays of sunshine forever dance along your pathway.)

Introduction

Make strong the cord
Which binds the canoe,
We are sailing home.

The storm
Which swamped our peaceful voyage
Is behind us now.

The wind lashed
The waves pounded,
But we did not go down.

Make strong the cord
Which binds the canoe,
We are sailing home. Joe Balaz ((Wendt et al., 2003, p.7)

The participants all arrived at their destinations; completing their psychotherapy trainings. For some the training context had become like another family and finishing meant *leaving home*. This brought up mixed emotions; relief at finishing and gratitude for the gains experienced, contrasted with sadness and feelings of isolation and abandonment. It took some time to settle. A number felt that the personal growth journey within the training context had resulted in a *coming home*. However, the homecoming was not experienced as a place of stagnation, as they acknowledged the personal growth journey is an ongoing progression. This would be supported by Ernesto Spinelli (Sullivan, 2005), a British existential psychotherapist who believes that ongoing personal change is essential for a psychotherapist to remain open and continue to be effective. In this place; a home re-claimed, or found for the first time, the participants reflected on the personal growth process they had experienced, and the meaning it had for them.

What does it all mean?

When we stumble in darkness the heart makes our meaning
And offers it to life and creation
That we may give meaning to life and creation
For we only give meaning we do not find meaning
The thing we can't find is the thing we shall give
To make love complete and honour creation (Leunig, 1990)⁶⁰

Human beings integrate by reflecting, finding significance and putting experience into words; to create and convey meaning within themselves and with others. A number of participants said that telling their stories during the interviews helped with this integration process. The interviews had become part of the journey

⁶⁰ no page numbers in original book

itself; a step deeper into the settled dwelling place where they could both savour the fruits gathered on the path and ponder any regrets.

I think it has been good for me to do this. It has made me realise lots; I am starting to give myself credit for how far I've come, how much effort I have put into it. (Bonnie)

It was good

The graduates in my study were very enthusiastic about the personal growth that occurred for them in their training. This is echoed by the positively perceived outcomes as shared by the participants in Karter's (2002) book:

I feel better equipped for life! I understand myself and I have a better understanding and tolerance of others. (Alan, p.32)

I am happier, calmer and generally enjoy my life much more – I am more fulfilled. I have lost the feeling of being a victim, I am more outspoken about my needs. (Sandra, p.33)

I am happy now to be 'good enough' (Jane, p.33)

Participants in this research reflected upon their personal growth. For virtually all it was a *good experience*:

It was a growing experience, it was a very good experience overall. (Anna)

I am pleased with these changes in myself. (David)

It wasn't just learning and education, it was life altering, life changing. (Bonnie)

The personal growth was not a bad thing. Not a bad thing at all. It was a good thing. I started to have a feeling about me. I was looking at me and not at other people. It was important to look at myself. (J.B.)

The mixed experience of leaving

A number of participants talked about how hard it was to leave the container of the training. For some it felt too abrupt, and it was challenging to make the transition to a separate, more *adult* life. Linda said:

It was really hard to leave AUT. They wanted some people to take tutor groups and I did one of those. It was really nice to go back to the campus. So I hung around for as long as I could really. I felt quite bereft when I left. It was really hard to go. It was a little world of its own there. I missed the lecturers. We didn't really have a ritual when we left. We had a cup of tea, a morning tea. But it didn't feel like enough. Suddenly we were grown up. The tutors were saying what are you going to do now? It would be nice to go back and see people. It is so intimate and then it's not there. Like my own family dynamics. I didn't feel like I had a good ending.

Some saw the developmental journey as parallel to an age development, experiencing themselves moving from child in the first year, to adolescent, then to adult at the end. The timing of the programme did not always

match their perception of their readiness to move to the next stage. Transitioning from the first year to working with clients on the second year felt too big a jump for Anna:

They send you to your placement...well you are grown-up, go! Compare it with a collage of different textures and colours. In the first year they ask you to put all your parts on the table and observe them and study them. But In the second year before you have the collage eorganized again you have to go, and be reliable. I don't think I was supported. It takes some time to process the inner work. It was like finishing childhood, you don't go from being a child to being an adult.

Judy, a woman with grandchildren, noticed that she was going into an adolescent phase in the middle of her training. It was however an experience she enjoyed, even though her husband found it difficult to understand or be with:

It was making new friends in the second year I joined with. They were very social, which the class I started with weren't. And we had a lot of parties and there was a lot of substances smoked which I'd never been around— I'd always been a good girl. It was an adolescence I'd never had. (Judy)

Linda felt she finished the course before she was grown-up, and she was out on her own, still a teenager:

I think the teenage thing wasn't done very well. I was not checked in with enough. It is hard seeing the tutors from the course outside. It is like you are gone now; they are not interested in you.

Anna also felt the ending was hard:

It wasn't very nice that we didn't have an ending. That is what is missing. One day it was finished. I am not enjoying that. I do not like that. Now you are grown up. Look after yourself. I think endings should be a meaningful thing. Some people had finished first, some people had already left. You have to find your own way to insert yourself into the community of psychotherapists.

In Hakomi trainings graduates can volunteer to be assistants on the next training. Taking on this role helps some to deal with completing the training before they feel ready to leave. It was so for J.B. who said, when asked if her three year training was long enough for her personal growth journey:

No! That's why I signed up as a tutor. I came from a clean slate. I had had no tertiary experience.

Winds of change.

I have come really, really far, I've come a long way. I definitely have changed, incredibly. (Bonnie)

On reflection, participants were aware that the winds of change had truly blown through their inner and outer worlds. They reported many personal changes that they felt were for the better; were part of a

development into greater aliveness, connection with the body, increased well-being and more effective functioning in work and in their lives generally:

I really have changed. I just know I have. It's like funnelling in to this tiny place that might seem small, but its not. I have been heading there all my life. It is enhancement. Yes, enhancement. Not fulfilment yet. That's what I strive for. (J.B.)

It's just been life changing and very transformative. (Maree)

In contrast to the other participants, Isobel who was trained as a clinical psychologist felt that her education brought about changes that actually reduced her functioning and well-being:

I had done Lifeline prior so I had a model of non-directive counselling and I kept asserting through my whole degree that I got a lot more from that than I did from university. I don't think my university training prepared me to be a therapist. It prepared me to understand things as a psychologist, but not to be a therapist. I was very empathic naturally. I knew that was my strongest thing. I think it took me away from that. The biggest thing it did, also, was to stop me trusting myself. Because I went in to the degree thinking that I am going to be great at this work and I came out thinking that I can't do this stuff, I don't know what to do. I can't work this way. I had so much self doubt. So it actually destroyed my ability to trust in my knowing.

Sense of self

Psychotherapy graduates spoke of developing a stronger sense of self, more self-awareness, and talked of an expansion of who they were:

And the more I work with my own truth the more expansive that is —it's more expansive in my heart, and my compassion becomes greater for others. And then it's not about me, it's about them. (Maree)

To be in this place where I can sit there and not worry about being disbelieved or overwhelmed with shame. It is now part of my story. (Bonnie)

I didn't have a sense of self until I came to Hakomi. I would go along with others and do what I was told. My sense of self was how well I did that job. That's how I got satisfaction. My growth is all about my own self awareness. I can also see myself in the picture now. It gives me more guidance to see something more clearly. That's what my growth is about. It is an expansion, not a shrinking, or even a splitting into parts. (J.B.)

I am amazed as I look back over five years that I can be so honest about myself. But I know that is where the meat of the work is. It is my own fragility that I see in clients. I don't have to know everything, I don't have to understand everything. So I am getting there. (Linda)

Embodied

A significant part of the growth process was a feeling participants had of coming into connection with the body. They noticed that this happened concurrently with other positive changes:

I found that seeking the answers to life's questions *was* futile until I stopped *doing* and started *being* with myself. Finding my authentic self *did* begin in my belly. I remember the exact day I felt the big 'klonk'!! And it did change my life!!! (J.B.)

As the passage (Fromm) says, it is in my belly, and “cannot be adequately formulated with words”, but I thank psychotherapy and God for these gifts of self. (Judy)

It has helped to reconnect me to my body as well as awareness of this in my work with others. (Bonnie)

Something really shifted in my body — physiologically as well as emotionally. It’s really changed. It’s like, I don’t feel cut off. I don’t feel split. I feel connected from my left side of my body to my right side of my body. I feel that sense of wholeness taking place. (Maree)

Prior to my psychotherapy training, I did not feel my body from the neck down, and I was unaware of this. Discovering my body, emotions, sensations and exploring them opened my body up to me. This part of my personal growth has been a treasured gift. It has given me self knowledge, self acceptance, and an emotional intelligence which I did not have before. (Judy)

Gift of the present

God let us be serious. Face to face.
Heart to heart. Let us be fully present.
Strongly present. Deeply serious.
The closest we may come to innocence.

(Leunig, 1990)⁶¹

Being able to sit in the present-moment with an observing awareness of one’s experience, has been shown to be an important capacity for effective psychotherapy. This ability is also indicative of the developmental stage that permits a fourth level of consciousness. Kegan (1994) believes that achieving this developmental level is necessary to fulfil the demands of parenting and be in healthy intimate relationships. Participants say:

The being in the present moment has been one of the big things for me. (Maree)

I’ve got a witness now. (Judy)

Slowing down is an aspect of the ability to be present. This is not always so easy in the modern world with its crazy demands on our time. As Leunig (1990)⁶² says:

Nothing can be loved at speed.

Sister Joan Chittister, (1990) a Benedictine, protests that we have become a people without patience, reacting with fury at irritations, not able to stomach delays and incapable of tolerating process. Psychotherapy training moves against the cultural flow.

Changes affirmed by others

According to Daniel Siegel (1999), an indication of having achieved a secure base, or earning a secure attachment style, is a greater aliveness and ability to relate. Other people in the participants’ lives noticed changes indicative of this, and spontaneously commented on what they observed:

The feedback that I’ve got is that I look a lot softer. And just look well. That sense of wellness and that spark in my eyes. (Maree)

⁶¹ no page numbers in original book

⁶² no page numbers in original book

Some (clients) have commented, not on my skills or hard sought interventions, but on my heart quality and who I am, as a person and the little things count and the relationship is vital. (Kerry)

I changed from a victim into a therapist. I changed my attitude to others and found others changed in their attitudes towards me. (Marama)

Behaviour changes

Behaviours, including relationship styles are laid down as procedural memory in neural circuits that become more functional and automatic over time. These are not easy to alter, as changing behaviour means literally re-wiring the brain. Rewiring takes time, conscious effort and practice. According to neuroscience some of the new patterns can be put in place through modelling, watching others perform different behaviours; mediated by mirror neuron systems in the brain (Cozolino, 2006b). It would seem as if some of this re-wiring had occurred for participants. Many observed how their familiar patterns of behaviour had become different by the end of the course:

I guess one of the things that is really clear to me, which transformed more towards the end of the training was being able to be more containing, be able to kind of resource myself and manage what was happening to me personally and be able to be in a group setting. (Maree)

I was used to finding solutions. I was used to checking things out, talking things through with others. In Hakomi it was just me, and not having to check anything out with anyone. I had to push that old way aside. I had been trained into my role in my whanau. It was a huge change. Huge! (J.B.)

The biggest changes for me were with my ex-partner in regard to handling our son; handling his behaviour. The patterns that were already built up between each other changed — greatly. The way I respond changed. I was responding rather than reacting. So I found that a big change. (Maree)

Ripples of change

Change extended into the immediate and extended family, and the workplace. Again, participants felt that this change was positive. Relationships were felt to have improved, and were experienced as more authentic, satisfying, and deeper:

I have wonderful conversations with my children now. There is more to talk about and share. Interestingly instead of talking about mundane things we have good discussions and good healthy debates. They are interested in what I have been learning about. It has helped them as parents too. It has helped me as a grandmother. I can see this flow on effect. I share everything with them. My mother wasn't that keen especially when she heard the word psychology. She was very wary about it. Since she came to the graduation she is asking me about it. My sisters are keen. We have wonderful conversations. I share the experience with everyone. (J.B.)

I can acknowledge that life wasn't that crash hot when I was little, but it can be better now, and I can make it better for my grandchildren. And I am able to make it better for my children with honesty rather than perfection because they don't need perfection. My husband doesn't need perfection either. I need to be me. (Judy)

I found that the more I know about myself the more capacity I have to know others. They don't have to explain things the same. (Marama)

I had an experience yesterday with my boss; she was way out of line. I sat I held my ground and I didn't attack her and I didn't get into overwhelm. I stayed with my truth and I had these thoughts of compassion for her. I noticed an

old part of me that wanted to create a drama out of what had just happened. And it would be easy to go and be saying negative things about her behind her back. Those parts of me are still there. I can just notice them now. I am kind of arriving to a new place. Doing things I have never ever done before. (Bonnie)

I guess for me I just relaxed a lot more as a mother. I've always been really hard on myself. It's okay to make a bloop here and a bloop there and, yeah, there was a lot more fun. Fun has crept into our relationship as well. (Maree)

My growth has been good for my parenting as well. I'm supposed to be the adult. I notice the difference in the way they talk, and the way I am able to be with them, and the way I'm able to be with them with their feelings. (Bonnie)

I have two teenage children; I think they lost something of me for a while. But they got something better back. I think what my kids actually got back was about my becoming more fulfilled, more satisfied.... I think the benefits for the whole family have been huge. I am the mainstay, I know that. And I think that because I have changed that everybody else is following. I came out of being so shut away from things I didn't want to see, and I became more engaged with them. I probably became more present for them. (Linda)

And I've changed in that now I'm meeting new people. The types of people that I want to be — want to be in my circle. And I'm starting to find that sense of community and belonging. (Maree)

Beyond self

As people move through adult developmental stages (Kegan, 1982) the focus changes from interpersonal awareness (adolescence), to forming an individual identity (early adult), then achieving an interindividual perspective (later adult). In later adulthood there can be a more transpersonal awareness (Wilber, 2000). For some participants the homecoming included a reconnection with nature and the spiritual, suggesting that this stage was being reached:

Because when you're living in that fearful place, you're always torn and then feel bad about yourself, and feel guilt and all that stuff. Our spiritual essence is to live — live in freedom and live joyously. That's what I'm experiencing, and that's what I want from hereon in. (Maree)

My connection is important - to the universe and to nature as well. (Marama)

My love for others close to me is now a realistic love. My love for the environment gives me a previously unexperienced pleasure. (Judy)

Through reading and various psychotherapy modalities and yoga, I have found a spirituality that works for me. It is also a comfort in my work as well. (Bonnie)

Gratitude

To wake at dawn with a winged heart and give thanks for another day of loving;
To rest at the noon hour and meditate love's ecstasy;
To return home at eventide with gratitude;
And then to sleep with a prayer for the beloved in your heart and a song of praise on your lips.

(Kahlil Gibran, 2003, p.15)

Gratitude is a state of being that is encouraged in Buddhist practice and is associated with the ability to exhibit loving kindness to self and other. It is an ingredient in the alchemy of love. Echoing the above words of *the prophet* (Kahlil Gibran, 2003), the participants arrived *home* with hearts full of gratitude, spontaneously expressed in their interviews:

The one thing I really have to say is I'm so grateful for the experience of personal growth. (Judy)

The gratitude I have for my teachers' gifts, which changed my life - how I parent, who I am, how I view and interpret the world is beyond words really. (Kerry)

So I'm very grateful that I have the opportunity to discover who I am before I die a bitter old lady of not knowing why. (Judy)

Telling stories around the fire.

Sit in front of your fireplace
And stay warm in the thought
Of umu⁶³ fires burning
And remember

Emma Kruse Vaai (Wendt et al., 2003, p.245)

Participants, as they looked back on their experiences, and reflected on the value of personal growth for psychotherapists, were passionate advocates of this education. It was as if they were sitting around the fire, in an older, wiser and more secure place now, sharing deeply held beliefs with anyone who would listen. Even though they remembered the trials and the pain of their own journeys, and how many times they nearly gave up, they fully recommended that others beginning a psychotherapy career should have to do no less.

The personal growth was very difficult, but it is so necessary. (Huia)

Participants, in a way reminiscent of religious converts, expressed strong feelings about the need for personal therapy:

There were people who did not do personal therapy. I thought that they should. They were the people who didn't do therapy before the course. I thought, "Well, do you want to be a therapist and you're not doing therapy!" I always wondered why the staff weren't saying something about it. Why is therapy not compulsory? Those students would say, "I don't have the money". It is not good. (Anna)

Some people on the course were not going to therapy, and that made me very angry. I had quite strong reactions because I was spending all that money on my therapy. It was like they were using the course and the group to get their own therapy. I know it is a lot of expense, but I don't see how you can be a psychotherapist if you haven't experienced long-term therapy, and I mean twice weekly therapy. (Linda)

⁶³ *Umu* — a Polynesian oven used for cooking food

I believe it is absolutely essential. I believe — I strongly believe that you could not be an effective therapist without having had therapy — to me therapy never stops. There will always be times when you go back because you notice you've been triggered and what's happened. It's a life long experience of change and understanding. (Judy)

Without my own personal therapy I would be in there trying to fix everyone and getting pissed off if they weren't doing it right. (Bonnie)

When participants were asked why they felt personal therapy, group experience and personal growth during training was important they gave very similar passionately articulated responses:

I just can't imagine how you could sit with people and do what I do without having done my own story. Being able to see when it's my story, being able to track my own experience being able to stay out of that, being there for them, and not run my own agenda. I can only do that because I have developed up that place in myself and a lot of times I have been there. No books can make up for the fact that you have been there and you've had the experience yourself. My therapist held me when I was in it. She was holding her own stuff and she was able to be there for me, and now I can sit with my own clients and hold my own stuff, so I can be there for them. It is like a gift you pass on really. I think it could be incredibly dangerous for both the therapist and the clients not to have done your own work. (Bonnie)

Because you cannot give to your patients or clients something that you don't have yourself, or can't investigate. Your clients, they can't go to places that you can't allow yourself to go to. I always will have places I need to explore. When people ask me, it's so obvious to me, you have to do it! It is a way that you as a therapist open up to yourself, and then that will be more inviting for your clients. You have to have been there yourself. (Anna)

Yes, it's an absolute vital component of becoming a therapist. How else can you have self-awareness and know what's yours and what isn't. (Judy)

Participants are both celebrating the gains from their journey, seen as vital for a psychotherapist, and acknowledging how demanding the journey has been. I think of the poem by Hone Tuwhare (Wendt et al., 2003, p.237):

The tree is not the same tree as it was yesterday
The tree is preening itself
it has grown two millimetres
it is showing off a brand new
family of leaves this morning.

Moving inwards and outwards with love.

The time will come
when, with elation,
you will greet yourself arriving
at your own door, in your own mirror,
and each will smile at the other's welcome.

and say, sit here. Eat,
You will love again the stranger who was yourself,
Give wine, give bread. Give back your heart
to itself, to the stranger who has loved you

all your life, whom you ignored
for another, who knows you by heart.
Take down the love letters from the bookshelf,

the photographs, the desperate notes,

peel your own image from the mirror.
Sit. Feast on your life.

Derek Walcott (Bennett, 1992)

Blessed are we for simply being ourselves.

Hone Tuwhare (Wendt et al., 2003, p.240)

Ernest Spinelli (Sullivan, 2005) believes that the personal qualities, related to therapeutic effectiveness, that are most important for the therapist are the ability to sit with uncertainty, and to attune to another with acceptance. To be able to genuinely accept others is related to self-acceptance, as the participants described. The development of self-acceptance, self-love, was seen by participants as fundamental; it was related to having been accepted with love on the training, and then with the growing ability to give love; outwardly to family, clients and the world:

After I cried, I thought: "and now I have to believe that this is good for me". I found it hard to be in the "child ego state" and accept the role of the one who expresses unprocessed grief, for my family and the wider group. Later I remembered the comforting words of my teacher, who said: "every time you cry, you make more room for love". This morning, I' was sitting by the river, fully appreciating the beauty around me, my heart is open with gratitude. (Diana – current student)

The sensitivity that is my nature; to have that affirmed and welcomed, and loved and nourished is – well it makes me feel like I belong. It invites me back into the world really, rather than being out of it. And back into relationship as well. (Maree)

It hasn't necessarily made things 'better', its more that I sit in a different place with myself about myself. I now feel that I am less impulsive and that I have a deeper sense of self acceptance. (David)

They mirrored I was OK and I was able to believe this over time. (Kerry)

It felt as if (the tutor) really cared about us. And we in turn cared about each other as she modelled this way of being. (Sarah)

I think something has settled. I don't know what was first. I got into a stable relationship and I think is this happening now because of my growth, or is this happening now because of my therapy. Or is it a combination of things. (Anna)

Being truly seen and understood by peers, tutors and trainers enabled my heart to grow stronger and therefore increased my capacity to love others and myself. (Sarah)

Most importantly I am far more accepting of myself, and the various aspects of my being. (Bonnie)

In spite of the added difficulties the Maori participants experienced due to cultural layers of wounding, they felt that they gained personal growth, and it helped them be stronger, more confident:

It is only recently that I will say something. In the workplace – I sometimes am carrying the stigma of the past. I am now able to use the tools I have learned in the training and my personal development (Marama)

I will feel things first and try to make sense of it for myself. I am not one to verbalise openly in a group setting. I am getting better at that though. (Huia)

I was learning how to deal with those things. It helped me develop a safe practice. (Marama)

As I went through different courses I got more game. I am a lot further on now. (Huia)

Love for self and love for others; cultural perspectives

Even though in Maori culture connection with whanau⁶⁴ and whakapapa⁶⁵ forms an important base for identity and a sense of belonging, all people live with the ongoing tension between wanting to be connected to others, and needing to be an individual (Kegan, 1982). In spite of only having a small sample of participants, twelve in total, with three being Maori, some differences, and some similarities did appear around this tension. J.B. had life-long experience in providing aroha⁶⁶ for others; it was her role in her family. As she started to focus in on her self and her own needs she felt that to care for herself meant losing this outwardly loving part of her character, which challenged her more whanau-linked identity. She described her learning as a child growing up in her particular family:

There were dire consequences to go against my father's orders. It was a damn good hiding usually. It was acceptable in those days to hit children – it was seen as being a good parent. My father was of the generation when he was beaten for korero⁶⁷ Maori. He was old in the way he was trained. My father was a hard task master he had a high work ethic. He would keep me working very hard – there was then less time for me. My whole training was to not think about myself. It became very harsh as I got older. As a child there was lots of space, a space of freedom – it's like that for a child on the marae⁶⁸. When I got to nine or 10 years it changed. When I got my own opinion it was not OK. If you questioned he said you were not listening. This was unacceptable. The harshness of it. We were part of this group of people who did things for benefit of others.

J.B.'s personal growth involved sorting out what she could claim around her own needs, what she could let go from her early training in the family, and what was important to keep as part of her Maori identity. She remembered a conflict with another Maori student:

The saddest thing was losing the relationship with (this student), it changed. I had to make a stand. It was resolved for me though, but not for her. If it had happened on the marae, I wouldn't have done anything different. I was staying true to myself and my whanau⁶⁹, and protecting her too.

For J.B. the resolution came with an expansion of self, rather than a loss:

I thought I would have to cut part of me off. But I don't have to split myself, or minimise myself, or change myself. I can hold both my self-awareness and my care for others; there is a place for both.

Marama had lost her sense of belonging, but felt at home when she found her connectedness in a Maori way:

I can relate to looking for a belonging myself. ... Once I found my whakapapa⁷⁰ again, and my wairua⁷¹ I wasn't lost any more. ... We can walk on our own, but our wairua tells us we are not alone. We stand with our tipuna⁷². Being

⁶⁴ *whanau* - family

⁶⁵ *whakapapa* – ancestral lineage

⁶⁶ *aroha* – love and care

⁶⁷ *korero* - speaking

⁶⁸ *marae* – traditional meeting, gathering place

⁶⁹ *whanau* - family

⁷⁰ *whakapapa* – lineage, geneology

⁷¹ *wairua* – spirit, spirituality

⁷² *tipuna* - ancestors

an individual on your own does not apply in the Maori world view. People who have passed on are there in a spiritual sense. We come with that.

Huia expressed a different perspective:

I found it the opposite to Marama (about belonging). I needed to find out who I was as an individual. ... In day to day life, I felt alone and isolated even with my family around.

J.B. had also struggled with belonging, for different reasons:

You see, I had a Pakeha⁷³ mother. I always had to balance both, sometimes feeling like I was not even belonging in both worlds. Even with Maori there isn't always a sense of going back to the marae⁷⁴.

However, it is clear that, even though J.B. felt she needed to develop awareness of her individual perspective and needs, she also highly values connection, expressing this differently from any other participants:

My six *mokopuna*⁷⁵ are the centre of my universe. Their wellbeing; their *āhua*⁷⁶ is my primary concern as too, the wellbeing of our land underneath us; *ko whakapuneke te maunga* and beside *ko roto te waikaremoana* for our next generations.

A number of the non-Maori students described a longing for feeling connected that was evoked when staying on the marae. (This was discussed in the last chapter). Many, in keeping with a more individualistic Western culture, emphasised finding out about themselves as a primary goal, speaking of belonging and relatedness in an almost secondary way:

I got a lot out of it personally, and professionally as well. ... I'm starting now to find that sense of community. (Maree)

I discovered why I was the person I was, and slowly and tentatively I discovered the person I am now. ... Being with others and holding a loving presence has given me insight, courage, trust, spirituality, grounding and feelings of a real connectedness. (Judy)

My personal growth journey has taken me to *me*. I am more in touch with my desires for life and my feelings.... I now live more consciously in my life on sharing this house/town/country/world/planet with other beings. (Bonnie)

In my relationships with others I am able to see more clearly my own needs. Overall I react less from my own anxiety or the anxiety of others and therefore have more inner calm. (Linda)

Others complained when there was too much focus on self and a lack of relationship and community shown on the course:

No one really appeared to care about each other!? It felt very individualistic and exclusive. (Sarah)

In spite of the cultural differences around belonging and separateness, there was a common theme, generally more implicit within the participants' stories, of the programme providing a belonging, or holding function,

⁷³ *pakeha* – non-Maori person, white-skinned

⁷⁴ *marae* – gathering place for Maori

⁷⁵ *mokopuna* - grandchildren

⁷⁶ *ahua* – talents, characteristics

from which a sense of self can grow. In keeping with Kegan's developmental theory, this stronger sense of self then allows for more connection with others, and the focus changes from self to both self and other.

From the love of the teacher

In the main teachers of psychotherapy that I spoke with were clear that loving relationships during the training process helped personal growth, and brought about positive change in the students.

I assume that I am modelling some kind of self-relationship for them. They probably feel totally accepted and OK just like my clients do.

(Love) enabled individuation; ... individuated yet interdependent with another.

I have heard many, many times over the years that it was the depth of relationship, love that made their learning and transformation possible.

Having one's lovability reflected in a genuine way is at the core of what makes learning possible. I am also modelling the therapeutic relationship. Both activities involve being the midwife for the unfolding of the soul.

Absolutely. (Love assists my students with their personal growth.) It is my belief that that's what this work is all about.

Ron Kurtz comments (personal communication) that when the trainer is able to access the state of being he calls *loving presence*, warm and caring feelings are generated, and these inform action with the well-being of the student held in pure intention He says:

I will go on record as citing two major factors in the personal growth of students. The first and most important is the student's own commitment to that growth. This has certainly shown itself to be the case with psychotherapy, as much research shows. That same research also shows that the personality of the therapist is the second most important factor. I can imagine the same factors being true in the student-teacher relationship.

Love as a magic gift

There is a round that we sing on the marae during our Hakomi trainings. It goes like this:

Aroha is love
And if you - give it away
It will come - straight back
To you

Its just like - a magic penny
Hold on tight - and you don't get any
Lend it - send it - give it away
And it will come - straight back
To you

From the responses of the participants, and the readings on love, there is evidence that the first step is for personal therapists and teachers to love and accept their students. As Marama put it:

If aroha hadn't been there it wouldn't have worked for me. A deep sense of caring went with the knowledge and skills.

Caring from teachers and therapists leads to the students developing self-love and self-acceptance. (It could be called *internalisation of the virtuous other* in psychological jargon.) Relationships are likely to improve in the student's personal life, with an increased exchange of love and support. This can only improve the well-being of the student, reducing the chance that he or she will depend on clients for nourishment. These students can, when they graduate as psychotherapists and go out into the world and work, show the same love and acceptance for their clients. As Sarah said, quoted earlier, reflecting on the verbalised love she had felt from her therapist:

(It is) a gift that I now pass onto my own clients

Passport to a life

Guruji, I came to you as a high school youth; now I am a grown man, even with a grey hair or two. Though you have showered me with silent affection from the first hour to this, do you realize that once only have you ever said, "I love you". I looked at him pleadingly. Master lowered his gaze. "Yogananda, must I bring out into the cold realms of speech the warm sentiments best guarded by the wordless heart?" Guruji, I know you love me, but my mortal ears ache to hear you say so. ... Two clear teardrops stood in Sri Yuktswar's eyes. "Yogananda, I love you always." "Your answer is my passport to heaven. " I felt a weight lift from my heart, dissolved forever at his words. (Yogananda, 1979, p.457)

None of the participants spoke of receiving a passport to heaven, as Yogananda put it. I was curious as to the essential, most significant change that participants felt had occurred for them. What was it that participants felt helped them the most in their personal growth? What was most noteworthy change for them? Graduates were asked these questions; to reflect on what it was that stood out for them as highly significant. A number felt that they had gained no less than their *life*.

Psychotherapy has given me a life; personal and emotional self awareness, knowledge, love, and spirituality. (Judy)

I trust the process of life, I can even shorten that to say, I trust. (Judy)

Now, I have a chance at life. (Bonnie)

Oh yes! (The change) is a good thing. It is all about my own self awareness. I can also see myself in life, in the glass. It does give me more guidance to see something more clearly. That's what my growth is about. (J.B.)

Conclusion

And did you get what
you wanted from this life, even so?
I did,
And what did you want?
To call myself beloved, to feel myself

beloved on the earth.

(Raymond Carver)⁷⁷

As a number of trainers in the literature have asserted, personal growth is highly individual in nature. The accounts of participants supported this. The time it took to move through resolving various personal developmental 'deficits' was individual, and the programme was not always in tune with the needs of the individual student. Being ready to leave the training and move into a professional life also varied with participants. Some left with a feeling of wholeness in themselves, others experienced being pushed out of the nest too early with nurturing relationships cut off unnaturally. Several participants were still sitting with unresolved hurts that originated from their relationships with personal therapists and teachers.

There were many common themes. In spite of deficiencies experienced in the programmes (discussed in the last chapter), personal growth did occur for all psychotherapy graduates, and they felt it was good. Most expressed gratitude. Many changes happened for participants that they evaluated as being for the better; a stronger sense of self, embodiment, more satisfying relationships, and a spiritual connection. The love and relationship received from therapists, peers and teachers, they believed had led to more self-acceptance and a greater ability to give and receive love. Some participants felt they had gained from the journey no less than *life*.

The meaning of life is growth
And the meaning of the eternal sea
Which holds everything in its embrace,
Is Love

from *Learning to fly* by Joy Cowley (1996, p.80)

Many participants had become like the newly converted; crusaders for personal therapy and personal growth within psychotherapy training. None of the psychotherapy graduates regretted having undergone the journey, and several said they would recommend their training programme to others.

⁷⁷ poem from personal collection, reference not known

Chapter Seven: Discussion of Results

We celebrate that part of us, that part within ourselves, which has rebelled, worked and suffered for the cause of love and joy. (Leunig, 1990b)⁷⁸

Introduction

The great challenge with this research has been to keep it sufficiently contained. The topics of personal growth, human change, and psychotherapy are huge and contain much that is uncertain and unclear, like *life*. Even more, the concept of *love* has the potential to dissolve into a mystical, boundaryless expansion where discussion and definition become distortions, or are denied altogether. One is invited into the pure experience of the *now*, and expression through creativity, rather than any form of logic or reason. Dividing personal growth and love into tidy components is good for an academic process, but essence may be sacrificed in the cutting process. I have endeavoured to keep moving between maintaining a necessarily narrow focus and a surrendering to a wide incomprehensible perspective.

Experiences of personal growth during psychotherapy education

They did grow

All my participants, with the exception of the graduate from the clinical psychology degree, felt they had experienced significant personal growth during their training. They found the process shattering and tumultuous, but also, in a way, enjoyable. Most felt appreciation and gratitude for the changes that had occurred. These changes, they believed, had improved the quality of their own lives, and as a consequence positive change rippled out into their families and communities, and to their clients.

⁷⁸ no page numbers in original book

Personal growth was stimulated and supported by students' personal therapy, within experiential groups on the course, as a result of being on the marae, and within the training programme itself. Graduates valued being *held* and feeling safe as they became more vulnerable in the process of change. Some graduates felt that there was not sufficient support for them during the difficult times. However, in spite of perceived deficits in the training programmes, the journey of personal growth proceeded in a satisfying way, with positive outcomes, and a sense of *gratitude* that frequently brought tears to the participants' eyes as they spoke of it. This would suggest that the *holding* provided by the training was generally *good-enough*.

Orlinsky & Ronnestad (2005) found that therapists in practice valued undergoing personal therapy, especially when distressed, and related their continuing personal growth to effectiveness, satisfaction with the work and general well-being. In my research, the participants likewise highly valued personal therapy as an essential part of their development. They also spoke at length of the support they received from their therapists, and how important this was when the journey of their growth became upsetting. *Requiring* students to undertake personal therapy has been difficult within university programmes, and some students find that the financial cost is too high along with course fees and little income, and so choose not to do their own therapy. It is possible however, that the costs from not doing therapy may be high, including increased suffering of emotional turbulence, even not being able to complete the programme.

Participants became converts

All the participants were strong advocates for personal growth being part of the training of psychotherapists. They felt that they would not be able to practice effectively had they not been through the personal development journey. They all whole-heartedly endorsed personal development as being essential in the preparation of the psychotherapist. This passion, I believe, needs to be held with a cautious curiosity. Religious zeal and knowing *the right way forward* can be a result of dependent relationships that hold unrealistic promise, as in cults. In these circumstances anger at, and judgement of, those who did not fully commit sometimes surfaces. People who have survived painful difficult journeys may make sense of the pain and distress by elevating the process to a place of underserved positivity. However, within this enthusiasm there could also be recognition of the deeply felt value of the journey one has just emerged from, and a genuine desire to convince others to reap the same rewards. It would be interesting to interview participants a few years further on to see if their viewpoint has been tempered with the passage of time and further integration.

Love was the key

Relationship and the various dimensions of *love* were found to be a key for successful personal transformation. On their trainings students were healing *wounds of the heart* that reduced their self-esteem and capacity to love others, and to be empathic and loving as therapists. Relationship deficits and unhelpful behaviour patterns, from the past were transformed within the container of loving relationships provided by the teachers, group facilitators, therapists and peers. However, the word *love* was not commonly used in trainings, was not talked about as an overt part of the curriculum, training process, or educational objectives.

During a presentation seminar on this research I was asked, “Why use the word *love*?” My first thought was, “Why not?” However, I went on to ponder the question. I talked at length with others about *love* in psychotherapy and training. I read more. I re-interviewed my participants, asking them specifically about love as part of their lived experience. I spoke with trainers in psychotherapy from several countries, asking them about their experiences of *love* in the teaching arena, and the place of *love* in psychotherapy training. The vast majority of those I spoke with were enthusiastic about the topic.

The nature of love

“What a silly thing Love is!” said the Student as he walked away. “It is not half as useful as Logic, for it does not prove anything, and it is always telling one of things that are not going to happen, and making one believe things that are not true. In fact it is quite unpractical, and, as in this age to be practical is everything, I shall go back to Philosophy and study Metaphysics.” So he returned to his room and pulled out a great dusty book, and began to read. from “*The Nightingale and the Rose*” (Wilde, 1993, p.296)

Elusive to definition

One result of the mysterious nature of love is that no one has ever, to my knowledge, arrived at a truly satisfactory definition of love. (Peck, 1978, p.85)

So why indeed use the word *love* and not one or more of the aspects of love, such as empathy, or positive regard, that is more acceptable in professional parlance? The Greeks differentiated types of love; *eros*, passionate or sexual love, *agape*, selfless love, and *filios*, brotherly love. *Love* as a concept, as an experience, is used in everyday speech; the word is rich with symbolism, ambiguous in meaning, but laden with emotional and spiritual content. *Love* is ‘experience-near’ language to most people. Its nature may be hard to define exactly, but it is part of the fabric of human life from birth to death. In making meaning,

human beings like to categorise and define, especially in the early stages of adult development. It may be more comfortable, but not so accurate, to clearly differentiate the faces of *love*.

Perhaps it is a sign of more advanced levels of development that people become willing to sit with the mystery and uncertainty of *love* and explore its manifestation, pleasant and painful, as a moment-by-moment felt experience. As Megan Tressider (2004, p.21) says:

The links between sex, love and the changing moods of the human heart remain mysterious. Traditional philosophy, mythology and literature still have much to teach us about love in all its manifestations.

We fashion newly, the misshapen
allegories of love — with one
red rose — furtive,
among the groceries.

Hone Tuwhare (Wendt et al., 2003, p.236)

Aroha and love

A person who has *aroha* for another expresses genuine concern towards them and acts with their welfare in mind, no matter what their state of health or wealth. It is the act of love that adds quality and meaning to life. (Barlow, 1991, p.8)

A number of the Maori participants spoke of *aroha* as being important in supporting their growth. I asked Maori teachers and graduates about the concept of *aroha*, and how it was the same or different from *love*. In my experience, Maori utter the word *aroha* a lot more freely than we Pakeha use *love*. Along with verbal expressions of *aroha* I have observed warmth, care, concern, respect and physical contact such as sitting close or embracing. The fact that *aroha* does not have sexual connotations maybe makes using this word easier. *Aroha* includes dimensions of *approval*, supporting a person's mana; that is not overtly there with the word *love*; has a sense of the sacred, and embraces care and *hospitality*. Perhaps using the word *aroha* instead of *love* would give the essence of what we are providing in psychotherapy, and it could be less complicated. (*For a longer discussion on the meaning of aroha see Appendix J.*)

The place of love in psychotherapy education

You its only seed

Some say love, it is a river, that drowns the tender reed
Some say love, it is a razor, that leaves the soul to bleed
Some say love, it is a hunger, an ever aching need
I say love, it is a flower, and you, it's only seed. from *The Rose* (McBroom, 1979)

Depending on the modality of the psychotherapy, and the developmental stage of the client, the psychotherapist can embody many facets of love, excepting that of *lover*. Although aspects of the 'lover' state

are expressed; warm eye contact conveys a limbic message that is taken into the heart of emotional memory. In the words of a teacher:

Having one's lovability reflected in a genuine way — in the eyes of the teacher a student can blossom.

The participants in my study spoke of these varying expressions of love. They saw that the trainers nurtured their growth, like a gardener. They felt seen and appreciated, as a poet might do, in their essential beauty and lovability. They also experienced the presence and absence of love; the pain and joy of being touched by love. Participants spoke of being given love with the intention of healing. Graduates had touched into the spiritual dimensions of love, as in prayer or meditation. Judy said:

I can feel a connection with the great unknown. I can just be, and feel myself flooded with warmth and love.

Teachers of psychotherapy also spoke of feeling and expressing the different facets of love:

I hold a deep appreciation for the students.

I am often the projected good mom they never had, loving them and supporting them in a way they did not have.

As a teacher I focus on acknowledging my students' achievements and then frame my feedback for their moving forward in loving terminology and affect.

As the years have passed the love connection continues.

Does it mean we have to tell them hard truths, even when it is painful? Probably.

Orlinsky & Ronnestad (2005) who interviewed nearly 5000 psychotherapists found that those that felt satisfied in their work, and in their personal relationships, reported what the researchers summarised as a *Healing Involvement* with their clients. An important dimension of *Healing Involvement* is being able to love and relate:

Healing Involvement reflects a mode of participation in which therapists experience themselves as personally committed and affirming in relating to patients, engaging at a high level of basic empathic and communication skills, conscious of Flow-type feelings during sessions, ... (Orlinsky & Ronnestad, 2005, p.162).

Orlinsky & Ronnestad (2005, pp.167-171) say that experiencing *Healing Involvement* has three main sources; development of clinical skill, theoretical breadth and engaging in ongoing personal growth. I would argue that the foundations for these capacities are laid down during training, and that love is an essential ingredient.

The unexpected perspective

As I said in the chapter on methodology, I was curious to uncover the unexpected, the unpopular perspective, and new possibilities for understanding the educational preparation of the psychotherapist.

Speaking openly about love has been shown to be ‘unpopular’. Participants initially never used the word, teachers spoke of more acceptable terms as currency in their programmes, and the majority of books on therapy and training therapists did not even have *love* in the index. There are many elements of the love experience that are unspoken, even underground, and much that is implicit. Maybe it is the force of love, as expressed below, that has us hesitant, pulling back.

Love is as strong as death,
Its jealousy unyielding as the grave.
It burns like a blazing fire,
Like a mighty flame.
Many waters cannot quench love;
Rivers cannot wash it away. (Song of Solomon 8:6)

Why not be open about love?

Yet, from my conversations with participants, teachers and colleagues, it is clear that love is already operating as a powerful force in facilitating personal growth during psychotherapy training. I feel that the healing, facilitation power of love could be more effectively employed, with the complexity better understood and managed, if there was more openness and dialogue. Some teachers spoke of feeling embarrassed around love, and their experiences of love in a professional setting, sensing that they would be ridiculed if they brought it into professional discourse. As one teacher said:

I think we would do a better job if we just came out and called it *love*. How might that change our thinking, our way of working with it educationally?

One of the reasons that we may not speak of love is the challenge of defining its nature. Tan (1991) says that it almost obscene dissecting something so delicate, fragile and precious as love. Yet it is a word that resonates for most, if not all, people. *Love* has meaning as wide and as deep as human experience itself, and incorporates a large number of aspects (Berscheid, 2006; R Sternberg, 2006). The neurobiologist Helen Fisher (2006, p.107) says:

Everywhere people sing for love, pray for love, work for love, live for love, kill for love, and die for love. ... nothing will extinguish the human drive for love.

Surely it is not the intention that psychotherapists be trained to maintain a distance from the potent experiences of love? One teacher of psychotherapy said with feeling:

I think that ... love goes far beyond qualities of presence, and includes a personal and passionate caring for another ... that calls forth the willingness to sacrifice self to some extent for the other. I've not witnessed this love between teachers and students. ...I truly don't think that questions about love in the teacher-student or therapeutic relationship are useful ones.

It is as if the complexity of love cannot be managed in psychotherapy, but it is assumed that it can be managed by parents. But I feel there is more to it than this. Psychotherapists are being trained to develop both skill for therapeutic work and personal capacity for relationship. Love is intimately related to both the process of this unfolding and the place of 'arrival' (Lewis et al., 2001). Eng-Kong Tan (1991) concurs when he says, "Long-term analytic psychotherapy is a long labour of love." Freud spoke of 'love and work' being essential.

Uncomfortable ground

I was allowing the myriad of experiences, opinions, and expressions on love that I had explored to sit on the back burner of my mind. While making a cup of tea, right at the end of this integrating process, it suddenly exploded into my consciousness. It is about money, being paid! I remembered Eng-Kong Tan's comment that it seemed almost *obscene* to define the sacred and mysterious phenomenon of love. *Love*, as feeling and as action, is from the heart, and most would say it should be freely given, within the usual boundary limits of parenting, partnering and friendship. It is almost *immoral* to consider that one would be paid for giving this love. To run with the thought further it begins to become uncomfortably close to prostitution, where that other 'love', sexual love, is bought and sold.

In my experience clients are on to this dilemma when they struggle with receiving love in psychotherapy. They commonly say, "But it's your job to care", with the subtext that the love given is not really genuine, but a kind of 'technique'. In my role as a psychotherapist and trainer, I also wrestle with the dilemma of how to contain the love factor within my work frame and boundary. It is both part of the job and so much more. In our Western culture we are encouraged to separate work and private life. Love belongs in one's private life; with children, lover, friends, and towards nature and God. To bring love into work, where one is being paid for time and energy, starts to confuse things. When I was a nurse I was told not to get emotionally involved with patients. Yet I have come to believe that love is the key ingredient for personal healing, development and arriving at a place of life fulfillment.

I find it interesting that only one teacher, quoted above, mentioned money in relation to love. He said:

Love goes far beyond qualities of presence, and includes a personal and passionate caring for another, a caring that is not predicated on a financial relationship.

In conversations with teachers over the years I have heard several say that they have some guilt or discomfort about being paid for relationships that feel nourishing, precious, and verging on the sacred. Maybe this is why we disguise love into something else; to make it more professional, and thus trick ourselves into feeling that it is somehow different in essence from the personal love we express in our family lives. We make it smaller and bordering on the pathological when we reduce it to transference, or countertransference. We turn love into something more acceptable, more understandable, and more impersonal when we call it empathy, or acceptance, or unconditional positive regard. These terms also bring a slight flavour of the expert, or superiority; where one person dispenses healing to another.

Love and work

Teaching and psychotherapy does involve expertise. We usually feel comfortable with being paid for these aspects of the role. But when the relationship between teacher and student, psychotherapist and client, becomes one where two human beings are sitting with each other, experiencing connection and love; those precious, sacred, mutually transforming moments, then is it appropriate that one person gets paid by the other? What if these moments, are not a bonus or by-product of the work, but constitute an essential part of what it is that we are doing? Can we sit consciously and comfortably with this? Work and love have merged. This is an expansion into levels of uncertainty that those still in Kegan's 'institutional' stage of development would struggle with.

David Whyte, a poet and author, writes of his own journey of growth through his work; love of his work, or otherwise stated, a work of love. In his book, "*Crossing the unknown sea: Work as a pilgrimage of identity*" Whyte (2001) says:

Work is where we can make ourselves, work is where we can break ourselves. (p.12). Our affections and loves will not be denied but must find a home by being expressed in the world. Work is the ground of their arrival, and ours too. This is the soul's individual journey (p.244).

Gender influences

There was a flavour within the interview data of a gender difference in relation to love. Women graduates and teachers seemed more willing to explore the topic of love in a intimate way with a blending of personal and professional perspectives. The participant sample was small so it is hard to generalise, but it could be an interesting avenue to explore further. Orlinsky & Ronnestad (2005, p.183)state that men take longer to mature and to develop therapeutic interpersonal skills than women.

Implications and recommendations for psychotherapy training

Personal development happens, and is needed

The experiences of the participants showed that personal development does happen on their training courses. There is a lot of support within the literature, the profession, and from participants for a high level of personal growth as being necessary for a psychotherapist. I think we can as trainers become more aware of developmental stages and what we can and should expect of students. The work of Kegan (1982, 1994) is especially useful in this regard, as well as the developmental awareness needed in psychotherapy training proposed by Rowan (2005). More clarity about levels of consciousness in stages of adult development and their relationship to education and the practice of psychotherapy, even self-directed learning, is likely to assist teachers with selection, facilitation of growth and evaluation. The discussion of love and work above would suggest that a high developmental level is a prerequisite for true therapeutic practice.

Personal development during training also takes place in groups and personal therapy. All my participants felt that both these activities were very important for their personal growth. The practicalities of how to include these experiences in training for maximum effectiveness needs, I believe more research and exploration. There is a lot of support within the profession and in the literature for both personal therapy and group to be part of trainings, but some dissension on whether therapy should be compulsory.

Love and relationship as catalyst for growth

As love, in all its dimensions from warmth, empathy, attunement, compassion, acceptance, holding, challenging, and setting limits, is such a fundamental part of facilitating change in people, I would recommend that we in psychotherapy training develop more consciousness about love and relationship in the psychotherapy education curriculum, and in the process of training. There is place for more debate, using the word *love*, openly and courageously, and for coming to grips with love's power and the complexity of its meaning. Can we deliberately turn and face the challenges that arise from being more consciously personal and sacred in our *loving work*, yet remaining ethically professional; being paid, being respected, and being responsible in the workplace and community?

The pain involved in growth

Participants felt that it would have been hard to adequately prepare them for the disturbance that was to come. It is probably the same as other major life journeys such as getting married and having a baby. It is hard to take warnings on board when you haven't had the requisite experience. However, I think training

programmes could give more attention to creative ways of preparing students, holding and supporting them through the difficult times. This is of course, complex too, as there needs to be a balance between allowing some regression for reparative purposes, and encouraging resilience. The degree and type of holding needed will be different for students depending on their developmental stages. Some will benefit from care and support, while others need to have this limited and to be challenged more. Ways of providing holding, challenge and continuity are described well by Kegan (1982).

Rituals, structures and environment

Safety and a sense of belonging allow growth to proceed. Welcoming ceremonies, rituals for transitions and endings are likely to assist the students with their development and integration of growth. Structures set in place to make accessing support easier for students would be appreciated by them. Otherwise those students who are more forthright and 'needy' get more assistance than those with shy or self-reliant personalities. From my experience on the Hakomi training where our assistants are *kaitiaki*⁷⁹ for a small group of students, overseeing their well-being and progress, I do not believe that a system of this nature is abused by students. I feel that Maori generally do containing rituals better than non-Maori. The marae is a setting that can be used more, not only to increase cultural awareness, but to facilitate the personal growth process through the welcoming and holding it provides. Having a comfortable environment, a home base for the training programme will also help with the holding function. For Maori students I would suggest that it will promote their development to have Maori support, teachers with bicultural awareness, and some of the teaching, at least, conducted in a Maori way. Many Maori have added *wounding* that result from colonisation and racist attitudes. Is this, or can this, be attended to in programmes that are predominantly Western in orientation? This requires thought and consultation. As discussed earlier, Maori participants reported distress and loneliness that was related to particular culturally-related hurts coming up in classes where there was inadequate understanding and or holding.

Mindfulness

Mindfulness practice could be introduced into teaching programmes to help students with emotional regulation, body awareness, empathy and developing the ability to be in the present moment. Mindfulness will help resource students, and is likely to be positive alongside loving relationships, and experiential exercises to explore the experience of love, to best prepare the personhood of the therapist.

⁷⁹ *kaitiaki* – one who takes care of, guardian

Preparation and support of teachers

To provide the requisite assessment and holding that would best serve students, teachers need to have achieved a high level of personal development themselves. Like the parent who needs a wider family containment to do his or her task with equanimity, the trainer requires the support of the wider training institution. This would involve education of managers. I am not sure if this is realistic in the current climate of increased bureaucratic demand. As Leunig says, "Nothing can be loved at speed." Kegan (1982) suggests that large institutions best suit people who are at 'stage three' consciousness. Psychotherapists need at least 'stage four' to fulfill the requirements for the activity of psychotherapy. It is possible that the best therapy teachers will become frustrated with the limitations of institutional structure and leave. Perhaps psychotherapy schools can create protected 'safe' havens within larger institutional cultures that do not fully understand or support them. This, however, puts considerable strain and demand on those programme coordinators at the interface with management. Maybe the answer is to return to private training establishments where psychotherapists used to learn their craft and there is more flexibility. There may be other options that could be explored.

The hard face of love, boundaries.

From speaking with the participants it is clear that many still carry hurt and confusion around relationships with teachers. Better guidelines, preparation and support for teachers around limit setting and challenging would be useful. Process-oriented supervision for teachers on a regular basis would help with this difficult function. If students were educated more consciously around love in all its dimensions they might understand the confrontational side of love a little better. Compassionate processes, involving support for teachers and students, to address perceived injustices seem to be most important. This takes time, willingness and maturity in the teacher. Gaining a deeper appreciation of the difficult function of love would help prepare students for the times this will be needed in psychotherapy practice.

Possibilities for further research

There are many areas that could be researched around personal growth in psychotherapy training. It would be useful to investigate the developmental stage needed at the start of training, assessment processes for the growth potential of students, and the best ways of facilitating movement to the required level of development. A deeper understanding of the relationship between entry characteristics of the student, and

personal development whilst training would help with both selection and designing the personal growth components of programmes.

Other research questions include: ways of educating for emotional intelligence, teaching methods to stimulate personal growth, and the most effective support and containment for developmental journeys. The timing needed for developmental changes, and if or how this could be augmented, is another area of potential interest. Individual student learning processes could be explored.

Research could also be undertaken to investigate the student experiences of and effectiveness regarding personal therapy and experiential groups during training. Training methods, and development needed, related to different modalities of psychotherapy would be an interesting area to research. The influence of bicultural approaches on personal growth could also be usefully explored.

There are many possibilities around exploring love in psychotherapy and psychotherapy education. I would be most interested to hear teachers' and therapists' experiences around love, work and being paid. It feels like this is a complex issue that needs to be faced head on. Maybe that is the next research project!

Strengths and limitations

This research represents exploration of a tiny slice of human experience. One of the constraints of the study is that there is a small sample of participants, from a narrow range of locations and programmes, so generalisability is limited. I personally knew a number of participants and this may have distorted their responses to me. It is possible that they felt less free to criticise their trainings. My own interests and prior learnings will have consciously and unconsciously biased the questions that I asked, leading the participants in some directions and precluding others. For example, I did not focus at all on issues of gender. The vast implications of the themes that emerged and the amount of data generated meant that I had to be selective, which brought in further partiality and maybe omissions due to overwhelm. My own enthusiasm and meaning making is strongly imprinted on the study. I am only a beginner hermeneutic researcher, so there will be clumsiness with how I have used the method, precluding extracting the best from my participants.

The willingness of the participants to openly share their lived experience and to keep contributing as the study progressed means that the data base is full and rich. Participants' experiences and meaning making

are liberally included in every section; their own words representing them. Another strength of the study is the excitement and resonance that so many people felt in relation to the topic and emerging findings. This led to the many discussions I had with a wide range of interested people in several countries. Many were keen to contribute, and a good number did. The *phenomenological nod* (van Manen, 1990) kept happening.

Conclusion

My motivation, in starting this research, was to learn from the experiences of the participants around their personal growth during psychotherapy training, and to share the meaning making we explored together and separately, so that psychotherapy education could be improved. I have to this end taken an assemblage of wild and seamless material; experience translated into words several times over, and condensed, expanded, categorised and summarised it all in order to distil out some kind of essence that brings meaning and food for thought to others. I trust I have been able to present in a true way significant ideas and stimulation that have arisen from the experiences of those who have recently undergone a psychotherapy education. I hope that the participants' very personal know-how will keep its life and continue to grow.

This has been a journey for me too. I have noticed already that my practice as a psychotherapist and my teaching of psychotherapy students has been significantly impacted for the better from doing this research. I have been transformed by this exploration; stimulated and humbled by the magnitude of what it is that we do as psychotherapy teachers. Some of the dilemmas posed by love and psychotherapy seem without a solution. Remembering Rilke's words, we are still mostly *living the questions* and maybe one day will more fully *live into the answers*. If psychotherapy is indeed the impossible profession, then educating for it must be equally unworkable.

Nevertheless we do it, maybe not as well as it could be done, and our students grow and develop before our eyes. Their lives are turned upside down in the process. Maybe we can make this frightening upheaval more bearable for them. Maybe we can't. In spite of the pain involved in personal change and our deficiencies as trainers, graduates express heart-felt gratitude for the experience. As I listened to Hakomi students speaking of their personal journeys, during the finishing ritual at Waimarama Marae, I was moved to tears. My heart was overflowing as I experienced in such an immediate, *truthful* way the fullness of who they had become over the three years of their training. All the struggles of how to best teach, contain,

support and love these students dissolved. I only remembered why I do this work, why love and work for me are inseparable, and what a gift that is.

I wish to express my gratitude to the participants, and to all who contributed to this study. My journey and the research would not have happened without all the collaboration and cooperation I received. It feels appropriate to end with the words of a graduate:

It was a good thing. I started to have a feeling about me; looking at myself and not only at other people. It was important to look at myself. I asked myself, "Who the heck am I?" (J.B.)

References

- Alred, G. (2006). A trainee's perspective. In R. Bor & M. Watts (Eds.), *The trainee handbook; A guide for counselling and psychotherapy trainees* (2nd ed., pp. 284-296). London: Sage.
- Anderson, S. (2000). *The journey from abandonment to healing*. New York: Berkley.
- Aponte, H. J., & Winter, J. E. (1987). The person and practice of the therapist: treatment and training. In M. Baldwin & V. Satir (Eds.), *The use of self in therapy*. New York: Haworth Press.
- Asay, T. P., & Lambert, M. J. (2002). The empirical case for common factors in therapy: Quantitative findings. In M. A. Hubble, B. L. Duncan & S. D. Miller (Eds.), *The heart and soul of change: What works in therapy* (pp. 33-56). Washington DC: American Psychological Association.
- AucklandUniversityofTechnology. (2004). *Auckland University of Technology ethics guidelines*. Retrieved 12th June, 2004:
http://www.aut.ac.nz/research_showcase/pdf/guidelines.pdf.
- Austen, J. H. (2001). *Zen and the brain*. Massachusetts: MIT Press.
- Bacall, L. (2000). By Myself. In E. Knowles & S. Ratcliffe (Eds.), *The Oxford dictionary of thematic quotations* (pp. 232). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Baker, E. K. (2003). *Caring for ourselves: A therapist's guide to professional and personal well-being*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Barlow, C. (1991). *Tikanga whakaaro*. Auckland: Oxford University Press.
- Basch, M. F. (1988). *Understanding psychotherapy: The science behind the art*. New York: Basic Books.
- Battye, R. (1991). On being a trainee. In W. Dryden, & Thorne, B. (Ed.), *Training and supervision for counseling in action* (pp. 74-86). London: Sage.
- Beanland, C., Schneider, Z., LoBiondo, G., & Haber, J. (1999). *Nursing research: Methods, critical appraisal and utilisation*. Sydney: Mosby.
- Bennett, J. G. (1992). *The way to be free*. Maine: Samuel Weiser.
- Bergum, V. (1989). *Woman to mother: A transformation*. Massachusetts.

- Berscheid, E. (2006). Searching for the meaning of 'love'. In R. Sternberg & K. Weis (Eds.), *The new psychology of love* (pp. 171-184). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Bird, L., & Drewery, W. (2000). *Human development in Aotearoa*. Auckland: McGraw Hill.
- Bly, R. (Ed.). (1981). *Selected poems of Rainer Maria Rilke: A translation from the German and commentary*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Bolger, E. (1999). Grounded theory analysis of emotional pain. *Psychotherapy Research*, 99, 342-362.
- Bond, T. (1993). *Standards and ethics for counselling in action*. London: Sage.
- Bowden, A. R. (2001). *A psychotherapist sings in Aotearoa: Psychotherapy in New Zealand*. Mana: Caroy.
- Bowlby, J. (1969). *Attachment*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bracey, A. (2002). Finding the patient within: Managing the transitions from student nurse to patient to nurse therapist. *Group Analysis*, 35(1), 135-151.
- Brandon, D. (1983). Nowness in the helping relationship. In *Awakening the Heart: East/West approaches to psychotherapy and the healing relationship* (pp. 140-147). Boston: Shambhala.
- Brockopp, D. Y., & Hastings-Tolsma, M. T. (1995). *Fundamentals of nursing research* (2nd ed.). Boston: Jones and Bartlett.
- Bugental, J. F. T. (1987). *The art of the psychotherapist*. New York: W. W. Norton.
- Butler, K. (2006). The art and science of love. *Psychotherapy Networker*, 30(5).
- Button, J. (1985). *Making love work: A radical approach*. Wellingborough, UK: Turnstone.
- Byrne-Armstrong, H., Higgs, J., & Horsfall, D. (Eds.). (2001). *Critical moments in qualitative research*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Charman, D. (2005). What makes for a 'good' therapist? A review. *Psychotherapy in Australia*, 11(3), 68-72.
- Chernin, K. (1995). *A different kind of listening: My psychoanalysis and its shadow*. New York: HarperCollins.
- Chittister, J. (1990). *Wisdom distilled from the daily*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco.
- Clark, M. M. (1986). Personal therapy: A review of empirical research [Research and Practice]. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, Volume 17(6), 541-543.

- Clarkson, P. (1995). *The therapeutic relationship*. London: Whurr.
- Clarkson, P., & Gilbert, M. (1991). The training of counsellor trainers and supervisors. In W. Dryden & B. Thorne (Eds.), *Training and supervision for counseling in action* (pp. 143-169). London: Sage.
- Cohen, B. M., & Cox, C. T. (1995). *Telling without talking: Art as a window into the world of multiple personality*. New York: Norton.
- Cook-Greuter, S. (1994). Rare forms of self-understanding in mature adults. In M. E. Miller & S. Cook-Greuter (Eds.), *Transcendence and mature thought in adulthood: The further reaches of adult development* (pp. 119-147). New York: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Cowie, H., Salm, A., Glachan, M., Pauli, R., Bray, D., O'Callaghan, J., et al. (1998). Investigating the learning experiences of counsellors in training: A research question. In P. Clarkson (Ed.), *Counselling psychology: Integrating theory, research and supervised practice*. London: Routledge.
- Cowley, J. (1996). *Psalms down under*. Wellington: Catholic Supplies.
- Coyle, A. (1998). Qualitative research in counselling psychology: Using the counselling interview as a research instrument. In P. Clarkson (Ed.), *Counselling psychology: Integrating theory, research and supervised practice* (pp. 56-73). London: Routledge.
- Cozolino, L. (2004). *The making of a therapist: A practical guide for the inner journey*. New York: W.W. Norton.
- Cozolino, L. (2006a). *The neuroscience of human relationship; Attachment and the developing social brain*. New York: W.W. Norton.
- Cozolino, L. (2006b). The social brain. *Psychotherapy in Australia*, 12(2), 12-16.
- Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. London: Sage.
- Cushway, D. (1992). Stress in clinical psychology trainees. *British Journal of Clinical Psychology*(31), 169-179.
- Cushway, D. (1997). Stress in trainee psychotherapists. In V. P. Varma (Ed.), *Stress in psychotherapists*. London: Routledge.
- Dale, F. (1997). Stress and the personality of the psychotherapist. In V. P. Varma (Ed.), *Stress in psychotherapists*. London: Routledge.
- Dickinson, E. (2005). If I can stop one heart from breaking. In K. O'Keefe (Ed.), *Small poems for busy people. Auckland: Cumulus*. (pp. 56). Auckland: Cumulus.
- Dinnage, R. (1988). *One to one: Experiences of psychotherapy*. London: Penguin.

- Dozier, R. W. (2002). *Why we hate: Understanding, curbing, and eliminating hate in ourselves and our world*. New York: Contemporary Books.
- Dryden, W., & Thorne, B. (1991a). Approaches to the training of counsellors. In W. Dryden & B. Thorne (Eds.), *Training and supervision for counselling in action*. London: Sage.
- Dryden, W., & Thorne, B. (1991b). *Training and supervision for counselling in action*. London: Sage.
- Durie, M. H. (1997). Whanau, whanaungatanga and healthy Maori development. In P. Te Whaiti, M. McCarthy & A. Durie (Eds.), *Mai i rangiatea: Maori well-being and development*. Auckland: University of Auckland Press.
- Dusay, J. (1971). Transactional analysis. In E. Berne (Ed.), *A layman's guide to psychiatry and psychoanalysis* (pp. 302-333). Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin.
- Elman, N. S., & Forrest, L. (2004). Psychotherapy in the remediation of psychology trainees: Exploratory interviews with training directors. *Professional psychology: Research and practice*, 35(2), 123-130.
- Etchegoyen, R. H. (1991). *The fundamentals of psychoanalytic technique*. (P. Pitchon, Trans. Revised edition 1999 ed.). London: Karnac Books.
- Eulert, D. (2003). Voices of psychology graduate students: Humanistic training for the 21st century. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 43(3), 66-80.
- Ferruci, P. (1982). *What we may be: The visions and techniques of psychosynthesis*. Northamptonshire: Turnstone Press.
- Ferruci, P. (2002). *What our children teach us: Lessons in joy, love and awareness* (V. Ferruci, Trans.). London: Simon & Schuster.
- Fisher, H. (2006). The drive to love: The neural mechanism for mate selection. In R. Sternberg & K. Weis (Eds.), *The new psychology of love* (pp. 87-115). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Frankl, V. E. (1984). *Man's search for meaning*. Boston: Pocket Books.
- Freud, S. (1912). Recommendations to physicians practicing psychoanalysis. In P. Gay (Ed.), *The Freud reader* (Standard Edition 1958 ed., pp. 111-112). London: Vintage.
- Freud, S. (1938). History of the psychoanalytic movement. In A. A. Brill (Ed.), *The basic writings of Sigmund Freud* (pp. 946-977). New York: Random House.
- Fromm, E. (1983). The nature of well-being. In J. Welwood (Ed.), *Awakening the heart: East/West approaches to psychotherapy and the healing relationship* (pp. 59-69). Boston: Shambhala.
- Furth, G. (1988). *The secret world of drawings: Healing through art*. Boston: Sigo Press.

- Gadamer, H. G. (1982). *Truth and method*. (G. Barden, Cumming, J., Trans.). New York: Crossroad.
- Garfield, S. L. (1977). Research of the training of professional psychotherapists. In A. S. Gurman & A. Razin (Eds.), *Effective psychotherapy: A handbook of research* (pp. 63-83). New York: Pergamon.
- Gendlin, E. T. (1986). *Focusing* (2nd ed.). New York: Bantam.
- Germer, C. K. (2005). Mindfulness: What is it? What does it matter? In C. K. Germer, R. D. Siegel & P. R. Fulton (Eds.), *Mindfulness and psychotherapy*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Germer, C. K. (2006). You gotta have heart. *Psychotherapy Networker*, 30(1), 54-65.
- Gibran, K. (1995). *The eye of the prophet*. London: Souvenir.
- Gibran, K. (2003). *The prophet*. Surrey, UK: Senate.
- Gladwell, M. (2005). *Blink*. Victoria, Australia: Allen Lane.
- Glikauf-Hughes, C., & Wells, M. (1997). *Object relations psychotherapy: An individualised and interactive approach to diagnosis and treatment*. Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson.
- Goldberg, C. (1988). *On being a psychotherapist: The journey of the healer*. New York: Gardner Press.
- Goldberg, D. A. (1998). Structured training goals for psychodynamic psychotherapy. *Journal of Psychotherapy Practice and Research*, 7(1), 10-22.
- Goleman, D. (2006). *Social intelligence*. London: Hutchinson.
- Gopelrud, E. N. (1980). Social support and stress during the first year of graduate school. *Professional Psychology*, 11, 283-290.
- Grahn, J. (1978). *The work of a common woman*. London: Onlywomen Press.
- Greenberg, L. (2002). *Emotion-focused therapy: Coaching clients to work through their feelings*. Washington DC: American Psychological Association.
- Greenberg, L., & Goldman, R. L. (1988). Training in experiential therapy [Special series: Training to competency in psychotherapy]. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 56(5), 696-702.
- Guntrip, H. (1968). *Object relations, schizoid phenomena and the self*. London: Hogarth.
- Halgin, R. P., & Murphy, R. A. (1995). Issues in the training of psychotherapists. In B. Bongar & L. Beutler (Eds.), *Comprehensive textbook of psychotherapy* (pp. 434-455). New York: Oxford University Press.

- Hannaford, C. (1995). *Smart moves: Why learning is not all in your head*. Arlington, Virginia: Great Ocean Publishers.
- Harvey, J., H. (1995). *Odyssey of the heart: The search for closeness, intimacy and love*. New York: W.H. Freeman.
- Hemara, W. (2000). *Maori pedagogies; A view from the literature*. Wellington: New Zealand Council for Educational Research.
- Hendrick, C., & Hendrick, S. S. (2006). Styles of romantic love. In R. Sternberg & K. Weis (Eds.), *The new psychology of love* (pp. 149-170). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Hendricks, G., & Hendricks, K. (1993). *At the speed of life: A new approach to personal change through body-centred therapy*. New York: Bantam.
- Hendrix, H. (1988). *Getting the love you want: A guide for couples*. New York: Harper Perennial.
- Higgs, C., & McAllister, L. (2001). Critical moments in qualitative research. In Byrne-Armstrong, H. H., J. & D. Horsfall (Eds.), *Critical moments in qualitative research*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Holloway, W., & Jefferson, T. (2000). *Doing qualitative research differently: Free association, narrative and the interview method*. London: Sage.
- Horsfall, D. (2001). Black holes in the writing process: Narratives of speech and silence. In H. Byrne-Armstrong, J. Higgs & D. Horsfall (Eds.), *Critical moments in qualitative research*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Houdsen, R. (2003). *Ten poems to change your life*. London: Hodder and Stoughton.
- Hulme, K. (1983). *The bone people*. Auckland: Spiral.
- Hulme, K. (2003). Lullaby for a stone doll. In A. Wendt, R. Whaitiri & R. Sullivan (Eds.), *Whetu moana: Contemporary Polynesian poems in English*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Johanson, G. (2006). The use of mindfulness in psychotherapy: An overview. *The Annals of the American Psychotherapy Association*(April).
- Johnson, S. (2006). Are you there for me? *Psychotherapy Networker*, 30(5), 40-53.
- Jung, F. (1925). *Freud und leid* (G. Jung, Trans.). Berlin: Burdardthaus Verlag.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. (2005). *Coming to our senses: Healing ourselves and the world through mindfulness*. New York: Hyperion.
- Kandel, E. R. (2006). The new science of mind. *Scientific American Mind*, 17(2), 62-69.

- Karen, R. (1994). *Becoming attached: First relationships and how they shape our capacity to love*. New York: Oxford.
- Karter, J. (2002). *On training to be a therapist: The long and winding road to qualification*. Buckingham, Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Kast, V. (1986). *The nature of loving: Patterns of human relationship*. Wilmette, IL: Chiron.
- Kegan, R. (1982). *The evolving self: Problems and process in human development*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Kegan, R. (1994). *In over our heads: The mental demands of modern life*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Kennedy, E., & Charles, S. C. M. D. (1990). *On becoming a counsellor: A basic guide for non-professional counsellors* (new expanded ed.). Melbourne, Australia: Collins Dove.
- Keyes, K., Jr. (1979). *A conscious person's guide to relationships*. Coos Bay, OR: Living Love.
- Kirschenbaum, H. (1979). *On becoming Carl Rogers*. New York: Dell.
- Koch, T. (1996). Implementation of a hermeneutic inquiry in nursing: Philosophy, rigour and representation. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 24, 174-184.
- Koocher, G. P. (1995). Ethics in psychotherapy. In B. Bongar & L. Beutler (Eds.), *Comprehensive textbook of psychotherapy* (pp. 456-473). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kopp, S. B. (1971). *Metaphors from a psychotherapist guru*. Palo Alto CA: Science and Behaviour Books.
- Kornfield, J. (1993). *A path with heart: A guide through the perils and promises of spiritual life*. New York: Bantam.
- Krieger, S. (1991). *Social science and the self: Personal essays on an art form*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Kurtz, R. (1990). *Bodycentred psychotherapy: the Hakomi method*. California: LifeRhythm.
- Kurtz, R. (2004). *Hakomi method of mindfulness based body psychotherapy: Readings*. Ashland, Oregon: Ron Kurtz Trainings.
- Ladinsky, D. (2002). *Love poems from God*. New York: Ladinsky.
- Langs, R. (2006). *Love and death in psychotherapy*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

- Leckman, J. F., Hrdy, S. B., Keverne, E. B., & Carter, S. C. (2006). A biobehavioural model of attachment and bonding. In R. Sternberg & K. Weis (Eds.), *The new psychology of love* (pp. 116-148). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Lesh, T. V. (1970). Zen meditation and the development of empathy in counselors. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 10*, 39-74.
- Leunig, M. (1990). *The prayer tree*. Sydney: Harper Collins.
- Leunig, M. (1990b). *A common prayer: A cartoonist talks to God*. Melbourne: Harper Collins.
- Leunig, M. (2003). *Poems: 1972-2002*. Camberwell, Victoria: Viking.
- Levine, P. (1997). *Waking the tiger*. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic.
- Levine, S., & Levine, O. (1984). *Embracing the beloved: Relationship as a path of awakening*. New York: Doubleday.
- Levy, T. M., & Orlans, M. (1988). *Attachment, trauma and healing: Understanding and treating attachment disorder in children and families*. Washington DC: CWLA Press.
- Lewis, T., Amini, F., & Lannon, R. (2001). *A general theory of love*. San Francisco: Vintage.
- Lincoln, Y., & Guba, G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Linn, S., Emerson, W., Linn, D., & Linn, M. (1999). *Remembering our home: Healing hurts and receiving gifts from conception to birth*. New Jersey: Paulist.
- Lipton, B. (2005). *The biology of belief: Unleashing the power of consciousness, matter and miracles*. Santa Rosa, CA: Elite Books.
- Lowen, A. (1975). *Bioenergetics*. London: Penguin.
- Macfarlane, A. (2000a). Rangatahi, Kaumatua. In L. Bird & W. Drewery (Eds.), *Human development in Aotearoa* (pp. 149, 231). Auckland: McGraw Hill.
- Macfarlane, A. (2000b). The value of Maori ecologies in the study of human development. In L. Bird & W. Drewery (Eds.), *Human development in Aotearoa: A journey through life* (pp. 46-51). Auckland: McGraw Hill.
- Mahler, M., Pine, F., & Bergman, A. (1975). *The psychological birth of the human infant*. New York: International Universities Press.
- Mahoney, M. J. (1991). *Human change processes: the scientific foundations of psychotherapy*. New York: Basic Books.

- Mahoney, M. J. (1995). The modern psychotherapist and the future of psychotherapy. In B. Bongar & L. Beutler (Eds.), *Comprehensive textbook of psychotherapy* (pp. 474-488). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Makeriti, M. (1986). *Makeriti: The old time Maori*. Auckland: New Women's Press.
- Mansfield, K. (1957). *34 short stories*. London: Collins.
- Maslow, A. H. (1954). *Motivation and personality*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative researching*. London: Sage.
- McBroom, A. (1979). The Rose. In P. Rothchild (Ed.), *Bette Midler: The rose*: Atlantic Recording.
- Mead, H. M. (2003). *Tikanga Maori: Living by Maori values*. Wellington: Huia Publishers.
- Meares, R. (2000). *Intimacy and alienation: Memory, trauma and personal being*. London: Routledge.
- Metge, J. (1986). *In and out of touch: Whakamaa in cross cultural context*. Wellington: Victoria University Press.
- Metge, J. (1995). *New growth from old: The whanau in the modern world*. Wellington: Victoria University Press.
- Miller, A. (2005). *The body never lies: The lingering effects of cruel parenting* (A. Jenkins, Trans.). New York: W.W. Norton.
- Mindell, A. (1992). *The leader as martial artist: An introduction to deep democracy*. San Francisco: Harper.
- Mindell, A. (1995). *Metaskills: The spiritual art of therapy*. Tempe, Arizona: New Falcon Publications.
- Mindell, A. (2000). *Quantum mind: The edge between physics and psychology*. Oakland, CA: Lao Tse Press.
- Mondo, L. (2000). *The practice of wholeness: Spiritual transformation in everyday life*. New Mexico: Golden Flower Publications.
- Montgomery, B., & Evans, L. (1983). *Living and loving together: A practical step-by-step manual to help you make and keep better relationships*. Victoria: Viking O'Neil.
- Moore, G. (2002). A man travels. In M. Pinkney (Ed.), *Pocket positives for living: An anthology of quotations*. Victoria, Australia: Five Mile Press.
- Morgan, M. (2006). *Hakomi training manual*. Taradale, HB: Eastern Institute of Technology.

- Morse, J. M. (1994). *Critical issues in qualitative research methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Morse, J. M. (1998). Editorial: What's wrong with random selection? *Qualitative Health Research*, 8(6), 733-735.
- Moyne, J., & Barks, C. (1986). *Unseen rain: Quatrains of Rumi*. Vermont: Threshold Books.
- Munhall, P. L. (1994). *Revisioning phenomenology: Nursing and health science research*. New York: National League for Nursing Press.
- Nathan, V., & Poulsen, S. (2004). Group-Analytic training groups for psychology students: A qualitative study. *Group Analysis*, 37(2), 163-177.
- Nichols, S. (1980). *Jung and tarot: An archetypal journey*. York Beach, Maine: Samuel Weiser.
- Norcross, J. C., & Prochaska, J. O. (1982). A national survey of clinical psychologists: Views on training, career choice, and APA. *The Clinical Psychologist*, 35(1), 3-6.
- NZAP. (2006). Assessment policy and procedures. Wellington: New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists.
- O'Donohue, J. (1998). *Eternal echoes: Exploring our hunger to belong*. London: Bantam Books.
- Ogden, P. (1997). Hakomi integrative somatics: Hands-on psychotherapy. In C. Caldwell (Ed.), *Getting in touch: The guide to new body-centred psychotherapies* (1st ed.). Wheaton, IL: Quest.
- Oliver, M. (1986). *Dream work*. Atlanta: Grove.
- Oliver, M. (2005). *New and selected poems* (Vol. 2). Boston: Beacon Press.
- Opie, A. (1999). Unstructured interviewing. In C. Davidson & M. Tolich (Eds.), *Social science research in New Zealand* (2nd ed., pp. 241-250). Auckland: Pearson.
- Orlinsky, D. E., & Howard, K. I. (1986). Process and outcome in psychotherapy. In S. L. Garfield & A. E. Bergin (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change* (3rd ed., pp. 311-381). New York: Wiley.
- Orlinsky, D. E., & Ronnestad, M. H. (2005). *How psychotherapists develop: A study of therapeutic work and professional growth*. Washington DC: American Psychological Association.
- Pagell, W., Carkhuff, R. R., & Berenson, B. (1967). The predicted differential effects of the level of counselor training on the level of functioning on outpatients. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 23, 510-512.

- Patton, M. Q. (1980). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Pearce, J. C. (2002). *The biology of transcendence: A blueprint of the human spirit*. Rochester, Vermont: Park Street Press.
- Pearsall, P. (1996). *The heart's code*. New York: Broadway Books.
- Peck, M. S. (1978). *The road less travelled: A new psychology of love, traditional values and spiritual growth*. London: Arrow.
- Peck, M. S. (1993). *Further along the road less travelled; The unending journey towards spiritual growth*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Penetito, W. (2000). The social construction of Maori identity; The role of tastes and preferences. In L. Bird & W. Drewery (Eds.), *Human development in Aotearoa: A journey through life* (pp. 52-65). Auckland: McGraw Hill.
- Perls, F. S. (1975). Group vs. individual therapy. In J. O. Stevens (Ed.), *Gestalt is* (pp. 9-16). Moab, Utah: Real People Press.
- Perry, B. (1999). The memories of states: How the brain stores and retrieves traumatic experience. In J. M. Goodwin & R. Attias (Eds.), *Splintered reflections: Images of the body in trauma* (pp. 9-38). New York: Basic Books.
- Pfaffenberger, A. H. (2005). Optimal adult Development: An inquiry into the dynamics of growth. *Journal Of Humanistic Psychology*, 45(3), 279-301.
- Pierrakos, J. C. (1990). *Core energetics: Developing the capacity to love and heal*. Mendocino, CA: LifeRhythm.
- Porges, S. (2001). The polyvagal theory: Phylogenetic substrates of a social nervous system. *International Journal of Psychophysiology*(42), 123-146.
- Porges, S. (2006). "Don't talk to me now, I'm scanning for danger." How your nervous system sabotages your ability to relate. An interview with Stephen Porges about his polyvagal theory. *Nexus*(March/April), 30-35.
- Prigogine, I. (1980). *From being to becoming: Time and complexity in the physical sciences*. San Francisco: W.H. Freeman.
- Proctor, B. (1991). On being a trainer. In W. Dryden & B. Thorne (Eds.), *Training and supervision for counseling in action* (pp. 49-73). London: Sage.
- Purton, C. (1991). Selection and assessment in counsellor training courses. In W. Dryden & B. Thorne (Eds.), *Training and supervision for counselling in action* (pp. 33-48). London: Sage.
- Quadrio, C. (2004). Boundary violations in psychotherapy. *Psychotherapy in Australia*, 10(3), 28-37.

- Rachelson, J., & Clance, P. (1980). Attitudes of psychotherapists towards the 1970 APA standards for psychotherapy training. *Professional Psychology*, 11, 261-267.
- Ralph, N. (1980). Learning psychotherapy: A developmental perspective. *Psychiatry*, 43, 243-250.
- Ramachandran, V. S., & Oberman, L. M. (2006). Broken mirrors: A theory of autism. *Scientific American*, 295(5), 38-45.
- Ram-Dass, & Gorman, P. (1985). *How can I help?: Emotional support and spiritual inspiration for those who care for others*. London: Rider.
- Rappaport, J. (1999). Maternal love and its manifestations in the therapeutic process. In C. Tosone & T. Aiello (Eds.), *Love and attachment: Contemporary issues and treatment considerations* (pp. 189-204). New Jersey: Jason Aronson.
- Reissman, C. K. (1993). *Narrative analysis* (Vol. 30). Newbury Park CA: Sage.
- Remen, R. N. (1994). *Kitchen table wisdom: Stories that heal*. New York: Riverhead Books.
- Richards, L. (1990). *Nobody's home: Dreams and realities in a new suburb*. Melbourne: Oxford University Press.
- Rizzolatti, G., Fogassi, L., & Gallese, V. (2006). Mirrors in the mind. *Scientific American*, 295(5), 30-37.
- Rogers, C. R. (1951). *Client centered therapy*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Rogers, C. R. (1969). *Freedom to learn: A view of what education might become*. Columbus, Ohio: Charles Merrill.
- Rothschild, B. (2000). *The body remembers: The psychophysiology of trauma and trauma treatment*. New York: W.W. Norton.
- Rowan, J. (2005). *The future of training in psychotherapy and counselling: Instrumental, relational and transpersonal perspectives*. London: Routledge.
- Rubin, T. I. (1975). *Compassion and self-hate: An alternative to despair*. New York: Touchstone.
- Rumi. (1994). *Rumi: Daylight* (C. Helminski & K. Helminski, Trans.). Boston: Shambhala.
- Rushdie, S. (1981). *Midnight's children*. London: Cape.
- Rycroft, C. (1971). *Reich*. London: Fontana.
- Scaer, R. (2001). *The body bears the burden: Trauma, dissociation and disease*. New York: Hayworth Medical Press.

- Schellenbaum, P. (1988). *The wound of the unloved: Releasing the life energy*. Dorset: Element.
- Schiffman, M. (1971). *Gestalt self-therapy; And further techniques for personal growth*. Menlo Park, CA: Self Therapy Press.
- Schore, A. N. (1994). *Affect regulation and the origin of self*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Schore, A. N. (2003). *Affect regulation and the repair of self*. New York: W.W.Norton.
- Schwandt, T. (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. London: Sage.
- Schwartz, R. C. (2005). No way is way: The power of artistry in psychotherapy. *Annals of the American Psychotherapy Association*, 6(1), 18-21.
- Shainberg, D. (1983). Teaching therapists how to be with their clients. In J. Welwood (Ed.), *Awakening the heart: East/West approaches to psychotherapy and the healing relationship* (pp. 163-175). Boston: Shambhala.
- Shaver, P. R., & Mikulincer, M. (2006). A behavioural systems approach to romantic love: Attachment, caregiving and sex. In R. Sternberg & K. Weis (Eds.), *The new psychology of love* (pp. 35-64). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Shirres, M. P. (1997). *Te tangata: The human person*. Auckland: Accent Publications.
- Siegel, D. J. (1999). *The developing mind: Toward a neurobiology of interpersonal experience*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Siegel, D. J. (2003a). An interpersonal neurobiology of psychotherapy: The developing mind and the resolution of trauma. In M. Solomon & D. J. Siegel (Eds.), *Healing trauma: Attachment, mind, body and brain*. New York: W.W.Norton.
- Siegel, D. J. (2006). Attachment and self-understanding: Parenting with the brain in mind. *Psychotherapy in Australia*, 12(2), 26-32.
- Siegel, D. J., & Hartzell, M. (2003). *Parenting from the inside out: How a deeper self-understanding can help you raise children who thrive*. New York: Tarcher/Penguin.
- Sinason, V. (1997). Stress in the therapist and the Bagshaw syndrome. In V. P. Varma (Ed.), *Stress in psychotherapists*. London: Routledge.
- Small, J. (1981). *Becoming naturally therapeutic: A return to the true essence of helping*. New York: Bantam.
- Smith, A. (1988). *Understanding children's development* (2nd ed.). Sydney: Allen & Unwin.
- Smith, B. (1986). *A tree grows in Brooklyn*. London: Pan Books.

- Smith, B. A. (1998). The problem drinker's lived experience of suffering: An exploration using hermeneutic phenomenology. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 27, 213-222.
- Snook, I. (1999). The ethics and politics of social research. In C. Davidson & M. Tolich (Eds.), *Social science research in New Zealand* (2nd ed., pp. 69-87). Auckland: Pearson.
- Spring, J. (1987). *Cry hard and swim: The story of an incest survivor*. London: Virago.
- Starhawk. (1982). *Dreaming the dark: Magic, sex and politics*. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Stern, D. N. (2004). *The present moment: In psychotherapy and everyday life*. New York: W.W. Norton.
- Sternberg, R. (2006). A duplex theory of love. In R. Sternberg & K. Weis (Eds.), *The new psychology of love* (pp. 184-199). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Sternberg, R., & Weis, K. (Eds.). (2006). *The new psychology of love*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Sternberg, R. J., & Barnes, M. L. (Eds.). (1988). *The psychology of love*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press.
- Strupp, H. (1973). *Psychotherapy: Clinical research and theoretical issues*. New York: Jason Aronson.
- Sullivan, B. (2005). Becoming a therapist: Challenging the role of training - an interview with Ernest Spinelli. *Psychotherapy in Australia*, 11(3), 60-65.
- Swanson-Kauffman, K. (1986). A combined qualitative methodology for nursing research. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 8(3), 58-69.
- Symington, N. (1995). *The making of a psychotherapist*. Madison, Connecticut: International Universities Press.
- Tan, E.-K. (1991). *Love and intimacy: Reflections of an analytic psychotherapist*. Paper presented at the New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists, Christchurch, New Zealand.
- Tan, E.-K. (2001). Spirituality and psychotherapy. *New Zealand Association of Psychotherapists Forum*, 7, 7-21.
- Tauroa, H., & Tauroa, P. (1986). *Te marae: A guide to customs and protocol*. Auckland: Reed.
- Taylor, A. (2005). Whakapapa. In K. O'Keefe (Ed.), *Small poems for busy people* (pp. 98). Auckland: Cumulus.
- Taylor, K. (1995). *The ethics of caring: Honouring the web of life in our professional healing relationships*. Santa Cruz, CA: Hanford Mead.

- Taylor, S. J., & Bogdan, R. (1984). *Introduction to qualitative research methods: The search for meaning* (2nd ed.). New York: John Wiley.
- Teicher, M. H. (2002). Scars that won't heal: The neurobiology of child abuse. *Scientific American*, 286(3), 54-61.
- Teilhard de Chardin, P. (1955). *The phenomenon of man*. London: Collins.
- Terr, L. (1990). *Too scared to cry: Psychic trauma in childhood*. New York: Basic Books.
- Thompson, S. (2001). Breaking through with subjugated knowledges: Pushing the boundaries of urban planning. In H. Byrne-Armstrong, J. Higgs & D. Horsfall (Eds.), *Critical moments in qualitative research*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Thorne, B., & Dryden, W. (1991). Key issues in the training of counsellors. In W. Dryden & B. Thorne (Eds.), *Training and supervision for counselling in action* (pp. 1-14). London: Sage.
- Tolich, M., & Davidson, C. (1999). *Starting fieldwork: An introduction to qualitative research in New Zealand*. Auckland: Oxford University Press.
- Tomblinson, T., & Hart, J. (1962). A validation of the process Scale. *Journal of Consulting Psychology*, 26, 74-78.
- Torrey, E. F. (1986). *Witchdoctors and psychiatrists*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Tremlow, S., W. (2001). Training psychotherapists in attributes of 'mind' from zen and psychoanalytic perspectives: Core principles, emptiness, impermanence, and paradox. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, 55(1), 1-21.
- Tremlow, S., W. (2001b). Training psychotherapists in attributes of 'mind' from zen and psychoanalytic perspectives, part II : Attention, here and now, nonattachment, and compassion. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, 55(1), 22-39.
- Tressider, M. (2004). *The language of love*. London: Duncan Baird.
- Truax, C., & Carkhuff, R. R. (1967). *Toward effective counselling and psychotherapy*. Chicago: Aldine.
- Trungpa, C. (1983). Becoming a full human being. In J. Welwood (Ed.), *Awakening the heart: East/West approaches to psychotherapy and the healing relationship* (pp. 126-131). Boston: Shambhala.
- Tutu, D. (2006). Reflections of the divine. *New Scientist*, 190.(2549), 48.
- Tweedie, I. (1979). *The chasm of fire: A woman's experience of liberation through the teaching of a Sufi master*. Longmead, UK: Element.
- van der Kolk, B. (1994). The body keeps the score. *Harvard Review of Psychiatry*, 1, 253-265.

- van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. Ontario: Althouse Press.
- van Manen, M. (1997). From meaning to method. *Qualitative Health Research*, 7(3), 345-369.
- Vygotsky, L. (1986). *Thought and language*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Walker, A., Rablen, R., & Rogers, C. R. (1959). Development of a scale to measure process change in psychotherapy. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 16, 79-85.
- Weiss, H. (1995). The emergence of the other. *Hakomi Forum*, Fall(11), 11-25.
- Welwood, J. (1983). On psychotherapy and meditation. In J. Welwood (Ed.), *Awakening the Heart: East/west approaches to psychotherapy and the healing relationship*. Boulder: New Science Library.
- Welwood, J. (2006). *Perfect love, imperfect relationships: Healing the wound of the heart*. Boston: Trumpeter.
- Wendt, A., Whaitiri, R., & Sullivan, R. (Eds.). (2003). *Whetu moana: Contemporary Polynesian poems in English*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Whiston, S. C., & Sexton, T. L. (1993). An overview of psychotherapy outcome research: Implications for practice. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 24(43:51).
- Whyte, D. (1997). *The house of belonging*. New York: Many Rivers Press.
- Whyte, D. (2001). *Crossing the unknown sea: Work as a pilgrimage of identity*. New York: Riverhead Books.
- Wilber, K. (1981). *No boundary: Eastern and western approaches to personal growth*. Boulder, CO: Shambhala.
- Wilber, K. (2000). *Integral psychology: Consciousness, spirit, psychology, therapy*. Boulder, CO: Shambhala.
- Wilcox, E. W. (2005). The depths. In K. O'Keefe (Ed.), *Small poems for busy people* (pp. 58). Auckland: Cumulus.
- Wilde, O. (1993). *The complete plays, poems, novels and stories of Oscar Wilde*. London: Magpie.
- Williamson, M. (2004). *The gift of change: Spiritual guidance for a radically new life*. London: HarperCollins.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1965). *The maturational processes and the facilitating environment*. New York: International Universities Press.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1980). *Playing and reality*. Middlesex: Penguin.

- Wisecchild, L. (1988). *The obsidian mirror: An adult healing from incest*. Seattle: Seal.
- Woskit, V. (1999). *The therapeutic use of self: Counselling practice, research and supervision*. London: Routledge.
- Yalom, I., D. (2005). *The Schopenhauer cure: A novel*. Melbourne: Scribe.
- Yalom, I., D., & Elkin, G. (1974). *Every day gets a little closer: A twice-told therapy*. New York: Basic Books.
- Yeats, W. B. (2005). The cloths of heaven. In K. O'Keefe (Ed.), *Small poems for busy people* (pp. 12). Auckland: Cumulus.
- Yogananda, P. (1979). *Autobiography of a yogi*. Los Angeles: Self-Realization Fellowship.
- Zull, J. E. (2002). *The art of changing the brain*. Sterling, Virginia: Stylus Publishing.

Appendix A

Participant Information Sheet

Date Information Sheet Produced

18.6.2004

Project Title

Recent graduates' lived experience of personal growth during psychotherapy education: a hermeneutic study.

Invitation

I am interested in knowing more about the psychotherapy student's experience of personal growth. If you have graduated in the last 2-3 years from a psychotherapy programme, of at least 3 years duration, offered by educational institutions in Hawkes Bay or Auckland, you are invited to participate in this research study. Your participation is entirely voluntary. The study is a thesis towards a Masters of Health Science (Psychotherapy) qualification at Auckland University of Technology.

What is the purpose of the study?

To explore personal growth experiences of students during their psychotherapy education, from the student's perspective.

How are people chosen to be asked to be part of the study?

Graduates who are interested in participating will volunteer, and 6-8 will be take part in the study. As a general principle those putting themselves forward first will be chosen.

What happens in the study?

We will arrange an interview time and place that is convenient to you, and I will tape an interview with you. You will be encouraged to share your personal experience freely and openly. The interviews will be tape-recorded and later transcribed. You will have an opportunity to read and make changes to your transcript. The different stories will be analysed for similarities and differences in the descriptions of experience, and meanings ascribed to experience.

What are the discomforts and risks?

It is anticipated that there are few risks in taking part in this study. However, it is possible that upsetting emotional memories may surface during the sharing of experiences. There will be time during the interview to talk about any feelings arising. I will check in with you by phone a day or two after the interview. You can withdraw from the study at anytime up until the stage where the final analysis is being written.

What are the benefits?

You get a chance to share your story, which I anticipate will lead to productive discussion in the field of psychotherapy education. Your experiences may positively influence the direction of psychotherapy education.

How will my privacy be protected?

All participants are protected by a confidentiality contract. Any identifying details will be edited from your story and you can choose a pseudonym. Tapes, and any other identifying information, will be kept securely. It is however, possible that others in our small community may recognise aspects of your story, even with details changed.

How do I join the study?

Contact myself, details below.

What are the costs of participating in the project?

Participating in the study will involve your giving your time and maybe some expenses to travel to the interview. The time involved will be about 90 minutes of interview time and time to review your information. I appreciate your willingness to do this.

Opportunity to consider invitation

Thank you for considering being a participant in this research. I wish to emphasise that your choice to participate is voluntary. If you would like to join this study, or have any questions that arise after reading this information sheet you can contact me, the researcher.

Opportunity to receive feedback on results of research

You will read your own story, have a chance to share your comments on the original, and edited, transcripts, and have a chance to make alterations while the research project is in progress, up to the final analysis stage. If you wish you will be able to read the final research thesis.

Participant Concerns

Any concerns regarding the nature of this project should be notified in the first instance to the Project Supervisor.

Concerns regarding the conduct of the research should be notified to the Executive Secretary, AUTECH, Madeline Banda, madeline.banda@aut.ac.nz , 09 917 9999 ext 8044.

Researcher Contact Details:

Marilyn Morgan, 9 Finnis Lane, Napier
Phone 06 8355135
e-mail; st.marys@xtra.co.nz

Project Supervisor Contact Details:

Margot Solomon, Psychotherapy, AUT,
09 917 9999 ext 7191
margot.solomon@aut.ac.nz

**Approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics
Committee on 19.05.05 AUTEK Reference number: 04/202**

Appendix B

Consent to Participation in Research

Title of Project: Recent graduates' lived experience of personal growth during psychotherapy education: a hermeneutic study.

Project Supervisor: Margot Solomon

Researcher: Marilyn Morgan

-
- I have read and understood the information provided about this research project.
 - I have had an opportunity to ask questions and to have them answered.
 - I understand that the interview will be audio-taped and transcribed.
 - I understand that I may withdraw myself or any information that I have provided for this project at any time prior to completion of data collection, without being disadvantaged in any way. If I withdraw, I understand that all relevant tapes and transcripts, or parts thereof, will be destroyed
 - I agree to take part in this research.

Participant signature:

Participant name:

Date:

Project Supervisor Contact Details:
Margot Solomon, Psychotherapy,
AUT, Private Bag 92006, Auckland.
09 917 9999 ext 7191
margot.solomon@aut.ac.nz

**Approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee on 19.05.05
AUTEC Reference number: 04/202**

The participant should retain a copy of this form.

Appendix C

Interview Guide

These questions are intended to be a guide only and may not all be asked, or necessarily asked in this order. Changes are likely as the interviewing of participants progresses.

1. Introductory questions

- How was the personal growth aspect of your course for you?
- What was easy?
- What was difficult?
- In what ways have you changed?
- Do you see yourself differently now?

2. Prompts (examples)

- Tell me more about that.
- How was that for you?
- Could you give me an example?
- Did that happen often?
- When was that?

3. Themes

- How did the changes impact on (your family, your skill as a therapist, and your priorities in life) during the course (and on reflection)?
- What helped make personal change easier (in the course, outside the course)?

- What was most important to you (about personal growth)?
- Did you have enough time for the process?
- What aspects of the course supported, (did not support), personal growth?
- Based on your own experience, do you think personal growth is important in the preparation of the psychotherapists?
- Were you prepared for this dimension of the course?

Appendix D

Extra Questions for Participants

(These questions were e-mailed to participants for their written responses)

Personal information

- I may use direct quotes from your interview in my research. What pseudonym would you like me to use for you?
- What personal background information can I comment on? (I will attempt to disguise, or leave out, any identifying details.)
 - Your age, or age group? (please say)
 - The name of the training programme(s) you did
 - How long since you graduated.
 - The work you do now.
 - Anything about you or your interests –family, country of origin, background.

Some more questions where I would be interested in hearing your response (if you have not already spoken of this in your initial interview).

- What were your reasons for starting your psychotherapy training?
- Could you sum up in a sentence or two where your personal growth journey has taken you, how are you different?
- Is there a spiritual aspect to your personal growth? If so please comment.
- Is there a social awareness dimension to your personal growth? If so please comment.
- Is there a somatic (bodily) aspect to your personal growth? If so please comment.
- If your training programme or teachers could have facilitated your personal growth in a way that was better for you, how would that have been?
- Is 'love' related in any way to your experience in psychotherapy training?

I quote a passage from Erich Fromm about the outcome of a successful psychoanalysis. Has this any relevance for your own experience of personal development?

“A person senses for the first time that he is vain, that he is frightened, that he hates, while consciously he had believed himself to be modest, brave and loving. The new insight may hurt him, but it opens a door, it permits him to stop projecting on others what he represses in himself. He proceeds; he experiences the infant, the child, the adolescent, the criminal, the insane, the saint, the artist, the male, *and* the female within himself; he gets more deeply in touch with humanity, with the universal man; he represses less, is freer, has less need to project, to cerebration; then he may experience for the first time how he sees colours, how he sees a ball roll, how his ears are suddenly open to music, when up to now he only listened to it; in sensing his oneness with others, he may have a first glimpse of the

illusion that his separate individual ego is *something* to hold on to, to cultivate, to save; he will experience the futility of seeking the answer to life by *having* himself, rather than by being and becoming himself. All these are sudden and unexpected experiences with no intellectual content; yet afterwards the person feels freer, stronger, less anxious than he ever felt before. The authentic psychoanalytic insight arrives without being forced or even being premeditated. It starts not in our brain but, to use a Japanese image, in our belly. It cannot be adequately formulated in words, and it eludes one if one tries to do so; yet it is real and conscious, and leaves the person who experiences it a changed person.”

Appendix E

Questions for Teachers of Psychotherapy

(These questions were e-mailed to teachers for their written responses)

I am at present doing research for my Masters degree about the personal growth experiences of psychotherapy students. How that is for them, what facilitates this, what meaning they place on their growth. I have interviewed nine graduates in some depth, and talked with others. Some have completed psychotherapy programmes of an academic nature (in three locations in NZ) and some have completed Hakomi training.

What has emerged is the sense of journey that these students take, and that the journey involves considerable disturbance, pain, and turbulence along the way. The end result is change, an expansion, and an increasing ability to be in relationship. I have noted that the experiences described by these graduates strikingly resemble the description of being subject to the power of *love* as described by Kahlil Gibran, in The ‘Prophet’.

This has me curious. Personal growth is facilitated by personal therapy, group experience, and by the trainers and the training itself. As psychotherapists, and trainers (particularly in mainstream academic programmes) we usually don’t talk of *love* as such, but rather ‘empathy’, ‘acceptance’ etc. I would appreciate your brief comments on any of the following questions:

- Do you feel that you love your students?
- If so, how is this experience for you?
- Do you feel that love (or any aspect of love) assists your students with their personal growth?
- Is love for students, from their teachers (holding, empathy, compassion, acceptance etc) built into your training programme as a conscious and deliberate part of their preparation for being psychotherapists?
- Are students in your programme encouraged to love their clients?
- If so, are they assisted with the management of the many complex dimensions of the feelings involved in *love*?

- Have you been prepared for the complexity of managing feelings of love (and what may be accessed as a result) in a training setting?
- Are you supported to include *love* in your curriculum/assessment?



Appendix F

Typist Confidentiality Agreement

Title of Project: Recent graduates' lived experience of personal growth during psychotherapy education: a hermeneutic study.

Project Supervisor: Margot Solomon

Researcher(s): Marilyn Morgan

I understand that all the material I will be asked to transcribe is confidential. I understand that the contents of the tapes can only be discussed with the researchers. I will not keep any copies of the transcripts nor allow third parties access to them while the work is in progress.

Typist's signature:

.....

Typist's name:

.....

Typist's Contact Details:

.....

.....
.....
Date:

Project Supervisor Contact Details:
Margot Solomon,
Head, School of Psychotherapy,
Phone: 09 917 9999 extn 7191, Fax:09 917 9780
e-mail: margot.solomon@aut.ac.nz

Approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee on 19.05.05
AUTEK Reference number 04/202

Appendix G

Research Participants

NAME: (pseudonym)	AGE decade	PROGRAMME	ETHNICITY
Linda	40	Masters (Psychotherapy)	Non-NZ
Judy	50	Hakomi Diploma Dip. Psych., BASS (Psychotherapy)	NZ pakeha
Maree	40	Hakomi Diploma	NZ pakeha
David	30	Dip. Psych., BASS (Psychotherapy)	NZ pakeha
J.B.	50	Hakomi Diploma, stud. BASS (Psychotherapy)	Maori
Huia	40	Cert in SS Hakomi Diploma	Maori
Marama	40	Counselling Dip.in A&D. Maori counseling	Maori
Bonnie	40	BASS (Psychotherapy)	Non-NZ
Anna	40	Masters (Psychotherapy)	Non-NZ
Sarah *	40	Dip. Counselling BASS (Psychotherapy)	NZ pakeha
Kerry *	50	Dip. Counselling	NZ Pakeha

Isobel *	30	Masters (Clinical Psych.)	Australian

* interviewed later in process of research; more briefly

Appendix H

Teachers of Psychotherapy who responded

NAME	PROGRAMME	LOCATION
Neil	Masters Clinical Psychology Hakomi Teacher	Australia
Cedar	Hakomi Trainer	Boulder, Colorado
Beth	Hakomi Trainer	Canada
Daniel*	Hakomi Trainer	United States
Halko	Senior Hakomi Trainer	Germany
Anihana	BASS, Hakomi	NZ
Pamela*	Private Psychotherapy Training Institute	NZ
Verona	BASS	NZ
Manuela	Masters Psychology Hakomi Trainer	San Francisco
Joan	Masters Psychotherapy – (retired)	NZ

* pseudonym by request

Appendix I

Full text of quote from The Prophet on Love (Gibran)

“Then said Almitra, Speak to us of Love.

And he raised his head and looked upon the people, and there fell a stillness upon them. And with a great voice he said: When love beckons to you follow him,

Though his ways are hard and steep.

And when his wings enfold you yield to him,

Though the sword hidden among his pinions may wound you.

And when he speaks to you believe in him,

Though his voice may shatter your dreams as the north wind lays waste the garden.

For even as love crowns you so shall he crucify you. Even as he is for your growth so is he for your pruning.

Even as he ascends to your height and caresses your tenderest branches that quiver in the sun,

So shall he descend to your roots and shake them in their clinging to the earth.

Like sheaves of corn he gathers you unto himself.

He threshes you to make you naked.

He sifts you to free you from your husks.

He grinds you to whiteness,

He kneads you until you are pliant;

And then he assigns you to his sacred fire, that you may become sacred bread for God's sacred feast.

All these things shall love do unto you that you may know the secrets of your heart, and in that knowledge become a fragment of life's heart.

But if in your fear you would seek only love's peace and love's pleasure,

Then it is better for you that you cover your nakedness and pass out of love's threshing floor.

Into the seasonless world where you shall laugh, but not all of your laughter, and weep, but not all of your tears.

Love gives naught but itself and takes naught but from itself.

Love possesses not nor would it be possessed; For love is sufficient unto love.

When you love you should not say, “God is in my heart,” but rather, “I am in the heart of God.”

And think not that you can direct the course of love, for love, if it finds you worthy directs your course.
Love has no other desire but to fulfill itself.
But if you love and must needs have desires, let these be your desires:
To melt and be like a running brook that sings its melody to the night.
To know the pain of too much tenderness.
To be wounded by your own understanding of love;
And to bleed willingly and joyfully.
To wake at dawn with a winged heart and give thanks for another day of loving;
To rest at the noon hour and meditate love's ecstasy;
To return home at eventide with gratitude;
And then to sleep with a prayer for the beloved in your heart and a song of praise on your lips.
(Gibran, K. (2003). *The prophet*. Surrey, UK: Senate.)

Appendix J

Aroha and Love

My perspective

Maori people seem to use the word *aroha* a lot more freely than we as Pakeha use the word *love*. Along with verbal expressions of aroha I have observed warmth, care, concern, respect and physical contact such as sitting close or embracing. The word *aroha* is there in the waiata that we sing.

Te Aroha
Te Whakapono
Me te rangimarie
Tatou, tatou e

(love, truth and peace for all of us)

E hara i te mea
No naiane te aroha
No nga tipuna
I tuku iho

(Love is not only a thing of today. It has been passed down from our ancestors.)

E kore te aroha e maroke I te ra
Makutu tonu, I aku roimata e-e

(My love will not be dried up by the sun. It will always be moistened by my tears.)

I became curious. Does *aroha* have different meanings from *love*? I asked two Maori women for their input. Anihana replied:

Aroha.

Personal love (for or of self and others) and romantic love (for another) does overlap with aroha. Its a huge term, defined by the relationship between two or more people. It embraces all levels of love and relationships from intimate one-to-one, to whanau, hapu, iwi, and universally, including nature and all living animals, life forms and things. How we (I) have learned to differ aroha is in our terminology of those many complex relationships we encounter on those many levels.

Aroha - aro and ha has its own tikanga - aro heart and ha breath (of life). It is demonstrated in how it's felt and then actioned rather than in it just being spoken. How does my heart and my breath honour someone or something when I'm with them? And when I am away from them? Tikanga shows me, informs me the way of sharing my aroha. And how I'd 'do' that, show that, action it, of course is where another difference is, dependant on the relationship.

Ko toku whaiaaipo - my lover (is a term we have when speaking privately with whanau or friends about a partner) Some do introduce her or him this way publicly, but its more an endearing respectful way within whanaungatanga circles.

Ko toku hoa rangatira - my partner, wife, husband is the more public respectful recognition of the relationship we use. I use 'Ko toku hoa ngakau' with my loved one, partner of my heart, of me.

There is a much greater picture too, may your korero with others create a beautiful piece of art for you.

J.B. responded:

According to the elders:

E hara te aroha I te kiri moko, engari kooia tērā e pupū ake ana I te whatumanawa

(Love is not skin deep like the tattooed face of a chieftain, but swells up continually from the depth's of one's heart.)
(Barlow, 1991)

Tuhoe Tohunga; Hohepa Kereopa said that *aroha* is love, pity, affection, approval. It's the way it affects two people who are their own separate universes. *Aroha* is a joining of two universes, but the joining can only work when each of the universes has the same thinking! When the two start to think differently, then the two universes begin to separate. Relationship problems come about because their universes are no longer joined properly. Knowing and understanding the roles and needs of *wahine and tane* universes and why the roles exist for each other in order to survive makes the relationship work. Once the two roles are brought together, a new universe is created. So the more you love another, the better (guardian) you are just as the more you share and the more you give, the more flows to you. Sometimes, when you hold it, no more comes until you let go!

Definitions from books

Aroha is love, respect, compassion. (Mead, 2003)

Aroha -1. usually translated *love*, aroha is not an exact equivalent for the English word. Its primary reference is not sexual love but caring compassionate love for others, especially kinsfolk and visitors. It is used to convey: 2. *sympathy* for those in sorrow and trouble; 3. *gratitude*, and 4. *proud approval*. (Metge, 1986)

Aroha — love, sympathy, charity. Aroha is a sacred power that emanates from the gods. Aroha in a person has an all encompassing quality of goodness, expressed by love for people, land, birds, and animals, fish and all living things. A person who has aroha for another expresses genuine concern towards them and acts with their welfare in mind, no matter what their state of health or

wealth. It is the act of love that adds quality and meaning to life. (Barlow also talks of hospitality as part of genuine aroha.) (Barlow, 1991)

Comment

Maybe not implying sexual connotations makes using the word *aroa* easier? Also aroha would seem to include dimensions of *approval*, supporting a person's mana; that is not overtly there with the word love, and includes *hospitality* such as offering food and shelter.

References

- Barlow, C. (1991). *Tikanga whakaaro*. Auckland: Oxford University Press.
Mead, H. M. (2003). *Tikanga Maori: Living by Maori values*. Wellington: Huia Publishers.
Metge, J. (1986). *In and out of touch: Whakamaa in cross cultural context*. Wellington: Victoria University Press.