



**How do Chinese Print Media in New
Zealand present ideas of Chinese
Cultural Identity?
-- A research of Chinese print media
in New Zealand**

David Gang Lin

A thesis submitted to Auckland University of
Technology in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of Master of
Communication Studies (MCS)
2007

Table of content

Certificate of authorship.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Abstract.....	v
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
1.1 The meaning of Chinese-ness	6
1.2 Chinese Identity.	7
1.4 Background to Chinese Print Media in New Zealand	10
Chapter 2: Methodology	12
Chapter 3 Literature Review.....	17
3.1 Communities and Diaspora.....	17
3.2 Chinese & Chinese-ness	21
Chapter 4 Case Studies	27
4.1 Case Study one: Face, Shame and Prostitution.....	27
4.2 Case Study two: Laughing at Mao.....	34
Chapter 5. Analysis of Case Studies	41
Chapter 6. Conclusion.....	49
References.....	53
Bibliography	57
Appendix.....	79

The Attestation of Authorship

"I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person (except where explicitly defined in the acknowledgements), nor material which to a substantial extent has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning."

Signed:

David Gang Lin

August 2008

Acknowledgements

In the recognition of the support, guidance, and encouragement that assisted me in the writing of this thesis, I would like to thank following people:

To my supervisor, Peter Hoar, thank you for your great advice, inspiration, encouragement and patience.

To Dr Rosser Johnson, the Head of Postgraduate Studies, thank you for your perceptive observations, ongoing support and generosity.

To Jessie Hsu, thank you for your great help, inspiration and smile.

To my parents, thank you for all your support and encouragement.

Abstract:

This thesis is a study of the free newspapers that form a significant part of the media consumed by Chinese people in New Zealand. In it I examine how these newspapers reflect and portray ideas of identity as expressed by members of the Chinese community. Little work has been done on Chinese print media in New Zealand and the free newspapers have often been regarded as ephemeral and of little interest to media scholars. However, in this thesis I argue that they offer insights into the experiences and attitudes of the Chinese people in New Zealand both those who have been settled here for many years and also more recent immigrants. This study is intended to show how these varied newspapers reflect ideas about cultural identity in a diasporic setting. Two case studies are used to examine and elaborate the idea of how the Chinese print media in New Zealand present Chinese cultural identity. Chinese readers pick up the newspapers to read and discuss various controversial stories. People argue about important questions such as “who we are” “what we are doing here” and “what is our identity”. By studying these newspapers, we can gain insights into how the Chinese cultural identity is transformed by the experience of immigration.

Chapter 1: Introduction

On a typical Friday evening, a Chinese family, the Lins, came to Taiping. This is one of the largest Chinese supermarkets in Auckland. It is very busy with families shopping. This is one of the Auckland markets, where they can get Chinese foods and products. There is another reason for them to come to Taiping. After they have checked out from the cashier, they pick up several of their favourite Chinese newspapers, such as *The Chinese New Zealand Herald*, *The Mirror*, and *The Mandarin*¹. There are at least twelve different types of Chinese newspapers located next to the check out counter. They are all free. Why are there so many different kinds of Chinese newspapers? Do these newspapers reflect the various voices of Auckland Chinese community? How do these Chinese newspapers report on issues? Are there any controversial perspectives? All these questions led me to investigate these free newspapers.

The purpose of this thesis is to study Chinese print media in New Zealand. More specifically, it examines the free Chinese newspapers given away in shops, supermarkets and other locations where Chinese people gather. Do Chinese people use the media to maintain their cultural identity or to adapt to a new environment? The Chinese community in New Zealand is varied due to the diversity of its origins and the different stages at which its members have arrived. The Chinese in New Zealand show many differences in countries or regions of birth, languages, dialects, religions, values, behaviour and cultural identities. This thesis reflects some of my own experience of being a new Chinese immigrant in New Zealand. My cultural background gives me insights into the acculturation process of Chinese immigrants in New Zealand, and the strategies they use to maintain or represent their cultural identity through community media.

¹ Explain: Please note that that all the names of any publications including newspapers, magazines, books and the title of articles and the Act will use italic format throughout this thesis.

Little work has been done on Chinese print media in New Zealand. Language barriers represent obstacles for academic studies of these newspapers. Many people are unaware of the existence of these newspapers. The Chinese print media are varied. Many New Zealanders regard the Chinese community as homogenous. They do not know how many different kinds of Chinese newspapers there are in New Zealand and why Chinese migrants have so many of them. Chinese are aware of the many differences within their community. Chinese migrants in New Zealand group themselves after their arrival according to their origin, values, religions, dialects, and behaviours. It is unlikely that one Chinese newspaper could meet all these different needs. Such varied groups of Chinese need their own papers to express their ideas, attitudes, values and argument. This study is intended to show how these varied newspapers reflect ideas about cultural identity in diasporic setting.

Another important factor is how the Chinese print media react to an issue or social events and how readers respond. Chinese readers pick up the newspapers to read and discuss various controversial stories. People argue about important questions such as “who we are” “what we are doing here” and “what is our identity”. By studying these newspapers, we can gain insights into how the Chinese cultural identity is transformed by the experience of immigration.

To understand what the Chinese are doing here in New Zealand, we need to go back a little bit to the historical background. Chinese came to New Zealand as just one part of a global diasporic movement. They originally came to New Zealand to work in the gold fields during the 1860s. Many of these immigrants were peasants and often illiterate. New Zealand was not a particularly welcoming place for them. They were seen as alien, due to their appearance, language and mannerisms. Early Chinese settlers were often subject to harassment both informally and through legislation, such as *The New Zealand Chinese Immigrants Act 1881*. This introduced a poll tax. This was an entry tax on Chinese settlers which controlled the flow of the immigrants (Ip, 1999, p. 287). In 1935 the Labour Government rescinded the Act (Huo, 1999, p.3). In 2002 Prime Minister Helen Clark issued a formal apology to the Chinese Community on behalf of New Zealand for the poll tax (Young, 2002).

A new immigration act was passed in 1987 by the Labour government. This began a new wave of immigration comprised many ethnic and national groups. The New Zealand's Chinese population alone had doubled by 1996 to be approximately two percent of the country's population of 3.6 million (Ip, 1999, p. 290). The new arrivals were not necessarily from mainland China, but from Singapore, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Malaysia, and other Southeast Asian areas. Even though they came from different parts of world, they still had something in common. They shared the admittedly contestable, meaning of "Chinese-ness".

This wave of immigration aroused many and varied reactions in New Zealand. Some saw the Chinese immigrants as vital stimulants for a somewhat moribund national economy. They contributed to business and provided investment capital. However, some elements of New Zealand society reacted with fear and hostility. Some organisations such as the New Zealand Defence Movement mobilised to stem Chinese immigration. They claimed to be protecting the interests of Maori and Pakeha against a perceived "Asian invasion". Such responses ranged from mild fear to outright xenophobia. They illustrated the tensions inherent in the transition New Zealand is undergoing to a multicultural society.

As mentioned the Chinese immigration to New Zealand was and remains just one part of a wider global Chinese Diaspora. The definition of the word "diaspora" has traditionally been centred on the notion that diasporic communities were forced away from home into exile. They were poor, uneducated, oriented to physical labour and often regarded as inferior to those in the mainstream of their host countries (Cohen, 1997, p. ix). "Diaspora" carries connotations of the loss of homeland, uprootedness, expulsion, oppression, moral degradation, a collective memory of the homeland and a strong desire to return to it one day (Safran, 1991, p. 83). From this perspective, it is clear that the word 'diaspora' signifies a process of population spreading to new places, and a process full of emotion. Wang (1999b) argued that Chinese migrations involved pull and push factors. Throughout history, these migrations can be described using terms like "chain migration, forced migration, labour migration, free migration,

student migration, seasonal migration, illegal migration, return migration, secondary migration (or re-migration) and so on.” (p. 60)

Pan (1999) analysed the Chinese diaspora under six broad categories. The following headings were used to categorise the forms of migration: trade, coolies, chain, students, re-migration and illegal immigration. The first of these, trade diaspora, is seen as form of cultural as well as economic exchange. It involved the physical relocation of merchants to new countries. Modern versions of this exchange may not require physical relocation on the same scale as formerly due to the rise of digital telecommunication, banking and financial networks. Many Chinese are in New Zealand for business reasons and the Chinese newspapers address their concerns.

The second category was the Coolie Trade. This was a labour diaspora and involved the relocation of often illiterate manual workers to provide a cheap and often exploited workforce. This was seen in New Zealand during the nineteenth century gold rushes. Although this was the first wave of Chinese immigration to New Zealand and China is still a major source of migrant labour (much of which is recruited through government channels). The coolie trade is not important in contemporary New Zealand. Patterns of labour migration are no longer dependant on blatant exploitation of manual workers (Pan, 1999, p. 61). Therefore this version of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand is not relevant to my research.

Chain immigration was Pan’s third category. This involves Chinese settlers using their links and networks to their home countries to facilitate the further immigration of relatives, friends and colleagues. Organisations such as friendly societies and Chambers of Commerce may work to this end while informal networks of families and friends also act as links in chain immigration. As Pan states: “Since most migrants have traditionally relied on people from the same native place already settled in their destination countries to help them adjust and find work, a strong correlation exists between the choices of destination of emigrants and the locations of their fellow townsmen” (Pan, 1999, pp. 61-62). Much Chinese immigration to New Zealand works in this way. The Chinese language newspapers are used to address financial

and personal aspects of these migrants. Tensions and differences among such settlers are at times addressed by local Chinese print media and the case studies used in this thesis highlight conflicting ideas about cultural identity and the roles and status of migrants in New Zealand.

People who enter a country for further education are usually granted a student visa that allows them to stay in a country for the duration of their studies. This “student diaspora” is the fourth of Pan’s categories and is particularly important in New Zealand. From the early 1990s, thousands of Chinese students have come to New Zealand. They have stimulated business in New Zealand. Many new businesses have been set up which rely on the Chinese students. These include language schools, finance companies, immigration agencies, and travel agencies. Even the universities have developed new programmes to accommodate these students. They often seek opportunities to stay longer or gain permanent residence. This group is of particular interest for this thesis as many of the newspapers I have examined are aimed at them.

The fifth category that Pan defined is re-migration diaspora (Pan, 1999, p. 62). This involves migrants alternating residence between two or more counties which may include their country of origin. Many Chinese in New Zealand spend significant parts of their lives in several counties due to family or business interests. Such migrants move in and through several cultures which can lead to ambiguities in their sense of cultural identity or, in other words, what it means to be Chinese. These ambiguities are an important part of the present research and I would argue that they are sometimes played out and contested in the Chinese newspapers of New Zealand.

The final category was described by Pan as clandestine migration. This is illegal immigration as seen by most governments. This does not appear to be a major component of Chinese migration to New Zealand due to New Zealand’s geographic isolation as small group of islands in a large ocean along with strict and well policed points of entry. This form of Chinese immigration in New Zealand is not important for the present study.

This taxonomy is valuable in that it illustrates the many and varied forms of the migrations that constitute the Chinese global diaspora. Some aspects are more relevant for the Chinese experience in New Zealand. I have included this discussion to highlight the varieties and disparate forms of Chinese culture and experiences within New Zealand. It illustrates the idea that there are many ways to be Chinese and these forms of “Chineseness” are discussed in the newspaper I have examined.

1.1 The meaning of Chinese-ness

If there are many ways to be Chinese then there are also many ways in which Chinese people refer to and understand themselves. To understand how these senses of “Chineseness” are articulated through the New Zealand Chinese print media it is useful to draw out some aspects of the terminology Chinese people use to differentiate their understandings and concepts of cultural identity, solidarity and belonging.

Some scholars such as Ang (2001) argued that speaking Chinese is not a necessary condition for Chinese identity. “Chineseness” worldwide is open and subject to renegotiation and redefinition both inside and outside territorial China. It is not a fixed state predicated imply on the speaking of Chinese. Rather, it is a fluid and changing cultural status that is assigned according to local circumstances and conditions.

A similar argument is found in the work of writers such as Ong and Nonini (1997). They find contemporary Chinese identity to be based in China itself but these identities have become more fluid and varied due to the cultural influences experienced by Chinese in the course of their global diaspora. The idea of identity as geographically grounded is questioned in the same ways in which notions of identity as language based have been undermined. Ideas of Chinese identity and culture, under the influence of diaspora, can therefore become parts of “constructed landscapes of collective aspirations [that are] now mediated through the complex prism of modern media” (Appadurai, 1990, p. 2).

Here the argument is that identities are not things people are born with, but that they are constructed in and through representations of culture and identity that are in turn

reflected and refracted by media such as the Chinese language newspapers along with the mainstream media of the New Zealand host culture. For a Chinese New Zealander to be Chinese is a reflection of the way “Chineseness” or “non-Chineseness” has been represented by other Chinese New Zealanders, European New Zealanders, Maori, and other local groups. This ongoing process of definition and redefinition occurs within the Chinese community in New Zealand and can be used as a gate keeping mechanism to maintain an idea of cultural identity that perhaps benefits some groups more than others. One aim of this study is to show this process in action and in turn highlight the fluid and variable nature of cultural identity in the context of global diasporic movements.

1.2 Chinese Identity.

An important aspect of the framing of identity in the Chinese newspapers is through language. These are after all text based media and so the contesting and discussion of identity is to a large degree a linguistic process. Semantic discussions of Chinese identity have been put forward by scholars such as Wang who noted that the definition of Chinese identity should be emphasised. He further explained that the English word ‘Chinese’ is too simple to capture the many meanings represented by Chinese language definitions and terms that refer to identity. The Chinese phrase ‘Zhongguo minzu’ (中国民族)² could refer to either ethnicity, people, or mainland China. Another phrase might be used, ‘Zhongguoren’, (中国人) which refers more specifically to citizens of the Chinese state (*G. Wang, 1991, in Chan, 1998, p.3-4*).

The single English word ‘Chinese’ also ignores other Chinese language terms that refer to identity. ‘Hanren’ (汉人) or ‘Huaren’ (华人) refers to the ethnic Chinese that make up to ninety-five percent of ‘Zhongguoren’ (中国人). ‘Han’ (汉) refers

² Explain: Please note that all instances where Chinese characters are used I first give the English transliteration, then the characters in parentheses, then explain the concept in its nearest English meaning.

to the first great dynasty and empire, the ‘Han’ (汉) (206BC to 220BC), while ‘Hua’ (华) connotes Chinese culture and civilisation.

Further, an important distinction is made in the People’s Republic of China between those who are citizens of the People’s Republic of China ‘Zhongguoren’(中国人) and those around the world, outside of China, who claim a common ancestry with the ‘Hanren’ (汉人) or ‘Huaren’ (华人) but who are not citizens of the People’s Republic of China. And it is they, as ‘Hanren’ (汉人) or ‘Huaren’ (华人), who are members of the Chinese diaspora. Chan (1998) added the notion of the ‘Huaqiao’ (华侨) which refers to the members of the Chinese communities that dwell outside mainland China. These people maintain strong ties with the ‘zuguo’ (祖国 the ancestral country), through the media, and personal and professional links. Contrasting with these groups are the ‘Huayi’ (华裔), communities of people of Chinese ancestry whose ties to the ‘zuguo’ (祖国 the ancestral country) are tenuous. The ‘Huayi’ may prefer to assimilate their identities into the host community but are unable to lose what Chan refers to as the "corporeal malediction of their imposed identity as Chinese”. They are Chinese by descent but do not speak, read, or write Chinese. They construct "Chinese-ness" for their own purposes and according to local circumstances (Chan, 1998, p. 4).

This discussion of the ways in which Chinese refer to their identities is intended to illustrate the relative linguistic poverty of the English word ‘Chinese’. It shows that there are many nuances of meaning that the English word ignores. When analysing the construction of Chinese identity within the newspapers this thesis examines it is useful to understand the richness of terms used in Chinese to refer to identity.

In addition to linguistic aspects of Chinese “identity”, historical and social factors have also shaped (and continue to shape) notions of Chinese-ness. Scholars such as Huntington (1996) have suggested that factors such as the opening up of China’s economy to the world markets during the late 1970s, the return of Hong Kong in 1997 and the rapid economic development have affected the ways in which contemporary

Chinese identities are constructed. Another important factor for this study is the Chinese diaspora.

Several factors shape the characteristics of diaspora of Chinese communities in countries like New Zealand. They include: political and economic development in the homeland³; discrimination against Chinese; immigration policies; and globalised networks of communications and economics (Ma, 2003, p. 9). However, the modern Chinese diaspora is more atomised than in the past. Immigrants come from a wide variety of countries and settlement patterns are often more widespread.. Additionally, Chinese diasporic communities divide into internal sub-ethnic populations even within the same country of settlement (Cox & Mair, 1991; Massey, 1990; Massey & Jess, 1995; Warf, 1993, in Ma, 2003, pp.12-25).

These new diasporic patterns give rise to novel forms of discourse about Chinese identity, or Chinese-ness. One such approach is taken by J. Kotkin who sees Chinese as a “global tribe”, one which, like Jews, Japanese and Indians, have among other things “a global network based on mutual trust that allows the tribe to function collectively beyond the confines of national or regional borders”. Overseas Chinese are portrayed as part of an “empire of guanxi 关系⁴” and the mainland as “the repository of virtually all the cultural heritage of the tribe” (Kotkin, 1993).

Wang (1991) believes that what “Chinese-ness” means is very complicated and differs among Chinese in different places. This points to the importance of factors that shape cultural identities and to the complexity of Chinese-ness (Wang, 1999). Further the relationship between spatial mobility and identity is highly controversial (Lin, 2003) and, of course, “a host state’s policies toward ethnicity and ethnic relations strongly affect the lives of diasporic Chinese” (Ma, 2003, p. 35).

³ Here the homeland of Chinese refers to the place that the Chinese origin comes from; it might be China, Malaysia, Singapore or Taiwan.

⁴ Guanxi 关系: Human relationship.

Chinese notions of identity are rich and complex not only in a purely linguistic sense but also with respect to the effects of economic, social and political factors within both home and host countries. In this thesis I have tried to capture a sense of the fluidity and dynamism of ideas of Chinese cultural identity as they play out within the diasporic communities print media within New Zealand. Although it is important to understand some of the complexities about Chinese identity that scholars like Kotkin (1993) and Wang (1991) have explicated, these cannot be viewed as definitive. Cultures and societies are in a state of constant flux. One of the values studying everyday media such as the free Chinese newspapers is that they often reflect this flux.

1.4 Background to Chinese Print Media in New Zealand

The first Chinese language newspaper in New Zealand was published in 1921 (**David find title of first newspaper**) It concentrated on mainland China's politics and the interest of the Chinese community within New Zealand. After 1947, with a new wave of Chinese immigration, many more newspapers began to be published. These included *Wellington Chinese Free School Magazine*, *New Zealand Chinese Growers' Monthly Journal* and *Wellington Chinese Sports and Culture Centre Newsletter* (Murphy, 1997, pp. 273-275). Typically, these newspapers had small print runs and were written in Chinese.

In 1989, Sing Tao Group, the Hong Kong-based media giant, established its first New Zealand Chinese-language newspaper Sing Tao Daily (**David check it**) in Auckland (Murphy, 1997, p. 274). The Wilson and Horton Group⁵ launched its first Chinese newspaper in 1994, (**name of this one**) but it only lasted for 28 months. Today, there

⁵ The publisher of the New Zealand Herald

are more than 20 newspapers (Huo, 1999, p. 71) and magazines, with a combined circulation of up to 90,000 copies⁶. Most of these are given away for free. They carry a lot of advertising and this is how the publishers make their profits. These newspapers typically feature editorials, news stories, cartoons, photographs and letters to the editors sections. They report on local news of interest to New Zealand's Chinese communities. They also feature news about mainland China, often taken from variety of Chinese websites and other sources. International news is also featured. They are mainly available from Chinese markets, shops and community centres in Auckland, Wellington and Christchurch.

These newspapers have been little studied. This may be due to language barriers. They are also not collected by libraries and other institutions which makes a difficulty for researchers to gain access to long print runs. Some scholars regard these publications as too trivial and ephemeral to warrant attention. However, these newspapers play important roles as media in the lives of the members of New Zealand's Chinese community. For many Chinese immigrants who have English as a second language the mainstream print media in New Zealand are of little value or interest. These free Chinese newspapers provide immigrants with information, perspectives and news that link them to New Zealand, their home countries and the world in general as well as their own local community. The purpose of this study is to use these undervalued resources as a means of exploring how changing ideas of Chinese identity are enacted, contested and inscribed within the context of a diasporic community.

⁶ Internal publications issued by various organizations are not counted here.

Chapter 2: Methodology

The basis for this study is a collection of material taken from several Chinese language newspapers published in Auckland, New Zealand from 20 February to 15 November 2006. This material formed the building blocks of raw data from which the thesis has been built. It is fundamentally a historical project in that I am examining several key moments in the recent history of the Chinese community of Auckland and examining how these were reported in the newspapers. These reports have been analysed to see how ideas about cultural identity were challenged and mediated through these publications. The archive I have built up of these newspapers from this period illustrated various facets of these processes of contesting and mediating ideas about cultural identity and cultural meanings within a diasporic community. I have chosen to approach this material as an historical archive from which meanings may be teased out. Discourse analysis was not felt to be a good approach due to the difficulties of dealing with material in Chinese and English as well as the large amount of material available. In a sense this is a preliminary mapping out of some ideas about the ways in which identity is negotiated in New Zealand's, or at least Auckland's, Chinese community. Future studies may build on this material and apply techniques such as discourse analysis to smaller and more nuanced subsets of the material.

B. L. Berg (1998, p. 212) defined a community as a “geographically delineated unit within a larger society”. Although the Chinese community is a small community in New Zealand, its members have to consider their Chinese cultural or subcultural homogeneity among themselves, or between the community and mainstream society, so that the members could create social identifications of their own (Berg, 1998).

Berg (1998, p. 219) further indicated that a case study of a community can be a systematic way of approaching and gathering information with a suitable understanding of the daily routines of the members in the community. Community case studies can specifically focus on some particular aspect of the community. For

example, I may consider how the Chinese community in New Zealand represent their *Chinese-ness, i.e. cultural identity, through its print media.

Yin (1984) and Hagan (1993) further suggested that the various data collection strategies can be used in community case studies: development; histories; documents; interviews; and observation. Since a community's print media can easily be analysed make use of case studies, those media provide evidence of what goes on in the community. They also show why and how these things happen, who takes part in these activities, and what social forces may bind together members of this community (Berg, 1998).

The purpose of this case study is to bring together various elements in order to create a bigger picture. Together these elements establish an understanding of the Chinese community in New Zealand. The research utilises primary and secondary sources, including historical literature surrounding the subject, because it requires a thorough historical knowledge of the Chinese community and of the development of the community both in New Zealand and globally. Due to the difficulties of conducting extensive research across multiple areas of media, this thesis will be limited to print.

The case study approach can provide a fundamental understanding of the meaning of Chinese-ness, and the roles of Chinese print media in New Zealand. In order to answer the research question "How do the Chinese print media represent Chinese cultural identity?" I will approach the research in an historical manner and give historical answers to the question. As part of the research, I had to create my own archives from the papers that I examined. From these archives, I have chosen two case studies.

When the research subject had been decided, I then had to collect the relevant material. The time frame for collection was from 20 February until November 2006. I

chose the most popular Chinese supermarket⁷ in Auckland to collect the newspapers from. All the newspapers were available free of charge.

Table 1 Newspapers selected and their publication frequency.

Name	Frequency
New Zealand Mirror 镜报	Every Friday (one issue per week)
New Zealand Chinese BizLink 新华商报	Every Tuesday and Friday (Two issues a week)
The Mandarin Pages 华页	Monday to Saturday (six issues a week)
New Zealand Chinese Herald 新西兰华人先驱报	Three issues a week. (Tuesday / Thursday / Saturday)
Chinese Express 中文一族	Every Tuesday (once a week)
WTV Magazine 中视	Monthly
iBall	Every fortnight

Table one lists the newspapers selected for this study. There are several reasons that I chose these newspapers. Firstly, most of the articles in these newspapers were written by journalists working for these newspapers or are translations of articles that have been published in the mainstream media. Secondly, most of these newspapers have a publishing history that goes back several years. For instance, by the end of November 2006, *The Mandarin Pages* had reached 2035 issues at six issues per week. This is a time period of over six years. *The Chinese Express* had published 670 weekly issues and *The New Zealand Chinese Herald*, published three times a week, had reached 775 issues by November 2006. *The Chinese Mirror* is a new publication and has strong links with mainland China. It includes articles and columns from the *Beijing Youth Daily*. *iBall* is important as it is published in English. There are other newspapers but they have been ignored for this study as they do not have regular publication dates. I have also ignored advertising booklets and focused on “true”, if free, newspapers.

⁷ Tai Ping Supermarket on Custom Street in the centre of Auckland City

The newspapers were scanned and material selected according to (a) how well they illustrated conflicting points of view between the Chinese community and (b) the attitudes of mainstream society to New Zealand Chinese. Many of the chosen articles were too broad to reflect ideas of Chinese cultural identities. For example, focusing on “Changing Lifestyles” or “Concepts of Home” was not relevant as both contemporary and historical concepts of home were too general to be included in the research. Therefore, after searching for key issues I had to further define specific case studies.

After a long process of collecting data, I selected two case studies because they were clear examples of events that generate discussion about Chinese identity in the Chinese community. The first case study concerns reports about Chinese students working as prostitutes. This was reported in the English language newspaper *iBall* on 12 May 2006. The second case study concerned Chinese newspapers’ responses to a cartoon of Chairman Mao which was on the cover of the student newspaper *Chaff* on 18 May 2006. Both were controversial and the issues relates to being “Chinese” and to cultural identity.

The first case study concerned allegations about Chinese student prostitution. This is particularly important because of the idea of “losing face”. Some reaction to Lincoln Tan, the editor of *iBall*, publishing the story was that New Zealand Chinese “lost face”. Therefore Tan was seen a not pure Chinese or “second class Chinese”. This is fascinating, because some in the community made distinctions about who was really Chinese and who was not based on media coverage. Analysis of this case study can shed light on how tensions surrounding identity were played out in the disaporic Auckland Chinese community. This case study is also important because *iBall* is the only English language newspaper in Chinese community. So, unlike other Chinese language newspapers *iBall* has a much wider potential readership. I suspect that is one of the reasons that there was a strong reaction to *iBall*’s reports. It suggests that people were more sensitive to the issue because they could have been read by many

outside the Chinese community. For these reasons, this case study was an important one for this research

The second case study was substantially different. The concerns a cartoon that appeared on the cover of the Massey University magazine *Chaff* in May 2006. This cartoon made fun of Chairman Mao in a way that many Chinese found offensive. The ensuing discussions in the Chinese print media highlighted differences in the ways in which the diasporic community regarded its leaders and the ways in which the host community approached political satire.

What emerged from these discussions was on the one hand a more conciliatory approach than that shown in the first case study and on the other a sense of ideas about collectivism and individualism. These responses illuminated some of the ways in which ideas about Chinese identity were being changed to some extent by the cultural influences of the host community.

Of course, since the initial stimulus of this issue came from a non-Chinese source, their case study is different from the first. However, since the underlying controversy here relates so strongly to identity formation, this case study provides an interesting counterpoint to the student prostitution issue. It is likely that the origin of the controversy (i.e. whether the issue surfaces in “Chinese” or “mainstream” media) is less important than the perceived cultural importance of the underlying issues of the events reported on.

However, there is a limitation to this historical research in that I could not look back further into the history of the Chinese community, as very few print sources have been archived. This was one reason why I had to build my own archive. So the two case studies that have been analysed are recent and have been selected as they provide significant insights into the research question concerning Chinese diasporic identity. Each case study generated valuable data regarding cultural identity, both within community media and in local mainstream society. Each case is an example of crisis and public tension. They illustrate the importance of words and their meanings in the

construction and maintenance of cultural identities and the important roles media such as newspapers play in mediating these struggles over meanings. The public dialogue conducted in the pages of the print media illustrates wider ideas about the contestable meaning of Chinese-ness in contemporary New Zealand.

Chapter 3 Literature Review

The literature relating to the fields of study this thesis is concerned with is large and varied. I have divided the material into two broad categories. The first concerns material that deals with the ideas of diaspora and community. I have concentrated here on several key works that are particularly relevant to my study. The second section is about the literature on the ideas of “being Chinese” and “Chineseness”, i.e. how Chinese identity is constructed.

3.1 Communities and Diaspora

One of the key thinkers on the idea of national communities and groups is Benedict Anderson. His seminal work *Imagined Community* (1983) focused on how cultural communities were formed. Anderson argued that concepts such as nationality, nationhood and nationalism can best be explained as cultural products. He investigated how these cultural artefacts have been created historically and concluded that they were able to be transplanted to and merged into other or different social and national contexts.

Anderson proposed the definition of a “nation”: “It is an imagined political community and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign” (Anderson, 1983, p. 6) It is “imagined”, because Anderson believed that people of a country do not

really know all their fellow-countrymen, never meet them or hear from them. The connection is in the mindset. Therefore communities can be defined by the “style” in which they are imagined. “Imagined community” is a concrete and powerful idea and one for which, over many centuries, millions of people sacrificed their lives.

For my purposes, the significance of Anderson’s research is that he gave a clear definition of community as existing in people’s minds rather than physically. He also reminds us that this imagined community is fluid.

Anderson’s research used the colonial period to demonstrate the relationships between media (newspapers in particular) and imagined communities. He found that the original function of newspapers in colonial countries was to spread news from home countries. In this way, the imagined community was naturally created among fellow-readers who shared information from the homeland. Anderson’s findings suggest that even today, newspapers could still be important in creating imagined communities despite the prominence of media such as television, radio and the internet. My study builds on Anderson’s emphasis on print media.

Appadurai refined and developed some of Anderson’s insights into imagined communities (Appadurai, 1990). He emphasised the role the imagined nation plays in the construction of social structures. Appadurai extended Anderson’s theory of “imagined community” into “imagined world”. He argues that “imagined community” is not sufficient for the world we live in today and that the concept of the “imagined world” will allow us to point to the fluid, irregular shapes of contemporary social cultural landscapes. The second idea that Appadurai offered is that of a framework for examining the “new global cultural economy a complex, overlapping, disjunctive order that cannot any longer be understood in terms of existing center-periphery models” (Appadurai, 1990, p. 32).

He used the suffix “scape-“ to combine with prefixes such as “ethno-; media-; techno-; finance-; and ideo-”. Appadurai used these terms to test the limitations of Anderson’s imagined community. He demonstrated this using examples of different diasporic

groups, such as Turkish workers in Germany and Korean migrants in Philadelphia. Through studying such groups' use of media Appadurai further suggested that such conjunctions of media and migration meant that what is imagined is no longer the "imagined community" of a nation state, but numerous "diasporic public spheres" (Appadurai, 1990, p. 4). In his later work, Appadurai extended his position and further developed the various "scapes". His main argument placed "mediascape" as the core with the others in support of it (Appadurai, 1996).

Another significant point is that Appadurai highlighted a clear definition of collective identity and individual identity (Appadurai, 1996, pp. 140-141). He stated that all groups involve a strong feeling of "*we-ness*" based on a shared language or territory. This kind of emotional drive binds groups together in powerful ways. On the other hand, individualism is seen to work against the idea of the collective identity. These definitions provide a foundation for understanding my research which analyzes the conflict between Chinese collective identity and European individualism.

Cohen (1997) attempted to provide a basis for studying diaspora. The word diaspora has been used in a variety of ways. According to Cohen, historically it referred to people or tribes exiled from their homeland. Today it also refers to migration or immigration. Cohen's work investigated a large number of exiled or migratory groups. He tried to discover features that diasporic groups had in common in an attempt to formulate a definition of diaspora. He points out that such communities develop collective identities. These identities reflect a collective commitment to the preservation and maintenance of cultural identity. This cultural identity is usually rooted within the linguistic, cultural, religious and social practices of the home country. These practices are maintained as best as they can be in host country, but will undergo changes as the diasporic community interacts with new cultures. This is important to my research as I am trying to illustrate changes of ideas about cultural identity within the New Zealand Chinese community. Cohen's work emphasizes the contingent and fluid nature of cultural identity.

Tsagarousianou (2004) reviewed recent debates on theories of diaspora. In particular she focussed on ways in which the concept of diaspora could be critically evaluated, and the key issues of 'ethnicity, mobility and displacement' (p. 53). She argued further that imagined communities are continuously reconstructed and reinvented, and that diasporic identities are reproduced and transformed via media technologies (p. 60). This provides a basis for my research to investigate how the Chinese diasporic media play crucial roles for New Zealand Chinese.

From reviewing how the definition of 'diaspora' was generated, Tsagarousianou shows how the concept has been employed as a theoretical framework for different perspectives in the study of human migration. She also investigated different perspectives of the relationship between Diaspora and home and concluded that not every mobile population can be identified as a 'diaspora'. She adds, "it is their keenness to hold themselves within the transnational imagination and self mobilise around awareness of a diaspora, that leads to the categorisation" (Tsagarousianou., 2004, pp. 56-58). In reviewing Appadurai's five "scapes", Tsagarousianou (2004, p. 61) found that there are dynamic interactions between migrant groups and societies of settlement as well as between migrant groups and the homeland. In terms of diasporic communication, Tsagarousianou (2004, p. 63) highlighted Mandaville's idea (2001) that the media continually construct, debate and reimagine concepts like cultural identity, the meanings of identity and the virtual territories of diasporic community.

In Tsagarousianou's conclusion (pp. 63-64), she argued that the concept of diaspora is a controversial transnational one and refers to "complex multidirectional flows of human beings, ideas, culture, and other forms of interaction". Diaspora as a concept is improved by linking it with the concept of connectivity and by focusing on cultural politics. Linking concepts of diasporic communities to Anderson's idea of "imagined communities", Tsagarousianou raises novel and productive modes of thinking about diasporic communities.

The connections between diaspora, mobility, connectivity, and communications that Tsagarousianou made are important for my research. The roles of diasporic media in

constructing imagined diasporic communities are emphasized in her conception of diaspora. I have drawn on work such as this to foreground the role of local Chinese print media in New Zealand as used by the Chinese community.

3.2 Chinese & Chinese-ness

Wang (1991) reviewed social science concepts of identity and ethnicity and applied them to the Chinese experience in the United States. Wang pointed out that Chinese identities were intricate and complex as seen from various points of view, (for example, ethnic, national, local, cultural, and class). Wang stated that apart from biology, Chinese-ness is related to the Chinese word *gen* 根 (roots) (L. C. Wang, 1991, p. 183). It is used to symbolize the ancestral birth place from which one derives one's identity. Wang proposed five types of identity among the Chinese diaspora: "the sojourner mentality; assimilator; accommodator; ethnically proud, and uprooted" (L. C. Wang, 1991, p. 192). Each of these types of identity corresponds to *gen* (the roots), which relate to: ancestral village, Chinese race, China nation, the Chinese government, and Chinese culture. The article tries to express a traditional Chinese belief: "a tree may grow a thousand feet high, but its leaves fall back to the roots – a person residing away from home eventually returns to his native soil" (L. C. Wang, 1991, p. 193). And the ultimate root is China. However, her research is limited to the United States so it is hard to generalise to the entire Chinese diaspora. However, this summary of the main aspects of the construction of Chinese identity is a useful overview that informs many aspects of my thesis.

Wu reviewed the history of Chinese immigration and argued that for Chinese all around the world, although their ancestors originally came from China, later generations might not remember where their original land was or even have basic language skills (Wu, 1991, pp. 163-165). These later generations might describe themselves as American Born Chinese (ABC), or simply deny that they are Chinese at all. However, Wu (1991, pp. 176-177) believes that language ability cannot be the only criterion for cultural identity. Everything, including language, can be changed except for Chinese sentiments which strongly connect people to shared beliefs and traditional customs. Wu further explained that both Zhongguoren (中国人) -Chinese people- and zhonghua minzu (中华民族) -Chinese ethnicity- represent Chinese identity (i.e. Chinese-ness) based on the concepts of cultural and historical implementation rather than nationality or citizenship. Finally, Wu concluded that the meaning of “Chinese-ness” changes, but diasporic Chinese keep themselves within the acceptable definition of “Chinese-ness” and engage other members within the Chinese community in preserving Chinese culture from non-Chinese influences.

Wu and Wang provided overviews of Chinese identity and how this is an historical construction that changes over time. Political, social and cultural changes (such as the Chinese diaspora) affect the ways in which Chinese communities construct and mediate their ideas of identity or Chinese-ness. This study builds on and applies these ideas of identity as a construct rather than a given within the context of the Chinese community in New Zealand.

There has been a certain amount of scholarly work on the Chinese community within New Zealand but little of this has been concerned with the role of local Chinese print media within the development and maintenance of identities. Ip’s work approached the Chinese in New Zealand from a social development and an historical perspective. She delineated the prejudices and hardships faced by Chinese in New Zealand since the early days of their immigration in the nineteenth century. Ip used interviews and historical analysis of pictorial evidence such as photographs and cartoons to highlight aspects of the Chinese experience in New Zealand. From these materials, Ip analysed issues like transnationalism, historical development, relationships, education and

assimilation. She is concerned to point out that Chinese immigration should not be treated as an isolated issue, but as one that relates to New Zealand's future relations with Asia, and the nature of its own developing national identity. Her analysis provided much useful background for this study but she has little to say about the use of modern newspapers by the latest groups of Chinese immigrants.

Some work on Chinese print media in New Zealand can be found in the major survey of New Zealand print cultures that was published in 1997 (Griffith, Harvey, & Maslen, 1997). This not only focused on English or Maori publications within New Zealand, but also investigated the print cultures of other languages in New Zealand – Chinese, Croatian, Dutch, French, Gaelic, German, Greek, Latin, Polish, and Scandinavian. The two essays that discussed Chinese print culture examined the older Chinese newspapers and publications from the nineteenth and twentieth centuries

Murphy's essay (1997) reviewed the historical development of Chinese immigration to New Zealand and discussed the newspapers published by these communities. It provided valuable historical background for my research and illustrates the roles these newspapers had in the historical development of Chinese community in New Zealand.

Murphy (in Griffith et al, 1997) divided twentieth century Chinese print culture into three periods: 1900-49, 1949-87, and post 1987 (p. 271). During the first period, China experienced revolution and Chinese in New Zealand quickly developed patriotic sentiment, gave financial support to the Nationalist Kuomintang (KMT) and in 1921 the KMT newspaper, the *Man Sing Times* 民醒时报 (p. 272) became the first New Zealand's Chinese-language newspaper. Published in Wellington every ten days, the paper informed readers about the revolution in China and advocated support for the KMT. In 1937, the Sino-Japanese war began and the Chinese community itself started its *New Zealand Chinese Weekly News* in Wellington. It contained both war news and reports about the local Chinese community. A similar paper, the *Q Sing Times*, was set up in 1938 in Auckland. Both papers were in a handwritten format and ended in 1946 when the war was over.

In the second period, New Zealand Chinese focus moved onto social issues such as discrimination and family reunion (Murphy in Griffith et al, 1997, p.273). Another feature of this period was continued political involvement with the newspaper industry. The KMT set up *The New Zealand Chinese Monthly Special* in 1950 and *The Kui Pao / Chinese News Weekly* in 1951 while the Chinese Communist Party published a monthly newsletter to persuade people to maintain relationships with mainland China. By the 1970s, overseas political issues receded as Chinese increasingly identified themselves as New Zealanders and Chinese papers were written in English and focused on community based news.

In 1987, the Labour Government opened the door to a new wave of Chinese immigrants, most of whom settled in Auckland (Murphy in Griffith et al, 1997, p.274). By 1996, there were at least eight Auckland papers published in the community, including *Sing Tao Daily* and *New Zealand Chinese Weekly* (which changed its name to the *New Zealand Chinese Herald*). There was only one magazine (*Hwa Hsia*), which was for Taiwanese immigrants. However, all these publications contained local and overseas news with useful information about New Zealand customs and settlement. The papers also carried large amount of advertising. By the 1990s there were several newspapers published in other parts of New Zealand, such as *the Christchurch Chinese Monthly News* and *the Dunedin Asian Monthly News*.

The other essay in Griffith's collection is by Ng (1993, in Griffith et al, 1997) who believes that the earliest waves of Chinese immigrants to New Zealand were mainly comprised of labourers, many of whom were illiterate or had minimal education. Therefore, oral transmission of news and information was more important to them than printed media. This is perhaps borne out by the small number and circulation of Chinese newspapers in New Zealand in those times. The only known 'Chinese' newspaper produced in New Zealand in the late 1800s was *Weekly Kam lei Tong I Po* (1993, p. 269), which first appeared on 12th May, 1883. From the 1880s to the 1890s, some other overseas Chinese newspapers and magazines circulated in New Zealand. These included *China Mail*, *Chinese Australian Herald*, *Review of the Times*, *Missionary Review*, *Chinese Illustrated News*, *the Chinese Globe Magazine*, and

Kwang Pao, Wa Tz Yat Pao. No copies of these paper appear to have survived in New Zealand archives (p. 270).

These surveys of Chinese newspapers provided much useful historical background and context to the present study. However, they do not directly address the contemporary issues of identity and culture as played out in modern Chinese newspapers. Griffith pointed out that little or nothing had been written on the social history of the Chinese community in New Zealand. A major difficulty for researchers has been that few of the historical publications have been preserved. This present study is concerned with contemporary publications and even these are not preserved on a large scale by libraries or archives. In the present case, I have overcome this by building my own archive. Griffith called for more studies to be done on Chinese media in New Zealand and this thesis is one such attempt.

Sinclair et al (in S. Cunningham & J. Sinclair, 2000, pp.35-90) also investigated the issue of Chinese cultural identity within the Australian context. Their research analysed the processes by which Chinese in Australia maintained their cultural identity while negotiating with the local host culture. The research found that consciousness of difference was important to Australian Chinese (Sinclair, Yue, Hawkins, Pookong, & Fox, 2000 in Cunningham & Sinclair, 2000, pp.36-39). Chinese immigrants wanted more news than the mass media gave them about the outside world, especially news that related to their home countries. The research concluded that members of Asian diasporic communities took a long time to negotiate with host societies and that they maintained strong cultural ties to their home countries. Sinclair's research examined a wide range of media including TV, radio, film, the internet, magazines, newspapers and books. This took a wider view than my study and raised difficulties when trying to assign particular roles in identity formation to any one medium. While Australian society is in some respects similar to that of New Zealand there are important differences that make it difficult to apply such work directly to local conditions.

Another study from Australia was that by Wanning (2005). She was concerned with the formation of the diasporic Chinese mediasphere. She argued that Chinese-language media in Australia play three roles (2005, p. 73). First, diasporic media provide a stage for expressing different points of view within the community. Second, Chinese-language media are useful channels through which the host society can reach those community members who do not understand English. Lastly, Chinese media report on mainstream society from a Chinese viewpoint. While Wanning discussed the wider media landscape as opposed to just newspapers, her ideas are relevant for the present study as they highlight the uses which Chinese language media are put to in diasporic contexts. This threefold process is complex and multi-directional and an examination of it can illustrate the roles of the media in identity construction.

The last few years has seen a significant amount of research into Chinese diasporic media. However, much of this has been concerned with America, Southeast Asia, or Australia. There is still a real need for much work on New Zealand Chinese media. This thesis is an attempt to examine the role of Chinese print media in identity formation in New Zealand's Chinese community.

Chapter 4 Case Studies

4.1 Case Study one: Face, Shame and Prostitution

For several months in 2006, starting in May, there was much discussion in the local Chinese print media about what it meant to be Chinese in New Zealand. The cause of this controversy was a report on Chinese students working as prostitutes that was published in the newspaper *iBall*. This report sparked off a series of claims and counter-claims, accusations and heated debates that not only played out in the pages of the Chinese language newspapers but also spilled over into the mainstream media. This case study gives an account of this debate and highlights some of its key points that reflect contested ideas about Chinese identity. A full analysis of this is given in Chapter Five.

On 12 May 2006, the newspaper *iBall* published a five page report about Chinese students working as prostitutes. The article was written by *iBall*'s owner and editor, Lincoln Tan. This report included interviews, an editorial and a provocative image on the front page (see Appendix 1). This illustration was example of the sort of sexualized image normally found in tabloid journalism. The image featured two "Asian" women posing in sexual manner. The headline identified Asian students as the focus of the report. The cover was designed to attract attention, as was the headline, by playing on fears concerning female sexuality. It should be noted that *iBall* is printed in English. It is designed to appeal to a wider community than Chinese speaking people. Some of the reactions to *iBall*'s report must be seen in the light of this wider distribution of the newspaper beyond the Chinese community.

The *iBall* report featured interviews with sex workers, local authorities, health workers and members of the Chinese community. Concerns were raised about the health of the sex workers. It was alleged that they lacked knowledge about contraception and sexually transmitted diseases and did not register with the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective because of shame. The report gave the impression that young Chinese women in New Zealand could drift into prostitution when their parents or relatives in China stopped sending money.

On the same day that *iBall* published this report, the *New Zealand Herald* (NZH) also featured investigation about Chinese students involved in prostitution. This report was co-authored by Herald reporters Julie Middleton and Lincoln Tan. As mentioned previously Lincoln Tan was the owner, publisher and editor of *iBall* but he also wrote a regular column for the Herald about the Chinese community in New Zealand. These reports on prostitution and Chinese students were thus simultaneously published in the mainstream media as well as a newspaper that, while written in English, was widely read in the Chinese community. This wider diffusion of the stories of young Chinese women working as prostitutes seemed to have been an important factor in the controversy that ensued in the Chinese press.

One notable factor that may have stimulated strong reactions from some members of Chinese community was the use of word “Chinese” in the Herald’s headline. The headline in *iBall* ran as follows; “Asians cash in on porn boom”(iBall, 12 May 2006, p.1). The Herald’s headline was more specific; “Chinese students take on sex for cash” (NZH, 12 May 2006, p.A7) This change of identity made the *Herald* article seem less ambiguous and switched the focus from the “Asians” to the Chinese community. This change seems to have been one of the key points that angered some members of the Chinese community. This Herald article added little that was new to the report in *iBall*. In fact, it was more or less a straight forward reprint. The same sources were interviewed, the same points were raised and the same conclusions were reached. The main difference was the more specific headline and that the Herald is a national newspaper that reaches a far greater readership than *iBall*.

Within four days of these reports appearing, Chinese language newspapers also carried articles about Chinese women and prostitution. While adding little new information, these reports emphasized (and deemphasized) certain aspects of Tan’s original articles that subtly altered their original meanings.

The *Mandarin Pages* (MP) combined the *iBall* and *Herald* reports into one article for their issue of 13 May 2006. The headline for this article ran as follows; “有报道指奥克兰华人娼妓数目急升 -- 以留学生为主 Some media point out that the number of Hua Ren prostitutes has increased dramatically in Auckland – Most of them are International Students”(MP, 2006) The title used “有报道指”(“some media point out”) to inform its readers that the news is not from them, they have just translated and reprinted the material from other newspapers. The headline used term “华人” or Hua Ren which refers to the Chinese people in general. The sub-heading used term “留学生” or international students with the clear implication that these were Chinese.

The body of the article contained information that had appeared in the *iBall* and *Herald* articles. While omitting the interviews with sex workers, the article featured the same spokespeople from the NZPC and local authorities. It raised the same concerns about sexual health, contraception and access to such information by sex workers. This article explicitly linked the increase in Chinese sex workers with international students from Mainland China;

有报道指出，奥克兰的国际留学生卖淫问题日趋严重，当中又以中国留学生占大多数。

Translation: Some media point out that the issue of international students selling sex is becoming more and more serious, most of them are international students from China. (MP, 13 May 2006, p.1)

This may have indicated some concerns about the behaviour of international students from China felt by the older, more established community members.

Three days later on 16 May 2006, another Chinese language newspaper reported on the issue of Chinese students and prostitution. *The Chinese Express* (CE) article once again recycled material from the *iBall* and *Herald* articles. It discussed the role of students in prostitution but also claimed that some Chinese women were coming to

New Zealand on tourist visas specifically to work as prostitutes. This article used the same interviewees as *iBall* and *Herald* but suggested that the Prostitution Reform Act of 2003 was encouraging young Chinese to become sex workers⁸. It went on to further suggest that there had been an overall increase in the number of international sex workers in New Zealand since the bill was passed.

The report did not itself directly identify cultural background or ethnicity of these workers but it quoted interviewee's who pointed to an increase in Chinese Sex workers and used the phrase “华人” (Hua Ren) in its translation of these statements. For example, Bronwyn Schofield, a nurse from a health service organisation, was quoted in Mandarin;

她接触了三十八位不具有永久居民身份的性工作者，其中[大概三分之二]是华人妇女，其中许多人是十八岁至二十四岁的学生

Translation: I have been contact with 38 sex workers who are non permanent residents in New Zealand during past two years. Two thirds of them are Chinese (Hua Ren) women. Most of them are students of 18 to 24 years old. (*CE*, 16 May 2006, p.A5)

As with the article in *Mandarin Pages*, an explicit link was made here between Chinese students and prostitution. The appearance of these articles in Chinese language newspapers brought *iBall*'s investigation to the attention of many in the Chinese community who did not read or follow the English language mainstream media. A strong reaction to these articles from many in the Chinese community then followed.

Following these articles, Lincoln Tan used his *NZH* column of 22 May 2006 to discuss some of the responses to *iBall*'s original article. In his column he quoted an

⁸ These international students believe that this Act could protect them as legal sex workers.

email to *iBall* that accused him of being a traitor to Chinese people. He also mentioned a reporter from a Chinese language newspaper who had asked Tan how he viewed his responsibilities to the Chinese community as a Chinese journalist.

To the first comment, Tan responded by writing that he never thought of himself as Chinese. He identified himself as Paranakan (Straits-born Chinese), which means that somewhere in his ancestry he had a great-great grandfather from Malaya. He further argued that there is a distinction in the Chinese language between being a “华人” (Hua Ren or Ethnic Chinese) and “中国人” (Zhong Guo Ren or Chinese national). He put himself in ethnic Chinese (华人) category. He found it hard to identify with Chinese from mainland China but he became more Chinese in New Zealand than he was in Singapore. He also found the mainstream society put him in the Chinese community without any thought.

As to the query about the role and responsibilities of a Chinese journalist in New Zealand, Tan stated that; “It’s not the job of a journalist to support blindly the community from which he springs.” The reporter who asked this question, according to Tan, implied that this responsibility was to protect Chinese face, i.e. to spare members of the Chinese community any shame. The publication of the reports in English language media and mainstream media at that was seen here as bringing shame to the Chinese community. Tan argued that as journalist his job was not to become the guardian of Chinese “face”. He believed that helping mainstream media in New Zealand to rise above ignorance and tokenism is a more important role for Chinese journalists than being “face protectors” for a community that has survived criticisms and attacks for thousands of years (Tan, 2006). The *NZH* followed up this column with an editorial on 23 May that argued that the Chinese community should be positive about negative but true news reports, thus showing its support for Tan.

What had begun as a report into Chinese students working in the sex industry had turned into a debate about the nature of Chinese identity and the role of the media in maintaining that identity in a diasporic context. The following reactions concentrated further on these ideas rather than the original discussion about young Chinese people in New Zealand and prostitution.

On 26 May 2006, the *Chinese Mirror* (CM) published an article entitled “Of Intuitive Knowledge of the Chinese Print Media in New Zealand” 《也谈纽西兰中文媒体的良知》 (Nan-Tai-Jing-Wa 南太井蛙, 2006). The article began by discussing the social functions and responsibilities of the media, especially the Chinese print media in New Zealand. It went on to question the motives of the reporters who had investigated the issue of Chinese student prostitution. The writer felt that the Chinese community was not a strong and united group and that it had been attacked by these articles. Such sensationalistic reporting was seen here as using the Chinese community to sell newspapers.

On 3rd of June 2006, the *New Zealand Chinese Herald* (NZCH) entered the discussion with a strongly worded editorial entitled: “iBall, What Are You Doing?” The editorial directly attacked iBall and its managing editor Lincoln Tan and also raised many points about how some sections of the Chinese communities felt about identity and regarded the role of the media (see Appendix 11).

The editorial began by emphasizing the special responsibilities and position of *iBall* and Lincoln Tan. Tan was the first Chinese columnist writing about the Chinese community in the mainstream media i.e. the *New Zealand Herald*. It was felt that his articles could foster understanding about the Chinese community in New Zealand. *iBall*, as the first English language newspaper of Chinese community, could fulfil a similar role.

Concerning the reactions from the Chinese community about the articles on prostitution, the editorial argued that it was natural to have a debate in any society and community when a newspaper reported on any sensitive issue. But because the Chinese community has a very complicated structure and community members come from different parts of the world. *iBall* couldn't expect all Chinese to agree with Tan. Some would laugh at what he wrote, some might agree and some would criticize. (Mao_毛凡, 2006).

Finally, the editorial argued that it was very good to report the dark side of the Chinese community if the facts were true and wouldn't harm most community members. The editorial stated that as journalists they understood the importance of "Freedom of Speech" (Mao_毛凡, 2006). But, the editorial argued that *iBall* had no intention of seeking that truth, but was more concerned with reinforcing mainstream prejudices about Chinese immigrants and especially students. So Lincoln Tan would gain favour with mainstream society. It questioned Tan's knowledge of the Chinese community by pointing out that he had denied to be identified as Chinese. In effect, this editorial seemed to argue that only certain sorts of Chinese people were allowed to comment on the Chinese community.

Along with the articles, editorials and features written by journalists that discussed ideas about Chinese identity following *iBall*'s original report, members of the Chinese community also contributed by writing letters to the editor. In particular, *iBall* received a number of these that contained both criticism and praise. These letters further illustrated conflicting ideas about Chinese identity in New Zealand.

There were personal criticisms directed at Lincoln Tan that were based on his ethnic origins. Some felt that as he was born in Singapore he was not a "true" Chinese. Willie Li wrote that "You are not Chinese and do not have authority to write any news about Chinese students. We think you are just second class Chinese." (Li, 12 May 2006, p.11) However, others defended *iBall* and accused its critics of ignorance and prejudice. The idea that "true" Chinese are those born in mainland China was rejected by members of the diasporic community in New Zealand. One correspondent, Victor Ong, wrote about the contributions of overseas born Chinese (*hua qiao*) and added that: "it's a pity that younger generation of Chinese students like Willie Li are ignorant about this. To him, overseas-born Chinese a second class. Proud to be *hua qiao*." (Ong, 26 May 2006, p.11) Contests over identity can be seen here as having generational as well as ethnic elements especially.

Furthermore, Tan's report upset some Chinese community members because they felt that the articles had shown the dark side of the Chinese community. Some Chinese

felt that these reports brought shame onto the community and that meant they caused Chinese people to lose face. They believed that such journalism, particularly in an English language newspaper, played to the prejudices held by some in mainstream New Zealand society. John Siew hoped that *iBall* would “go further and not merely report about the evils of the Asian community but also the good, the morally upright and the things that are worthy of praise among the Asians in New Zealand.” (Siew, 26 May 2006, p.12) He, for one, was concerned about the image of the Chinese community in New Zealand and that its members might be shamed by media reportage about subjects such as prostitution or crime.

However, some writers felt that the idea of shame or “losing face” was not such an important part of Chineseness in the diasporic community in New Zealand. One example was provided by Mary Lim who condemned the division of Chinese into first and second classes based on ethnic origin. She questioned the importance of saving face and challenged “the self-proclaimed first class Chinese” to change their attitudes towards other Chinese, to ignore negativity in the media and not to be “so hung up about face.” (Lim, 9 June 2006, p.11)

These reports, editorials and letters reflect a debate about the meaning of “Chinese-ness”. Chinese with different backgrounds hold different perspectives on the meaning of “Chinese-ness”. Different ideas of how to be, or to act as real “Chinese” in New Zealand society were discussed in the wake of these reports. This material provides insights into the dynamic nature of identity in the New Zealand Chinese community. These will be further discussed in Chapter Five.

4.2 Case Study two: Laughing at Mao

The issue of the Massey University student magazine *Chaff* for 16 May 2006 featured a cover that made fun of communism. With the fake title “Commupolitan” making a none too subtle reference to the fashion and lifestyle magazine *Cosmopolitan*, it featured headlines such as “Reds in the bed! Sealed section inside”, “273 ways to conform to mass standardization while staying fabulous” and “I’m not touching that!

How to deal with your boyfriend's bourgeois individualist penis". This might seem to have been just another example of undergraduate humour but this cover caused much controversy in the Chinese language newspapers. The reason for this was the illustration that featured Mao Ze-dong's head photoshopped onto a young women's body (see illustration 1).

This image angered many Chinese students and others in the Chinese community. The *New Zealand Chinese Herald* (NZCH) reported disturbances at Massey University. A protest was lodged at the university by angry students who compared the image to anti-Muslim cartoons that had caused worldwide controversy in February 2006 (Mai_Ji_麦吉, 2006). An article appearing in the *Chinese Biz Link* (CBL) the previous day had quoted Xing Tang, one of the student protestors at Massey, as tearfully stating that "to us Mao Ze-dong as the same as your God. We pay over \$20,000 for study fees to the university, and in return we got this racist treatment from the school" (CBL, 19 May 2006, p.A5). The *Chaff* cover was widely commented on in online forums such as skykiwi.com where many Chinese students in New Zealand expressed their anger. They tended to regard the use of Mao's image as a racist attack on Chinese rather than a political satire on Communism⁹. The controversy attracted attention from non-New Zealand media with reports appearing on Fox news¹⁰ and in the *Chronicle of Higher Education*¹¹ (Fox News, 21 May 2006, online at <http://www.foxnews.com>; *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 23 May 2006, online at <http://chronicle.com>)

⁹ <http://www.skykiwi.com/news/200605/hotnet22650.shtml>
and <http://new.skykiwi.com/bbs/viewthread.php?tid=277549&highlight=&frameon=no>

Retrieved on 13 September 2006

¹⁰ online at <http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,196390,00.html> retrieved on 13 September 2006

¹¹ Online at <http://chronicle.com/news/article/473/chinese-students-protest-chairman-mao-as-that-cosmo-girl> retrieved on 13 September 2006

While some Chinese students at Massey reacted with anger and staged a protest, the *Chaff* staff responsible for the cover felt that the students were overreacting to a light hearted joke. *Chaff* News Editor Matt Russell told the *Manawatu Standard* that the image of Mao was an arbitrary choice; “We were looking for a picture of Marx or Lenin and we couldn’t use Castro because he had a beard and it just didn’t work. I didn’t think it would offend.” He added that Chinese students in New Zealand should be aware that ‘a good sense of humour is part of Kiwi culture’ but did not explain exactly what constituted such a sense of humour (*Manawatu Standard*, 18 May 2006, online at <http://www.stuff.co.nz>)

Several Chinese newspapers carried reports of the protest and controversy at Massey University that occurred when the cover was published. Three newspapers, *Oriental Times*, *New Zealand Chinese Herald* and *Chinese Biz Link* all carried articles that explained why Mao was so important for people from Mainland China. They explained that as the founder of the People’s Republic of China, Mao is regarded as one of the most important people in Chinese history. He is regarded as a spiritual leader of the Chinese as well as a political figure. The *Chaff* staff had ignored this spiritual dimension when they published the offending cover. This spiritual aspect of Mao in Chinese culture makes the image of him important for Chinese when they think about cultural identity (NZCH, 20 May 2006, P.A5)

An important and large article appeared in the *New Zealand Chinese Herald* on 27 May 2006. It canvassed many viewpoints and suggested the wide range of responses to the *Chaff* cover that were felt in the Chinese community. It pointed out that many Chinese believed that the media should be mainly concerned with social responsibility rather than the right to freedom of speech because this right should not harm others’ self-esteem or emotions. But the *Chaff* cover had vilified Mao in way that hurt Chinese emotionally, especially those who were community leaders. They felt, along with the Chinese Massey students, that *Chaff* should apologise to all Chinese in New Zealand. However, *Chaff* had released a public letter indicating that an apology would not be necessary. The main reason given was that the image was a political

opinion and this was not a racist issue. The *New Zealand Chinese Herald* stated that this attitude was the same behind the incident of September 2003 when prominent radio host Paul Holmes referred to the United Nations Secretary General Kofi Annan as a “Cheeky darky”. In that case many in the New Zealand media and social mainstream regarded these comments as a joke just as the *Chaff* cover was seen as lighthearted satire.

The article quoted some comments that had been left on Websites where Chinese people, especially students, commented on issues. A person identifying themselves as a New Zealander had left a question on skykiwi.com that suggested that if the Chinese students were entitled to an apology over the Mao image then Russians and Germans were owed apologies for critical comments about Joseph Stalin and Adolf Hitler. This was replied to by equally rhetorical questions about the possible reaction if *Chaff* had made fun of the Maori Queen on their cover. Many writers on the website, along with the Massey students, saw the issue as being one of racial discrimination in that the mockery of Mao was seen as an attack on Chinese culture in general. They felt, according to the *NZCH* report, that mainstream society did not understand or respect Chinese culture.

The article featured an interview of Jian Yang, Senior Lecturer in Political Studies at the University of Auckland, whose comments were used to explain the varying attitudes of both mainstream New Zealand society and the Chinese community. Each had different attitudes towards politicians. The individualistic ideas of New Zealanders meant that they had less respect for politicians. Political satire and mockery of them is part of the political process in New Zealand. Chinese, on the other hand, have a more collective spirit. Most Chinese believe that the individual is only a small part of the group or nation. In the Chinese language, the word for nation (国家) contains the meaning that it is an extension of the family. So the leader of the nation is in effect also the head of the family and must be respected. While mockery of politicians is seen as normal and healthy in the West, it is seen as disrespectful in China.

Yang (NZCH, 27 May 2006, p.A1) also believed that the *Chaff* issue indicated that people have different ideas about Mao's role as a historical figure. Much has been published in the West that portrays Mao as an autocratic dictator. They do not understand how the Chinese have respect for Mao who they believe brought death and disaster to China. However, as Yang pointed out, many Chinese do not accept comments on their families when made by outsiders. Many Chinese do not agree with what Mao has done, but they do not let non-Chinese criticize him as in a symbolic sense he is the head of the Chinese national 'family' (as the founder of the modern Chinese state). Any vilification of Mao, by extension, also vilifies the Chinese people just as any criticism of the head of a family is felt by family members to be criticism of the family itself.

This article was perhaps the most important response from the local Chinese newspaper to the incident of the *Chaff* cover and will be analysed more fully in the next chapter.

Another Chinese response came in the *Mandarin Pages* (MP) of 20 May 2006. Dong Li, Senior Lecturer in Chinese at Massey University, argued that Chinese students should know more about Mao and his role in Chinese history. He said Mao had been venerated as the most respected leader in Chinese when he was actually a murderer and that Chinese students have been brainwashed by the government. Dong Li pointed out that millions of Chinese had lost their lives under his regime. He also agreed with the Chinese students at Massey New Zealand society has racist attitudes to Chinese people but he did not support the protest against *Chaff*. He believed that the students should accept diverse opinions and need to focus on more than practical subjects such as science, finance and economics. They should take the opportunity to understand more about China and its history (MP, 20 May 2006, P.A1;A5)



Illustration 1; *Chaff*, 16 May 2006, Cover.

Chapter 5. Analysis of Case Studies

A storm of abuse in the Chinese print media greeted *iBall's* news report about Chinese prostitution in Auckland. The *Mandarin Pages* viewed it as a “disappointment”, “a shock”, a “calamity”, “a scandal and a disaster”(MP, 13 May 2006, p.A1). The *New Zealand Chinese Herald*, in a special editorial, felt that the report would “accelerate the deterioration of the Chinese community’s development in New Zealand”, and sternly accused the editors of betraying the trust of Chinese community (NZCH, 17 May 2006, p.B5). The *Chinese Express* saw the publication, *iBall*, and its report as “deplorable”, “a flagrant example of journalistic irresponsibility” and “a serious blow to the cause of good Chinese community newspaper” (CE, 16 May 2006, p.A5). In a similar way, the *Chaff* cover mocking Mao also evoked strong responses in the Chinese print media. The two case studies presented above illustrated tensions within the Chinese community about ideas of identity. This section is intended to analyse how these case studies can show such tensions and concerns within this particular diasporic community.

Cohen (1997, p. ix) argues that as all diasporic communities settle outside their natal (or imagined natal) territories, they acknowledge that the “old country” always has some claim on their loyalties and emotions. The cartoon of Mao clearly presented problems for some Chinese immigrants. In Chinese custom, a leader, especially a national leader, is not ridiculed. But this cartoon of Mao was obviously satirical. Something that seems so normal and routine as political satire in New Zealand society caused problems for many Chinese people. There was an obvious clash between the values of the host society and the traditional expectations of parts of diasporic Chinese community within New Zealand.

It was a clash of customs, loyalties and emotions. This was also clear in the case of *iBall's* report about prostitution. Chinese regard prostitution as dirty and shameful. Some members of the New Zealand Chinese community believed that the reports about prostitution brought shame to the entire community. In effect the reports caused loss of face for the Chinese people in New Zealand. Fear of public shame or loss of

face is an important part of traditional Chinese social ethics. The phrase *tiu mien tzu* 丢面子 or “losing face” refers to public events where social performance has fallen below acceptable levels (Ho, 1976). It was felt by some that Chinese should show a clean face in public and that anyone who disagreed was not showing loyalty to the Chinese community. Further, according to this view the Chinese diasporic print media have a responsibility to protect the community. As Cohen (1997, p. ix) stated, a member’s adherence to a diasporic community is demonstrated by an acceptance of an inescapable link with their customs and history and a sense of co-ethnicity with others of a similar background. This clearly applies in this case. The Chinese custom is that people should never wash dirty laundry in public but *iBall* seemed to have done just that.

Some scholars such as Sklair (2001, pp. 255-288) have argued that globalization has an impact on people’s opinions and, through these opinions, on their identity. This is because people identify themselves with the opinions they hold and these opinions locate them in a group or society. Based on this concept of identity formation, it is possible to examine the likely significance of the New Zealand Chinese print media in shaping opinions and identity on the basis of these case studies.

According to Sklair holding similar “opinions about certain issues groups the opinion holders together, while different opinions tend to belong to either lower class or outsiders” (Sklair, 2001, p. 255). In the case study about Chinese student prostitution, Chinese who believed that *iBall*’s report shamed the Chinese community identified themselves as “pure” Chinese, regarding others who held different opinions as second-class Chinese or non-Chinese. On the other hand, Tan and many who wrote to support *iBall*, believed that he had the right to report on social issues even when they cast the Chinese community in a bad light. These people argued that they didn’t have to be “pure” Chinese to comment. They grouped themselves together as “English Educated” Chinese; white Chinese or Singaporean Chinese. Here, the reactions in the Chinese print media reflected the differing opinions and ideas of sub-cultural groups within the wider Chinese community who used the newspapers to contest dominant

ideas about identity that were being upheld by those who felt their identity depended on the maintenance of traditional Chinese values.

Sklair also points out that the print media shape and influence opinions as part of a person's identity. In the case study concerning the Chairman Mao cartoon, many Chinese reacted strongly (such as the Massey students who staged a protest and the many people who commented on websites). Chinese newspapers discussed this issue by highlighting the importance of Mao in Chinese culture. As the founder of modern China he is more than a political figure to many Chinese. His status is something like that of "the father of the nation" and he is seen as an important spiritual leader in China. However, having pointed this out, most of newspapers reports then went on to suggest that Chinese people, particularly students, would benefit from gaining different views and knowledge about Mao while they were outside China as Western society treats Mao as an historical figure who can be questioned and criticised. The newspapers often pointed at the humorous nature of the cartoon and that understanding it was part of understanding the host culture of New Zealand. Here we can see this print media acting as a buffer between the diasporic community and host culture. The newspapers were explaining to the Chinese community that while many of them may put great importance on the veneration of Mao as part of their cultural identity, this identity was not being threatened by political satire such as the *Chaff* cover.

Culture can be thought of an umbrella that covers a wide range of activities. Qiu (2003, pp. 155-156) summarizes that such cultural continuity can be demonstrated at both the macro level, (such as the tradition of a nation) and micro level (as in a common lifestyle in a particular group). To promote this cultural continuity at both levels is exactly what Chinese print media do in their efforts at building an "imagined community", especially since efforts have been made to mobilize common experiences and Chinese culture.

On the macro level, the Chinese who come to New Zealand from different parts of the world share common traditions, such as festivals and food. Such traditions will be

carried from generation to generation as long as they remain important. And often it does not matter if people are ethnically Chinese or whether they can speak Chinese. They carry on the traditions, and so they are regarded as under the umbrella of Chinese culture.

On the micro level, the Chinese community is divided into several layers by lifestyle, native language, modes of thinking and religions. When Malaysian Chinese re-immigrate to New Zealand, they bring a lifestyle from Malaysia which is different from those of China, Taiwan and Hong Kong. And a Taiwanese Chinese might have quite different political views from a Chinese from Mainland China. This is why in my case studies, some journalists and readers make such fine distinctions on the micro level as first class, or “pure”, and second class Chinese (David & Li, 2006; Li, 2006; J. Lim, 2006; M. Lim, 2006). Tan regarded himself as an ethnic Chinese (hua ren 华人). However, his identity was not the thing he was born with. His Chineseness was constructed by his reaction to his surrounding’s representations. For instance, he felt more Chinese in New Zealand than in Singapore. And as he stated, most New Zealanders regard him as Chinese even though English was his only language. On the other hand, from the case study, the Chinese people addressed Lincoln Tan as second class Chinese.

Furthermore, in Chinese culture, Chinese can “discern a unity of spirit” to which they find no parallel in Western Culture (Chai, 1957, pp. 47-50). This reflects the issue of collective versus individual cultural identity. Chinese heritage is built on a collective cultural identity. Many Chinese, especially those from mainland China, believe that Chinese people everywhere are part of one “family”. This family has a leader, (or imagined spiritual leader) who is Mao. This is based on Confucian teachings where any citizen should respect their governors, sons must respect elders, wives must respect husbands and so on. These ideas had ruled Chinese society for millennia and are undoubtedly part of Chinese cultural identity.

However, Western culture is more individualistic. Western people do not judge others by who they are or their social or political rank or status, but by what abilities they

have. For example, local New Zealanders would not blindly respect Helen Clark just because she is the prime minister. They would form judgements on the basis of her actions and policies. Mockery and satire are not seen as disrespectful of leaders in the same way that they are in Chinese culture.

One assumption about collective identity is that it simply reflects sentiments that connect families and kinship groups. Appadurai (1996, p. 35) explained that group sentiments that involve a strong sense of group identity draw on “smaller” attachments. Another is that like individuals, large groups have an “unconscious” that is the repository for every slight and injury experienced over time and that this is an expression of negative experiences (Appadurai, 1996, pp. 42-43).

These ideas can be linked. When *Chaff* mocked Chairman Mao it inflamed the Chinese “unconscious” because these people were away from their homeland and they turned to their traditional sense of collective identity and respect for Mao. Even if it was a joke, some Chinese took it as a racist attack and assumed the local mainstream society were against them. In China, people certainly joke about Mao. But, once they leave China, the diasporic group dynamics play out against a background where every slight and injury is remembered and traditional ideas of identity take on a heightened role.

According to Wanning “in general the formation and sustenance of any given collective Chinese identity outside China usually requires the healthy and continuous functioning of three institutions” (Wanning, 2005, p. 73). Firstly, there are Chinese social and business networks. Second, there is an education system which permits or even supports Chinese-language schools. Third there is a Chinese-language media industry with credible claims to sizable circulation and community representation. Suryadinata (1997, in Wanning, 2005, p.74) believes that these three pillars exist in conjunction with one another.

All three pillars apply to the New Zealand situation but with locally determined differences. The Chinese community in New Zealand have business and social

networks that have been existence for over one hundred years (Chou, 2000). New Zealand has a relatively small number of native Mandarin speakers. However, within New Zealand's mainstream education system, students can learn Chinese as second language in some high schools and outside the mainstream education system, there is a range of private schools where Chinese is studied and taught. As for the third of Wanning's pillars, there is a sizeable Chinese-language media industry in New Zealand. The New Zealand Chinese Herald has a Circulation of 15,000 copies¹² per issue, and 45,000 copies per week and "The Chinese Express" Weekly¹³ circulation is over 14,000 copies which are delivered to over 300 shops.

Since these three pillars exist in New Zealand, it would seem that the diasporic Chinese community in New Zealand form and sustain a strong idea of its identity. As A. Appadurai has pointed out, the conjunction of media and migration means that what is imagined is no longer the "imagined community" of the nation-State, but numerous "diasporic public spheres" (1990, p.1). In Auckland, there are varied groups of Chinese, including migrants from old and new generations as well as re-immigrants from various Southeast Asian countries. Auckland is also the temporary home to many Chinese tertiary, secondary and language school students. Some of these aim to become permanent residents in New Zealand.

Besides eating Chinese food and speaking a Chinese language these people can practise "being" Chinese through Chinese language media and cultural products. More specifically, the conjunction of Chinese diasporic media and Chinese immigration means the Chinese community is possibly no longer an "imagined community" in New Zealand, but a "diasporic public sphere". In my case studies Chinese newspapers provided channels for Chinese immigrants to express ideas and opinions and to mobilise in support or against certain social issues. Chinese

¹² The Chinese Herald circulation information comes from <http://www.alibaba.com/company/10436249.html>

¹³ Chinese Express circulation information comes from <http://www.chinese-media.co.nz/back-pop.htm>

newspapers and other Chinese media reconstruct and reform ideas about the Chinese community. In Auckland, there are approximately ten different kinds of Chinese newspapers, Sky TV has variety of Chinese speaking channels from mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong and Singapore and www.Skykiwi.com is the most popular Chinese community website for both immigrants and students. Additionally many Chinese DVD shops exist in different parts of Auckland. All of these form the frame work of New Zealand's "Chinese (diasporic) public sphere".

Sun Wanning (2005, p. 73) indicated that diasporic print media continue to play a central role in the life of various Chinese migrant groups in Australia. Australia and New Zealand are in some ways similar countries with reasonably similar histories of Chinese immigration and settlement patterns. It would seem that Wanning's general proposition may also apply to New Zealand. For instance, *the Chinese Mirror* (镜报) is a mainland Chinese based newspaper which has links with *Beijing Youth Daily* (北京青年报) in order to get the latest news from and about China. On the other hand, *the Mandarin Pages*, a local content focused newspaper, attracts old immigrants and those from Hong Kong and Taiwan. Further, *iBall* serves those immigrants who cannot read Chinese and New Zealand born Chinese. All these newspapers serve different groups of Chinese within the wider community.

Secondly, all these newspapers relate to each other. For example, when *iBall* first reported on prostitution by Chinese students it received much criticism from other local Chinese newspapers. This controversy indicated the important role that this print media played in the diasporic community. It highlighted and played out competing ideas about shame, the public image of the Chinese community and the roles of the media. Those groups in the community who held traditional views on the "loss of face" and the face that they would like to present to the mainstream New Zealand community, felt their identity threatened by the publication of such articles and responded by denying the Chinese-ness or identity of the journalists who wrote them.

However, in the second case study, the Chinese print media took the role of "the voice of the Chinese community". The response to the mocking of Mao on the part of some

Chinese, especially the students at Massey, was angry and hostile. The Chinese print media seemed to take on the role of peacemaker by using their pages to explain and explore the different attitudes held by the various groups involved. Rather than advocating a limited and particular version of Chinese identity, the newspapers tried to help their readers understand that such actions as the *Chaff* cover were not threats or insults but simply normal actions of the host culture. In effect, the Chinese newspapers here were explaining a form of cultural identity to a group who had felt their own sense of identity under threat. Taken together, the case studies clearly demonstrate how particular issues can be central to a diasporic group.

Chapter 6. Conclusion

The case studies analysed in this thesis reflected particular conflicts within the Chinese community and sites of negotiation between this community and mainstream society. The core arguments focused on the meaning of “Chinese-ness” and how to be Chinese in New Zealand. The two cases clearly presented the idea that the diversity of Chinese origins and the different stages at which they have arrived mean that Chinese groups in New Zealand are a microcosm of the differences in the Chinese diaspora.

The research has illuminated Cohen’s (1997) theory about some aspects of diasporic communities. Specifically, his idea that the loyalties of a diasporic community maybe claimed by a nation that is often buried deep in the language, religion or customs maintained by the diasporic community in the host country. Alternatively the case studies show how meanings are contested around issues of particular importance.

Nonetheless, the discussion of the idea of “pure Chinese” from the case studies highlighted Cohen’s point. Lincoln Tan was regarded by some as a “second class Chinese” or not really Chinese after he reported on an issue that some saw as shameful to the Chinese community. They saw him as betraying his loyalty to this imagined community. This was an issue involving a perceived lose of “face”, an idea that is very important in traditional Chinese culture. It may have been “buried deep” as Cohen would say but Tan’s articles brought it to the surface as still an important component of identity for many in New Zealand’s diasporic Chinese community especially when that community felt under threat. Similarly, the controversy of the cartoon of Chairman Mao showed Chinese ideas and customs about collectivism and respect to leaders clashing with Western ideas about individualism and political satire.

Furthermore, these case studies illustrated some of the ways in which members of the Chinese community located and identified themselves in this community through the opinions they expressed in the pages of the Chinese newspapers. As Sklair has pointed out, the opinions expressed were both a part of and means of constructing this identity. The process, a conjunction of media and migration, indicated that the

imaginary being constructed here was not so much a unified national one but rather a co-existing set of diasporic public spheres. This plurality of public spheres as mediated in the newspapers reflects a similar diversity of emerging notions of Chinese identity as they have been shaped under the social, political and economic conditions of the modern Chinese diaspora.

The issue I raised in the case studies concerned how the members of Chinese community positions themselves in New Zealand. And the local Chinese media provide a stage for them to express their points of view. The local Chinese media play vital roles for new immigrants, for the Chinese students studying in New Zealand, and for older immigrants maintaining their position in the Chinese community. However, there are a number of ‘gaps’ in this study of Chinese diasporic media. In terms of local Chinese newspapers, there are over twenty different kinds of newspapers in Auckland and there are many differences between their owners. Hence, their newspapers would almost certainly represent Chinese culture and identity differently. My research has not been able to investigate this to any great degree. However, if we take Chinese newspapers in New Zealand as a whole, they are going to play the function of enculturation or acculturation.

Throughout the history of New Zealand Chinese, every new wave of immigrants strengthened the community’s cultural identity through economic factors, providing news from “home” and reinvigorating traditional culture, and after the 1990s (when there was a very strong “wave”) Chinese community media built up very quickly. Now there are various kinds of newspapers, two radio stations, many magazines and CTV 8 (Chinese TV channel eight). No doubt, all these media play very vital functions in the Chinese community and there are several potential growth areas for research. For instance, controversial ideas about Chinese cultural identity appear on these. How do broadcast media deal with conflict? Do broadcast media help Chinese community members to acculturate or keep their identity as “pure Chinese”? How do Chinese media exist or co-operate with mainstream society?

Moreover, this thesis only focused on the Chinese newspapers in Auckland. But the Chinese community in other parts of New Zealand have their own newspapers, such as *NZ Messengers* (信报) in Christchurch, and *Capital Chinese News* (首都华文报) in Wellington. None of these newspapers was used in my study. But for future research, it would be very interesting to investigate how these newspapers represent local Chinese cultural identity and how this compares to my results for Auckland.

Apart from newspapers, there are also other media in the Chinese community. There are two main Chinese radio stations; *AM936* and *FM90.6* (*FM 90.6* is Cantonese while *AM936* is Mandarin). Some of the programs are very popular in the Chinese community and these tend to focus on current issues and migration. In terms of television, the community puts lots of efforts into Triangle TV (a community channel). Furthermore, web-blogs are very popular in the community, especially among Chinese students. Skykiwi.com is the most important here. Apart from posting some commercial information, it also provides for arguing, debating and discussing current issues in New Zealand. It not only involves all “kinds” of Chinese in New Zealand, but also engages some members of mainstream society and even Chinese in China or other parts of the world. Thus Skykiwi recedes the nation’s (land-scape) boundaries. My research would serve as a starting point for future investigation on radio, TV and web-blog representing the Chinese cultural identity.

And this thesis could also lead the further study to compare the New Zealand Chinese print media with other parts of the world. It would be very interesting to look into and compare the ways that New Zealand Chinese newspapers represented cultural identity with similar newspapers in the other parts of the world, (such as the United States of America, Australia).

The newspapers studied in this thesis may seem ephemeral and lightweight as print media. They are usually given away for free, they carry significant advertising and often employ very few reporters. To some they may not even be newspapers in the traditional sense of the word. However, they are important for many in the Chinese community and play varied roles. They can act as a site where the Chinese

community can negotiate issues with the mainstream community by bringing its own perspectives, ideas and language to the complex two-way flows of information that constitute these negotiations. This study has been a preliminary study of just some of the ways in which these publications are important for members of the Chinese community. Even in an age of digital global communication networks, print media can still play vital roles in the social and cultural lives of many communities.

References

- Anderson, B. (1983). *Imagined communities : reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism* (Rev. ed.). London: Verso.
- Appadurai, A. (1990). Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy. *Public Culture*, 2(2), pp.1-24.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large : cultural dimensions of globalization* (Vol. v. 1). Minneapolis, Minn.: University of Minnesota Press.
- Berg, B. L. (1998). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences* (3rd ed.). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Chai, C. (1957). The Spirit of Chinese Culture. *Social Research*, 24(1), pp.47-64.
- Chan, H. (1998, 20-21 November). *Rethinking the Chinese Diasporic Identity: Citizenship Cultural Identity, and the Chinese in Australia*. Paper presented at the Chinese in Australasia and the Pacific: Old and New Migrations and Cultural Change, Hutton Lecture Theatre, The University of Otago.
- Chou, L. (2000). *Chinese Immigrants in New Zealand Society - A study of migrant acculturation and the effects of communication and multicultural public relations*. Auckland University of Technology, Auckland.
- Cohen, R. (1997). *Global diasporas : an introduction*. London: UCL Press.
- Cox, K., & Mair, A. (1991). From Localised Social Structures to Localities As Agents. *Environment and Planning*, A(23), 155-308.
- David, & Li, S. (2006, 9 June). Letter to the Editor: Shame on you Willie. *iBall*, p. 11.
- Griffith, P., Harvey, D. R., & Maslen, K. I. D. (Eds.). (1997). *Book & print in New Zealand : a guide to print culture in Aotearoa*. Wellington: Victoria University Press.
- Hagan, F. E. (1993). Research Methods in Criminal Justice and Criminology. In B. L. Berg (Ed.), *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Science* (pp. 212-222). New York: Macmillan.
- Ho, D. Y.-f. (1976). On the Concept of Face. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 81(4), 867-884.

- Huo, J. (1999). *A Study of Chinese Print Media in New Zealand -- History, Culture and Professionalism*. the University of Auckland, Auckland.
- Ip, M. (1999). New Zealand. In L. Pan (Ed.), *The Encyclopedia of the Chinese Overseas* (pp. 286-291). Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Kotkin, J. (1993). *Tribes : how race, religion and identity determine success in the new global economy*. New York: Random House.
- Li, W. (2006, 12 May). Letter to the Editor: Shup-up you two second-Class Chinese. *iBall*, p. 11.
- Lim, J. (2006, 10 July). Letter to the Editor: Pure chinese don't give a damn about democracy. *iBall*, p. 11.
- Lim, M. (2006, 9 June). Letter to the Editor: Loosen up, you first-class pure Chinese. *iBall*, p. 11.
- Lin, G. C. S. (2003). Identity, Mobility, and the Making of the Chinese Diasporic Landscape in Hong Kong. In L. J. C. Ma & C. Cartier (Eds.), *The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility and Identity*. Lanham Boulder New York Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.
- Ma, L. J. C. (2003). Space, Place, and Transnationalism in Chinese Diaspora. In J. C. M. Lurance & C. Cartier (Eds.), *The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility, and Identity* (pp. pp1-50). Lanham: Rowman and littlefield.
- Mai_Ji_麦吉. (2006, 20 May). Disturbances arose repeatedly from Victoria to Massey 维多利亚大学风波未平梅西大学事端又起. *New Zealand Chinese Herald*, p. A5.
- Mandaville, P. (2001). Reimagining Islam in Diaspora: The Politics of Mediated Community. In R. Tsagarousianou. (Ed.), *Rethinking the Concept of Diaspora* (Vol. 1-1, pp. 52-65).
- Mao_毛凡. (2006, 3 June). iBall, What are you doing? (iBall 在做什么?) . *New Zealand Chinese Herald*, p. A1.
- Massey, D. (1990). Questions of Locality. *Geography*, 78(339, Part 2), 142-149.
- Massey, D., & Jess, P. (1995). *A Place in the World?:Places, Cultures and Globalization*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- MP. (2006, 13 May). You Bao Dao Zhi Auckland Hua Ren Chang Ji Shu Mu Ji Sheng -- Yi Liu Xue Sheng Wei Zhu (有报道指奥克兰华人娼妓数目急升 - 以留学生为主) . *Mandarin Pages*, p. A1.
- Murphy, N. (1997). The 20th Century of Chinese Print Media. In P. Griffith, R. Harvey, K. I. D. Maslen & R. Somerville (Eds.), *Book & Print In New Zealand -- A Guide To Print Culture In Aotearoa*. Auckland: Victoria University Press.
- Nan-Tai-Jing-Wa 南太井蛙. (2006, 26 May). Ye Tan New Zealand Zhong Wen Mei Ti de Liang Zhi 也谈纽西兰中文媒体的良知. *New Zealand Chinese Mirror*, p. A10.
- Ng, J. (1993). Windows on a Chinese past. In P. Griffith, J. Hartley, K. I. D. Maslen & R. Somerville (Eds.), *Book & Print in New Zealand -- A Guide To Print Culture in Aotearoa* (pp. 263-275). Dunedin: Otago Heritage Books.
- Ong, A. (1997). Chinese Modernities: Narratives of Nation and of Capitalism. In A. Ong & D. Nonini (Eds.), *Ungrounded Empires: The cultural politics of modern Chinese transnationalism* (pp. pp. 171-202). London & New York: Routledge.
- Pan, L. (1999). *The encyclopedia of the Chinese overseas*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Qiu, H. (2003). Communication among knowledge diasporas -- Online magazines of expatriate Chinese students. In K. H. Karim (Ed.), *The Media of Diaspora*. New York: Routledge.
- Safran, W. (1991). Diaspora in modern societies: myths of the homeland and return. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 83-99.
- Sinclair, J., Yue, A., Hawkins, G., Pookong, K., & Fox, J. (2000). Chinese cosmopolitanism and media use. In S. Cunningham & J. Sinclair (Eds.), *Floating Lives: The Media and Asian Diasporas*. St. Lucia, Australia: University of Queensland Press.
- Sklair, L. (2001). *The Transnational Capitalist Class*. Oxford: Blackwell Publisher Ltd.
- Suryadinata, L. (1997). "Ethnic Chinese in Southeast Asia: Overseas Chinese, Chinese Overseas or Southeast Asians?" in *Ethnic Chinese as Southeast Asians*. Leo Suryadinata, ed. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

- Tan, L. (2006, 22 May). True loyalty transcends the bounds of tokenism. *the New Zealand Herald*, p. A11.
- Tsagarousianou., R. (2004). Rethinking the concept of diaspora: mobility, connectivity and communication in a globalised world. *Westminster Papers in communication and culture*, 1(1), 52-66.
- Wang, G. (1991). Among Non-Chinese. *Daedalus*, spring 120(2), 135-157.
- Wang, G. (1999). Chineseness: The Dilemmas of Place and Practice. In G. G. Hamilton (Ed.), *Cosmopolitan Capitalists: Hong Kong and the Chinese Diaspora at the end of the 20th Century*. (pp. 118-134). Seattle and London: University of Washington Press.
- Wang, L. C. (1991). Roots and Changing Identity of the Chinese in the United States. *Daedalus*, 120(2), pp181-206.
- Wanning, S. (2005). Media and the Chinese Diaspora: Community, Consumption, and Transnational Imagination. *Journal of Chinese Overseas*, 1(1), pp.65-86.
- Warf, B. (1993). Postmodernism and the Localities Debate: Ontological Questions and Epistemological Implications. *Tijdschrift voor Economische en Sociale Geografie*, 84(3), 162-168.
- Wu, D. Y.-h. (1991). The Construction of Chinese and Non-Chinese Identities. *Daedalus*, 120(2), pp.159-179.
- Yin, R. K. (1984). Case Study Research: Design and Methods. In B. L. Berg (Ed.), *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Science* (pp. 212-222). Beverly Hills: CA:Sage.
- Young, S. (2002). Prime Minister Helen Clark Speech on the Chinese New Year Celebration. Retrieved 12 May, 2007, from <http://www.stevenyoung.co.nz/The-Chinese-in-New-Zealand/Poll-Tax/Helen-Clark.html>

Bibliography

- Chinese MP Press Conferences. (2006, 23 May). The Mirror.
- Chinese MP Press Conferences. (2006, 23 May). Oriental Times, p. B3.
- Humorous and Satirizing. (2006, 1 June). WTV, 70, 14.
- Anderson, B. (1991). *Imagined communities : reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism* (Rev. ed.). London: Verso.
- Ang, I. (1996). *Living room wars : rethinking media audiences for a postmodern world*. London ; New York: Routledge.
- Ang, I. (2001). *On Not Speaking Chinese: Living Between Asia and West*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Anthias, F. (1998). Evaluating 'diaspora': Beyond Ethnicity? *Sociology*, 32(3), 557-580.
- Appadurai, A. (1989). 'Global Ethnoscapes: Notes and Queries for a Transnational Anthropology', in R.G. Fox. *Interventions: Anthropology of the Present*.
- Appadurai, A. (1990). Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy. *Public Culture*, 2(2), pp.1-24.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large : cultural dimensions of globalization* (Vol. v. 1). Minneapolis, Minn.: University of Minnesota Press.
- Armstrong, J. A. (1976). Mobilized and Proletarian Diasporas. *The American Political Science Review*, 70(2), 393-408.
- Babbie, E. (1994). *The Sociological Spirit* (2nd ed.). Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Co.
- Beaglehole, A., & New Zealand. Dept. of Internal Affairs, H. (1988). *A small price to pay : refugees from Hitler in New Zealand, 1936-46*. Wellington, N.Z.: Allen & Unwin : Historical Branch.
- Beal, T. (2001). Taiwanese Business Migration to Australia and New Zealand. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Re-examining Chinese Transnationalism in Australia - New Zealand* (pp. 25-44). Canberra: CSCSD, Australian National University.
- Berg, B. L. (1998). *Historiography and Oral Traditions*. In *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences* (3rd ed., pp. 198-211). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Berg, B. L. (1998). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences* (3rd ed.). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

- Bhabha, H. K. (1990). *DissemiNation: Time Narrative and the Margins of the Modern Nation*. In H. K. Bhabha (Ed.), *Nation and Narration* (pp. pp291-322). London: Routledge.
- Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. K. (1992). *Qualitative Research for Education*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Brah, A. (1996). *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*. London: Routledge.
- Brink, P. J., & Wood, M. J. (1989). *Advanced Design in Nursing Research*. Newbury Park: CA:Sage.
- Carey, J. W. (1988). *Media, myths, and narratives : television and the press*. Newbury Park Calif.: Sage Publications.
- CBL. (2006, 19 May). Mao Ze Dong's Cartoon on University Journal spark off Protest 校刊出现毛泽东漫画引抗议. Chinese Biz Link, p. A5.
- CE. (2006, 16 May). Nu Liu Xue Sheng He Lu You Zhe Wei Qian Lai Auckland Dang Ji Nu Wu Wei He Fa: 女留学生和旅游者为钱来奥克兰当妓女误为合法. Chinese Express, p. A5.
- Chai, C. (1957). The Spirit of Chinese Culture. *Social Research*, 24(1), pp.47-64.
- Chambers, I. (1996). *Migrancy, culture, and identity*. London: Routledge.
- Chan, C. (2006, 12 May). Editorial: Easy money too tempting for desperate people. *iBall*, p. 2.
- Chan, H. (1998, 20-21 November). *Rethinking the Chinese Diasporic Identity: Citizenship Cultural Identity, and the Chinese in Australia*. Paper presented at the Chinese in Australasia and the Pacific: Old and New Migrations and Cultural Change, Hutton Lecture Theatre, The University of Otago.
- Chan, S. (1999). What is this thing called a Chinese Daspora? *Contemporary Review*, 274(1597), 81-83.
- Chan, S. (2006, 26 May). Letter to the Editor: Tell it as it is. *iBall*, p. 12.
- Chee-kiong, T., & Kwok-bun, C. (2001). One Face, Many Masks: the Singularity and Plurality of Chinese Identity. *Diaspora*, 10(3), pp361-389.
- Chen, D. (2006, 10 July). Letter to the Editor: Forget about saving face, expose the crooks. *iBall*, p. 11.
- Chen, H. (2006, 24 Jul). Letters to the Editor: Pathetic and immoral way to wipe out competition. *iBall*, p. 11.

- Chen, X. (1995). *Occidentalism : a theory of counter-discourse in post-Mao China*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Chou, L. (2000). *Chinese Immigrants in New Zealand Society*. Auckland University of Technology (AUT), Auckland.
- Chou, L. J. (2000). *Chinese Immigrants in New Zealand Society*. the Auckland University of Technology (AUT), Auckland.
- Chow, R. (1991). *Woman and Chinese modernity : the politics of reading between West and East* (Vol. v. 75). Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Clammer, J. (1981). "Chinese Ethnicity and Political Culture in Singapore." *The Chinese in Southeast Asia*. Ed. LA. Gosling and L. Lim. Singapore: Maruzen Asia.
- Clifford, J. (1992). *Travelling Cultures*. In L. Grossberg, C. Nelson & P. Treichler (Eds.), *Cultural Studies* (pp. 96-116). London and New York: Routledge.
- Clifford, J. (1994). *Diasporas*. *Cultural Anthropology*, 9(3), 302-338.
- Clifford, J. (1997). *Rounts: Travel and Translation in the late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Cohen, M. L. (1994). *Being Chinese: The Peripheralization of Traditional Identity*. In T. Wei-ming (Ed.), *The Living Tree: The Changing Meaning of Being Chinese Today* (pp. 89-108). Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Cohen, R. (1988). *The new helots : migrants in the international division of labour*. Aldershot, Hants, England ; Brookfield, Vt.: Gower.
- Cohen, R. (1997). *Global diasporas : an introduction*. London: UCL Press.
- Cohen, S., & Taylor, L. (1976). *Escape attempts : the theory and practice of resistance to everyday life*. London: Allen Lane.
- Collins, R. (1990). *Television : policy and culture*. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Collins, R. (1994). *Trading in Culture: The Role of Language*. *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 19(3-4), 377-399.
- Conrad, S. (2004). *Being Chinese: Voices from the diaspora*. *The China Business Review*, 31(4), 59.
- Corrigan, P., & Sayer, D. (1985). *The Great Arch: English State Formation as Cultural Revolution*. London: Basil Blackwell.
- Cox, K., & Mair, A. (1991). *From Localised Social Structures to Localities As Agents*. *Environment and Planning, A*(23), 155-308.

- Cunningham, S., & Sinclair, J. (2000). *Floating Lives: The Media and Asian Diasporas*. St. Lucia, Australia: University of Queensland Press.
- Da-Fu 达夫. (2006, 30 June). Xi You Can Ban de Du Hou Gan (喜忧参半的读后感). *New Zealand Chinese Mirror*, p. B8.
- Danforth, L. (1996). *The Macedonian Conflict: Ethnic Nationalism in a Transnational World*, Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.
- David, & Li, S. (2006, 9 June). Letter to the Editor: Shame on you Willie. *iBall*, p. 11.
- David, & Li, S. (2006, 23 June). We are a greedy, envious, selfish and corrupted people. *iBall*, p. 11.
- Denzin, N. K. (1978). *The Research Act*. Chicago: Aldine.
- DeVito, J., OrRourke, S., & O'Neill, L. (2000). *Human Communication* (New Zealand ed.). Auckland: Pearson Education New Zealand.
- Djao, W. (2002). Opinion Status as Ethnic Identity in the Chinese Diaspora. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 32(3), 363-380.
- Donald M, N., & Aihwa, O. (1007). "Chinese Transnationalism as an Alternative Modernity". In *Undergrounded Empire: Transnationalism*. Aihwa Ong, and Donald M, Nonini, eds. London: Routledge.
- Fazal, S., & Tsagarousianou., R. (2002). Transnational Cultural Practices and Communicative Spaces. *Javnost/The Public*, IX(1), 5-18.
- Featherstone, M. (1990). *Global culture : nationalism, globalization and modernity : a theory, culture and society special issue*. London: Sage.
- Fishman, J. A. (1977). "Language and Ethnicity." *Language, Ethnicity and Inter-Group Relations*. Ed. H. Giles. London: Academic Press.
- Fong, N. B. (1959). *The Chinese in New Zealand*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Forrest. (2006, 18 May). From the speech of Victoria University Student Journal sullied Chinese to consider the importance of learning a foreign language. 从维多利亚校刊辱华言论谈学习一门外语的重要性. *New Zealand Chinese Herald*, p. B7.
- Foucault, M. (1979). *The History of Sexuality* (Vol. 1). New York: Vintage.
- Foucault, M. (1982). "The Subject and Power." In P. Rabinow and R. Dreyfus, cds. *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- Foucault, M. (1991). Governmentality. In G. Burchell, C. Gordon & P. Miller (Eds.), *The Foucault Effect: studies in Governmentality* (pp. 87-104). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Friedman, J. (1992). Narcissism and the Roots of Postmodernity. In J. Friedman & S. Lash (Eds.), *Modernity and Ideality*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Gans, H. (1979). "Symbolic Ethnicity: The Future of Ethnic Groups and Cultures in America." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 2, 1-20.
- Giddens, A. (1991). *Modernity and Self-Identity*. Stanford: Stanford UP.
- Glass, L. (1989). Historical research. In P. J. Brink & M. J. Wood (Eds.), *Advanced Design in Nursing Research*. Newbury Park: CA:Sage.
- Greif, S. W. (1974). *The Overseas Chinese in New Zealand*. Singapore: Asia Pacific Press.
- Greif, S. W. (1995). *Immigration and national identity in New Zealand : one people, two peoples, many peoples?* Palmerston North, N.Z.: Dunmore Press.
- Griffith, P., Harvey, D. R., & Maslen, K. I. D. (Eds.). (1997). *Book & print in New Zealand : a guide to print culture in Aotearoa*. Wellington: Victoria University Press.
- Gungwu, W. (1994). Among Non-Chinese. In T. Wei-ming (Ed.), *The Living Tree: The Changing Meaning of Being Chinese Today* (pp. 127-147). Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Gungwu, W. (2004). The Fourth Rise of China: Cultural Implications. *China: an International Journal*, 2(2), pp.311-322.
- Ha, M.-P. (1998). Cultural Identities in the Chinese Diaspora. *Mots Pluriels*, 1998(7).
- Habermas, J. (1974). The public sphere. *New German Critique*, 1(3), 49-55.
- Hagan, F. E. (1993). *Research Methods in Criminal Justice and Criminology*. New York: Macmillan.
- Hall, S. (1990). Cultural identity and diaspora. In J. Rutherford (Ed.), *Identity : community, culture, difference* (pp. 222-237). London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Hall, S. (1993). Culture, community, nation. *Cultural Studies*, 7(3), 349-363.
- Hamel, J., Dufour, S., & Fortin, D. (1993). *Case Study Method*. Thousand Oaks: CA:Sage.

- Hamilton, D. B. (1993). The idea of history and the history of ideas. *Image: Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 25, 45-48.
- Hannerz, U. (1989). Culture Between Centre and Peiphery: Towards a Macroanthropology. *Ethnos*, 54(III-IV).
- Hartley, J. (1996). *Popular reality : journalism, modernity, popular culture*. London: Arnold.
- Hartley, J. (1999). *Uses of television*. London ; New York: Routledge.
- Hartley, J. (1999). What is Journalism? The view from under a stubbie cap. *Media International Australia incorporating Culture and Policy*, 90(February), 15-34.
- Hartley, J., & MacKee, A. (2000). *The indigenous public sphere*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hassanpour, A. (2003). Diaspora, homeland and communication technologies. In K. H. Karim (Ed.), *The Media of Diaspora*. New York: Routledge.
- Helweg, A. (1986). The Indian diaspora: Influence on International Relations. In G. Sheffer (Ed.), *Modern diasporas and international politics* (pp. 103-129). London and Sydney: Croom Helm.
- Henderson, A. (2003). *Untapped Talents: The employment and settlement experiences of skilled Chinese in New Zealand*. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity -- The Chinese in New Zealand*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Ho, E. (2003). *Reluctant Exiles or Roaming Transnationals? The Hong Kong Chinese in New Zealand*. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity -- The Chinese in New Zealand*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Hollan, W. (1996). Mis/taken identity. In E. Vasta & S. Castles (Eds.), *The teeth are smiling: the persistence of racism in multicultural Australia* (pp. 97-111). Sydney: Allen & Unwin.
- Horowitz, L. D. (1985). *Ethnic Groups in Conflict*. Berkeley: U of California P.
- Hu, Y. (2005). *The Year Books of World Chinese Media [Electronic Version]*. Retrieved 17, August, 2005 from <http://www.chinanews.com.cn/news/2005/2005-08-17/26-613065.html>.
- Huntington, S. P. (1993). The clash of civilizations? *Foreign Affairs*, 72(3), 22.
- Huntington, S. P. (1996). *The clash of civilizations and the remaking of world order*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

- Huo, J. (1999). A Study of Chinese Print Media in New Zealand -- History, Culture and Professionalism. the University of Auckland, Auckland.
- Husband, C. (1992). Minorities, Mobility and Communication in Europe. Bradford: Race Relations Research Unit Research and Policy Paper Series.
- Husband, C. (1998). Differentiated citizenship and the multi-ethnic public sphere. The Journal of International Communication, 5(1&2), 134-148.
- Hwang, B.-H., & He, Z. (1999). Media Uses and Acculturation Among Chinese Immigrants in the USA. GAZETTE, 61(1), 55-22.
- Ip, M. (1990). Home away from home: Life stories of Chinese women in New Zealand. Auckland: New Women's Press.
- Ip, M. (1995). Chinese New Zealanders - Old Settlers and New Immigrants. In S. W. Greif (Ed.), Immigration and National Identity: One People, Two People - Many People? (pp. 161-199). Palmerston North: The Dunmore Press Ltd.
- Ip, M. (1996). Dragons on the Long White Cloud: the making of Chinese New Zealanders. Auckland: Tandem Press.
- Ip, M. (1997, 12-14, November). Successful settlement of Migrants and Relevant Factors for setting migrant targets' Paper presented at the Proceedings of the Population Conference, Wellington, New Zealand Immigration Service.
- Ip, M. (1999). New Zealand. In L. Pan (Ed.), The Encyclopedia of the Chinese Overseas (pp. 286-291). Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Ip, M. (2001). Chinese Business Immigrants to New Zealand: Transnationals or Failed Investors? In M. Ip (Ed.), Re-examine Chinese Transnationalism in Australia - New Zealand (pp. 45-59). Canberra: CSCSD, Australian National University.
- Ip, M. (2002). Redefining Chinese Female Migration: From Exclusion to Transnationalism. In L. Fraser & K. Pickles (Eds.), Shifting Centres: Women and Migration in New Zealand History (pp. 149-166). Dunedin: Otago University Press.
- Ip, M. (2003). Chinese Immigrants and Transnationals in New Zealand: A Fortress Opened. In L. Ma & C. Cartier (Eds.), The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility and Identity (pp. 339-359). Maryland, USA: Rowman & Littlefield.

- Ip, M. (2003). Seeking the Last Utopia: The Taiwanese in New Zealand. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity -- The Chinese in New Zealand*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Ip, M., & Murphy, N. (2005). *Aliens at my table : Asians as New Zealanders see them*. Auckland, N.Z.: Penguin Books.
- Isaacs, R. H. (1975). "Basic Goup Identity. The Idols of the Tribe." *Ethnicity: Theory and Experience*. Ed. N Glazer and D. P. Moynihan. Cambridge: Harvard UP.
- Jamieson, N. (1987). Relata, relationships, and context: A perspective on borrowed elements in Vietnamese culture. In T. B. Lam (Ed.), *Borrowings and Adaptations in Vietnamese Culture* (Vol. South East Asia Paper No. 25, pp. 124-140). Manoa: Centre for South East Asian Studies, School of Hawaiian, Asian and Pacific Studies, University of Hawaii.
- Jing Wei, Z. (2006, 1 June). Selective Trials. *WTV Magazine*, V.70, p10.
- Kahn, H., & Hudson, I. (1979). *World economic development : 1979 and beyond*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press.
- Karim, K. (1998, July). From ethnic media to global media: Transnational communication networks among diasporic communities. Paper presented at the The XXI Biennial Conference of the International Association for Media and Communication Research, Glasgow.
- King, T. (2003). Rhodesians in hyperspace. In K. H. Karim (Ed.), *The Media of Diaspora*. New York: Routledge.
- Kolar-Panov, D. (1997). *Video, war and the diasporic imagination*. London: Routledge.
- Kotkin, J. (1993). *Tribes : how race, religion and identity determine success in the new global economy*. New York: Random House.
- Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (1980). *Metaphors We Live By*. . Chicago and london: University of Chicago.
- Lamming, G. (1997). But the Worl' get small, samll, ol' man. *Cultural Logic*, 1(1).
- Lary, D. (2004). Book Review: *The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility and Identity*. *Pacific Affairs*, 77(1), 112-113.
- Leedy, P. D. (1993). *Practical Research: Planning and Design* (5th ed.). New York: Macmillan.
- Ley, D. (2004). Book Review: *The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility and Identity*. *Canadian Geographer*, 48(1), 88-89.

- Li, J. (2003). Chinese media, global contexts. London ; New York, N.Y.: RoutledgeCurzon.
- Li, V. (2006, 24 July). Letters to the Editor: Media and social responsibility: a "concerned Chinese" speaks up. iBall, p. 11.
- Li, W. (2006, 12 May). Letter to the Editor: Shup-up you two second-Class Chinese. iBall, p. 11.
- Lim, J. (2006, 10 July). Letter to the Editor: Pure chinese don't give a damn about democracy. iBall, p. 11.
- Lim, M. (2006, 9 June). Letter to the Editor: Loosen up, you first-class pure Chinese. iBall, p. 11.
- Lin, G. C. S. (2003). Identity, Mobility, and the Making of the Chinese Diasporic Landscape in Hong Kong. In L. J. C. Ma & C. Cartier (Eds.), The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility and Identity. Lanham Boulder New York Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.
- Lyman, M. S., & Douglas, W. A. (1973). "Ethnicity: Strategies of Collective and Individual Impression Management." Social Research, 40, 73-90.
- Ma, L. J. C. (2003). "Space, Place, and Transnationalism in Chinese Diaspora." In The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility, and Identity, Laurance, J.C. Ma and Carolyn Cartier, eds. Lanham: Rowman and littlefield.
- MacFarquhar, R. (1980). The post-Confucian challenge. The Economist, 285(7068).
- Mai_Ji_ 麦吉 . (2006, 20 May). Disturbances arose repeatedly from Victoria to Massey 维多利亚大学风波未平梅西大学事端又起. New Zealand Chinese Herald, p. A5.
- Mandaville, P. (2001). Reimagining Islam in Diaspora: The Politics of Mediated Community. Gazette, 63(2-3), 169-186.
- Manning, S. (2005). Media and the Chinese Diaspora Community, Consumption and Transnational Imagination. Journal of Chinese Overseas, 1(1), pp65-86.
- Mao_毛凡 . (2006, 27 May). Another disturbance by media offensive 媒体冒犯又一例. New Zealand Chinese Herald, p. A1.
- Mao_毛凡 . (2006, 3 June). iBall, What are you doing? (iBall 在做什么?) . New Zealand Chinese Herald, p. A1.

- Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (1989). *Designing Qualitative Research*. Newbury Park: CA:Sage.
- Massey, D. (1990). Questions of Locality. *Geography*, 78(339, Part 2), 142-149.
- Massey, D., & Jess, P. (1995). *A Place in the World?: Places, Cultures and Globalization*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- McKay, R. A. (1940). Early Printing in New Zealand. In R. A. McKay (Ed.), *A History of Printing in New Zealand 1830-1940* (pp. 1-32). Wellington: Wellington Club of Printing House Craftsmen.
- McKeown, A. (1999). Conceptualizing Chinese Diasporas, 1842 to 1949. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 58(2), pp.306-337.
- McKinnon, M. (1996). *Immigrants and citizens : New Zealanders and Asian immigration in historical context*. Wellington N.Z.: Institute of Policy Studies.
- McKinnon, M., Asia Foundation of New, Z., & Victoria University of Wellington. Institute of, P. (1996). *Immigrants and citizens : New Zealanders and Asian immigration in historical context*. Wellington N.Z.: Institute of Policy Studies.
- McNeur, J. (1930). *The Chinese in New Zealand*, MA Thesis. University of Otago.
- Middleton, J. (2006, 1 July). Immigration policy and Chinese involved in massage parlour stories. *WTV Magazine*, V71, p44.
- Mitra, A. *Diasporic Web Sites: Ingroup and Outgroup Discourse*. 14(2), 158.
- Moore, M. J. *The Chinese in New Zealand : Thesis presented for the degree of M.A. in history*, University of New Zealand. Dunedin: University of Otago.
- MP. (2006, 20 May). Massey University student Journal took Mao Ze Dong for a joke touched off Chinese students protest rally. 梅西大学学生会刊拿毛泽东开玩笑招中国学生示威抗议. *The Madarin Pages*, p. A1 & A5.
- MP. (2006, 13 May). You Bao Dao Zhi Auckland Hua Ren Chang Ji Shu Mu Ji Sheng -- Yi Liu Xue Sheng Wei Zhu (有报道指奥克兰华人娼妓数目急升 - 以留学生为主). *Mandarin Pages*, p. A1.
- Murphy, N. (2003). Present archival and library resources on the study of the Chinese in New Zealand including recent Asian immigrants. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity -- The Chinese in New Zealand*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.

- Naficy, H. (1993). *The making of exile cultures: Iranian Television in Los Angeles*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Naficy, H. (1998). *Narrowcasting in diaspora -- Middle Eastern television in Los Angeles*. In K. H. Karim (Ed.), *The Media of Diaspora*. New York: Routledge.
- Naisbitt, J. (1994). *Global paradox : the bigger the world economy, the more powerful its smallest players*. New York: Morrow.
- Nan-Tai-Jing-Wa 南太井蛙. (2006, 26 May). *Ye Tan New Zealand Zhong Wen Mei Ti de Liang Zhi 也谈纽西兰中文媒体的良知*. New Zealand Chinese Mirror, p. A10.
- Nederveen Pieterse, J. (1995). *Globalization as Hybridization*. In M. Featherstone, S. Lash & R. Robertson (Eds.), *Global modernities* (pp. 45-68). London: Sage.
- News Agency, B. (2006). *New Zealand police name Chinese found in suitcase*. 04(16).
- Ng, J. (1993). *Windows on a Chinese past*. Dunedin: Otago Heritage Books.
- Nonini, D. M. (1993). *On the Outs on the Rim: An Ethnographic Grounding of the "Asia-Pacific" Imaginary*. In A. Dirlik (Ed.), *What Is in a Rim? Critical Perspectives on the Perspectives on the Pacific Region Idea* (pp. 161-182). Boulder: Westview.
- Notter, L. (1972). *The case for historical research in nursing*. *Nursing Research*, 21, 483.
- NZH. (2006, 23 May). *Editorial: Real News better for minorities*. New Zealand Herald, p. A11.
- Ong, A. (1987). *Spirits of Resistance and Capitalist Discipline: Factory Women in Malaysia*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Ong, A. (1991). *The Gender and Labour Politics of Postmodernity*. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 20, 279-309.
- Ong, A. (1996). *Anthropology, China, Modernities: The Geopolitics of Cultural Knowledge*. In H. Moore (Ed.), *The Future of Anthropological Knowledge* (pp. 60-92). New York: Routledge.
- Ong, A. (1997). *Chinese Modernities: Narratives of Nation and of Capitalism*. In A. Ong & D. Nonini (Eds.), *Ungrounded Empires: The cultural politics of modern Chinese transnationalism* (pp. pp. 171-202). London & New York: Routledge.

- Ong, A., & Donald M, N. (1997). *Ungrounded Empires: The Cultural Politics of Modern Chinese Transnationalism*. New York: Routledge.
- Ong, V. (2006, 26 May). Letter to the Editor: Attack on overseas Chinese betrays Willies's ignorance. *iBall*, p. 11.
- OT. (2006, 23 May). Massey University Chinese students protest: "This is not humour, it is abuse!" 梅西大学学生校园抗议: "这是玷污不是幽默". *Oriental Times*, p. A5.
- Pan, L., & Chinese Heritage, C. (1999). *The encyclopedia of the Chinese overseas*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Pan, L., Yuanfang, S., & Yong, C. (2002). Some Thoughts on the state of Chinese Diaspora Studies. *China Review International*, 9(1), 17-22.
- Pang, D. (2003). Education, Politics and Chinese New Zealander Identities: The case of the 1995 Epsom Normal Primary School's 'Residency Clause and English Test'. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity -- The Chinese in New Zealand*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Pred, A., & Watts, M. (1993). *Reworking Modernity: Capitalisms and Symbolic Discontent*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press.
- Qi, R. (2006, 26 May). Letter to the Editor: From second-class to low lives. *iBall*, p. 12.
- Qiu, H. (2003). Communication among knowledge diasporas -- Online magazines of expatriate Chinese students. In K. H. Karim (Ed.), *The Media of Diaspora*. New York: Routledge.
- Rambo, A. T. (1987). Black flight suits and white Ao-dais: Borrowing and adaptation of symbols of Vietnamese Cultural Identity. In T. B. Lam (Ed.), *Borrowings and Adaptations in Vietnamese Culture* (Vol. South East Asia Paper No. 25). Manoa: Centre for South East Asian Studies, School of Hawaiian, Asian and Pacific Studies, University of Hawaii.
- Rex, J., & Centre for Research in Ethnic, R. (1996). *Ethnic minorities in the modern nation state : working papers in the theory of multiculturalism and political integration*. Basingstoke, Hants. ; New York: Macmillan ; St. Martin's Press.
- Richmond, A. H. (1994). *Global apartheid : refugees, racism, and the new world order*: New York : Oxford University Press.

- Roberts, G. (1996). Narrative History as a Way of Life. *Journal of Contemporary History*, 31, 221-228.
- Robyns, C. (1994). Translation and Discursive Identity. *Poetics Today*, 15(3), 405-428.
- Rogers, E. (1969). *Modernization among peasants: The impact of communication*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Roscoe, J. (1999). *Documentary in New Zealand: An Immigrant Nation*. Palmerston North: Dunmore Press Limited.
- Roughan, J. (2006, 27th, May). All dirty laundry has much the same look. *the New Zealand Herald*.
- Rouse, R. (1991). Mexican Migration and the social space of postmodernism. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 8-23.
- Roy, W. T. (1975). New Zealand's China Policies: A Review and a Prospect. In D. Bing (Ed.), *China: Cultural and Political Perspectives*. Auckland: Longman Paul Limited.
- Rushdie, S., & Grass, G. (1987). "Writing for a Future" In B. Bourne (Ed.), *Writers and Politics* (pp. 52-64). Nottingham: Spokesman Hobo Press.
- Safran, W. (1991). Diaspora in modern societies: myths of the homeland and return. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 83-99.
- Sarnecky, M. T. (1990). Historiography: A legitimate research methodology for nursing. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 12(4), 1-10.
- Schiller, H. I. (1989). *Culture, Inc. : the corporate takeover of public expression*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Schiller, H. I., Glick, N., Basch, L., & Blanc-Szanton, C. (1992). *Towards a Transnational Perspective on Migration: Race, Class, Ethnicity, and Nationalism Reconsidered*. New York: New York Academy of Sciences.
- Seagrave, S. (1995). *Lords of the rim*. London: Bantam.
- Shaughnessy, J. J., & Zechmeister, E. B. (1990). *Research Methods in Psychology*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Sheffer, G. (1986). A new field of study: Modern diasporas in International politics. In G. Sheffer (Ed.), *Modern diasporas and international politics* (pp. 1-15). London and Sydney: Croom Helm.
- Sheng, J. (2006, 16 May). Victoria University arosed disturbance themselves by anti-Chinese joke. 维多利亚大学反华裔玩笑惹风波. *New Zealand Chinese Herald*, p. A5.

- Siew, J. (2006, 26 May). Letters to the Editor: Refreshing but don't forget the good things Asians are known for. *iBall*, p. 12.
- Sinclair, J., Jacka, E., & Cunningham, S. (1996). *New patterns in global television : peripheral vision*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Sinclair, J., Yue, A., Hawkins, G., Pookong, K., & Fox, J. (2000). Chinese cosmopolitanism and media use. In S. Cunningham & J. Sinclair (Eds.), *Floating Lives: The Media and Asian Diasporas*. St. Lucia, Australia: University of Queensland Press.
- Sinclair, J., Yue, A., Pookong, K., & Fox, J. (1998). Media, Communication and Identity in the Chinese Diaspora: A Melbourne Study. *Communication Research Forum*, pp.504-522.
- Sklair, L. (1995). *Sociology of the Global System* (2nd ed.). Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Skrbis, Z. (1998). Making it tradeable: Videotapes, cultural technologies and diasporas. *Cultural Studies*, 12(2), 265-273.
- Sleeman, G. (2006, 26 May). Letter to the Editor: Thanks to the insight. *iBall*, p. 12.
- Smolicz, J. (1981). "Core Values and Cultural Identity." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 4(1), 75-89.
- Sofos, S. (1996). Interethnic Violence and Gendered Constructions of Ethnicity in former Yugoslavia. *Social Identities*, 2(1), 73-91.
- Stake, R. E. (1994). Case Studies. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: CA:Sage.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks: CA:Sage.
- Suryadinata, L. (1997). "Ethnic Chinese in Southeast Asia: Overseas Chinese, Chinese Overseas or Southeast Asians?" in *Ethnic Chinese as Southeast Asians*. Leo Suryadinata, ed. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Tan, L. (2006, 12 May). Asians Cash in on porn boom. *iBall*, p. 3.
- Tan, L. (2006, 12 May). Happy hooker still studying business degree. *iBall*, p. 4.
- Tan, L. (2006, 12 May). Hi Mom you cut me off, now I am a hooker. *iBall*, p. 1.
- Tan, L. (2006, 5 June). Minorities have a vital role in mainstream society. *the New Zealand Herald*.
- Tan, L. (2006, 12 May). They said NO. *iBall*, p. 5.

- Tan, L. (2006, 9 June). Time to pull together -- Interview with Manying Ip. iBall, p. 5.
- Tan, L. (2006, 15 May). To live our parents' dreams. the New Zealand Herald, p. A13.
- Tan, L. (2006, 22 May). True loyalty transcends the bounds of tokenism. the New Zealand Herald, p. A11.
- Tan, L. (2006, 10 July). What, I'm Chinese? Banana forum to also discuss gay issues. iBall, p. 8.
- Tan, L. (2006, 12 May). Why they became sex workers -- I want to show Mom I don't need her money. iBall, p. 4.
- Tan, L., & Middleton, J. (2006, 12 May). Chinese students take on sex for cash. the New Zealand Herald, p. A7.
- Teo, P. A. C. (2006, 21 August). Conflicting Views due to different backgrounds. iBall, p. 11.
- Thompson, E. (2006, 12 May). Letter to the Editor: Just Marvellous. iBall, p. 11.
- Tololian, K. (1991). Nation State and its Others: In Lieu of a Preface. *Diaspora: Journal of transnational Affairs*, 1(1), 4-5.
- Tololyan, K. (1991). The Nation-State and Its Others: In Lieu of a Preface. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 3-7.
- Tololyan, K. (1996). Rethinking diasporas: Stateless power in the transnational moment. *Diaspora*, 5(1), 3-86.
- Tomlinson, J. (1999). *Globalization and Culture*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Tong, K. C., & Lian, K. F. (2002). *The Making of Singapore Sociology*. Singapore: Oxford.
- Tsagarousianou., R. (2004). Rethinking the concept of diaspora: mobility, connectivity and communication in a globalised world. *Westminster Papers in communication and culture*, 1(1), 52-66.
- Wang, G. (1999). Chineseness: The Dilemmas of Place and Practice. In G. G. Hamilton (Ed.), *Cosmopolitan Capitalists: Hong Kong and the Chinese Diaspora at the end of the 20th Century*. (pp. 118-134). Seattle and London: University of Washington Press.
- Wang, L. C. (1991). Roots and Changing Identity of the Chinese in the United States. *Daedalus*, 120(2), pp181-206.
- Wang, L.-C., & Gungwu, W. (Eds.). (2003). *The Chinese Diaspora: Selected Essays (Vol. II)*. Singapore: Eastern Universities Press.

- Wanning, S. (2005). Media and the Chinese Diaspora: Community, Consumption, and Transnational Imagination. *Journal of Chinese Overseas*, 1(1), pp.65-86.
- Warf, B. (1993). Postmodernism and the Localities Debate: Ontological Questions and Epistemological Implications. *Tijdschrift voor Economische en Sociale Geografie*, 84(3), 162-168.
- Weber, M. (1992). *Economy and Society*. New York: Bedminster Press.
- Wee, V. (1988). "What Does Chinese Mean? An Exploratory Essay." National University of Singapore, Singapore.
- Wei-ming, T. (1994). Cultural China: The Periphery as the Center. In T. Wei-ming (Ed.), *The Living Tree: The Changing Meaning of Being Chinese Today*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Weiner, W. (1986). Labour migrations and incipient diasporas. In G. Sheffer (Ed.), *Modern diasporas in international politics* (pp. 47-74). London: Croom Helm.
- Werbner, P. (1997). Essentialising Essentialism, Essentialising Silence: Ambivalence and Multiplicity in the Constructions of Racism and Ethnicity. In *Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism*, P. Werbner and T. Modood (eds.), 226-254.
- Williams, R. (1976). *Keywords : a vocabulary of culture and society* (Rev. and expanded ed.). London: Fontana.
- Willmott, W. E., & Novitz, D. (1989). *Culture and identity in New Zealand*. Wellington: GP Books.
- Wu, D. Y.-h. (1991). The Construction of Chinese and Non-Chinese Identities. *Daedalus*, 120(2), pp.159-179.
- Wu, D. Y.-h. (1994). The Construction of Chinese and Non-Chinese Identities. In T. Wei-ming (Ed.), *The Living Tree: The Changing Meaning of Being Chinese Today* (pp. 148-167). Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Yang, M. M.-h. (1994). *Gifts Favours and Banquets: The Art of Social Relationships in China*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.
- Yang, M. M.-h. (1997). Mass media and transnational subjectivity in Shanghai: Notes on (re)cosmopolitanism in a Chinese Metropolis. In A. Ong & D. Nonini (Eds.), *Ungrounded Empires: The cultural politics of modern Chinese transnationalism* (pp. 287-319). London & New York: Routledge.

- Yang, P. Q. (2000). The 'Sojourner Hypothesis' Revisited. *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies*, 9(2), 235-258.
- Yee, B. (2003). Coping with Insecurity: everyday experiences of Chinese New Zealanders. In M. Ip (Ed.), *Unfolding History, Evolving Identity -- The Chinese in New Zealand*. Auckland: Auckland University Press.
- Yew, L. K. (1999). Lee Kuan Yew's "Asian Values". In L. Pan & C. Chinese Heritage (Eds.), *The encyclopedia of the Chinese overseas*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Yin, R. K. (1984). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. Beverly Hills: CA:Sage.
- Zhou, Y. (2003). Book Review: *The Chinese Diaspora: Space, Place, Mobility and Identity*. *Geographical Review*, 93(3), 417-419.
- Zlotink, H. (1998). International Migration 1965-96: An Overview. *Population and Development Review*, 24(3), 469-510.
- Zolberg, A. R., Suhrke, A., & Aguayo, S. (1989). *Escape from violence : conflict and the refugee crisis in the developing world*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- 文扬, W. Y. (2006, 18 May). Media's offensive 媒体的冒犯. *New Zealand Chinese Herald*, p. B5.
- 张丽. (2006, 30 June). Bo Ke Yin Fa de Xin Mei Jie Si Kao (播客引发的新媒介思考). *New Zealand Chinese Mirror*, p. B8

Appendix

1. The front page of iBall on May 12, 2006

Media WORKS 2005 Ltd. Email: news@iballmedia.co.nz

Yours Free

Ph: 09 360 3282
Fax: 09 360 2180
Po Box 46018
Herne Bay,
Auckland, NZ


iBall

YOUR ENGLISH LANGUAGE ASIAN NEWSPAPER

Auckland 12 May 2006

Hi Mom you cut me off now I'm a hooker

**They said
NO to
temptation** Pg 5



It's better than kidnap or murder, say Asian students turning to sex work for "easy" money Pgs 3 - 4

In NZ Herald

DANGER ZONE

They worry about face, but what about Sexually Transmitted Infections and other dangers of working in the sex industry. Julie Middleton reports in The NZ Herald.

Easy money too tempting for desperate people

She is a Desperate Chick. Up to her neck in debt and several weeks behind in her rent, she has run out of friends when she can hit for yet another loan.

With eviction staring in her face as winter approaches, she is seriously considering a job in a massage parlour. Doesn't matter that she knows next to nothing about bringing relief to aching muscles through shiatsu or acupressure. She can earn big bucks offering "special services."

This is a real story, a tragedy that is unfolding. People in my office know this Asian girl who is thinking of becoming a sex worker when the solution to her problems is just a telephone call home.

This girl, let's call her Miss X, is reluctant to call her mom for financial help because they had a falling out over her Paki ex-boyfriend who introduced her to P. She does not want to return to China because her mother is trying to marry her off to a man she does not love.

So far, her desire to be independent and self-sufficient has not been matched with an ability to hold down a job and the discipline to live within her means. Whatever she earned was spent on expensive clothes and accessories and partying in trendy Ponsonby nightspots with her friends.

Now that she is broke, she is learning who her real friends are. Her housemates, the very people she used to hobnob with,

have turned their backs on her. If she cannot pay her share of the rent, she is out in the cold.

There are many young women like Miss X who have come to NZ ostensibly to study English and acquire other work skills so they can land better jobs after returning home. Sadly, quite a number of them fail to attain their objectives and face tough choices trying to overcome financial difficulties.

It's also obvious that many of them have kept their parents in the dark about how they are really coping in NZ.

As recent incidents in NZ have shown, some male Asian students had resorted to criminal activities including extortion and kidnap to resolve their financial difficulties.

In the case of some female Asian students, it would seem sex-for-sale is the answer. The hard choices Miss X has to make to overcome her financial difficulties bring into sharp focus the issue of growing Asian involvement in New Zealand's sex industry.

As our reports (Pages 3, 4 and 5) indicate, an increasing number of Asian women including students are turning to the world's oldest profession to earn quick money, taking advantage of the Labour Government's prostitution law reform.

It would also seem that many of the Asian sex workers are not part of the New Zealand

Prostitutes' Collective, preferring to operate on their own in apartments or townhouses shared with others.

The wisdom of such go-it-alone ventures remain to be seen as, according to the NZPC, they are exposing themselves to unnecessary risk of sexually-transmitted infections (STI) to the overall detriment of NZ health.

The Asian presence in the sex business has also taken on a new profile with the recent launching of a porn magazine featuring pictures of Asian girls in the nude and engaging in sex acts.

In this issue of iBall, we also highlight the wonderful Mother's Day gift which long-time Takapuna resident Mary Norton received from her daughter Emma and son Darcy (Page 10).

As Kiwis honour their moms with Mother's Day gifts and other treats, one may ask, "What's the best present a Mother can get from her child half a world away?"

Yes, a gift from NZ would be nice. But perhaps the best present a Mother can have is to hear their only child's voice on the phone, expressing her gratitude for sacrifices made by her parents and pledging to work or study hard. Knowing her child is safe and doing well is the best present.

So I hope Miss X will listen to her friends. Swallow your pride, pick up that phone and call your Mom.



Charles Chan
Editor
kychan@iballmedia.co.nz

iBall news

email: news@iballmedia.co.nz

Publisher
iBall Media Works 2005 Ltd.

Editors
Lincoln Tan
Charles Chan

Advertising
Ph: 03-3803282
Email: sales@iballmedia.co.nz
Chuan Chee Lou, Manager
Coleman Lam

Production
Jing Min Lee, Senior Design

iBall Media Management
Ambrose Tong, Chairman
Chris Koo, Managing Director
Lincoln Tan
Chuan Chee Lou
Sie Ming Ling

General enquiries to PO Box 46018, Heme Bay, Auckland
email: info@iballmedia.co.nz
Published by iBall Media Works 2005 Ltd, 300 Richmond Rd, Grey Lynn, Auckland. Printed APN Print.

Asians cash in on porn boom

By Lincoln Tan

THE Asian flavour in New Zealand's sex industry is getting stronger since the legalization of prostitution.

An increasing number of women from China, Korea, Thailand, Malaysia and even Singapore are selling sex in Auckland through newspapers and the Internet.

Many are running their own unlicensed 'single owner operated brothels' from central city apartments and suburban homes.

Auckland's first Chinese pornographic magazine was also launched earlier this month.

From interviews iBall had with a number of Asian hookers, it would seem that they were motivated by easy money to support their lavish lifestyle rather than toil at menial jobs paying \$10 an hour.

Chinese student Dora, 21, said she became a sex worker when she ran out of options to finance her stay in New Zealand. It was also an act of defiance against her mother.

"Prostitution is legal in New Zealand, I sell my body for money, so what?" she said in Mandarin. "It is better than kidnapping or murder for money."

Dora (her trade name) first got into sex work eight months ago when her parents stopped supporting her financially and wanted her to return to China. Until then, she was getting about \$3,000 per month in allowance.

"My mother did not want me to have a Kwei boyfriend, and said that unless I dumped him, she will stop giving me money," she said. "I told her that she cannot control me with money and I will find my own way to earn my money. I want to prove to her that I didn't need her or her money."

Dora said jobs paying \$10 an hour will not be able to support her lifestyle, which includes eating out daily because she does not know how to cook, going to pubs and lounges, and shopping for 'good quality fashion accessories' such as the latest Louis Vuitton bags.

Her situation is not unique, according to authorities.

While there are no precise figures, it is believed that since the legalization of prostitution, more Asian women have gone into sex work and started their own unlicensed brothels in search of "easy money".

The Chinese sex industry is also now seen as big enough to support its own magazine.

KiwiNight, a monthly R18 glossy sex magazine in Chinese, featuring pictorials of Asian sex workers, related advertisements and adult cartoons was launched earlier this month. It has a cover price of \$8 and is sold through subscriptions, Chinese massage parlours, dairies and Asian bookshops.

Single owner brothels have been known to be operating in central city apartments, and the North Shore City Council had also recently uncovered nine unlicensed brothels operated by Asians - but believe there are still a lot more that are not known to them yet.

Chinese women, including many international or language school students, are said to be sharing apartments and rental homes, from where they operate their own unlicensed single owner operated brothel.

Warwick Robertson, team leader environmental protection at the North Shore City Council, said that every brothel complaint he investigated involved Chinese nationals. There is also evidence that some of the prostitutes are students and at least one from Massey University.

"Every one that I've investigated on the North Shore had Chinese staff and some are also operating more than one brothel," he said. "My information suggests that one operator is running up to six brothels, four on the North Shore, one in the city and one in South Auckland."

Robertson said he had spoken to women of different ethnic backgrounds in the North Shore and they were worried for their safety.

"Residents living in areas where these brothels operate are genuinely fearful for their safety, because men were turning up at the wrong address and driveways were being blocked," he said. "It's a family environment, and people should not be subjected to such fears."

Chinese girls turning to sex work is a worrying trend, said former homestay mother Wilhelmina Xu.



"A lot of the Chinese students who come here are used to getting easy access to money, and when that flow stops, they don't know what to do," Xu said. "Boys turn to gambling and sometimes even resort to criminal acts such as stealing and kidnapping to get money, but girls see their bodies as an ATM card to gain easy access to cash."

One Asian prostitute told iBall that like herself, many Chinese students are selling sex because they want to, not because they have to.

"No one forced me have sex for money," she said. "I think most of us decide to go in it for ourselves and think it is a better choice than working for minimum wage."

Suzie (not her real name), 19, said that her clientele were mainly Pakeha and the reason they preferred Asian prostitutes was because "we are cheaper" and "are prepared to do more". She said many of her clients were willing to pay a premium for sex without wearing condoms or any other form of protection.

This gives rise to another worry - sexually transmitted infections (STI).

"The Chinese girls are charging more for low protection, and in our evidence (studs), we found one woman having to wash her mouth out, at another, three were caught in the act, one had to wash hands, the other two had to

have a mouth rinse," said Robertson. "That is extremely dangerous."

He added: "STIs can sit around dormant for years, and many of the (Chinese) girls lack knowledge in sexual health."

There is also a reluctance among them to join organizations such as the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective for fear that they could be stigmatized.

"We Chinese are more concerned about face than health or safety," Suzie said. "If we register with the NZPC, it means that we are officially a prostitute and there will be a record in NZ to say that we are one. We make our own safety checks on our clients."

Kate Dickie, an official of the NZPC in Auckland, says there has "definitely" been an increase in Chinese sex workers.

"Ten years ago, most Asian sex workers were Thai," said Dickie who sees the increase as a reflection of the growing Chinese population.

She is concerned over stories of sex workers who allow sex without a condom because they can't see any evidence of ill-health than things are OK.

Students on temporary visas can work 15 hrs a week but are explicitly banned from working in brothels under the Prostitution Reform Act.

On the issue of students in prostitution, Catherine Healy of NZPC Wellington said:

"It's not just Chinese, I think there have always been students in the sex industry. There have always been sex workers who are students and students who are sex workers. Some do it to avoid student debt and for many the flexible hours are good - but I haven't noticed a big increase in Chinese student sex workers."

"There has been an increase in the numbers of Chinese women overall in the industry but it's more of a shift than a clish."

"People think that's awful but they have to remember that there are New Zealand students who work in the sex industry in other foreign countries. All kinds of people are involved in sex work."

* Pic of Healy by Mark Mitchell, NZ Herald

4. iBall: Why they became sex workers
5. iBall: Happy hooker still studying for business degree

4

iBall News

iBall

Why they became sex workers

I want to show Mom I don't need her money

SHE'S now a prostitute and blames her mother in China for it.

"I once had a Kiwi boyfriend. She could not accept that and thought she could use money to control me," Dora said. "I want to prove to her that she cannot do that and I don't need her money."

Dora (her trade name), 21, came to Auckland from Shanghai two years ago - first to learn English and later to do business studies at a private school, which she did not complete. Her monthly allowance from her parents was then about \$5,000.

She had a 45-year-old Kiwi boyfriend and wanted to bring him back to China to meet her mother. But when Dora told her mother that "all hell broke loose".

"My mother wanted me to have a Chinese boyfriend and said she wanted me to go back to China immediately if I continued seeing my Kiwi boyfriend," Dora said. "She cried and told me that she would ask my dad to stop giving me money."

Her parents stopped sending money to her about 10 months ago and she has stopped contacting them since.

Dora said she felt lost after her parents stopped her allowance and worked as a supermarket trolley for minimum wage. But that could not feed her lifestyle which included living in a central city studio apartment, shopping for luxury fashion items and dining out on a daily basis.

To make matters worse, her Kiwi boyfriend left her for another Chinese girl.

She started borrowing money from friends but they stopped when they found

FROM high school student to part-time prostitute while she pursues a degree in Business Management - Suzie is making the best of an unusual situation.

She came to New Zealand with her parents in 2002 and enrolled in an Auckland high school.

When her father could not get work for her and her mother's food business here failed, they wanted her to move back to Korea with them.

But after experiencing the freedom she got

Happy hooker still studying for business degree

every cent but now not only am I able to spend freely, I also have money to send back to my parents for Korean New Year."

After finishing high school, she worked in an Asian grocery shop, where she was paid \$180 per week. This was not enough to pay her \$110 weekly rent, let alone her living expenses.

One of her friends suggested the sex industry.

"I was looking at ways where I can earn a bit of money, and looking at the classifieds, there were a few advertisements for work at massage parlours," she said. "But if I went for them, they take a commission."

Since I know sex work is legal in New Zealand, I may as well think of myself and keep everything," she said.

She bought a pre-paid mobile phone and then ran an ad in the classifieds in the "amusements" section. To her surprise, she received over 20 calls.

"One man said he had been lonely after his wife had died. He felt pity for him and he became my first customer," Suzie said. "He was Kiwi in his mid-40s and I sort of a nice man. He talked and we had sex only for a short while and then he went off."

They did not use a condom because she said that "looked like a nice family man, not the kind that would be a prostitute every night."

Suzie claims she is a good judge of character and "can judge people by their voice."

"If they sound nice, I won't even give them my address or go to where they want me to go," she said.

Although she is aware of the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective, she will not approach them for help for fear that would be registered as a "prostitute".

"I do not want my friends to know, or parents to find out, whether today or one about the fact that I am selling my body," she said. "I am happy doing what I do now. I will stop when I find a good paying professional job one day."

6. iBall: They say NO



Shandong stunner resists temptation for sake of 'my future husband'

iBall News 5

They said NO

Sarah Wang

Shandong stunner resists temptation for sake of 'my future husband'

Shandong stunner Sarah Wang has been offered a house and a Porsche to become a "little wife" to a wealthy businessman.

Another man offered the tall, attractive part-time model \$20,000 to "entertain" his girlfriend for a week.

Last year, she was offered \$2,000 to pose nude for a New Zealand magazine.

She admitted that she had been tempted by some of the offers but is "legged out" all down because she "must well think of my future husband".

Sarah, 24, was a model in Shanghai before coming to New Zealand to study at the ABI-Ascent Business Institute in Auckland, and a 2000 Miss China finalist.

She said she met a lot of "rich" people who think I will do anything for money," she said. "They offer me all sorts of things wanting me to be a prostitute, but I know they are just trying to get me and after only one day."

She found the offers tempting and

was not surprised that some girls would succumb to this temptation but she chose to think long term.

Sarah said she could identify with most Chinese girls here and a Chinese news article she came across entitled "Princess in China, slave in NZ".

She said: "For most girls, money comes easy for them in China. They only have to ask their parents. But when they come here and sometimes have to depend on themselves, they don't know what to do".

"I know I can choose an easy path in life, but I don't know if it will make me happy in the long term," Sarah said. "I still think working hard and finding a husband who is equally hard working and who loves you is the path to long term happiness."

Sarah said she is not the conservative sort and would not object to stripping for art, such as body painting. But she will not strip for porn.

"Girls who want to get involved with the porn industry or becoming prostitutes are just destroying their lives," she said. "It is a dead end and

Kiki Chen

Kiki runs for cover from nude pix offer

student at AUT said she was "shocked and disgusted" when told of the offer.

"Why not?" she said. "They wanted to talk money but I told my agent that no amount of money can get me to pose nude."

Kiki said she was no prude and have done photo shoots "close to being nude" - but they were for fashion magazines.

"But no decent Chinese girl who has been raised right by her parents would consider doing something like that for a porn magazine," she said.

Kiki said she also cannot believe that Chinese girls are becoming prostitutes in New Zealand.

"Girls from China who can afford to come here must come from quite wealthy families, so I cannot understand why they have to sell their bodies," she said.

She said that being raised in a strict family with high morals, she will never contemplate doing anything close to what these girls are doing.

"They are giving the rest of us Chinese a bad name and a bad image," Kiki said. "If they have no money, then they should just go home."

7. The New Zealand Herald: Chinese students take on sex for cash

nzherald.co.nz

NEWS

The New Zealand Herald • Friday, May 12, 2006

A7

A growing number of young Chinese women who come to Auckland as students are turning to prostitution. Julie Middleton and Lincoln Tan investigate

Chinese students take on sex for cash



Julie Middleton



Lincoln Tan

This story is a joint investigation by Julie Middleton of the Herald and Lincoln Tan, the managing editor of *iBall*, a free fortnightly English-language Asian newspaper, available in Auckland. Its latest edition, out today, investigates Chinese prostitution.

The number of foreign prostitutes in Auckland has jumped in the last three years, as young Chinese students look for a fast way to make money.

A study shows a 25 per cent increase in foreign sex workers since prostitution was decriminalised by the Prostitution Reform Act in 2003.

One of the authors, nurse specialist Bronwyn Schofield, said that "probably two-thirds" of the 38 non-resident sex workers she had interviewed over two years after the act were Chinese women.

Many of them were students aged between 18 and 24, who told her they went into the trade for "easy money" or out of desperation to get cash.

However, prostitution is still illegal for these women. Students and tourists are barred from sex work by the Immigration Act and the Prostitution Reform Act.

The figures — compiled from a weekly clinic Ms Schofield runs for sex workers — corroborate what police and the Prostitutes Collective have told the Prostitution Law Review Committee.

Both used the phrase "significant issue" to describe the increase in non-Kiwi sex workers, with police adding that international students in the industry were "an increasing problem" as well as people who came on student visas with sex work in mind.

The Department of Labour said that illegal sex workers were typically on student or visitor permits. Api Fiso, group manager border security, said the department visited brothels "on most weeks" to check workers' status and educate employers.

The Prostitutes Collective said staff had noticed "an increase in Chinese

sex workers coming from parts of Asia where they speak Cantonese", and the increases were most noticeable in "areas where there are language schools and universities".

In an editorial in today's English-language Asian newspaper *iBall*, editor Charlie Chan discusses the case of "Miss X" who was up to her neck in debt and behind in rent.

"There are many young women like Miss X who have come to New Zealand ostensibly to study English and acquire other work skills so they can land better jobs after returning home. Sadly, quite a number of them fail to attain their objectives and face tough choices trying to overcome financial difficulties. . . . In the case of some female Asian students, it would seem sex-for-sale is the answer.

"The hard choices Miss X has to make to overcome her financial difficulties bring into sharp focus the issue of growing Asian involvement in New Zealand's sex industry."

The Prostitutes Collective periodically counts Auckland's sex workers, trawling through all the parlours and checking ads and websites.

Auckland had about 1500 sex workers, said regional co-ordinator Kate Dickie. Many were sole traders working from apartments or suburban homes.

A decade ago, most foreign workers were Thai, but their numbers fell as visa rules tightened.

Catherine Healy, the collective's national co-ordinator, said the increase in Chinese sex workers reflected a growing Chinese population.

"We think there is a bit of an intersection between those who come to



SEEDY SIDE: A number of the brothels using Chinese students are unlicensed. PICTURE / GETTY IMAGES

study and sex work," said Ms Healy.

"We know this has been the case in other parts of the world.

"People think, 'Oh my gosh that's awful, they have come here to study and that's what they should do'.

"But people have to remember that New Zealand exports students who also work in the sex industry in

foreign countries." The trade has been thrown into focus on the North Shore, where the number of commercial unlicensed brothels — those with more than four workers — "has increased dramatically in the last 12 months", according to Warwick Robertson, North Shore City Council's environmental team leader and a former policeman.

He knew of "about nine or 10" large illegal brothels, most of them run and staffed by Chinese people. Frate neighbours of one in suburban Albany have threatened to publish clients' plate numbers on a website called Where Is Your Husband?

A Herald survey of other councils

found they were not experiencing the same trends. Although Mr Robertson's main concern was the environmental impact of brothels, such as traffic congestion, he was concerned that some "Chinese (sex workers) are charging more for low protection", whether oral or penetrative sex was involved. "That is extremely dangerous."

At the same time, New Zealand also has its first Chinese-language porn magazine, *Kiwinght*, which appears to be managed from Australia, and features explicit pictures of mostly Chinese women, adult cartoons, and advertisements for local brothels. Cut-out coupons promise \$10 discounts. "It's a first," said Catherine Healy.

IN
ES
(期六)

有報道指奧克蘭華人娼妓數目急升 以留學生為主

【華頁訊】有報道指出，奧克蘭的國際留學生賣淫問題日趨嚴重，當中又以中國留學生佔大多數。

一個由英文先驅報和一份以亞裔為對象的英文雙週報iball聯合進行的調查報道指出，奧克蘭的外國娼妓數目在過去三年顯著增加，原因是很多年輕的中國女子希望能「搵快錢」。

一個由專業護士Bronwyn Schofield進行的調查顯示，娼妓改革法於兩年前通過使到賣淫非刑事化後，他所訪問的三十八名非本地居民的性工作者中，約有三分之二為華人婦女。

Schofield表示，這些婦女大部分是年齡在十八歲至二十四歲的學生，她們表示，當娼是急需用現金或藉此「搵快錢」。她表示，部分學生妓女因為無知和被欺負，被迫在沒有使用安全套下進行性交。

以學生和旅遊簽證進入新西蘭的

人，在移民法和娼妓改革法下，假如進行賣淫行為，均屬違法，Schofield表示，必需對非法的性工作者進行宣傳教育。

警方表示，國際學生從事性行業，是一個日趨嚴重的問題。

勞工部表示，非法性工作者往往以學生和旅遊簽證進入新西蘭，該部門已不定期調查妓院，以檢查性工作者的身分，並告訴僱主不能聘用外地人當性工作者。

娼妓組織Prostitutes Collective表示，該組織的職員知道來自亞洲的賣淫性工作者的人數正在增加，她們多會說廣東話，這些妓女在有語言學校和大學的地區顯著增加，該組織的全國統籌Catherine Healy指出，在華裔人口增加下，中國性工作者的人數也隨著增加。她表示，往海外求學的新西蘭人，同樣有人在其他國家當性工作者。Prostitutes Collective會定期

統計奧克蘭的性工作者人數，該組織會調查所有按摩院、廣告和網站。

該組織的地區統籌Kate Dickie表示，奧克蘭目前約有一千五百名性工作者，很多是在公寓單位和住宅區的房屋從事賣淫活動。十年前，海外性工作者主要來自泰國，但在收緊簽證後，泰國性工作者的人數下跌。

北岸市由於出現沒有領取牌照，並在住宅區經營的妓院，引起居民不滿。北岸市政府環境小組組長Warwick Robertson表示，在住宅區開設妓院的數目，在過去一年突然增加，以他所知，至少有九至十家這類妓院，裡面的妓女數目超過四人，這些妓院大部分由華人經營。

這些在住宅區開設的色情場所，已引起當地居民不滿，一名住在北岸市Albany的居民表示，假如

附近的妓院不關門大吉，她會把當娼者的車牌放在網上公告天下。

英文先驅報的報道訪問了一些從事性工作的留學生。一名韓國學生表示，在她的父母回國後，她在雜貨店一週180元的收入不足以維持她的生活費，於是她在同學建議下從事性工作。她和兩名中國留學生在一間房屋內當娼，每週可賺取約二千元。她表示，她的客人以白人為主，這些客人告訴她，他們喜歡找亞洲婦女，因為較便宜和這些婦女可能會提供更多服務。

一名二十一歲的娼妓表示，她的父母為了迫她返回上海，於是不再每週寄三千元生活費到新西蘭給她，於是她成為性工作者。



9. Chinese Express: 女留学生和旅游者为钱来奥克兰当妓女误为合法

女留學生和旅遊者為錢來奧克蘭當妓女誤為合法

新西蘭 中國一週

時事重點



www.chinese-media.co.nz

根據英文主流媒體的調查，越來越多的中國年輕女學生來到奧克蘭之後走上了賣淫的道路。這消息因而在不少海外報紙轉播。紐西蘭很多女留學生做妓女。

在過去三年中奧克蘭地區外國妓女人數大增，調查顯示自從2003年國會通過「妓女改革法」，使得賣淫成為非法罪惡活動以後，來自海外的性工作者人數上升了25%，可能有人誤以為這就是合法，就不怕去做。

定期為妓女提供健康檢查服務的護士專家Bronwyn Schofield表示，新法實施後兩年多來，她接觸過三十八位不具備永久居民身份的性工作者，其中「大概三分之二」是華人婦女，其中許多人是十八歲至二十四歲的學生，這些人告訴她說，進入這個行業是為了「賺些零錢」，或者急於需要錢。

雖然紐西蘭的色情業是合法的，但對這些人來說，從事賣淫仍然非法，因為根據「移民法」和「妓女改革法」，海外學生和旅遊者不得賣淫。

Schofield女士每週為性工作者提供一次診所醫療服務，由此她獲得了這些第一手的資料。這些數字與警方以及妓女工會向妓女法律援助委員會提交國籍中的數字相吻合。

警方和妓女工會在辯論外籍性工作者人數上升時，都用了「黑箱問題」這個詞，警方另外還表示，海外學生從事行業是個「日趨增加的問題」，而有些來自國外的學生，心目中早就想好來這地當妓女。

勞工部表示，非法的性工作者常在學生或旅遊簽證持有者中出現，勞工部邊境安全經理Ari Pao表示，本國工作人員經常去妓院檢查，核實其身份，並教育雇主相關事宜。

並教育雇主相關事宜。

妓女工會表示，已注意到「來自南東亞的亞洲地區的華人性工作者人數增加」，而在那些開設有一些語言學校或大學的週圍地區，這類妓女人數之增加相當明顯。

有許多年輕婦女，她們來紐西蘭時是為了學習英語並獲得其它工作技能，以便回國後能得到更好的工作，但是很令人傷心，有相當大一部分人未能達到她們的目標，又面臨著經濟上的困難。對於許多亞洲女學生來說，賣身便是個答案了，由此令人注意到紐西蘭亞裔婦女從事性業人數增加的問題。

妓女協會定期結算在奧克蘭從事性服務的人數，該協會地區副理Kate Dickie表示，奧克蘭約有一千五百名性工作者，許多人是單獨從業者，在公寓樓中或位於郊區的住宅中接待顧客。

十年前，大部份海外性工作者來自泰國，現在泰國妓女人數下降了，因為簽證控制收緊了。

協會全國副理Catherine Healy表示，華人性工作者人數上升，反映了華人總人口的上升。她說：「我們了解有些人來這裡既學習又賣身，但我們知道在世界上其它地方也有這種情況，人們會想：『哦，那真可怕，她們來這裡是應該學習的。』但人們忘記了，紐西蘭也在出口學生，有些人也在外國從事性業。」

北岸市政府舉壇科主任，隨聲緊Warwick Robertson表示，北岸地區近三個月來，未申領執照的妓院（妓女人數超過五人）數目大增。他還指出出現了九個或十個大型非法妓院，大多數是由華人經營或從業的，導致一些週圍居民的不滿，Albany地區最近在居民區開了一家非法妓院，鄰居們十分惱火，想出一個絕招，向那些顧客發出威脅：你的車牌號碼將在「你丈夫在哪裡」(Where Is Your Husband)這一網站上公佈。

雖然Robertson主任的主要擔心是妓院對

環境造成的影響，如交通擁塞等，他也擔心「華人性工作者以高收費來提供低保護的性服務，這是特別危險的。」

一直以來，奧克蘭不少報章中文版那些大版中版的色情廣告，已令很多華人讀者及商家不安，與此同時，紐西蘭現在還出現了第一份含有裸體的中文全版色情雜誌，這份雜誌是在澳洲管理的，其中登刊的色情照片大多數是華人女子，還有成人色情卡圖書，賞地妓院的廣告等，並附帶妓院的100%拍券，這種情形助長問題更加嚴重，南道之士實覺慘不忍睹。

●為什麼會走上賣身的道路？

ASunee一位來自泰國的學生，父母後來回國了，她曾工作於一家餐館，但每週得到的\$180收入不夠支付帳單，後來，她聽取了一位同學的建議，走上色情之路，位於北岸Glenfield地區的一棟民房中，現在她與兩名華人學生妓女同住其中，每週她的收入可達\$2000，她的客戶大多數是歐洲人，客人們告訴她，因為亞洲婦女比較便宜，並且「準備做更多的」，所以願意選擇亞洲妓女。

B另一位來自上海的Dora，今年二十一歲，當父母停止付給她\$3000生活費（目的是為了逼她回上海）後，她便選擇了當妓女。

C她曾將在超級市場的貨架上擺放商品，以此來賺些生活費，但那些\$10一小時的工酬無以支持她所慣性的生活方式，因為她不會做飯煮菜，因此每天都要外出吃飯，她還喜歡抽煙已很開銷。

D以上這兩人都沒有將賣身告訴其父母，但當向媒體吐露了真相，令人感到吃驚的是，這些婦女都將錢看得很重，都準備冒著健康危險去賺更多的錢，這些人在經濟上並不拮据，對這些人來說，金錢就是身份，金錢代表你是誰，那就是為什麼步入這行業並力進更大的原因了。



●女學生容易從事不設防性交易

有關部門擔心非法工作於色情業的華女學生，可能為錢或在妓院東主逼迫下，從事不設防的性交易活動。

性傳染病醫生Rick Franklin表示，不戴安全套的性交易在奧克蘭很容易找到，「肯定有一些妓院在倡導不戴安全套的性交易，當我聽到一名客人說曾經未戴安全套與妓女性交的時候，我驚得下巴都掉下來了。」

安全套可以防止HIV這種會引起愛滋病的病毒，以及其它的性病。紐西蘭最常見的性傳染病是chlamydia，會引起疼痛和五歲以下危險性極大，Franklin醫生說，一些女學生妓女不知道這種性病是沒有症狀的，「除非你去化驗檢查，否則不會知道自己已染上此病。」

在紐西蘭妓女協會每週開診一次的Bronwyn Schofield護士表示，相當數目的學生妓女每週開診一次，認為如果一位客人看上去乾淨健康，與他性交時不戴安全套不會威脅自己的健康。這些妓院東主故意雇用非法性工作者，為的是能更好地控制她們，她建議，「我們需要想辦法能夠進入她們工作場所中去，教育她們正確地……，需要在負面影響形成之前（就採取行動）。」

紐西蘭妓女協會是一個向妓女提供教育和服務的機構，政府對該機構有撥款資助。該協會奧克蘭地區副理Kate Dickie表示，雖然協會已得到會說普通話的義工的支助，但是協會很難接觸到華人性工作者。

專欄 COLUMN B3

也談紐西蘭中文媒體的良知

作者：南太井蛙（摘自新西蘭中文網）

我們都知道，媒體是一種社會公器，肩負着聲張社會正義、表達民衆聲音、科學社會弊端并引導社會輿論等一系列重要職責。新聞記者是媒體的眼睛與喉舌，記者從何角度來訪何類新聞，往往反映出媒體的立場。各國媒體與新聞記者，都訂有業守則，按照新聞記者的倫理規則，如果你的報道使無辜的人受到傷害，就不公正。有道德的記者和公正的新聞報道應該將傷害最小化。新聞教科書還提醒記者，對那些可能受到新聞報道負面影響的人要表示同情。要認識到你所採集的新聞和報道信息可能造成的傷害和不便。這些都是媒體必須具備的基本素質。

關於華人學生會淫的新聞報導，就本國國情而言，並無不妥。紐國雖然在過去幾十年前，曾秉承英國維多利亞時代保守傳統，恪守聖公會嚴格教規，一度對「性」採取近乎禁欲主義的控制。但近年紐國社會風氣開放，更在國會中通過娼妓合法化。在這種社會環境中的媒體，出現有關娼妓的報導，無疑是沒有任何華人新聞的價值的。

紐西蘭華人是具備東方文化背景的亞洲民族，移民至英國文化背景的紐西蘭，兩種不同文化交匯之間，自然產生生活習俗、價值觀等方面的差異衝突。政府及本地主流社會有識之士，一向鼓吹不同文化相兼容，不同種族和諧共處。作為媒體應推動種族和諧文化交融，這是毋庸置疑的，也是每一個媒體人良知所在。

作為一個外來族群的華裔（或泛稱亞裔），有女學生賣淫，卻成為個別媒體人心目中的賣點。喬裝嫖客，秘訪妓寨，從華裔妓女口中，騙取有新聞價值的資料，再拼湊成章，刊于報上。新聞炮制出來了，也引起了轟動效應，作者家喻戶曉。但這篇文章產生了什麼樣的社會效果呢？作者通過華人賣淫這一新聞，提出了什麼有實質社會意義道德標準的思考與探索呢？

我質疑作者的真正用心與最終目的所在！

妓女是人類最古老的職業，一直以來，青樓妓寨，風月場所，包括尋花問柳的風流韻事，都是文人騷客新聞記者創作採訪的題材。除了一些青樓女子仗義心腸多才多藝的故事傳說，其面紗后面的神秘感，往往也是許多

市民感興趣一窺究竟的。很多西方國家都不禁娼，荷蘭還向遊客派發「叫鴿指南」，指導如何去尋歡。奧克蘭有娼妓千余，嫖客口味或性取向不同，自然會有各種需求。除歐裔白人女子，有其它種族女子從事賣淫，本是極平常的一種社會現象。為什麼作者會試圖從這一平常的社會現象中尋找不平常的新聞題材呢？

我認為作者基于以下兩個理由：

一、華人社區近年罪案比較多，今年的販毒夫婦再保潛逃；華裔黑幫大佬被殺案鬧得；留學生萬應被綁架遇害案發生等等，加上走私、偽證、作假、詐騙等不法行為，形成社會對華人移民的負面認知與抨擊；

二、華人社體力量分散，在國會裏形勢單薄，又沒有代表華裔之政黨，中文媒體各類各自維持生存，尚未形成社會固有輿論力量，故對華人社區中不法行為大加鞭撻，諒也無人組織反擊。

統一個備受非議的弱勢族群，只敢一隅不及其餘，迎合主流社會政治黨派中少數反移民反華勢力，為自身報刊爭取讀者占有市場，却置良知于度外，沒有履行一個新聞工作者的基本職責：通過報導新聞，去喚醒社會良心，探討社會根源，尋求根治解決之道！

華人士學生在紐出賣色相，逼着「一雙玉臂千人枕，半點朱唇萬人嘗」的皮肉生涯，儘管個中有許多你我不知的內幕隱情。但有見同胞淪落于此，凡華人者，心中應懷憐憫之念。有條件者和兩位作者，應該利用手中社會公器，為掙扎社會底層女性爭取社會關注，從根本上推動減少華裔進入賣淫行業，而不是利用自己同文同種的有利條件，騙取資料，加以曝光，這種片面追求提高銷量的庸淺作法，給華人娼妓雪上加霜，再受一次傷害，也給華人社區帶來更多的打擊和壓力。

本人絕非不贊成批評揭露社區中弊端罪惡，但作為少數弱勢族群，媒體應從正面鼓吹道德重建，樹立榮譽觀念着手，避免從人以訛。我曾致信華人國會議員及中文媒體，亦在網站論壇撰文，闡述社區道德重建，修復華人正面形像的必要，嘆應者寥寥，如晦暗中一撥如豆，滅明不定，令人不禁一再呼喚良知的蘇醒！



iBall 在做什么？

(上接A1版)

們有任何好意。”這說：“對少數族群中的問題作誠實的、可信的報道事實上只會令他們被社會大多數人更好地瞭解。社論在結尾處說：‘他們（少數族群）應當珍視那些對他們同更廣大社區聯繫起來的人。誠實、可信的新聞最終會對所有的人都有好處。’”

在《紐西蘭先驅報》的社論中，Lincoln Tan 先生似乎成了一個受了挺大委屈的人，在5月27日英文先驅報的另外一位專欄作家 John Roughan 的文章“Ally dirty laundry has much the same look”裏，Lincoln Tan 先生成了一個不畏艱難、勇於揭自己族群短處的英雄。

作為同行，我們讚賞Lincoln Tan 先生熱衷於揭露華人社區所存在的問題的勇氣，因為我們也同樣在做，並且深知這並不是一件容易的事情。由於華人作為少數族裔所處的特殊邊緣社會地位，由於環境的陌生和語言的障礙，由於華人經常成為種族主義行為的受害者，我們的許多華人同胞缺乏安全感、自信心，也難免缺乏面對外來族群批評時的坦蕩，他們生怕會進一步導致在

大街上被人歧視甚至辱罵。

身為媒體同行，我們更深知言論自由的可貴，深知批評對一個社群健康發展的必要。然而，作為一個有意充當英語讀者觀察亞裔社區的一個視窗的專欄作家，Lincoln Tan 先生的文章是否是在做“誠實、可信”的報道呢？

且不說Lincoln Tan 先生關於學生做妓女的報道是否客觀、是否有以偏蓋全之嫌和嘩眾取寵之嫌。他在自家報紙 iBall 上的文章題目是“ Asians cash in on porn boom”，而在《紐西蘭先驅報》上的題目卻是“ Chinese students take on sex for cash”，為什麼要用“華裔”替換“亞裔”，這其中是否有什么特別的含義嗎？而在“華人學生從事賣淫交易”的大題目下所羅列的案例也有韓國學生，這就更加引起讀者注意到文章題目明顯的誤導性，也導致了對其文章客觀性和公正性的強烈質疑。

在Lincoln Tan 先生那篇“True loyalty transcends the bounds of tokenism”的文章中，他以偏蓋全的文字手法更加突出。在他的文章中，絲毫看不到事實中存在的華人讀者對其批評

文章的理性反應，所有的反應——不論是網民的還是女記者的一一都是極端的、過激的，在不明真相的其他族群的眼裏，華人社會同一個開關的敵意修斯林群體如出一轍。

就事實而言，主流媒體對華人的負面新聞報道幾乎沒有間斷過。每次出現，華人媒體都會及時翻譯轉載，而幾乎每次有批評報道出現，都會在華社引起一番激烈討論，總會有人認為批評得好，並痛斥毒害之場使華社蒙羞，也總有人認為華人社社應當深刻反省自己、還總有人領導要自尊自愛，當然也總有人對此不高興，把正當的批評同種族攻擊聯繫起來。

Lincoln Tan 先生自稱他在新加坡長大，從不真的認為自己是Chinese，但主流媒體不是把他當成華人社群中會用英語寫文章的一員才特別為他開闢這個專欄的嗎？他自己的 iBall 報紙不是因為寄望亞裔社區才獲得一個特別地位嗎？英語讀者不是希望通過他的文章更真實地了解亞裔社區嗎？他不應當承擔一定的社會責任嗎？

但遺憾的是，不知Lincoln Tan 先生是真的出於對華人社會

缺乏瞭解，還是出於一己偏見，除了上述所說的他在文章中只寫出部分華人讀者對他文章的過激反應從而引發《紐西蘭先驅報》專門發表評論對整個華人社群進行教育外，他還在文章中說一個華人網站經營者告訴他華人仍舊相信華人有天賦的優越感，還要大家記住中國過去歷史上的衰敗就是因為中國人認為中國國土之外的所有人都是野蠻人。

且不說他的這些話有多少事實根據，畢竟他有權利持有自己的觀點。但是在華人事實上在紐西蘭社會屬於少數族群、弱勢群體、處於邊緣地位的真實處境下他有意無意地把華人同種族主義心態聯繫起來，這展示的是目前華人社會的真實心態嗎？如果不是，那不是在誤導主流社會嗎？

另外，本報記者近日對本地包括報紙、電臺、電視臺、網站幾乎所有的華人媒體進行了詳細的調查核實，除了一家華人媒體機構承認曾經計劃採訪Lincoln Tan 先生並同其有過接觸外，所有其他媒體都否認同其有過接觸，但據那家華人媒體機構說，Lincoln Tan 先生拒絕接受採訪其理由是他找到了一些華人媒體

的電話和電子郵件。而在對這家媒體機構和Lincoln Tan 先生的調查瞭解中，Lincoln Tan 先生稱正是這家機構的記者在電話中說了華人媒體的職責是保全華人臉面的話並質問他對誰效忠。但那家華人媒體機構斷然否決有記者說過這樣的話。

本週三，電視一台灣節目 Agenda 就華人媒體如何看待外界批評採訪了本報記者，也採訪了被提及的那家華人媒體機構的新聞負責人和Lincoln Tan 先生。在一些主流媒體如電視一台灣節目 Agenda 眼裏，通過採訪弄清華人媒體如何看待自己的職責是件重要的事情。相比之下，《紐西蘭先驅報》在不核實不調查的情況下就刊登Lincoln Tan 先生那以偏蓋全的文章，並在此基礎上發表一面倒的社論讓人遺憾，不知這是否因為Lincoln Tan 先生的文章恰恰符合了該報對華人社會和華人媒體的某種概念化的想象？

(注：Lincoln Tan 先生在解釋他為什麼沒有在專欄文章中說明是哪家媒體的哪位記者的質問時說，他的文章是個人評論而不是新聞報道。)

選擇性的審判

Selective trials

最近紐西蘭傳媒對華裔族群的報導越來越多，看來 KIWI 社羣似乎也開始關心與她們一起生活多年的華人社羣。但是細看這些新聞事件，總是負面消息多於正面消息。從之前的販賣假學歷到最近的謀財害命的學生竊屍案、還有華人販賣P毒、隱胎藥、壯陽藥，甚至學生賣淫，一件比一件負面。身為華社一份子也覺得有夠令人沮喪。

這些紐西蘭傳媒盡所能挖華人隱私、揭華人醜聞；自以為在「新聞自由」的藉口下，以審判者的角度，無所不用其極報導所謂的「真相」！或許滿狗血的方式來報導華社新聞，短時間立刻可以獲得讀者們的注意，但是久而久之必然受到唾棄。為所欲為的「報導」自由，不只歪曲了新聞自由的專業，更忽略傳媒「維護民眾知情權」的真諦。但在部份新聞傳媒追求高利潤的前提下，加上後現代主義批判的推波助瀾，除了「真相」，似乎已將人性尊嚴拋諸九霄雲外，至於報導真相的目的為何，那就不太重要了。

紐西蘭中華電網與紐西蘭的主流媒體相比，只是一間小型的華文傳媒。但慶幸的是，成立之初公司高層就確認，中視新聞將秉持客觀、公正、超然的原則報導新聞，新聞部在沒有廣告業務的壓力之下，記者更能夠報導新聞發揮其專業水準。而成立至今的六年裡，中視新聞部始終秉持道德標準，採訪報導紐西蘭華社所發生的新聞。像是最近與大最年輕的畢業生吳傑熙，駐華使節包逸之暢談新中關係，北岸市路易艾黎紀念銅像揭幕，專訪匯豐銀行亞太區首位華人主席

鄭海泉及海關家電總裁張瑞敏，傑出華人學子參加奧林匹亞數學競賽，送愛心到貴州資助學童上學反應熱烈，駐新大使張振遠接見奧克蘭僑胞等等新聞。從以上的新聞選材中，不難看出我們的新聞取向與原則：是以社會的光明面為主軸，讓觀眾、聽眾，讀者都可以看到華人傑出的表現，而非只是看到華人在紐西蘭社會上負面的表現。

這些年來，新聞部團隊在經理鄭成美及文字記者楊如惠、于明芳、梁玲玲、倪靜薇、黎純君、于雅娟，攝影記者布依樂、許沐平、何志凱、黃威銘、馮國賓等人及數十名專業翻譯的通力合作之下，目前每年採訪報導的紐西蘭新聞高達數千則，翻譯的新聞更是高達數萬則，更獲得中區中央電視台、台灣宏觀電視的肯定而成為他們的新聞合作夥伴，這份成績可說得來不易。

記者一向有無冕王的稱號，新聞被西方國家視為立法、司法、行政三權以外的「第四權」，除了監督政府、提出批評，以免政府濫權之外，更有公正報導社會新聞的責任。但如今一些傳媒為了「搏版面」而拋棄了其社會責任，用不公正、不客觀的方式來報導新聞，這尤如一場選擇性的審判，失去媒體工作者的職業道德。如果記者發掘真相的過程，遠比呈現真相的結果對當事人的影響更重要，那報導及發掘出來的新聞，便淪為記者自我表現、自我滿足的一種方式而已，而社會大眾對記者的信任及尊敬也就蕩然無存了。

新聞之淪落，世界之悲也。

13. Lincoln Tan: True loyalty transcends the bounds of tokenism

nzherald.co.nz

The New Zealand Herald • Monday, May 22, 2006

A11

True loyalty transcends the bounds of tokenism



LINCOLN TAN

It is not the job of a journalist to support blindly the community from which he springs

LAST week, I was asked to pledge my allegiance. The call was not from Prime Minister Helen Clark or Winston Peters, or the Singapore Government, reacting to comments I made in this column two weeks ago.

The request came from a Chinese reporter wanting to interview me about my "true intentions" in collaborating with the Herald on a story about Chinese prostitutes in Auckland.

She wanted to know if my loyalty was to the Chinese people or, because I wrote English, to Westerners.

Not only was this the first time I had received such a request from a fellow reporter, it was also the first time in my life I had been asked to justify why I, as a journalist, reported news.

The increase in Chinese prostitutes was news — so I did a story. Isn't that what journalists are supposed to do?

The reporter, who said she was not speaking for herself but for many in the Chinese community, went further. She

asked: "As a Chinese reporter, do you think of your responsibility to the Chinese community?"

"What is that responsibility?" I asked. Her reply: "To protect Chinese face."

I told her that the "honour" of becoming Lord Protector was too great for me to accept and asked her to tell her audience I could never live up to that expectation of the community.

Just weeks ago, I was sent an email from a Chinese student labelling me — and my co-editor at *2iHoi*, Charles Chan — as second-class Chinese because we are not from the mainland.

Growing up in Singapore, I never really thought of myself as Chinese, perhaps because I am Peranakan (Straits-born Chinese), meaning that somewhere in my ancestry I had a great-great-somebody from Malaya.

There is a clear distinction in the Chinese language between being a *hua ren* (ethnic Chinese) and *zhong guo ren* (Chinese national), and while I feel I am an

ethnic Chinese, I find it hard to identify with Chinese from the mainland.

Funnily enough, I have become more Chinese in New Zealand than I was in Singapore. I eat more Chinese food here. I shop more Chinese. When I do my grocery shopping, it's usually at one of the many Chinese grocery shops in Northcote.

I have more Chinese friends. But most are not from the mainland. They come from Malaysia, Singapore, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and include New Zealand-born Chinese.

So the response to the prostitute story I reported with Julie Middleton shocked me.

A few individuals took it upon themselves to become the guardians of Chinese face. They felt that a report on Chinese individuals was an attack on the entire community and they went on the offensive — through phone calls to the media, emails and online.

On one Chinese website the discussion forums were filled with angry accusations

that the Herald was attacking the Chinese community and there were calls from its members to "stand up for the Chinese".

In another, there was a call for all Chinese — from Taiwan, Hong Kong and beyond — to stand united to "save the face of Chinese" by speaking out against New Zealanders.

The tone and some of the language was comparable to white supremacists' websites. The words used were divisive and emotive.

A Chinese website operator insists that the discussions were harmless and that the forums were just an arena for a community largely ignored by mainstream media to "let off steam".

He said many Chinese here suffered from low esteem because they could not get jobs in line with their qualifications and experienced difficulties in integration. The internet provided a platform for them to express their thoughts without the need to "expose their identities".

Perhaps that might explain the email, sent under the banner of "United China" to *2iHoi* saying: "They say you are Chinese but traitor Chinese, so if you want to be one of us you must unite with us. I hope you consider your colour and stand united with the people of China in NZ so you can one day become first class Chinese to us and stop taking side of white people."

I showed this email to the Chinese website operator and he commented sadly that some Chinese still believed in the myth of China's inherent superiority.

He said that there was no such thing as a "United China". On his website forums he found that Southern Chinese resented Northerners, local Chinese disagreed with international students on most things, and older Chinese had completely different views to younger ones. How can anyone be a spokesperson or the protector for the entire community?

I declined to be interviewed by the Chinese reporter because I am not used to dealing with media organisations that see their role as being public relations promoters for a community. On where my allegiance lay, I told her that it was with

New Zealand, my adopted homeland. Putting issues on the table where they can be discussed is far more important than sweeping things under the carpet, pretending they do not exist.

The feeling by ethnic minorities that they do not have a voice can lead to serious and dangerous consequences. Remember how some Muslim youths in Britain felt that they did not have a voice and the only way to be heard was through calculated acts of violence?

Helping mainstream media to rise above ignorance and tokenism is a more important role for Chinese journalists than being "face protector" for a community which has survived criticisms and attacks for thousands of years.

As Chinese, I told my inquirer that we must change how we think. Remember that China's downfall in the past was attributable to its thinking that everyone outside the Middle Kingdom was a barbarian.

■ Lincoln Tan is managing editor of *2iHoi*, a free fortnightly English-language Asian newspaper.

To live our parents' dreams



LINCOLN TAN

New Zealand is seen as a ticket to a better life; to good academic qualifications that could lead to important jobs

I STILL remember vividly the farewell dinner my parents gave me in Singapore before my permanent move to New Zealand in 1992.

My dad, who was never the emotional sort, got rather sentimental that night when he said, "Go to New Zealand and live my dreams."

I never really understood what he meant then.

His dream never became a reality because life had been hard.

His father, my granddad, was killed during the Japanese occupation of Singapore in World War II when Dad was just a teenager. As the only child, he was left to fend for my grandmother, who was illiterate.

After marrying my mother, he was the sole breadwinner supporting not only our immediate family — which included Mom, my sister and me — but also Grandma and one unmarried aunt who lived with us.

In the tiny two-bedroom government high-rise flat where the six of us lived, there was hardly any room for potted plants, let alone the green pastures and mountains he secretly dreamed his children might enjoy.

I still recall the day when my sister opened a letter and was so excited that she had been accepted into Singapore's university.

What followed was a long talk with Mom and Dad, and that joy turned into sadness when she found out that she wasn't going to varsity because Dad could not afford the fees.

I never knew the sacrifices Dad had made for us because life had been good for me in my growing years. I never had a day hungry.

It was only when we were adults — Sis eventually became the director of sales at an international hotel, and me a newspaper journalist — that Dad told us about the many hungry days he had just to make ends meet.

At the airport and knowing I knew of his ambition, he repeated those same words: "Go and live my dreams — do everything I've always wanted to do but never got the chance to."

As a father I am starting to

understand — and was reminded of this when recently working on stories relating to Chinese students in New Zealand.

The students we see around us are the first batch of Chinese to reach adulthood since the implementation of the one-child policy in the 80s. They are precious to their parents.

As Nancy Hu, the president of the NZ Chinese Students' Association puts it: "Because the law only allows one child, Chinese parents would sacrifice everything and place all their hopes for the future on their son or daughter."

Unlike Dad, their sacrifices may not be financial. But letting go of their only child, entrusting them to the unknown, must be difficult.

But like Dad, their parents will be living their own dreams in these students. Going overseas for further studies or learning English in a Western country must surely have been their dream, too.

They must hope that New Zealand

'Some have been sidetracked from the simple privileged tasks their parents sent them here for — to study, enjoy New Zealand and get a head start.'

will be their children's ticket to a better life giving them good academic qualifications that could land them prestigious jobs, perhaps also getting a New Zealand passport allowing them to travel the world freely.

They must hope their children meet the right partners, get married, have children of their own and live happily ever after.

But some have been sidetracked from the privileged tasks their parents sent them here for — to study, enjoy New Zealand and get a head start.

They choose to live the high life: gambling, smoking and buying fancy sports cars with money meant for their living expenses, then turning to crime when they run out of money and places to borrow from.

Last week, while working on a story for the Herald, I spoke to a Chinese student who saw her body as

the way to easy cash, turning to prostitution when her mother stopped sending money. She let her business studies lapse and then even blamed her mother for her becoming a hooker.

In traditional Chinese culture, respect for elders and especially parents plays a very important role.

Some Chinese youths are also living in denial — and are not used to hearing or reading anything negative about them.

Reading reports in iBall on some non-Chinese responses to the murder of Wan Biao on Good Friday prompted one Chinese student to write saying we were "second-class Chinese" because Charles Chen, my co-editor, was from Malaysia and I was from Singapore.

Are these students a picture of China's one-child policy gone wrong? Their parents have no clue about their lives in New Zealand and I cannot imagine the pain they would feel if they found out.

How can they be so irresponsible as to turn their parents' dreams into nightmares?

With me living in New Zealand, Dad now gets to live his dreams when he makes regular visits.

Some of these students would be in a position where they, too, can help their parents to live their dreams — and perhaps

repay them a little for the sacrifices that they have made.

As I dropped off my son Ryan at school, I think I finally understood what Dad told me before I left Singapore. Parents do live their dreams in their children.

In Ryan, I am living my dream, as I watch him grow in a land with green pastures to run around in and mountains to climb — to do the things that I, too, only dreamed of doing as a child.

I dream that one day, after he has run around the pastures, he will climb the highest mountain.

Then, when he plants the flag, I will be standing there beside him as his very proud dad.

■ Lincoln Tan is managing editor of iBall, a free fortnightly English language Asian newspaper

15. New Zealand Herald: Real news better for minorities



The New Zealand Herald

Published since 1863, No. 40,038

Tuesday, May 23, 2006

Our view

Real news better for minorities

LINCOLN TAN, a New Zealand Chinese journalist, has begun to share that community's news and views with Herald readers. His column yesterday offered an insight into the difficulties facing any journalist who reports a minority's affairs. Tan described how he was approached by another Chinese journalist who took a critical view of his contribution to a Herald article on prostitution among Chinese women in Auckland.

He was asked, "As a Chinese reporter, do you think of your responsibility to the Chinese community?" He asked his inquirer what that responsibility was, and he says she replied, "To protect Chinese face." That is one way of saying what members of all minorities are inclined to say to anyone who publishes their problems. No minority wants to be ignored by the mainstream media but we do face what to be reported in the way that general affairs are covered.

That is not unusual; industries, arts, sports and the like also welcome public attention on their own terms and all are liable to turn on the professional reporter whose first and only loyalty is to a wider audience. But most industries, arts, sports and the like learn to live with the criticism because in the price of the public attention they need to sell their products or attract financial support. It may be less clear to ethnic minorities that critical reporting can do them any good. Yet it does.

'It takes courage for a minority to accept open public discussion of its problems'

Honest, credible reporting of their problems is, in fact, the only way that they will become better known to the majority. Very few people are going to read or listen to news from a minority if that news amounts to a relentless diet of non-conventions, culturally affirming comment and ceremony. The reason very few want to read or listen to much of that sort of "positive" material is not just that it is boring but, more important, it is not candid. It is the public face of people who are afraid to let other people get to know them well. It is the best of all possible worlds, it leaves the audience unconvinced and its prejudices reinforced.

It takes courage for a minority to accept open public discussion of its problems and concerns. It can reasonably ask that those who report its affairs know the subject intimately. Nobody welcomes criticism from "outsiders", whether the subject is of ethnic, religious, cultural or gender concern. And for good reason. Outsiders are unlikely to understand nuances and will either overstate problems or, more likely these days, feel disqualified from covering them critically. For all those reasons mass media have made strenuous efforts to diversify their voices of late.

But the task of a minority reporter can be a thankless one, unappreciated by his or her own people, who regard their identities as being solely their business. The professional journalist has no obligation, or desire, to be a mouthpiece or representative of any group in society, but that is exactly what a minority seems to expect of intimates assigned to cover its community. When they report the community's faults and all, they are liable to suffer questioning not just of their allegiance but, as Lincoln Tan also discovered, their ethnic status.

They can find reassurance in the knowledge that in serving the general public interest they are also serving the ultimate best interests of their people. No minority prospers in any society by keeping its problems to itself. The minorities that have carved out a secure, confident place in Western societies are those that have been able to discuss themselves frankly, laugh at themselves, revel in their common humanity as well as their cultural distinctions. They ought to value those of their own who connect them with the wider community. Honest, credible journalism is ultimately to the good of all.

16. iBall: What, I'm Chinese?

8 iBall News

iBall

What, I'm Chinese?

Banana forum to also discuss gay issues

By Lisaola Tan

ANOTHER "banana conference" is around the corner, this time examining the perplexing issue of multiple identities confronting people of mixed parentage.

It's about people like Jenna Wee whom the New Zealand Chinese Association would describe as a "banana" - yellow on the outside, but white on the inside.

Jenna, whose father is a Chinese Malaysian and mother part Japanese and Polaka, was "in denial" of her Asian roots during her growing up years.

She wanted to be just like her other Polaka classmates but over the years, she realized that it was impossible.

Jenna embarked on a journey of self-discovery, from reading and researching on the Chinese and Japanese cultures, and even to listening to music influenced by her "other" ethnicities.

Now, the 19-year-old Auckland University student has accepted that she is Asian - that she is part Chinese and part Japanese - and says she is proud of it.

Jenna Wee

"I am proud to be part of cultures that dates back thousands of years," Jenna said. "It's funny how I used to refer to Asians as 'them', but I feel so much as one of them now."

"Bananas" make up a significant portion of the 25 per cent of under 25s in Auckland who have Asian backgrounds.

"New Zealand Chinese are unique with many of the younger ones having multiple ethnicities and identities," said NZCA National President Kai Lucy. "Instead of being ashamed, they should be proud of who they are."

The conference, called "Going Bananas: Multiple Identities Forum" will also address the issues on creativity and sexuality. It will be held at the AUT University on Aug. 12.

"The forum aims to show that the NZCA is not just an old man's club, and the issues we will talk about will focus very much on the challenges that our young Kiwi Chinese of today face," Kai said. "In one session, the young people will be talking about their own experiences in living with multiple identities."

Apart from just multiple ethnicities, a young Kiwi

Chinese David Do will also talk about his life as a gay Chinese New Zealander.

Kai said the Chinese living in New Zealand "are a really diverse lot", and the forum aims to bridge and strengthen connections between and among communities.

"In talking about common issues that we face, we hope that the forum can help us ethnic Chinese work together," he said. "There is already division among the communities along political lines, but I hope that being New Zealanders, that can be put aside as we talk about our future here together."

Kai said that the established Chinese community, which were once thought as the "ideal minority" suffered because of the backlash on recent Asian immigration, and said the forum was timely to help Kiwi Chinese youth find their identity.

Some New Zealand Chinese are "more Chinese" than some recent migrants from China even, he said.

"Other than the fact that some of us cannot speak Chinese, we still observe many Chinese traditions and festivals, including Qing Ming (ancestral worship), Chinese New Year and the Lantern Festival."

For more information, visit www.goingbananas.org.nz

Kai Lucy

17. iBall: Time to pull together

iBall
iBall News 5

Time to pull together

'We have the numbers to make them take notice of us'

By Lincoln Tan

THE Chinese community can become major players in New Zealand business and politics if they can rise above their petty intra-community squabbles and move forward together.

Doing so will make mainstream New Zealanders see them in a different light - as dynamic Kiwis with useful connections to Asia which is a more important market for the country's exporters than Europe or America.

With a population of more than 100,000 and rising, the Chinese are beginning to have the numbers to make an impact in NZ, says Maryling Ip, an associate professor of Asian Studies at Auckland University.

"Having the numbers mean politicians, businesses and media will look at the Chinese community in a different light," she said. "The opportunities available now for the community are far more than it was for the early settlers."

The New Zealand Chinese community comprises local-born Chinese (25 per cent) and "new Asians"

who arrived after 1987 from countries like Hong Kong, Taiwan, Malaysia, Singapore and Mainland China.

The new arrivals created tensions between the old settlers and new immigrants, and Professor Ip witnessed a dramatic confrontation in 1993 during preparations for a formal maori visit by Chinese community leaders.

In one of her papers, Professor Ip wrote of how two men vied for the honour of making the obligatory ceremonial reply speech to their Maori hosts on behalf of all the Chinese present.

A man representing the longest-established local born community felt that he should be the speaker. "I was born here. My association was founded in the 1930s," he said.

However, a new arrival from Hong Kong, a medical doctor by profession, had a different opinion. "How can you represent the Chinese? You can't even speak Chinese properly," he countered.

Professor Ip said these are the types of intra-community squabbles that the various Chinese communities should

avoid, in order to work towards a common good for all.

But New Zealand also has to change its attitude towards Asians here.

"Asian communities have given New Zealand a taste of what a vibrant and multicultural society could be like," Professor Ip said, but they are still treated as "intruders" rather than "yellow citizens" by New Zealanders.

She said New Zealand should embrace the Chinese and Asians here, otherwise "we are only excluding ourselves from opportunities".

The economies of China and East Asia are surging forward, and the new Asians can be the link New Zealand needs to build business and trade relationships with Asia.

** Maryling Ip was born in Guizhou, China and immigrated to New Zealand in 1974. She is Associate Professor of Chinese in the Asian Studies Department at the Auckland University, and is a highly respected advocate for the Chinese communities. Her current research is on interactions between Maori and Chinese.*



18. Chairman Mao's Cartoon

