The Productive & Symbolic Functions of Management Control in the Chinese Hotel Industry:

A Foucauldian Analysis

Jenny Jing Wang

A thesis submitted to

Auckland University of Technology

in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
of

Master of Philosophy (MPhil)

2014

School of Business

Table of Contents

List of Figures

CHAPTER SIX

List of Tables

Attestation of Authorship

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person (except where explicitly defined in the acknowledgements), nor material which to a substantial extent has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning.

Jenny Jing Wang

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to express the deepest appreciation to my supervisor, Professor Keith Hooper, for giving me the opportunity and support to do this research project. Your encouragement, guidance, inspiring suggestions and substantial support from the initial to the final level enabled me to develop an understanding of the subject and accomplish this research project. Also, I would like to show my gratitude to Dr. Rowena Sinclair, my M. Phil supervisor, without her stimulation, advice and guidance, this thesis would not have been finished.

I would like to express a special thanks to Dr. Andy Godfrey and Associate Professor, Stephen Teo, for their expertise and inspiration in the Research Methodology classes, which enabled me to be academically prepared for the commencement of this research project. In particular, Dr. Andy Godfrey has given me excellent support on qualitative method.

I am grateful to the postgraduate office the support given and School of Business at AUT for giving me permission to complete the Master of Business major in accounting, to carry out the necessary research study and to use facilities and resources from AUT.

Most importantly, I must offer my regards and blessings to my family for their understanding, patience, support and love during this period. And finally, a big thank you to all of those who supported me in any respect during the completion of the research project, including friends, colleagues and academic peers, who offered words of encouragement. Thank you all.

Structured Abstract

Purpose – Thus, this thesis concerns, more generally, the mobilisation of accounting control mechanisms in organisations. The generic research question is: "How is accountability determined by measuring the productive and symbolic functions of staff labour in hotels in China". The question is employed in the context of hotel organisations in China. Foucault's concepts are employed to explain "how power is exercised" by managers to achieve performance and to maintain and improve Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). Power involves and promotes surveillance, examination/inspection, and discourse (what is said and what is unsaid) to provide managers with necessary power/knowledge to be effective decision makers (Foucault, 1980). The empirical illustrations are drawn from the author's own experience as an employee of various Chinese hotels.

Design/methodology/approach – the approach is ethnological employing the theories of Foucault on techniques of management control in the Chinese hotel industry. This is an empirical study based on the researcher's own working experiences in several hotels within various positions. For this purpose, throughout her working experience a journal record was maintained of meetings and conversations with other staff. Ethnography as a research methodology, based on the researcher's experiences is applied to this thesis. It is an approach that allows the researcher's observations to develop the empirical elements necessary to meet the research questions posed in this thesis.

Central to Foucault's work is the question, "How power is exercised", and, "What is its mechanism" (Foucault, 1980, p. 89). Power is exercised by mostly managers over staff to the end of what Foucault calls the triple function of labour (Foucault, 1980, p. 161). Foucault (1980) considers that accountability comprises three functions: the productive function - ensuring the work is done; the symbolic function - where staff are used to represent the organisation as in the Singapore Airlines ubiquitous "Singapore girl"; and the dressage or discipline function - where staff are enclosed and made uniform. It is the contention of this thesis that the dressage function is fundamental to maintain performance in the productive and symbolic functions.

Findings – The surveillance, inspection and use of key performance indicators are control features familiar to accountants and auditors, whose function is to impose discipline and to enclose for accountability. By borrowing the disciplinary processes of accounting, managers can separate and enclose staff by function. With regard to the productive function record keeping and quantifying are necessary elements as are establishing performance indicators. The symbolic function has grown out of the productive function and the key performance indicators are harder to quantify as the function is more qualitative in application than quantitative. Nonetheless, to establish accountability, staff must be enclosed and made into efficient, uniform bodies aware of being always under the "gaze" of management. But, perhaps, control of the symbolic function owes most to the practices of audit, which relies on inspection, explanations and judgement before arriving at a qualitative evaluation.

The overall contention of this thesis is that while both the productive and symbolic functions of staff are vital to financial performance in hotels, and the end of achieving financial key indicators is the driver for managers, it is the means of control of the symbolic function in the industry which has received little attention.

Originality/value – the paper explains how a technique developed by Foucault to explain the transition from the management of labour in medieval times to modern times is effected. Other accounting researchers have published landmark works using Foucault's techniques to explain how accounting and accountability has been established in various industries. The originality of this thesis is to show how such techniques of disciplinary control relating to the productive and symbolic function of Chinese hotel staff becomes embedded.

Keywords – Foucauldian, Chinese Hotel Industry, Management Control Mechanism, Accountability

CHAPTER 1: Introduction

1.1   Introduction

In the early 20th century Ellsworth Statler, an American entrepreneur, was the first person to codify the operation of a hotel group, using the motto " a room and a bath for a dollar and a half" (The Economist, 2013, p. 111). The Marriott family later turned the method into a science. The second-generation boss, J.W. Marriott junior, who still runs the firm, became a fanatic. "When I say that the company's prosperity rests on such things as our sixty-six-steps-to-clean-a-room manual, I am not exaggerating" he wrote in his 1997 autobiography (The Economist, 2013, p. 112). Thus, there has been an early emphasis on what Foucault (1980) calls the productive function in the hotel industry. The aim of reducing hospitality to a science is to increase profitability by reducing costs.

However, it is much harder to quantify and measure what (Foucault, 1980) calls the symbolic function in the hotel industry. The symbolic function is directed at making guests feel warm and welcome at the least possible cost to the hotel. It is argued in the literature (Sherman, 2007) and this thesis that the symbolic function has become more important than the productive function in the recent years as the industry has become institutionalised by ubiquitous hotel chains. These chains are focused on the guest's loyalty. The symbolic function of staff is important in establishing a loyal clientele. But it is difficult to standardise the symbolic function of staff without reducing staff creativity. A veteran chef explains the grip that Standard Operating Practices (SOPs) have. From Tokyo to Sao Paulo all omelettes must match a laminated picture (They should be cigar-shaped). A manager in Dubai says he follows 2,300 rules, including the phrases used to greet guests. A 2010 Hilton manual stipulates that staff must answer phones after three rings that guests' pets may not weigh more than 34 kg and that scuba-diving boats must provide free pieces of fruit. A 2004 SOP book for Intercontinental allows staff to wait until the fourth ring, requires drinks to be refilled when two-thirds empty and specifies that rooms must offer at least four pornographic films (The Economist, 2013).

The Chain hotel has been an economic triumph. But over the years its uniformity has made it an emotional failure. Because of its impersonal blandness, frequent travellers have less

loyal. They carry not one but several loyalty cards, according to Deloitte, a consultancy. "Unless I see a brand sign on the door I cannot tell the difference" one hotel boss himself admits (The Economist, 2013, p. 113).

If chain hotels do not have an emotional connection with their guests, can they manufacture one? This hope is behind the modern cult of service. Yet perfect service is a slippery elixir: branding gurus speak in tongues to describe it; hospitality professors' crunch regression equations to capture it and every hotel chain swears it is what makes them unlike all the others.

Replicating intimate service on a mass scale is an inherently implausible goal and when applied to the world's 16,500 posh hotels; the mission has led to an arms race of obsequity. Once hotels competed through their facilities: first came shampoo bottles, then ergonomic mattresses, flat-screen TVs and spas. Now they jostle to engineer "emotional touch points" and "wow moments" with guests (The Economist, 2013, p. 113). Staff compile dossiers on customers before they arrive. A hotel in Colorado downloads pictures of your family from the Internet and frames them. The housekeeper at a luxury hotel in Mexico matches the colour of the tread in guests' sewing kits to their clothes (The Economist, 2013).

The trouble is that many people do not want to be touched, emotionally or otherwise. Others like the flattery and grovelling but forget who did it. And the service craze may be making hotels less, not more, human. Should guests really expect authentic affection from staff whose weekly wage is less than their minibar bill? Obsequity and grovelling by low paid staff are the hallmarks of the Chinese chain hotel where bowing to guests is standard practice. This thesis considers how the productive and symbolic functions are performed in China where managers may exercise control at the lowest cost to promote profitability.

Everywhere the concepts of accounting become more influential and their effect becomes a means to recognise measure and disclose the productivity of those employed. It is the contention of this thesis that hotels in China, being labour intensive organisations, provide an interesting example of the mobilisation of the accounting concepts of internal control.

Thus, this thesis concerns, more generally, the mobilisation of accounting control mechanisms in organisations. The generic research question is: "How is accountability

determined by measuring the productive and symbolic functions of hotel staff in China". The question is employed in the context of hotel organisations in China. Foucault (1980)'s concepts are employed to explain how power is exercised by managers to achieve performance and to maintain and improve Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). As Foucault (1980) came to recognise that what interested him about power was how it produced the subject (Honderich, 1995). Foucault (1980) recognises that power involves and promotes surveillance, examination/inspection, and discourse (what is said and what is unsaid) to provide managers with necessary power/knowledge to be effective decision makers (Foucault, 1980). The empirical illustrations are drawn from the author's own experience as an employee of various Chinese hotels.

Central to Foucault's work is the question, "How power is exercised", and, "What is its mechanism" (Foucault, 1980, p. 89). Power is exercised by mostly managers over staff to the end of what Foucault calls the triple function of labour (Foucault, 1980, p. 161). Foucault (1980) considers that accountability comprises three functions: the productive function - ensuring the work is done; the symbolic function - where staff are used to represent the organisation as in the Singapore Airlines ubiquitous "Singapore girl"; and the dressage or discipline function - where staff are enclosed and made uniform. It is the contention of this thesis that the dressage function is fundamental to maintain performance in the productive and symbolic functions.

The classical economic theories of consumer choice have directed accounting practice to concentrate on the productive function and its control (The Economist, 2013). However，McFadden (2013) have challenged this concentration on the productive function in their paper, "The new science of pleasure", the classical view of consumer choice (McFadden, 2013). By adopting the McFadden (2013)'s challenge, this thesis maintains that the concentration on the productive function by managers is of lesser importance and that more emphasis on the importance of the symbolic function is a growing feature of managerial oversight. Such a challenge to the economic theory of consumer choice is supported in this thesis by showing how the symbolic function is performed and controlled in hotels to create a sense of dignity, warmth and trust among guests.

The thesis examines the productive and symbolic functions in Chinese hotels and utilises Foucault (1979)'s concepts of surveillance, enclosure, discourse, examination and the efficient body to show how managers gain power/knowledge and thereby exercise control. Finally, there is a brief discussion of how this thesis contributes to the knowledge of accountability in recognising, measuring and disclosing the extent of human industry in Chinese hotels.

1.2   Motivations and objectives of this research

Foucault (1979) points out that accountability can be derived from systems of accounting; this provides a discourse which uses mechanisms of enclosure, surveillance, and examination to control people within Chinese hotels. The role of accounting systems influencing accountability and control individuals is well documented by many organisational, accounting and management studies that rely on Foucault's work (Gelfand, Lim, & Raver, 2004). Within these studies (Foucault, 1977, 1979, 1980, 1983) there is, however, less focus on the effects that culture has on accountability and organisation.

The global hotel industry draws on the financial concepts of performance indicators to facilitate mechanisms of internal control (Galbraith & Schendel, 1983). Hotels are relatively labour intensive with many staff working as receptionists, waitresses and housekeepers (Sherman, 2007). In such circumstances, the challenge for hotel managers is how to combine optimum levels of output (productive function), with high levels of customer satisfaction (symbolic function), while effectively disciplining staff to be accountable in terms of the measurement goals adopted (dressage function). By adopting Foucault's concepts of power/knowledge and discipline, this research will identify how the concepts of internal control can become a vehicle to fulfil not just productive functions, but also symbolic functions. The "productive" and "symbolic" functions identified by Foucault (Foucault, 1980, p. 161) are directed at enhancing performance and financial goals.

The research approach is ethnographic, drawing on the journalised experiences of the author who worked for several years in various Chinese hotels. They draw on her personal experiences as recorded and are therefore subjective experiences. It is proposed that the symbolic function is of the increasing importance in the Chinese hotel industry but that

establishing the necessary performance indicators to assess symbolic performance is difficult; it is these questions that are central to the research inquiry. It is further proposed that it is culturally acceptable for Chinese managers to subject staff to a greater range of rewards and penalties than would be acceptable in less authoritarian cultures (Hofstede, 1986). In Foucauldian terms, the latter question is: how successful are Chinese managers in making staff become efficient bodies?

1.3   Overview of study contribution

This thesis explores and explains the internal control mechanisms and forms of accountability in the hotel industry in China. Hotels are relatively labour and gender intensive with many female staff working as receptionists, waitresses and housekeepers, while many of the managers are male. The optimum challenge for hotel managers is how to produce good performance standards from staff, thereby making a profitable organisation.

In this thesis, I will explore Foucault's questions "how power is exercised" and "What is its mechanism" (Foucault, 1980, p. 89) based on an authoritarian service structure. In particular, how accountability is determined and discipline maintained. The study uses various concepts outlined by Foucault (1979) such as: enclosure, surveillance, examination/inspection, discourse (what is said and what is unsaid) and the power/knowledge possessed by managers to provide a theoretical framework for my research. There are some significant benefits for organisations throughout this study. First, it is necessary to recognise what are the customary, internal disciplinary models in China. Chinese hotels may differ from that of other cultures because, as Hofstede (1986) found, the Chinese have a characteristic of acceptance of an authoritarian structures and, because the supply of low paid hotel staff is plentiful, staff are more likely to be docile.

The study can explain how managers by exercising power over staff can achieve a high level of customer satisfaction, profit maximisation and accountability. On the other hand, for hotel staff there is an emancipatory purpose: to explain how being subjected to power, according to Foucault, "induces pleasure, forms knowledge, and produces discourse" (Foucault, 1980, p. 89) while not being necessarily repressive. Nonetheless, experiences of staff resistance are not precluded.

The significance of the growth of global hotels in China is that international hotel brands have invaded China. By borrowing from practices prevailing internationally, the trend of Chinese hotels is to become more professional and less arbitrary in governance, while projecting the hotel as a warm place - another home away from home (Sherman, 2007). This also has implications for the development of measurements to standardise outputs and identify outcomes. Furthermore, there is some evidence from the literature (Sherman, 2007) to suggest that there is less concentration on the productive function and more on the symbolic function staff performance. Thus, the central research question is: how is staff performance of their productive and symbolic functions measured, what the difficulties of such measurements are and how staff are disciplined to become efficient bodies.

1.4   Overview of the methodology

The literature review (chapter three) has the aim of understanding the concept of management control from a Foucauldian perspective: how power is exercised and resisted in Chinese hotel industry. It is important to understand this in the light of how power might impact the change process within the Chinese hotels as this highlights the gap in the literature.

This is an empirical study based on the researcher's own working experiences in several hotels within various positions. For this purpose, throughout her working experience a journal record was maintained of meetings and conversations with other staff. Ethnography as a research methodology, based on the researcher's experiences is applied to this thesis. It is an approach that allows the researcher's observations to develop the empirical elements necessary to meet the research questions posed in this thesis.

1.5   Outline of the thesis

The thesis is organised, first, to consider the nature of qualitative research, which is the basis of this study. Chapter 2 reveals the essential purpose of this thesis is to draw on the author's experience, and make the point that the Chinese hotel context has something original to contribute. In this respect, the author makes an ethnographic contribution as she has worked in a variety of roles in Chinese hotels, while recording her experiences of staff

and meetings in a daily journal kept over the period. Chapter 3 explores the accounting academic literature around the employment of internal controls by management. Chapter 4 reviews the literature surrounding the employment of Foucault's concepts in the accounting literature, while Chapter 5 makes use of, some of the land mark case studies to show how accounting has been mobilised in contexts other than that of Chinese hotels. Chapter 6 considers the empirical evidence in the context of the productive, symbolic and dressage functions. The empirics are set within Foucault's concepts of surveillance, examination, enclosure, discourse and the making efficient body to show how managers gain power/knowledge. Finally, Chapter 7, the conclusion contains a discussion of how this thesis contributes to the literature and knowledge of the power of accounting in recognising, measuring and disclosing the extent of human industry.

CHAPTER 2: Research Methodology and Method

2.1 Introduction

This chapter discusses the research methodology and the research method which were adopted in this thesis. The research methodology adopts the naturalistic inquiry approach, and the chapter considers aspects of naturalistic inquiry such as ontology, epistemology, generalisation and causal linkages. It also explains ethnography as a methodology, which draws on the experiences of the researcher as a former hotel employee in China. Furthermore, the chapter outlines the research method adopted in terms of observation and document analysis, and follows with a review of the literature on observations and documentary analysis. Finally, how an analytical framework is used to interpret the empirical data is introduced. The method of evaluation is discussed at the end of this chapter. The empirical was collected between March 2005 and March 2010. Also retrospective data were gathered from hotels in China.

2.2 Research questions

The initial research questions to be investigated are:

RQ1. How are internal control mechanisms exercised by managers in a hotel over staff to determine behaviour and accountability?

RQ2. How do power relationships impact on the productive and symbolic functions of labour in a hotel context?

RQ3. How do managers organize the production of the intangible, self-subordinating relationship between staff and guests?

However, these questions are recognized as a starting point of this research and are subject to redefinition within the research process due to the demands of a qualitative methodology (Eisenhardt & Graebner, 2007). The aim of this research is to study the internal control mechanisms and the means of accountability in hotels in China based on Foucauldian theoretical framework. The research aim is to be accomplished by looking at two main research subjects: managers and, junior, staff in hotels in China. Those two research

subjects are both related to Foucauldian theory in terms of being the objects of : "what is its mechanisms" and "how is power exercised" in hotel industry (Foucault, 1980, p. 89) .

2.3   Research methodology

2.3.1   Naturalistic paradigm

Given my research topic and the proposed theoretical framework, it can be seen that as internal control mechanisms, like accounting, are a social construct. For this reason, the naturalistic paradigm is applicable to this research. My ontological position is that experiences of how power is exercised may be varied and depend on relationships and position within an organisation. As Foucault (1980) points out that while some may resist the exercise of power to control, others experience power more positively and cooperate in their own subjection.   Epistemologically, knowledge of how junior staff experience the mechanisms of control is what matters. Their subjective experiences are valued and within a Foucauldian framework be the subject of the mechanisms of control. To explain further the elements of the naturalistic paradigm in this research draws mostly on the work of Lincoln and Guba (1985).

Lincoln and Guba (1985) consider that there are five axioms in the naturalist paradigm. They define axioms "as the set of undemonstrated "basic beliefs" accepted by convention or established by practice as the building blocks of some conceptual or theoretical structural or system" (p. 33). These axioms constitute and explain the characteristics of naturalistic inquiry and include ontology, epistemology, generalization, causal linkages, and axiology (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). As Lincoln and Guba (1985) note, qualitative research follows the naturalistic paradigm, which is in opposition to the positivistic paradigm. A table, as shown below, is constructed by Lincoln and Guba (1985, p. 37) to explain the axioms of the naturalistic paradigm and the ways in which it differs, contrasts and even conflicts with the positivistic paradigm.

Axioms About	Positivist Paradigm	Naturalist Paradigm
The nature of reality	Reality is single, tangible and fragmentable.	Realities are multiple, constructed, and holistic
The relationship of knower to the known	Knower and known are independent, a dualism.	Knower and known are interactive, inseparable
The possibility of generalization	Time and context-free generalizations are possible.	Only time-and context-bound working hypotheses are possible.
The possibility of causal linkages	There are real causes, temporally precedent to or simultaneous with their effects.	All entities are in a state of mutual simultaneous shaping, so that it is impossible to distinguish causes from effects.
The role of values	Inquiry is value-free.	Inquiry is value-bound.

Table 2.1: Naturalistic Axioms (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 37)

Naturalistic inquiries form an ontological perspective that supports realities that are "multiple, constructed and holistic" which is opposed to positivist paradigm in which the reality is "single, tangible and fragmentable" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 37). From an ontological perspective the positivist (and to an extent post-positivist's) argument that there exists a single reality to be seen as "objective, empirical and rational" does not fit into the current research (Covaleski, Dirsmith, Heian, & Samuel, 1998, p. 549). Different individual experience, beliefs, opinions and understandings emanate from diverse backgrounds in society. The different experiences of hotel staff are likely to be multiple, constructed and holistic.

The naturalistic paradigm suggests that the relationship between the knower and known is "interactive and inseparable" which is opposed to positivist paradigm in which the relationship is "independent and a dualism" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 37). Giddings and Grant (2002) explain that the positivist researcher is expected to maintain an objective position in relation to the subjects of the research. The positivists believe that such an objective stance is very important because the researcher can unconsciously bias the data collected. However, Hammersley and Atkinson (1995) state that there is no way in which

we can escape the social world in order to study it. Similarly, Lincoln and Guba (1985) argue that observation not only disturbs and shapes but is shaped by what is observed especially when both investigators and respondents are human beings. Rossman and Rallis (2003) concur with this view and further explain that this means a relationship always exists between the researcher and those being researched.

The third axiom of a naturalistic paradigm outline by Lincoln and Guba (1985) is the possibility of generalisation. The aim of a naturalistic paradigm is "to develop an ideographic body of knowledge in the form of "working hypotheses" that describe the individual case" (p. 38). In contrast, the positivist paradigm suggests that time and context free generalisations are possible. The notion of naturalistic generalisation was originally introduced by Stake (1978). Stake acknowledges that case studies are often considered not a suitable basis for statistical generalisation, however, the case study based research may be "epistemologically in harmony with the reader's experience and thus to that person a natural basis for generalisation" (Stake, 1978, p. 5).

The fourth axiom of naturalistic inquiry is the possibility of causal linkages. The positivist paradigm suggests that every action can be explained as the effect of a cause that precedes the effect temporarily or at least happen with the effect simultaneously (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Lincoln and Guba (1985) argue that in the naturalistic paradigm, all entities are in a state of "mutual simultaneous shaping", so it is "impossible to distinguish causes from effects"(p. 37). Each entity is influencing others and is influenced by others simultaneously.

The last axiom of naturalistic inquiry is the role of value in the inquiry. In the positivist paradigm, the inquiry is "value-free", while in the naturalist paradigm, inquiry is "value-bound" and influenced by five corollaries: the value of the inquirer, the chosen research paradigm, the choice of theory, the social context of the inquiry and whether the inquiry is value-resonant or value dissonant (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 38). In this thesis, the value of the inquiry is determined by the researcher.

To conclude, it can be seen from the axioms set out by Lincoln and Guba (1985) that the naturalistic paradigm is applicable to my research interest into internal control mechanisms in hotels in China. To summarise, the nature of reality is socially constructed, knower and known are interactive and inseparable, representing a context bound generalisation as to all

hotel internal control mechanisms is not possible. That is become mutual experiences of reality cannot be analysed into cause and effect, and all inquiry by interview is value bound as the subjects recall their experiences.

2.3.2 Ethnography

Ethnomethodology has a firm status as a contribution to sociological inquiry (Atkinson, 1988, p. 441). Podsakoff (1987) make the point regarding ethnomethodological approaches that: "there are any number of advantages to be gained by such direct techniques" (p. 443). Ethnography methodology is adopted as action research by a former hotel staff. My role approximated to what Sherman (2007) calls the ethnographer as a hotel staff member. The researcher acted as a hotel staff member and was allowed access to subsidiary hotels on the assumption that the involvement would "add value" to the hotel (p. 146).

Sherman (2007) explains that the ethnographic researcher is expected to take initiative and be self-sufficient in terms of gaining access to employees and building their own networks in hotels as sources of data. The researcher is asked to provide not only data describing what is found but also recommendations for action based on the findings.

Given the importance of researcher reflexivity in ethnographic research, the researcher must carefully preserve her relationship with the biggest hotels chain, and subsidiary hotels, and use her observations as data that could be used to further understand the hotel industry in China.

In the context of her ethnography research method Sherman (2007) reports:

> *I heard these stories from luxury hotel managers I interviewed in the late 1990s as part of my preliminary research on this book. I talked with mid- and upper-level managers in all different kinds of urban hotels-economy, mid-price, convention, and so on-about the challenges of running the hotel, the service they offered, the types of guests they catered to ,changes in the economic climate and the structure of the industry, and their views about unions. But managers in luxury hotels recounted especially captivating anecdotes …. these tales described hotel staff going to great lengths to observe guests' preferences, recognize each guest's individuality, and meet-even anticipate- the guest's wishes.(p. 2)*

Using ethnographic methodology to analyse power relationships in hotel organizations is to link Foucault's concepts with present reality in China. The study draws on the researcher's observations of hotel organizations and utilizes these observations within a Foucauldian framework. Such observations were at the time record in a daily journal that the researcher was in the habit of keeping. Ethnographies make it possible to become sensitive to the power relationships between staff and managers in many ways. In reality, some of the front line staff are prospective department managers, even hotel managers. For staff to be considered "good staff" depends to a large part on the staff's social relations with senior managers or his/her family background. Ethnographic methodology is also quite beneficial as it will help to refine future questionnaires, observation techniques, and focus.

There are important benefits from doing even an admittedly limited ethnography. Detailed guidelines, in part, in the form of observations, are offered, which help to focus on observations and common concerns. Selected features to investigate include: 1) location, internal history, discipline, architecture and facilities of the hotel; 2) ages of staff and managers; 3) different departments' staff's behaviour and verbal and nonverbal interactions with others (staff, managers and guests); 4) staff members' attitudes about their work; 5) the relationships between front line staff and managers; 6) the staff responses to guests' problems; 7) the whole "atmosphere" in the hotel; and 8) the feedback from guests. The ethnography constitutes a finished study at the conclusion of the observation period. However, any follow up observations and conclusions about significant findings will highlight areas needed to be further explored as well as the implications for the power relationships existing in hotel organizations.

The value of this thesis does not lie so much in the particular findings or in the sophistication of techniques as much as in the engaging of ethnographic observations. In other words, it is by examining closely the nature of power relationships in particular situations and critiquing the practice of hotel organizations. Specifically, one of the primary benefits of utilizing an ethnographic study in the hotel industry lies in its attempt to link Foucault's theory with hotel organizations, in particular, to certain situations that exist in the hotel industry in China.

Ethnography is a tool to actively investigate and become more aware of the hotel's culture. Four staff behaviour patterns are often expected: good manners, effort, helping others and

friendly competition. In certain situations, staff may be praised for helping others, while on the other hand punished for " not doing better" than others.

The first step of ethnography is to observe the hotel organizations then step back to analyse the result of observations, including its disciplinary implications. A further step is to become more aware of the complex and often "hidden" nature of the hotel industry in China.

Ethnographies also make it possible to examine more closely the perceived limits of the power relationship in hotel industry and to make some judgements about their legitimacy. These limits are often seen problematically and are important in determining the power relationships that impact on hotel organizations because change can only occur when the limits of what is considered possible becomes an important prerequisite for promoting change in the hotel industry system.

This thesis details how ethnography can be utilized in the hotel industry, so that better understanding of power relationships in hotel organizations may be achieved, and potential benefits may result from such understanding.

2.4   Research method

2.4.1 Observation

I have worked for big hotel chains in China, some of which control more than 100 hotels (most of them are four or five stars). As a potential hotel manager in the future, the director of the hotel group intended to train me by giving me experience of different positions in different hotels. For instance, I was sent to a four star domestic hotel for training, where I held different roles in different departments. In the first month, I was working in housekeeping department as a housemaid. I was cleaning the rooms everyday like other housemaid staff. Next, I was working in reception, luggage department, food and beverage department, marketing department, security department and so on. I have learned a lot from working with the front line staff. Furthermore, I was trained in the same way in five star international hotels in Beijing in 2009.

Based on my working experience with front line staff, I am confident that I have recorded sufficient data observations and insights. Besides, my working connections with hotel managers, I have heard many stories regarding work and control relationships between managers and front line staff.

I gained access to the directors of human resources in two luxury, non-union hotels, the five star international hotels, located in Beijing city in China. I explained to these mangers that I was interested in how their hotels defined and met a luxury service standard. Because the managers themselves are very interested in this question, I persuaded them to allow me to conduct ethnographic research in these sites.

I organized my research at hotels in Beijing to allow me to compare different kinds of work. I was formally hired, at a pay rate about half that of regular staff, and was treated like any other staff, except that I was allowed to do several different jobs. I started with interactive work: answering the telephone, reserving rooms, checking guests in and out at the front desk, doing concierge tasks such as making dinner and limousine reservations, parking guests' cars, carrying their bags back and forth, and running errands for them. In all I spent about twenty-five shifts, over six months, in each of the following jobs: concierge/front desk agent, bellman/valet parker, telephone operator, and reservationist.

I then spent five weeks working the 3:00pm - 11:00pm shift in room service, both taking guests' phone orders and delivering their fried calamari and seasonal sorbets. During this period I also worked as a food runner in the restaurant on a few occasions. Finally, I spent a month shadowing housekeeping workers, mainly room cleaners (during the day) and turn down attendants (in the evenings). Though my focus was on interactive staff, this comparison of interactive and non-interactive work allowed me to explore the specific characteristics of jobs that involved relations with guests, and to look at how interactive workers thought about each other.

When my stint at the international hotel in Beijing was over, I worked in another luxury hotel, for four months (May 2009 - September 2009), to look at the organizational features involving the production and consumption of luxury service. The international hotel was larger than the domestic hotel Beijing, with 450 rooms, and it was corporately managed.

The hotel commanded the highest rates in the city: NZD500 - NZD750 a night for a room, as much as NZD3, 000 for a suite and the hotel catered mostly for business travellers.

For two months, I worked four shifts weekly as a concierge at the domestic hotel, which primarily involved procuring restaurant reservations, car and driver services, flowers, massages, rental cars, and tickets to theatre or sporting events, plus meeting other, more unpredictable guest requests. For another two months, I continued to spend two shifts each week at the concierge desk, but I also shadowed room cleaners, turndown attendants, bellmen, and doormen, business centre workers, spending between one and five shifts in each area. Here I was an unpaid internship, though I was permitted to keep tips.

I socialized with staff from both sites, but especially those at the international hotel, with whom I often went out for drinks after the evening shift. Both on and off the job in both hotels, I talked extensively with workers about their jobs, the work environment, and their personal lives. Though these were not formal interviews, they allowed me to get a sense of what workers thought about a broad range of issues, and I quote their observations frequently in the research.

I participated in staff orientation and training sessions at both sites. I also analysed comment cards and guest letters from both hotels, over a four-month period (approximately two hundred cards total). In addition, the international hotel management granted me access to detailed reports, comprising hundreds of pages, written by mystery shoppers whom they had hired to evaluate the hotel's service. Thus, these experiences constitute my ethnographic observations of the hotel industry.

The ethnographic observations are drawn from a journal maintained over the period 2006 - 2009 of individual conversations with staff and of staff meetings when the researcher worked in various hotels. The focus is on the unsaid aspects of each role and how the what-is-not-said contributes to authority, discipline and accountability. From the literature (Sherman, 2007) and from Foucault (1980)'s observations what-is-not-said is an important form of discourse; as dress, demeanour and deportment produce identity and influence perceptions of performance. The argument is that dress, demeanour and deportment can be disciplinary technologies of power to produce docile, useful bodies involving techniques of subjection and objectification (Dreyfus & Rabinow, 1983). Dreyfus and Rabinow (1983)

also point out that the aptitudes of behaviour are developed by means of a whole ensemble of regulated communications including coded signs of obedience, differentiation marks of the value of each person and their level of knowledge using a series of power processes: enclosure, surveillance, reward and punishment and pyramidal hierarchy (Dreyfus & Rabinow, 1983).

2.5   Data analysis

The initial analytical task was to detect patterns and processes that could help to " make sense of what is going on in the scenes documented by the data" (Hammersley & Atkinson, 1995, pp. 209-210) . I was conscious throughout the research program, in this regard, that "what we call our data are really our own constructions of other people's constructions of what they and their compatriots are up to" (Geertz, 1973, p. 9). This, in effect, is what (Giddens, 1993) calls the double hermeneutic in social science and Van Maanen (1979) first and second-order concept in ethnography. Within this process, I continually sought to differentiate between presentational and operational data (Van Maanen, 1979) and to reflect on what these data reveal about the agents involved and the research setting.

The data analysis was characterized by a hermeneutic, iterative process of going back and forth from critical reflection to the data, and from part to whole, searching for key themes and patterns, and questioning, redefining, or buttressing the key themes and patterns identified with further evidence (Sherman, 2007).

For the purpose of this thesis, thematic analysis is adopted in analysing the qualitative data. Thematic analysis is "a method for identifying, analysing and reporting patterns (themes) within data" (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 79). Thematic analysis is also a flexible research tool that can provide a rich, complex and detailed description of data (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Foucauldian themes can be reviewed by constructing a thematic matrix. Each theme will be continuously refined and shaped to fit into boxes within the matrix arrangement. Translation from Chinese to English will occur after data is analysed and when the thematic themes can be identified. The translation process focuses on capturing the key phrases and

key ideas rather than translating the whole sentence word by word. Finally, a convincing and well-structured analysis report is produced (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

2.6 Chapter summary

The chapter has been organised to, first to consider naturalistic inquiry and its philosophical axioms. Second, the method section is set out beginning by considering ethnography as adopted in this thesis. Third, the literature around documentary analysis is reviewed to inform the reader as to how data was gathered. Finally, the chapter illustrates the method of data analysis adopted using the framework drawn from the literature. The aim of the chapter is to fully apprise readers of how the empirical data is obtained and interpreted so that in the next chapter where the literature is reviewed the approach of this study is understood.

CHAPTER 3: Literature Review of Staff Functions in the Hotel Industry

3.1 Introduction

This chapter provides a review of the internal control mechanisms in the hotel industry in China. The focus is shaped by Foucault (1980)'s observation that the management of labour involves three functions: productive, symbolic and dressage. This review is divided into two sections. Section 3.2 explores importance of the symbolic function in the hotel industry in China. The quality service and expectations in hotel industry are highlighted in respect of hotel management and implications of service delivery. Section 3.3 focuses on the productive function. In Section 3.4 some of the dressage function's important measurements are interpreted: Performance Indicators and Key Performance Indicators. Managers run hotels using KPIs to measure staff performance. However, while KPIs are useful for measuring outputs with regard to the productive function, they are not so useful to measure outcomes with regard to the symbolic function. The symbolic function is the soft function and is about creating warmth and emotional attachment to the hotel brand. How these outcomes are recognised is an important question which this study investigates. Even the productive function, on which many managers concentrate their attention, can have outcomes other than intended – what in the literature is called the dark side (Parmenter, 2013). Section 3.5 focuses on contrasting the concept drawn from the literature of technical and non-technical managers (Enns, Huff, & Golden, 2002). Finally, Section 3.6 the chapter summary discusses the influence of hotel managers and their pre-dispositions towards the hard or soft functions of staff performance.

3.2 The importance of the symbolic staff function

The symbolic function involves using staff to promote the organization. For example, staff are used to represent the organization as in the international hotel chain ubiquitous "reception girl". Or, with regard to the housemaids, they are expected to greet every guest that passes them in the corridor and appear efficient and tidy in their housemaid uniforms.

Along with reception staff, housemaids represent the hotel, and the impressions they give is important to mirror hotel warmth and efficiency and serve the goal of customer satisfaction.

The hotel industry is relatively labour intensive and feminine with many staff working as maids, waitresses and receptionists, while many of the managers are male (Sherman, 2007). Staff at the behest of their managers must provide services and hospitality with the requirement to be efficient and profitable (Lashley, 2001). Thus, providing good service is quite different from the production of goods. The function of good service and hotel representation is what Foucault calls a symbolic function.

Crick and Spencer (2011) argue that "the delivery of hotel services is qualitatively different from the delivery of other types of services, and that this will influence the way that service is managed, delivered and perceived by the customers" (p. 463). They also point out that customers tend to require more from staff and guest expectations are increasing. Many hotels conceive of quality as encompassing emotional concepts of delight and as involving the creation of a memorable experience (Crick & Spencer, 2011). Such an observation is important to the current study which focuses on the symbolic function of internal control.

The hotel industry is special for guest as it is " a home away from home" (Lashley, 2001). McDowell (2009) decribes hotels as being: "notorious employers of cheap, relatively docile and insecure migrant labour" (p. 201). Arguably, in a Chinese context this observation is very apposite as many of the staff have migrated from the countryside and have the wrong identity card for city living. Pizam and Shani (2009) argue that managing this tension between creating the feeling of being at home while simultaneously trying to create an extraordinary experience is a challenge faced by management. Hotels are required to supply comfortable environments including both facilities and hospitality service (Sherman, 2007). Moreover, some of the uncertainty and fears associated with staying in a new setting need to be compensated by friendly hotel staff (O'Connor, 2005).

According to Sherman (2007), the ideal hospitality service may involve service beyond that of a mother, and require in fact the services of an idealised mother. It may involve helping guests to have a good time by engaging them in activities and small talk. While they help others to play, hospitality staff may be expected to act as if they enjoy their jobs, and even act as if they are not really working but are paid to play (Crick, 2000).

According to Sherman (2007) hotels promise, " a service that cares for your every need" (p. 2). Thus, smiling politeness of staff is one of the symbolic functions that many managers deem necessary. Also Sherman (2007) points out that most hotel service standards instruct staff to "engage guests with eye contact and a warm, sincere smile." (p. 45). For example, receptionists should act professional, by being always acting with a smile on their face (Zampoukos & Ioannides, 2011). They represent the first impression of the hotels.

Sherman (2007) states that the hospitality industry literature insists that a caring service is more important than the physical characteristics of the hotel or its amenities. For instance, the hotel's sales director says "It is the service, because we all have beds and bathrooms". As one manager said " the rooms helps, the views help, but it is really the people" (p. 2).

According to Guerrier and Adib (2003), staff may even be seen as failing in their jobs if they do not themselves seem to be having fun while interacting with guests. Crick (2000) further maintains that interaction among employees and guests in resort hotels is often expected to progress rapidly towards a service relationship and employees may be held responsible not only for their own behaviour towards the guests but for the guests' response to them.

Sherman (2007) maintains that front of house staff also enact interactive self-subordination to a much greater degree than other staff: deferring to guests, anticipating and responding to their every need, customizing interactions, and transgressing limits for them. Staff in these jobs must subordinate their own selves to those of the guests and restrain impulses to say what they really think (Sherman, 2007). Such self-subordination is very apparent in Chinese hotels where bowing is common and is done to make guests feel they are superior. The work of hotel staff can be demanding, pretty and menial (Sherman, 2007).

Sherman (2007) observes that door attendants govern a narrow outdoor space between the hotel's front doors and the curb, loading and unloading guests' luggage and keeping an eye out for meter readers. Telephone operators and reservationists outfitted with headsets sit in windowless offices, staring at computers as they connect callers or discuss room availability. Restaurant servers shuttle between the hushed, intimate dining room and the loud, chaotic kitchen, while sweaty cooks and kitchen staff are confined behind the cooking line or next to the steamy dishwasher.

How do managers organize all these labor processes? They first split them into two categories: interactive and non-interactive positions. In the hotel industry, the interactive public areas of the hotel are known as the "front of the house" and are home to concierges, front desk agents, bell persons, door attendants, valets, and restaurant servers (Sherman, 2007, p. 59). The non-interactive private areas of the hotel are known as the "back of the house". Here we find workers who rarely have contact with guests, such as room cleaners, turndown attendants, and laundry workers. In the grey area between the front and back of the house, we find what are called "semi visible" staff, who have limited face to face or exclusively telephonic contact with guests, including reservationists, telephone operators, room service staff, and housemen or runners. This division of labour is defined in terms of worker visibility to guests (Sherman, 2007).

Hospitality work, in summary, is complex, challenging, and seems to incorporate both the pleasure and pains of service work (Korczynski, 2002). In the light of these extensive requirements made on many hospitality employees it is surprising that the industry still has a reputation as offering primarily low skill employment. For example, some staff like housemaids normally have minimal skills and perform in a low-end position which involves limited interaction with customers. Because of their limited interaction with guests, the productive function is more important for housemaids (Korczynski, 2002).

Shamir (1980) considers most of the work provided by hotels staff as subordinate service. Many staff occupy subordinate service roles where their job is to help the guests feel important and, the emphasis on enhancing the guests' status may be even more exaggerated as visitors are encouraged to come to be "pampered", "admired" and spoilt (Taylor, 1975, p. 88). In this respect, some hotels in Asia compel junior female staff to bow before guests as a sign of their servility. Also receptionists being in a position to give the first impression of the hotel are required to have a pleasant chats with guests about the weather or their experience last night at the restaurant they recommended (Zampoukos & Ioannides, 2011).

Sherman (2007) observes that personalized attention is indeed an important element of creating guest loyalty. For example, a loyal guest recalls that staff had remembered not only her name and her husband's but also the names of her two dogs. Most general managers realize that " the guest needs to be able to get anything he wants" (Sherman, 2007, p. 37).

Managers encourage staff to use proper verbiage regarding their efforts, such as my pleasure or I would be happy to, which minimizes guest perception that human labor is being exerted. Sherman (2007) states that "I was also told that "a guest should never touch a door" and of course, guests should never carry their own bags, and the time they wait for any service must be minimized (p. 40). Sherman (2007) also argues that:

> *Literally folding the corner of the bedding down, of course, serves no useful purpose; the gesture indicates, rather, that an invisible hand has been at work. Other elements of the elaborate turndown service in luxury hotels include switching on lights, turning on the radio, closing drapes, emptying trash baskets, cleaning the bathroom, replacing used towels, arranging the laundry bag and room service menu on the bed, and filling the ice bucket. (p.40)*

In addition, some hotel jobs are considered to be jobs of last resort, possibly because some people associate them with servility and dirty work (Guerrier, 1999). For those staff with limited skills and training there are a few options in hotels. Most of them are to clean rooms in the housekeeping department, or wash dishes in the kitchen (Guerrier, 1999) and so on. Their work is "dirty" and physically demanding, exposing them to the risk of injury (Seifert & Messing, 2006). Moreover, those front line staff working as housemaids or waitresses in hotels in China normally get very low salaries and no bonus at the year end. Compared to others in hotels, their work is more physical demanding but poorly paid. Thus, they have mainly a productive function to perform in a menial situation.

Finding the best staff to carry out these demanding jobs can be a challenge, and high hotel staff turnover continues to be a problem in many parts of the world (Chalkiti & Sigala, 2010). Hospitality services have a particular challenge in controlling quality due to the multidimensional nature of the services provided, and it is worthy of detailed analysis as a separate part of the service sector (Crick & Spencer, 2011; Gronroos, 1984).

As Crick and Spencer (2011) make the case; hotel work is still qualitatively different from hospitality work. For instance, the type of welcoming behaviour results in the expression of the hotel as a home away home. Hotel work tends to be of a longer duration than the average hospitality experience requiring employees to display emotional, aesthetic and other types of human interaction in a sustained manner (Crick & Spencer, 2011). Hotel staff often interact with guests with different cultural expectations, and a guest's perception of

quality may be affected by factors such as power distance (Tsang & Ap, 2007). Thus, front line staff, especially receptionists performing a symbolic function, need to be more multicultural. That is the reason why we may see many French faces and Russian faces performing as receptionists in international hotels in China.

Ladhari (2009) points out that there are emotional satisfactions to be derived from service-quality performance. Hospitality organisations should therefore focus on more than cognitive satisfaction but should also pay attention to the emotional aspect of satisfaction (Crick & Spencer, 2011). Torres and Kline (2006) argue that guest satisfaction means that guests are at ease, but they are not necessarily excited by the hotel. Delighted guests are by contrast not only excited but are likely to give positive word of mouth referrals to others (Torres & Kline, 2006). Front line staff play an important role in bringing the "delight" experience to guests by delivering creative services (Van Hoof, 2002). Service and quality have been elusive concepts (Van Hoof, 2002). Service quality in the hotel industry can be seen as an essential strategy to achieve competitive advantages for an organization (Lewis, 1987).

O'Connor (2005) points out that there is often a gap between management and guest perceptions of quality. In the hotel industry, the managers' perceptions of guests' expectations may be different from the guests' actual expectations. However, staff were found to be closer in their perceptions of guests' expectations even though there were again some areas of difference. This gap is troubling since in the main it has been accepted that the quality of the service offered must be assessed based on guest perceptions (Pickworth, 1987). For example, in some hotels in China bowing may not be expected by guests and some staff may resist by not bowing low enough.

Increasingly, staff are being used as walking billboards (Zeithaml, Bitner, & Gremler, 2013). Moreover, they are no longer passive elements in the company's brand strategy but are required to live the brand (Brexendorf & Kernstock, 2007). Managers therefore have to be concerned about hiring and retaining those staff who are motivated to perform the emotional, aesthetic, scripted, and voluntary acts that are such an important part of service. In particular, they have to be concerned about the performance of emotional labour as staff may withhold smiles and even courteous behaviour or go into robot mode (Hochschild, 1983).

Sherman (2007) observes that managers standardize appearance by requiring staff to adhere to particular norms; and as in many service enterprises, these include specifications about fingernail length, jewellery, makeup, hairstyles, beards, and so on. Not just regulation but also transformation of self was a major theme. Furthermore, staff wore different uniforms depending on their position: the doormen's gold coat differed from the bellmen's outfit, and the concierges' sober uniform contrasted with the gold and black apparel of the front desk agents (Sherman, 2007). Thus, enchanted moments come from the credo dignity, excellence, and enchantment. The aim is to create a certain kind of selfhood, telling the staff what kind of person to be (Sherman, 2007).

Therefore, hotels are placing significant emphasis on soft skills which include aesthetic and self-presentation skills as well as the better known emotional skills (Crick & Spencer, 2011). Liu and Chen (2006) also found that agreeability; stability, activity, and conscientiousness relate and contribute to the guest's satisfaction with the performance of frontline staff and managers. Finally, the opinions, values, beliefs, and behaviour of staff members with respect to service can also be impediments to quality service (Presbury, Fitzgerald, & Chapman, 2005).

John and Robert (2004) also propose that managers should model the appropriate behaviour for staff members by treating front-line staff in the way that they wish them to treat their guests. This is a proposal that may not be observed in practice. Managers also serve as models to others in hotels and their failure to mentor younger managers and supervisors effectively may be an important factor in delivering quality service (Presbury et al., 2005). Managers must establish priorities, and to deliver quality service they must understand what their guests want (Crick & Spencer, 2011).

Saleh and Ryan (1991) determined that there was a gap between what managers thought that their guests wanted and that while mangers tended to overestimate guest expectations. They appeared to fall short in the delivery of the service. Senior hospitality managers tend to emphasis the more functional, objective, and controllable aspects of the quality service experience, while guests were focussed on the more subjective interpersonal factors (Mosley, 2007). In this context, it can be argued that managers that emphasise the hard outputs rather than soft skills are themselves products of systems which concentrated more on the productive function. The latter function is the subject of next section.

3.3   The productive staff function

Foucault (1980) observes that: "the productive function equals practically zero for the categories of individuals I am concerned with, whereas the symbolic and disciplinary functions are very important, but most often the three components go together" (Foucault, 1980, p. 161). This research shares Foucault's observation and the inquiry is concentrated more on the symbolic and disciplinary functions. These functions are scarcely addressed in the hospitality literature especially in the context of Chinese hotels. This thesis contributes to the literature by addressing this gap.

It should be explained that the productive function: relates to the relationship between physical inputs and outputs. In the hotel industry, controls around the productive function are to ensure the work is done. Alternatively, a production function can be defined as the specification of the minimum input requirements needed to produce designated quantities of output. For example, that each housemaid must clean 14 rooms per morning is a standard Novotel output expectation.

In the hotel industry, the productive function focuses more on those staff performing the low-end tasks with limited training and skills or education qualifications (Guerrier, 1999). Another feature of the productive function is that staff are overwhelmingly female (Zampoukos & Ioannides, 2011). For example, housemaids clean rooms in hotels; waitresses wash dishes or serve for customers in restaurants and so on. In China, these low-end positions are commonly occupied by women (Liu & Chen, 2006).

Brody, Lane, and Steed (2004) point out that performance measures and incentives regarding to the productive function in the hotel industry environment have influences on accounting treatments. The hotel industry needs to provide food and beverage promotions to attract guests and maximize the available rooms. Thus, it requires staff and managers to figure out the occupancy and promotion costs. Such costs will therefore affect the internal performance evaluation and the departmental manager's behaviour.

Zampoukos and Ioannides (2011) maintain that these steps undoubtedly have significant implications regarding employment, given that the costs related to staff' wages and benefits constitute a substantial share of a company's expenses. Front line staff in hotels are controlled strictly with regard to the productive function with fixed tasks every day. For

example, housemaids are required to clean so many rooms per day. Qualitatively their work is important for preserving and also projecting the aura of the quality of the hotel. But not much attention is paid by guests to them. So the productive function is important for output measurement but less so for outcome satisfaction (Zampoukos & Ioannides, 2011).

Seifert and Messing (2006) stress that those low-end operations are "dirty" and physically demanding. While the housemaids are always allotted a minimum number of rooms to clean within a specific work day, they often end up cleaning more rooms when circumstances demand; for instance, on busy days or when colleagues are absent (Seifert & Messing, 2006). Zampoukos and Ioannides (2011) also maintain that often housekeeping staff feel excluded when it comes to decisions about the operation of the hotel, complaining that they are not consulted in the situations dealing with room refurbishments, though the consequences of such decisions may mean a harder work environment.

Often those front line staff who are working hard and longer hours, also get lower pay and less bonus compared to other positions in hotels. In the hotel industry, it is very common for bonuses to be restricted to management. No one questions it, even though sometimes they complain. But they have no choice and are unable to change this situation. The only way to measure the housemaids' performance is by their outputs. That is how many rooms are cleaned and how many dishes are washed. Those outputs can be checked by supervisors (Zampoukos & Ioannides, 2011).

Sherman (2007) observes that room cleaners and turndown attendants are given a certain number of rooms to clean or turn down each day, which for room cleaners rarely varies. Management give staff extremely detailed specifications on what the room should look like, including how many hangers belong in the closet, how to tie the sashes of bathrobes, and where to place amenities and towels in the bathroom or items on the desk and bedside table. In general these staff exercise very little discretion (Sherman, 2007).

As a consequence of this tangibility and quantifiable "output", room cleaners are also easily monitored. Supervisors examine the rooms that have cleaned, they hold glasses up to the light to look for spots or run a finger along the window sills checking for dust. Supervisors are inconsistent about this task because the amount of time they have to inspect rooms

varies daily. However, room cleaners do not know when their rooms will be checked, and clear standards make measurement of performance very simple (Sherman, 2007).

Soltani and Lai (2008) observes that there exists a weak relationship between productivity and skills. Housemaids are treated as costs rather than long term resources because they do not have high profile skills. Shaw and Williams (1998) also point out that staff involved mainly in a productive function are not motivated by salary and get little non-material job satisfaction from employment.

On one hand, compared to well-qualified staff, such staff have less functional flexibility. Because receptionists, for example, can encounter to guests and talk to them face to face. Thus, by doing so, receptionists make contributions to hotels by way of a symbolic function. However, housemaids, being in a less promotional area, cannot make this contribution. The managers value them only from productive function. That is the reason why they are in poor position in hotel industry. They are important to the operation of hotels, but due to their function, they can only perform the physical demanding work without adding a contribution to the symbolic function (Shaw & Williams, 1998).

The housemaids clean rooms after the guests have left. Their output is a perfectly made bed, an empty paper basket, a clean bathroom and perhaps new towels. However, the work itself is not to seen by guests, and ideally, guests are never aware of the staff' existence. Partly this concealment of the work has to do with the status of the hotel room as a semi-private space. Guests might feel uncomfortable if confronted with those cleaning up the traces that their bodies and bodily activities leave (Shaw & Williams, 1998). According to Sherman (2007), semi-visible jobs can also be routinized (Sherman, 2007).

In the kitchens of hotels, staff are washing dishes. The kitchen is another part of the hotel's "private space" in the sense that it is not available to guests (Shaw & Williams, 1998). The work, as well as the staff member performing it, is meant to be invisible.

At reception, managers value staff as performing both the productive function and the symbolic function. Even though they are checking guests out, they need to be well groomed and polite. Their job requires both physical and social contact with the public. In fact, they are always observed by someone. In addition, they interact with the hotel's clients and, if circumstances allow it and they are not too busy, they can even have a pleasant chat with

them about the weather or their hotel experience. Thus, the productive function is less important to them compared to the symbolic function (Soltani & Lai, 2008).

For other positions in hotels, the focus is more on productive function: for example, the security guards, and the valet parking attendants. They are not seen as having any discretionary role but as menial staff who must follow instructions without deviation. The more productive personnel are recognised as knowledge workers such as managers or supervisors.

Soltani and Lai (2008) emphasise that given the competitive environment they face and their constrained ability to replace front line staff with capital, the contribution of housemaids, waitresses, etc., is underestimated. Shaw and Williams (1998) also stress that to maintain budgetary control it is necessary to curb the wage bill since labour costs are a significant proportion of total production costs.

Sherman (2007) maintains that service work consists at least, in part, of intangible interactions between staff and guests. To describe this aspect of the product, Hochschild (2003) coined the term emotional labor, which refers to staff managing their own feelings in order to create a certain state of mind in the guest. Also, hotel occupations and interactions are gendered with females often fulfilling a junior role (Sherman, 2007). Therefore, resistance may surface when staff speak with guests on the telephone by using their own performance as entertainment for their co-workers, such as rolling their eyes or speaking in a strange voice. Such resistance allow staff to preserve their authentic selves (Sherman, 2007).

In the context of her ethnographic research Sherman (2007) also observes that :

> *Depending on the setting, managers can try to routinize work by developing standard procedures, scripting interactions, and controlling customers, as they do at McDonald's. Or managers can attempt to transform workers' selves in a more fundamental way, through extensive training and techniques, to ensure what Hochschild (2003) calls "deep acting". Service staff have another kind of manager: the client. Customer feedback and monitoring create a "second boss" who supervises the worker even in the absence of managers (p.9).*

Sherman (2007) maintains that:

As in traditional labor process theory, the language of "control" and "resistance" remains dominant. Staff are seen as responding to managerial dictates and customer demands either with passive compliance or active resistance, which ranges from refusing to smile to cussing at customers" (p. 9).

Of staff and their employers, Rollins and Armstrong (1988) suggest that: "A moment of "psychological exploitation" stems from " the personal relationship between employer and employee"(p. 9). According to Rollins, this exploitation is explained as giving employers "the self- enhancing satisfactions that emanate from having the presence of an inferior" (p. 9). Profit is not extracted, but the relation is exploitative because of its psychological benefit. Indeed, Rollins focuses primarily on staff' deep resentment of and disdain for their client-employers, which she sees as stemming from this inequality (p. 9).

Sherman (2007) further argues that there are asymmetries in power, authority, and entitlement that apply in the relationships between staff and guests. Staff demonstrate deference and subordination; guests enact entitlement to human attention and labour. In addition, staff who have some autonomy become involved in and engaged with their jobs by means of small incentives and choices, which become meaningful in the context of particular shop-floor status hierarchies and cultures.

Unequal entitlements and responsibilities are not obscured, because they are perfectly obvious and well-known to interactive staff. Moreover, it was easier for staff to forge powerful selfhoods, because managerial rhetoric emphasized professionalism, status, and organizational belonging (Sherman, 2007).

Sherman (2007) finally argues that "the normalization of guest entitlement arise from workers' ability to construct powerful selves" (p. 20). The ways staff manage to create dignity and power in the face of subordination, lead them to accept rather than to challenge the inequalities that define their workplace.

3.4 The dressage staff function

3.4.1 Key performance indicators (KPIs)

Performance indicators may not be necessary for a hotel to function but provide sufficient information on the use of resources for management to audit and justify their strategies

(Brody et al., 2004). Generally speaking, hotel managers are responsible for the financial performance of their hotels. Brody et al. (2004) states that: a defining aspect of the hotel industry is the large fixed capacity costs of a hotel as the product cannot be inventoried such as available rooms. Using financial measures of the manager's performance, operational performance measures become very important evaluations in the hotel industry.

Goldratt (1991) points out that all behaviour can be predicted by what is being measured: "Tell me how you measure me, and I will tell you how I will behave." (p. 26). Such a statement is borne out by the experiences of the researcher: that staff react to what is inspected. However, for managers faced with controlling a large and diverse workforce, measurement is important. The famous physicist Lord Kelvin was well known for saying that if you cannot measure something, your understanding of it is "meagre" (Lord Kelvin, 1883). This explains management's drive to establish metrics around staff activities. Moreover, Harrington (1994) comments "If you cannot measure something, you cannot understand it. If you cannot understand it, you cannot control it. If you cannot control it, you cannot improve it" (p. 24).

Brody et al. (2004) also maintain that much of the cost structure is relatively predictable and is typically reported in diagnostic formats; expenses such as depreciation, rent, staff, laundry, etc., can be projected and analysed in variance reports. Given the large fixed commitment to make rooms available, the identified key to success is filling those rooms at profitable rates.

Importantly for this study, Phillips and Louvieris (2005) point out that a cross country performance comparison is very difficult in hospitality because different cultures have different expectations with regard particularly to the symbolic function of hotel staff. In the light of this study the difficulty of cross country comparison because of culture should not be under-estimated. Kaplan and Norton (1992) maintain that the Balanced Scorecard (BSC) has emerged as a ubiquitous performance managerial tool that provides managers with the mechanism's to develop performance objectives and measures linked to strategy. Moreover, Denton and White (2000) maintain that the BSC helps unify all parties in their quest for a favourable hotel guest experience, which leads to positive financial outcomes by establishing common goals for all stakeholders. However, the claim that the BSC may establish common goals for all stakeholders may not survive cross country comparison give

their substantial cultural differences. Whether, the concept of a balanced score card truly applies in a Chinese hotel context is one of the underlying questions of this research study.

Spitzer (2007) observes that, for the most part, those who love measurement are those who come from scientific or financial disciplines for which measurement is a fundamental component. Obviously, some disciplines, like accounting, are more naturally associated with technical measurement than others, and this factor alone will likely affect individual staff attitudes and propensity to embrace performance measurement. Nonetheless, it is the contention of this study that accounting concepts of control and measurement are influential in this context, whether or not managers have a specific background in accounting because as managers they will have to be familiar with some of the financial metrics. Such use of metrics, Stewart (1992) comments, makes accounting a mechanism for the exercise of disciplinary power. Accounting as power is an alternative angle for study; that is future research could be conducted for achieving a more meaningful interpretation of the role of accounting from this perspective.

Oliveira (2001) argues that the outcome measurement - a "lagging indicator" - measures what has happened, while a driver measurement - a "leading indicator"-looks at the potential to improve performance. Indicators that can be used to measure progress are used to measure the long-term drivers of success and performance (Amaratunga, Baldry, & Sarshar, 2001). Every indicator should be part of a chain of a cause-and-effect relationships that represents a managerial strategy, and there should be a mix of lead and lag indicators (Oliveira, 2001). Ziegenfuss (2000) states that there should be a maximum of ten indicators across the four BSC perspectives, to avoid the process becoming unwieldy. Gautreau and Kleiner (2001) stress that the three key performance indicators, as perceived by businesses, are cash flow, guest satisfaction, and staff satisfaction.

Brewer and Speh (2000) propose a model for developing performance indicators across the four perspectives of the BSC. Firstly, the financial perspective: the most important lagging factor which acts as a system of checks and balances to control what is feasible given budgetary restraints. Such a check requires collecting all the relevant information to support financial decision making. In this way, accounting serves as the vehicle which drives all other functions and indicators. Secondly, with regard to the guest perspective the requirement is: what do guests think makes the business successful? Measures should be

developed to capture guests' opinion. Thirdly, internal business processes can be put in place such as, what must be done internally to meet and exceed guest needs?

The fourth BSC perspective focuses on learning and growth and requires investing in staff. Brewer and Speh (2000) participants cited staff as key to measuring and evaluating internal business processes. There is a clear emphasis on training and development and staff empowerment, with a view to streamlining internal operations and highlighting potential problems. Innovation and learning: what needs to be done on a continuing basis to delight and retain guests? The focus should on the future rather than current capabilities. Staff must be drivers of innovation. To encourage innovation and facilitate learning, hotels should ensure there is dialogue between staff and senior management and should aim to foster a strong organizational culture (Phillips & Louvieris, 2005).

Galbraith and Schendel (1983) argue that performance appraisal indicators cannot be determined from a single perspective. The scope and perspectives involved are very complicated and extensive and performance cannot be evaluated from a single perspective. Nevertheless, when analysing the case data, it is evident that four key concepts currently drive performances across the hotel industry these being: (1) the exercising of budgetary control with a view to increasing total revenue; (2) the undertaking of guest relationship management as a means of improving quality of service and guest retention; (3) the necessity for strategic planning in managing internal business processes and; (4) collaboration to drive innovation and learning (Phillips & Louvieris, 2005).

There is often too much reliance on so-called hard financial information to inform business strategies. So called soft performance indicators, which are not affected by the time-lag effect, are becoming more important, and case studies across the industry are able to articulate examples, particularly in guest care (Phillips & Louvieris, 2005). Hotels invest heavily in motivating, training and retaining their staff to achieve good results. However, the literature (Galbraith & Schendel, 1983; Phillips & Louvieris, 2005) identifies priority factors: budgetary control, guest relationship management, strategic management, weighted in combinations slightly different from the balanced score card advanced by Kaplan and Norton (1992). Phillips and Louvieris (2005) argue that by including financial and non-financial indicators for performance indicators, enterprise strategies could be enhanced to

create competitive advantages, and add data completeness as well as making extensive evaluations of staff possible.

From a more egalitarian perspective, Phillips and Louvieris (2005) maintain (what appears to be unlikely in a hierarchical Chinese context) that staff should be involved in the formation of performance indicators. Well-trained and empowered staff enhance the guest experience, track and evaluate the effectiveness of internal business processes, and drive innovation and learning. While Phillips and Louvieris (2005) find that it is encouraging that many organizations involve staff in their performance measurement process, in both informal and formal capacities, it may be argued that in Chinese hotels, where hierarchical separation is greater, such involvement is not certain and remains to be explored.

Foucault (1980) points out that power/knowledge and accountability are made possible by recording and measurement. Fuller and Smith (1991) demonstrate, carefully recorded guest responses are now extensively used by management in the service sector as a means of imposing discipline and such careful recording does not involve or necessarily empower staff.

Brody et al. (2004) also argue that: "Different performance evaluation criteria for different department managers can lead to conflicts when inter-departmental accounting issues arise. This, in turn, can lead to adverse manager behaviour in an attempt to avoid poor evaluation" (p. 57). For example, restaurant managers are under particular pressure due to the recent trends in the hotel industry towards outsourcing of the restaurant function. Sales managers focus and are evaluated on room revenues rather than hotel profits so that they may be discouraged by a breakfast combination that helps them attract business but reduces their performance ratios because the accounting treatment then allocates room revenue to the restaurant (Brody et al., 2004).

Spitzer (2007) also points out that " fear is a major cause of measurement dysfunction, as many employees become hapless victims of a measurement system over which they have no control" (p. 26). For example, when guest complaints are up 8 per cent, staff will meet the letter of a law, but violate its spirit; or they will grudgingly do just enough to stay out of trouble and keep managers off their backs; this is what is referred to as " passive resistance"

or "malicious compliance," which are very common reactions when people are forced to make their numbers - or else (Spitzer, 2007, p. 27).

More common in China is the effect that Spitzer (2007) observes as " the measurement hall of shame" where organizations produce "results" on the wrong measures of success (p. 29). For instance, a hotel chain responding to a cash flow crisis by mercilessly cutting costs when it should have been focusing on occupancy rate. This may result in a short-term increase in cash, but a further deterioration of the business (Spitzer, 2007).

In relation to the measurement systems, Spitzer (2007) states that:

> *When you add rewards or the threat of punishment to a measurement system, the informational value of the measurement becomes subordinated to its use for control. Kohn (1993) points out incentives and rewards can be just as controlling as threats and punishments. If rewards for good performance and penalties for poor performance are too great, it can also encourage situational and inaccurate measurement and reporting, which can negate the accuracy and trustworthiness of the information. (p.44)*

From the researcher's experience in several hotels, it is claimed that Chinese hotel managers tend to employ the extreme ends of the range of rewards and penalties with some of the "hall of shame" effects that Spitzer (2007) observes (p. 16). Generally speaking, staff in the hotel industry tend to do what it takes to obtain rewards or to avoid punishments. Thus, what is measured tends to get their attention among so many competing demands. In other words, it is well known that staff will do what management inspects (measures), not necessarily what management expects (Spitzer, 2007). Such observations may play a key part in research findings.

However, "negative accountability" is when measurement is used to force performance and punish non-performance(Spitzer, 2007, p. 47). For the most part, performance measurement continues to make staff feel helpless, rather than empowered. Staff in most organizations are still more likely to receive defective reports, be reprimanded for poor quality, and not have the tools or authority to improve things (Spitzer, 2007).

Spitzer (2007) observes that when the organisational climate is the prevailing "atmosphere" of the organisation, then it is the social-psychological environment that profoundly influences all behaviour, and it is typically measured by staff' perceptions. The hotel climate is what best "defines" the organization to staff. It reflects perceptions on a variety

of dimensions, including, among others: the extent of formality versus informality, trust versus distrust (and cynicism) of staff, controlling versus collaborative decision making, risk-taking versus risk aversion.

3.4.2   Balance Score Card (BSC)

Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) are those indicators which are necessary for a hotel to function well (Parmenter, 2013). Often in the hotel industry KPIs play an important part in terms of the dressage function. According to Parmenter (2013), the definition of the KPIs is that KPIs tell you what to do to increase performance. They serve to discipline the front line staff to meet the organisations critical success factors (Parmenter, 2013).

According to Parmenter (2013), KPIs are those indicators with several characteristics, many of which are non-financial measures, that measure and tie responsibility down to a department, to have a significant impact and encourage appropriate action (p. 6). When you put a dollar sign on a measure, you have already converted it into a result indicator. For instance, daily sales are a result of activities that have taken place to create the sales. The KPI lies deeper down. It may be the number of visits or contacts with the key guests who make up most of the profitable business. Thus, a KPI should tell you what action needs to take place (Parmenter, 2013).

As Parmenter (2013) points out, every performance measurement has both a dark side and a bright side. For example, most of performance measures lead to better performance. But staff's unintended actions can lead to inferior performance. In particular, as the hotel industry focuses more on staff performance in terms of the symbolic function. Parmenter (2013) observes that: "One needs to anticipate the likely human behaviour and minimise the potential dark side of the performance measure"(p. 46). In order to make staff act appropriately, managers need to find the dark side and rework how the performance measures should be used.

Some measures in the hotel industry can lead to unintended negative behaviours. Front line staff may not understand measures or use poor measures inappropriately, which will promote dysfunctional actions (Parmenter, 2013). For example, managers try to achieve zero wastage food materials in the food and beverage department. They may direct the chef

in the kitchen not to cook anything until receiving orders from guests. Such behaviour looks likely to achieve the measure of not wasting food materials, but will lead to long wait for guests. The long waits time results in lower guest satisfaction. Then hotels will lose a lot of guests. Spitzer (2007) points out that "People will do what management inspects, not necessarily what management expects" (p. 29).

The Chinese hotel industry tends to be more professional due to global brands expanding in the world (Parmenter, 2013). Most of the famous hotel chains have many branches in different countries. For management and marketing purposes, professional managers are employed. Those professional managers are assigned tasks each year measured by a financial aspect. In the short term, they do not worry about the strategy or the guests (Parmenter, 2013). They just make their financial outputs acceptable and get the rewards and bonuses on offer. Thus, this situation also leads to dark side of performance measures.

KPIs focus more on those aspects of the hotel industry performance that are most critical for the current and future success (Parmenter, 2013). Parmenter (2013) points out that managers also instruct front line staff how to perform in an appropriate way to achieve desired outcomes and strategies, such as guest satisfaction, staff satisfaction, return on capital employed and so on. Those measures have been mistaken for KPIs but they are outcomes not outputs. However, KPIs can give a clear indication of how a hotel is performing and can be a critical success factor (Parmenter, 2013).

All front line staff should understand the metrics employed and what corrective action is required. KPIs have a significant impact on more than one of the critical success factors. KPIs also encourage appropriate behaviours (Parmenter, 2013). The latter is crucial in driving the symbolic function of staff performance. For instance:

> *By focusing only on timeliness of deliveries to key customers managers are telling staff to focus on these shipments first. If you measure all deliveries, staff would pick the easiest and smallest deliveries in order to achieve a high score, sacrificing the large complex orders to the key customers where hotels typically make most of their profit. (p. 48)*

Therefore, KPIs are special performance tools and are very important to a hotel. In the long term, it will affect the profit of the whole organisation by acting appropriately. In the short term, when it is linked to pay, KPIs may be manipulated to enhance the probability of a

larger bonus by individuals and departments (Parmenter, 2013). Parmenter (2013) states that the definition of the key result indicators (KRIs) are to tell you what you have done in a perspective or critical success factor (Parmenter, 2013).

3.5   Technical and non-technical managers

The generic research question is "How accountability is determined and discipline maintained by the use of: surveillance, key performance indicators, enclosure and the audit functions of examination and inspection". Managers may adopt different strategies to determine accountability and maintain control. Some may take a "hard" approach, focusing mainly on the productive function of staff and their ability meet KPIs. Other may take a "soft" approach using their communication skills to concentrate more on outcomes and have a greater focus on the symbolic function of staff. Nonetheless, both types of managers may employ, in Foucauldian terms, a dressage function to control staff and cement discipline.

In the hotel industry, there are technical senior managers such as IT support, engineering department and so on. In addition, non-technical managers also control many different departments, such as front office department, housekeeping department and food & beverage department (Enns et al., 2002). Technical and non-technical managers play an important role in respect of the internal control system (Enns et al., 2002). Due to the responsibility they have, it is vital for hotels to run successfully. The question is, do managers with "greater" technical backgrounds differ from those who with "lesser" technical backgrounds with respect to their influence over the behaviour of staff. Managers with technical backgrounds have a less personal orientation and influence behaviours and maintain accountability by reliance more on key outputs drawn from accounting and budgetary concepts (Enns et al., 2002).

Enns et al. (2002) contend that a newly promoted manager will continue to engage in behaviours that were acceptable and reinforced in the manager's prior work environment. Thus, a technically trained manager will prefer outputs to outcomes as a measure of accountability. Technically oriented people, according to advocates of this perspective, tend to deal with objects and things, are more tasks and output focused, and are less relationship centred (Enns et al., 2002). The relationship centred managers will focus more on the

symbolic functions to be performed by hotel staff with the goal of creating favourable impression among guests. Singapore Airlines ubiquitous "Singapore Girl" is typical of this soft approach which is aimed at promoting customer relationships.

Socialization theory suggests that managers with technical backgrounds are reluctant to use "soft" behaviours, requiring them to find other ways to influence staff (Enns et al., 2002). One future research aim could be to test this socialisation theory among hotel managers by ascertaining their backgrounds and relating their background to their impressions of the relative importance of the productive and symbolic functions of staff (Enns et al., 2002).

3.6 Chapter summary

This chapter has been organised to review the extant literature with regard to internal control of hotel industry in China. This chapter has been broken into several sections each discussing different functions to illustrate the focus of their control. While the first few sections are necessary to describe and understand the productive, symbolic and dressage functions, the latter section is of more specific important in terms of internal control in hotel industry.

In a world of accelerating change, the hotel that is better able to adapt to new developments may possess a significant competitive advantage (Shaw & Williams, 1998). In China, it is argued that there is a shift to focus more on the control of the symbolic function of staff and to extend this function so that even house maids have a symbolic performance role to play. The problem for managers is not so much recognising the importance of the symbolic function as determining its measurement. This is not easy as the symbolic function offers not outputs but outcomes. Thus, the control emphasis has to be on the implementation of a symbolic function rather than on staff performance indicators. Implementation can be advanced by employing Foucault (1979)'s concepts of surveillance, enclosure, discourse and examination.

For measurement of the productive function hotels employ accounting concepts of cost control, profit growth rate, and sales growth rate. Indeed, the financial perspectives are the indicators most valued by all the hotel industry. Thus, while the hotel industry puts a strong emphasis on financial indicators, it is argued that, of increasing importance is the shift to

implementing and controlling the symbolic perspective of staff performance. The literature does not discuss how symbolic performance is measured and controlled in terms of Chinese hotels.

CHAPTER 4: Theoretical Framework: Foucault's Concepts and Accounting

4.1   Introduction

Foucault (1980)'s study uncovered the networks of power and knowledge. The concept of power/knowledge can be interpreted as the desire to know the true nature of what it means to be a normal human, and it can be used for the correction of individual behavior along the lines of that knowledge (Foucault, 1980). Foucault (1980) argues that the techniques of power operate through infinitesimal mechanisms in daily life. The appearance of different organizations such as the clinic, the insane asylum, the military academy, the factory, and the prison are as a consequence of human power struggles; these organizations have not always existed but are constructions so that human society can progress. Foucault (1980) argues that the power/knowledge relations were implicated in various disciplinary practices and in many different organizations, and gives rise to modern strategies of discipline and surveillance.

Foucault (1979)'s most famous book "Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison" describes a picture of the system of criminal "justice". The punishment for the criminal employed direct physical assault on the body with torture, but later on, it used the indirect punishment of the body, and the deprival of personal liberty. This indirect punishment was integrated with a repressive system of discipline and surveillance. Consequently, the individuals were normalized toward an existence as "docile bodies."

His description of the systems of punishment over centuries to explain social behavior has a significant influence in the literature (Dreyfus & Rabinow, 1983). His main motivation is to disclose strategies of power that had been marginalized in social discourse rather than examine the "negative" aspect of punishment system such as physical torture and repression (McKinlay & Starkey, 1998). Foucault (1977) indicated that these strategies represent specific forms of power. Disciplinary power and surveillance are flourishing with the development of modernization and industrialization.

The aim of this research is to interpret and critically analyze control and discipline from a Foucauldian perspective; in particular, as such control applies to staff in the hotel industry in China. Fundamental to Foucault's work is the question, "How is power exercised", and, "What is its mechanism" (Foucault, 1980, p. 89). In this study, power is exercised by managers over staff to the end of what Foucault calls the triple function of labour: "the productive, symbolic and dressage functions of labour" (Foucault, 1980, p. 161). Accountability embraces all three functions: the productive function – ensuring the work is done; the symbolic function - where staff are used to represent the organization as in the Novotel's hotel chain ubiquitous "Receptionist girl"; and the dressage function – where staff are made efficient by surveillance, enclosure and discourse.

4.2   The productive, symbolic and dressage functions

The dressage function is defined as those practices of control: the recording, processing or transmission of staff inputs (Foucault, 1979). In the hotel industry, for purposes of surveillance, staff are enclosed to specific work areas, and made uniform by wearing different uniforms according to function. In addition, for housemaids, room doors must remain open when housekeepers are cleaning. In this way, housemaids are made available for inspection and are under constant surveillance. The dressage function is performed by supervisors and managers to ensure that staff are working rather than resting or doing other things. As Foucault stressed, the triple functions of labour are always combined (Foucault, 1980). In the hotel industry, reception staff are required to wear uniforms and appear uniform as their appearance performs a symbolic function as well as a productive function.

Foucault (1979) further elaborates that the examination of disciplined bodies incorporates aspects of surveillance, hierarchization, measurement and normalization. Through ceremonies of power, a regime of truth about each individual is established that is one of the most effective instruments of discipline and control in hotels. Consequently, each individual is seen, examined, inspected and normalized. Hopper and Macintosh (1993) maintain that power is exercised on the individual through a punishing gaze over them. To be effective, disciplinary forms of power are also exercised on the individual's mind rather than on the body, disciplinary power is about getting knowledge of, and over, individuals.

Prado (1995) argues that Foucault tried to get appearance-determining realities beyond practices to discourse. For example, in hotels, managers seem to be determining many appearance realities: uniforms, the way of speaking to customers, the enclosure to each department, etc. In particularly, managers could be the designers of appearance-determining realities. Staff in hotels may become docile bodies with fixed uniforms as they do not themselves determine the uniforms that they wear. In other words, they have to wear what managers decide as appropriate to perform a symbolic function. Such symbolic functions may be seen among airline staff and the ubiquitous "Singapore Girl", where hair-style and grooming are contrived to be identical.

Foucault (1979) states that "disciplines" as a technique for managing people were established as a way to control people by examinations, restrictions and surveillance. These techniques may exercise bodily control. Hopper and Macintosh (1993) also argue that the disciplines as new forms for power are far more insidious than public torture and execution: "it inflicted its mark, not on the body, but on the mind" (p. 202). The disciplinary techniques are also used in the hotel industry as a large number of people are managed by a few. For example, the front line staff are usually controlled by their supervisors or departmental managers. There are many schedules, restrictions and examinations of staff and all of these structures are directed to making docile bodies that carry out their functions in the required way. Receptionists, generally speaking, bring first impressions to customers and are always expected to smile. Thus, managers are keen that receptionists show the positive aspects of a hotel.

However, if they do not fulfil their function very well, they would be subjected to greater surveillance and examination. Such attention being the dressage techniques employed to achieve the necessary standards required to meet their productive and symbolic functions. Their bodies are controlled and subjugated by the imposition of their functions. In other words, staff in hotels are subjected to managerial power/knowledge. The disciplinary techniques involved in most hotels in China may be by way of enclosure, discourse and surveillance in which the metrics of accounting also participate.

In this thesis, these fundamental ideas of (Foucault, 1979, 1980, 1983)'s study are the premises of the management control. Accounting can be interpreted as a disciplinary practice. Accounting is a particular form of knowledge and record keeping in organizations.

This kind of knowledge can contribute to the strategies of surveillance and discipline. In the accounting literature, many studies (Carmona, Ezzamel, & Gutiérrez, 2002; Hopper & Macintosh, 1993; Knights & Collinson, 1987; Macintosh, 2002) made extensive use of the Foucault's concepts since the mid-1980s. The undoubted attraction of (Foucault, 1979, 1980, 1983)'s study has motivated many academic studies that have contributed to the accounting literature by using Foucauldian methods from different perspectives (Gaffikin, 2010).

4.3   Disciplinary practices and power relationships

The central Foucauldian perspective used in the accounting literature is the nature of discipline and how power produces the subject (Honderich, 1995). Foucault's concepts can be used to explain how accounting disciplinary practices can serve management by providing power/knowledge. In the accounting literature, there are many studies (Carmona et al., 2002; Hopper & Macintosh, 1993; Knights & Collinson, 1987; Macintosh, 2002) that illustrate his concepts of disciplinary power and surveillance (Townley, 1993). Thus, although Foucault does not write about management accounting, he is been seen as a major influence (Hoskin, 1998).

Berente, Gal, and Yoo (2010) state that like the prisoners in the Panopticon system of surveillance, human beings' behavior is regulated by the disciplinary practice of management accounting practice. The relationships of observer and the person who is observed are transformed in this practice. Foucault (1977) states that every person who is subject to disciplinary power and control is "seen without ever being seen" (p. 202). For example in schools or prisons, each person is seen when they are in classes or cells. Those people who are observed become disciplined by specific regulations and rules which are from specific disciplinary practices. These disciplinary practices were contained in administrative procedures. Similarly, workers and even managers in a company will become disciplined through different rules, regulations and procedures, especially by the accounting numbers, therefore, management accounting controls play pivotal roles in organizations.

This thesis draws on these ideas to look at accounting as a disciplinary formation and considers the usefulness of a Foucauldian perspective for understanding internal control

and accountability in different organizations. Moreover, this thesis adds to a Foucauldian understanding of the role and functioning of organizations by examining how concepts are used in Chinese hotel practice.

Macintosh (2002) states that in the disciplinary organizations, there are three categories underlying principle of disciplinary practice: the principle of enclosure; the principle of efficient body; and the principle of disciplinary power. This thesis will follow this framework of the disciplinary practice, but add the related concepts of power/knowledge and surveillance.

Foucault (1980) links the concepts of power and knowledge in his book "Power/Knowledge". Foucault's idea of power and knowledge, and how the two interrelate, states that in fields of specialized knowledge, individual actions are governed by the components of the power structures themselves. In simple terms, this means that without structures in place, specialized knowledge would not exist. In other words, power is not possible without knowledge. In addition, knowledge is not possible without power. Accounting is a form of surveillance which provides measures and structures to enable knowledge (Hopper & Macintosh, 1998). By recording outputs, managers can know if staff are achieving the metrics demanded as a performance measure. Failure to achieve the necessary target metrics can mean dismissal - not so much as at the manager's arbitrary discretion but as a result of objectives embedded in a structure, which demands that certain metrics be achieved.

Hull and Umansky (1997) maintain that staff often lack the attitudes of someone in possession of power but may welcome the positive effects of power. Foucault (1980) observes: "it (power) doesn't only weigh on us as a force that says no, but that it traverses and produces things, it induces pleasure, forms knowledge, and produces discourse" (p. 119). However, sometimes the outcomes of these power relationships could be analysed in terms of resistance.

Foucault (1980) provides insights into how differing power relationships impact upon "improving labour productivity and industrial performance in general, improving the competitiveness of firms, and giving more discretionary power to management" (Burgess & MacDonald, 1990, p. 18). In spite of power being a generally positive exercise, Miller

(1987) maintains that "where there is power, there is resistance" (p. 205). For example, because male managers are more common in the hotel industry in China; it is important to consider how power is experienced by junior female staff, as such findings could influence the application of internal control mechanisms in hotels. It is the possibility of such a difference in application of power in Chinese hotels that this study seeks also to explore.

Bernauer and Carrette (2004) observes that "power/knowledge is always a relationship between structures of "sayable" ability and "unsayable" ability" (p. 160). What is sayable? For instance, discourse taking the form of instructions from managers; records kept; key performance indicators; etc. And what is unsayable? That is the structure that regulates by, uniform, dress, body postures, speech tone, etc. Foucault's concept of the "docile" body contributes to the concept of the unsayable. Foucault (1979) states that docile bodies are made by organizations through discipline by means of enclosure, examination, hierarchical surveillance and normalizing sanctions (Foucault, 1979). Behaviours may be subjected to the normalising power of surveillance. We use our bodies to follow acceptable standards of behaviour. However, people can discipline their bodies in different ways to be seen as "normal" in their appearance (Foucault, 1980). Therefore, we can see that Foucault does not view the body as an entirely natural entity.

Dreyfus and Rabinow (1983) state that Foucault also sees the body as discursively produced. Foucault (1979)'s theory concerning the "docile" body plays important part in our understanding of how the body is created to conform and also "the disciplinary technology of power to produce docile, useful bodies" (p. 160). Hopper and Macintosh (1993) argue that "enclosure, confinement and partitioning were the necessary first steps for turning a heterogeneous mass of humans into a homogeneous social order" (p. 193). Such theories have relevance to Chinese hotels where the supply of junior labour is relatively plentiful and the structure reflects the authoritarian and hierarchical culture observed by Hofstede (1986).

Foucault (1980) rejects the statement that power is a commodity. He argues that, "power is not something that is acquired, seized or shared, something one holds on to or allows to slip away" (p. 94). For Foucault (1980) power is relational and it will become obvious when it is exercised. Therefore, power is not associated with any institution due to its relational nature. It is associated with practices, techniques, and procedures. According to Foucault

(1980), power is productive in the sense that it produces objects. Power is the desire to know. Foucault argues that power is not necessarily negative.

Foucault (1980) states that it is wrong to describe the effects of power in negative terms, such as the term "excludes" or "represses" (p. 194). On the contrary, he maintains that power is positive and creative, it produces objects and reality, and it produces rituals of truth. "The individual and the knowledge that may be gained of him belong to this production" (Foucault, 1980, p. 194). That is to say power can positively produce the ways of how human beings behave and the features in human subjects. Foucault also points out that the most prevalent quality of power is that its subjects become cooperative and connive in their own subjection. Moreover, power is used at all kinds of levels; it is embedded into daily life and employed through different dimensions.

Foucault (1980) suggests that knowledge is gained through power. Townley (1993) states that knowledge is not a separated and independent, and that knowledge is an integral part of the exercise of power. Thus, it can be seen that knowledge is not a neutral instrument for the presentation of the truth in terms of the process of knowledge formation and accumulation. These procedures of knowledge formation reflect how power is utilized and exercised. Knights (1992) also argues that the assumption of knowledge as a scientific discourse should be questioned. Knowledge is the operation of disciplinary power. It creates perceptions of truth and describes an analytical space. It means the accumulation of knowledge can provide the basis for constraining or enabling action and make such interventions the operation of power. The term truth does not indicate universal "Truth".

Foucault (1980) states that truth means "the types of discourse which accepts and functions as true; the mechanisms and instances which enable one to distinguish true and false statements, the means by which each is sanctioned; the techniques and procedures accorded value in the acquisition of truth; the status of those who are charged with saying what counts as true" (p. 131).

According to Knights (1992), Foucault (1980) opposes positivism's portrayal of power and knowledge as independent and neutral. Foucault (1980) shows how systems of disciplinary power are instruments for the accumulation and formation of knowledge. He criticizes the traditional differentiation between the concepts of power and knowledge. He maintains that

power and knowledge are interrelated and influence each other. They do not have an independent existence as portrayed by positivism. Foucault (1980) shows that knowledge relations are always implicated in power relations, and power relations are implicated in knowledge relations. He argues that the inter-relations between power and knowledge can be applied to construct the present and the future. These applications of inter-relations translate as "power-knowledge".

Foucault (1980) describes this relationship in his study:

> *The exercise of power itself creates and causes to emerge new objects of knowledge and accumulates new bodies of information.... the exercise of power perpetually creates knowledge and, conversely, knowledge constantly induces effects of power...it is not possible for power to be exercised without knowledge, it is impossible for knowledge not to engender power. (p. 52)*

Prado (1995) observes that "of greatest importance in Foucault are his challenges to traditional philosophical methods and assumptions and to established conceptions of truth and knowledge. Truth and knowledge may be products of power" (p. 4). With respect to discipline, Prado (1995) observes that "For Foucault a "discipline" is both a field of study and a field of control…. involves both understanding how they constitute a learned practice and how that practice shapes behaviour"(p. 26).

In Foucault (1977)'s book "Discipline and Punish: the birth of the prison", the concept of power/knowledge is illustrated in the prison system of Panopticon. However, knowledge and power adopts negative forms in this system. For instance, one of the ways of keeping rigorous control is through the collection of knowledge and information about every prisoner in the Panoptic prison. By collecting this knowledge and information, disciplinary strategies could be exercised according to specific personal characteristics. The detailed information and knowledge of each individual enables power to be exercised over that individual. Also, this knowledge can put an individual at a disadvantage in a situation when the individual seeks to resist imposed discipline (Beresford, 2003). In a system of discipline, strategies of power define the nature of knowledge. In the Panopticon, such power is used to maintain control over the inmates through intimidation and manipulation. In fact, power/knowledge could be utilized to produce positive influences as well. For example, it will yield positive effects in terms of the development of an informed citizenry (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011).

4.4   Surveillance

In the book, "Discipline and Punishment: the Birth of Prison", Foucault (1977) describes the changes that happened in the punishment system in Europe in the18th and 19th centuries. He states that the punishment by torture disappeared to be replaced by a pervasive and impersonal system of disciplinary surveillance. The disciplinary surveillance was more visibly coercive compared to physical control. This kind of discipline seems softer and less physically coercive. However, it can generate more obedience among prison inmates (Foucault, 1977). Moreover, the disciplinary power of the punishment system shifts the emphasis of control to individuals themselves; it focuses attention on the individuals' psychology. The consequence of it is that when individuals know they are visible to other people and that they are under persistently surveillance, they begin to regulate their own behaviour and control themselves.

Foucault (1977) describes how, in order to design a new prison, which would be cost-effective to operate from the perspective of the State's point of view, the French National Assembly implemented a competition for designing a new prison. This new prison would help to create model prisoners and citizens. Jeremy Bentham participated in the competition and his ideal form of prison-Panopticon demonstrated the type of disciplinary power of which Foucault writes. The Panopticon was designed with a low operating cost because only one guard could survey all inmates at the same time. They had little or no privacy in the Panopticon; and were like goldfish in a glass bowl. The prison designed by Jeremy Bentham is a circular building. In the centre of the building, elevated watchtower stands with many cells were radiating around the tower. Only one observer stands in the central watchtower to observe all the inmates, such that all of them are subject to surveillance. Moreover, screens conceal the guards so that they remain unseen by the inmates.

Due to the special design of prison, the inmates know it is impossible for them to avoid the gaze of the guard but they do not know if a guard is actually observing them or if they are under surveillance. Thus, they have to behave as if they are under surveillance. That means that even when there is no observer in the Panopticon, the inmates would still behave as if they are under surveillance. The disciplinary power of the Panopticon is felt constantly by inmates; such that everyone in the cells needs to learn and practice self-control in order to act as good prisoners who obey the rules and regulations in prison (Hopper & Macintosh,

1998). Although there is no more institutionalized physical violence against inmates, the significant effects of the constant gaze serves to normalize the conduct and personality of prisoners, and the way they see the world (Beresford, 2003). The principle of surveillance becomes internalized rather than due to the external agency's conscious exercise. Moreover, this principle of surveillance can be generalized to hotels, hospitals, schools and factories and the whole society.

This phenomenon is highlighted by Foucault (1977) in the following excerpt:

> By the effect of backlighting, one can observe from the tower, standing out precisely against the light, the small captive shadows in the cells of the periphery. They are like so many cages, so many small theatres, in which each actor is alone, perfectly individualized and constantly visible. The panoptic mechanism arranges spatial unities that make it possible to see constantly and to recognize immediately…Each individual…is seen, but he does not see; he is the object of information, never a subject in communication…the Panopticon induces in the inmate a state of conscious and permanent visibility that assures the automatic functioning of power…the inmate will constantly have before his eyes the tall outline of the central tower from which he his spied upon…the inmate must never know whether he is being looked at any one moment; but he must be sure that he may always be so…(Foucault, 1977, p.200–201).

Initially observation is thought of in terms of agents of the relevant authority being empowered to conduct surveillance of those to be watched. But once the effectiveness of panopticism is appreciated, once it is seen that the ever-present possibility of observation works as well as constant surveillance to keep individuals, it is a small step to realize that if the subject can be made compliant, that is, through the internalization of norms, then control may approach near-perfect completeness and efficiency. What follows is a shift in emphasis from the enforcement of rules and regulations to the inculcation of norms through disciplinary techniques. The objective then is to normalize individuals, to rehabilitate wrongdoers, to train productive members of society. What actually occurs is that new subjects are manufactured through disciplinary techniques (Prado, 1995).

Concerning surveillance, Appelrouth and Edles (2011) writes that "in order to be exercised, this power had to be given the instrument of permanent, exhaustive, omnipresent surveillance, capable of making all visible, as long as it could itself remain invisible" (p. 409). Thus, surveillance became integral to the productive and symbolic functions within the hotel industry.

Labelling and individualization occur in the workplace. Shawki (2009) points out that the "Gaze", a crucial component of the "Panopticon", has found its way into the work environment. Employees in corporations are aware that many of their moves are being watched. Management information systems allow managers to monitor activities such as computer operators stokes per minutes as well as the amount of time it takes for phone operators to complete a transaction. Visions of elite groups exercising control using management information systems also bear a striking resemblance to the principles of Panoptic surveillance. It bears a striking resemblance because managers have such complete control over their subordinates (Shawki, 2009).

4.5 Enclosure

In the discipline regime, human beings are distributed in self-contained places of confinement. According to Foucault (1977), these enclosure practices were "destined to spread throughout the social body" (p. 207). All kinds of institutions such as hotels, schools, factories and hospitals employ this practice to various extents. According to Foucault (1977), enclosures could be defined as the "specification of a place heterogeneous to all others and closed up on itself, it is the protected place of disciplinary monotony" (p. 141). Enclosures separate places within their confines from the outside places and from each other, to effectively keep "order and discipline" (Foucault, 1977, p. 142). Human beings enter one "self-enclosed" system of control after another in everyday life; there is a unique system in each institution, which has its own unique disciplinary logic such as a form of discourses, unique rules and normalization techniques. Enclosure facilitates the control function, and accounting is a technique of enclosure allowing departments and sections to be accountable in terms of cost and revenue ratios.

Enclosure produces a disciplinary space; there is a need for partitioning everyone to a particular space. The particular space is an individual's and that space is where a staff member is expected to function. To be found outside that disciplinary space means that the productive function is not being fulfilled. According to Foucault (1977), "disciplinary space tends to be divided into as many sections as there are bodies or elements to be distributed" (p. 143). These spaces can be used to analyse the performance of an individual, precisely locate individuals, uncover an individuals' presence and absence, build up the

communications with and among these people who are under control. Furthermore, enclosure will contribute to the supervision and evaluation of their performance. It can be seen that partition produces the possibility for the functional sites to make rules come into effect; every functional site is defined in terms of the specific and regular function to be performed.

Moreover, each partition is serialized within the general enclosure distinctly. In relation to all the other partitions in the function chain, each partition's usefulness will be identified (Martinez, 2011). Furthermore, hierarchy should be reflected from the partition practice. Each partition has its unique rank in terms of its hierarchical position in the organization; every partition separates it from other partitions which are above and below it. The horizontal and vertical partitions are established in an organization, and produce a consistent grid of serialized, ranked and functional spaces. The significant result is that individuals are defined by the physical space they occupy.

According to Foucault (1977), the strategies for regulating and controlling human beings will be established by enclosing people and partitioning individuals into functional paces, and it is a good method to "produce maximum advantage and to neutralize inconveniences such as interruptions of work, thefts and so forth" (p. 142). The production function of labour will be more concentrated because of the enclosure and partition practice. Moreover, other principles of control will be facilitated by enclosures. Macintosh (2002) points out that subject will become more available for discipline due to the fact that they are confined in a relatively permanent disciplinary space. In general, the disciplinary power in organizations depends heavily on the principles of enclosure and partition. Through a network of institutions and defined spaces where human beings are allocated and organized based on their specific functions, this disciplinary power can be exercised effectively. In their particular space, each individual will become the object of examination. Moreover, ranking schemes and timetables can be put into effect for disciplining behaviours within the enclosure (Deleuze, 2006).

4.6   Discourse

According to Foucault (1977), power cannot be separated into discourse and enclosure. Cusset, Haber, Renault, and Touboul (2006) state that "Discourse is not the medium of

transmission of power, it is its manifestation" (p. 142). Power can be exercised through discourse in organizations. Following this point, the process of demanding accountability also can be shown as an exercise of power.

For Foucault (1972), the subject is something to be understood as an historical product, and as emergent. There could not be discernment or acknowledgement of the individual soul in the process of discipline. Instead, the process of discipline contributes to the creation of the modern self in that "the subject" is a product of discourse. Rather than the subject being prior to discourse, the subject emerges in discourse.

Instead of being "the majestically unfolding manifestation of a thinking, knowing, speaking subject," discourse is the generative context in which the subject arises (Foucault, 1972, p. 54). Once this is understood, discourse is seen as "a totality, in which the dispersion of the subject and his discontinuity from himself may be determined" (Foucault, 1972, p. 55). When we understand what we are actually doing in speaking as we do about people, by attending to the discontinuities genealogy uncovers, we appreciate that "the subject" is what we say it is. This is clearly a philosophical view of the self; it is not a socio-historical account of the recognition of some basic humanity (Prado, 1995).

It is the body, in its habits and gestures, in its postures, in its speech, in how it is dealt with, that bears the emergent subjectivity that is the multifaceted total effect of regulating discourses. The task, therefore, is not to establish the nature of the self or to articulate that nature in a philosophical theory, but rather "to expose a body totally imprinted by history" (Foucault, 1971, p. 83).

Foucault (1979) offers a list of five devices, used during the development of the prison and other institutions that dealt with significant populations gathered into a compact space. They are hierarchical observation, normalizing judgment, the examination, panopticism, and surveillance. These devices can only function in the context of an institution, such as a school, industrial plant, prison, or asylum. To be effective, discipline "requires enclosure…a place heterogeneous to all others and closed in upon itself" (Foucault, 1979, p. 141). Whether the place be a monastery, corporation, hospital, factory, school, or prison, observation and discipline of large groups require that they be gathered and restricted to a given place for significant period of time.

Hierarchical observation means physically structuring institutions to maximize visual and/or auditory access by those with greater authority and responsibility over those with less authority. An example is tiered work-areas, where increased height affords oversight from a given level over echelons below. Normalizing judgement, the second device, is negative assessment of individuals or groups that turns not on outright criticism or condemnation, but on individuals comparisons with a favoured paradigm real or imagined. An example is the glorification of a work-team or other cohort as a model of high morale and productivity.

4.7   Normalizing Sanctions

The system of normalizing sanctions involves exercising various rewards and punishments based on a set of arbitrary regulations. These regulations and various sanctions are not in reference to any philosophical ideals. In fact, a private justice system, which excluded the state's legal judicial system, is constituted. Surveillance and normalizing sanctions together function as a control system (Foucault, 1979).

Foucault (1977) pointed out that in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the practice of normalizing sanctions spread to every field of the society such as hospitals, schools, barracks, and prisons. The private systems of justice were developed in these organizations. Stipulations and rules contained all kinds of aspects such as timeliness, appearance and attentiveness (Sargiacomo, 2008). If individuals depart from these regulations, or cannot reach the specified level of requirement, they will receive a range of penalties based on their departures. The punishments may include petty humiliation, light physical punishment and so forth (Sargiacomo, 2008). It can be seen that individuals are evaluated constantly by a structure of disciplining sanctions.

Normalizing sanctions are not designed only for elaboration or repentance but to guide the individual to abide by the regulations of proper behaviour. Normalisation is designed to drive people to make efforts to reach a higher level of ability (Hopper & Macintosh, 1998). For example, repetitive and intensified learning exercises are the forms of punishment. That is to say the disparity between actual acts and the regulations is reduced through this system and this provides the correcting and training opportunities for the offenders. Moreover, the exercises of punishment are to be avoided as far as possible. The teacher, the prison

director, hotel manager, or the military officer may try to distribute rewards more frequently rather than penalties. But rewards such as more pay or less time working may involve costs while punishments are often cost-free.

The principles behind sanctions are that offenders will be motivated more to behave properly by the desire for rewards rather than the fear of punishment. Based on this principle, many organizations designed intricate normalizing systems. The combination of positive and negative normalizing sanctions function as a repetitive loop of examining and rectifying individuals' behaviour. A strictly managed mixture of sanctions function automatically, silently, and without physical enforcement to drive individuals to rectify themselves and abide by the regulations of appearance and behaviour (Hopper & Macintosh, 1998). Thus, self-normalization is generated by means of this quiet sanctioning.

Penalties may be more corporeal, using rigorous physical repetition of disciplinary routines and constraint to modify conduct. Whatever the abstract constructions and goals of the reformers, Foucault maintains that penalty's objective is not the reformation of minds, but the production of docile, obedient bodies (Foucault, 1979).

4.8   The examination

The concept of examination, as described by Foucault (1979), promotes individual accountability and is a mechanism for controlling people within organisations. Examination is achieved by making subjects visible through the process of documentation (Desai, 2010). According to (Desai, 2010), performance measurement is implemented to assist the organisation in controlling staff. For example, in the Chinese hotel industry, internal audits are often conducted on a regular basis to ensure that employees are complying with their organisation's business objectives. The employees work is reviewed independently with intention of identifying mistakes or failed performance indicators. Managers often use the internal audit reports as a tool to review staff performance and remuneration, thus managers are able to exercise power and control over staff as a result (Desai, 2010).

Examination is the requirement and application of all manner of tests, usually presented as ways of enabling those tested to achieve their full potential, and of enabling the managing

authorities to treat those tested in the most appropriate and supposedly beneficial manner (Prado, 1995).

The examination associated with surveillance makes every individual a case. The ordinary individual is no longer below the threshold of description. Yet, as Foucault (1979) points out, this was not always common practice. During the era of the monarchic power, the regular person was by no means an individual. It was only the wealthy and powerful who were able to amass any semblance of individuality. This ascending individualization was established through lives of excess as well as the building of great monuments intended to be testaments to a certain few. Ascending individualization was disbanded during the eighteenth century due to the end of the ultimate power of the monarch as well as new forces such as surveillance (Shawki, 2009).

Descending individualization is what replaces the old model imposed by monarchs. Instead of those with the most power receiving the greatest individualization, it is those who are lacking power that become highly individualized. Foucault (1979) elaborates, "The child is more individualized than the adult, the patient more than the healthy man, the madman and the delinquent more than the normal and the non-delinquent" (Foucault, 1979). In hotels the junior staff may be the most individualised and the most subjected to surveillance, inspection and examination.

Foucault (1977) states that visibility is transformed into the exercise of power through the techniques of examination: the technique of examination integrates the observing hierarchy and the normalizing sanction.

For example, in the context of the school, the surveillance and observation of pupils can take place by using the technique of the examination. The examination process is highly ritualised and the examined students are subject to constant visibility. Their performances are documented and recorded so that the school becomes the apparatus of persistent examination (Hoskin & Macve, 1986). A new power of judgment takes place over pupils. They become subject to a penal accountancy system in the form of mathematical marks that are awarded to them (Hoskin & Macve, 1986). The marks not only awarded for academic work, but also cover all areas related to their behaviour and performance. The students will be always judged based on their marks. Thus, the written performance and records make it

possible to produce a "history" about every person. Then, individuals will be classified into categories, and finally they will be classified into "populations" with norms (Hoskin & Macve, 1986).

Individual attributes, abilities and characteristics are measured by the technique of examination so that each individual becomes knowable and subject to an annual performance review. From records and archives, it is possible to accumulate a great deal of and ever-increasing areas of knowledge for different human sciences. Moreover, each individual could be treated as a case study. Based on the rules and averages of the general population, any individual could be treated as an object to be described, compared, and measured. Foucault (1977) points out that the technique of examination uses a novel principle of individual accountability by applying a numerical "objective" judgment on each individual. Thus, it substitutes for the individuality of the memorable man that of the calculable man and facilitates the dreaded annual performance review. Such, knowledge about each individual empowers managers.

4.9   Resistance

Foucault (1983) argues that the individuals' conscience was brought to the centre stage by the disciplinary power in modernity, these subjects need the space and they should be allowed to have space for resistance or refusal. Foucault (1983) point out that to discover "what we are" is not today's objective, the target today maybe is to refuse what we are.

Two senses were given to the term of subject. The first meaning of the term is used to represent the sense of being subject to someone else (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011). That is to say the populations are subjected to regimes of truth and power. The second meaning of the term is that individuals should know themselves and need to be tied to a fixed identity (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011). Foucault (1983) states that this form of power can be explained as one that labels the individual with his own individuality. His own identity is tied to him and a law of truth is imposed on him, and these must be recognized by himself and other people. However, it does not means that the form of power is "domination"; it should be interpreted as relational, entailing behaviours on the behaviours of other individuals. Thus, this feature makes a demand about a degree of freedom, that is to say it is necessary to have resistance in the power relations (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011).

There would be no power relations without the possibility of resistance such as violent resistance, flight and deception and so forth (Foucault, 1983). The resistance exists everywhere in the power network. The power relationships have a rigorously relational feature, every resistance could be seen as a particular case which arising from specific conditions and power relations. Moreover, these resistances function as various roles within power relations: some as supportive or some as adversarial (Foucault, 1977).

4.10 The efficient body

The efficient body principle is very significant when human beings are enclosed partitioned, ranked, serialized by functional space. According to Macintosh (2002), this concept can be reflected in three additional disciplinary practices: the timetable; the articulation of body and machine; and the exhaustive use of time.

The concept of timetable is used for disciplining time. Timetables stipulate when particular activities and routines need to be done in every partition, which has a particular function. A rhythm and regularity to behaviors and actions are established by it (Hopper & Macintosh, 1998). Each individual's behavior can be stipulated in terms of days, hours, minutes and seconds. The timetable generates a life with daily repetition and a fixed cycle of functional activities in the space an individual occupies. Moreover, the temporal elaboration of the act defines the precise manner as to how to behave and perform the activity (Macintosh, 2002). In addition, it is necessary to reach a meticulous and systematic matching of the body to the specific object. Soldiers and gymnasts, for example, their feet position and movement, the positions of the arms, even the chin are strictly stipulated when they are drilling or doing gymnastics. Within a fixed sequence, every movement is stipulated by direction and duration. It means every part of the body is disciplined. In addition, the exhaustive use of time is also necessary (Macintosh, 2002). Foucault (1979) argues that these techniques of making an efficient body allow the body to become an object to be manipulated and exercised in prescribed movements. Ever more knowledge can then be imposed on the body. So, to cite from Foucault, the individual becomes obedient, docile and willing flesh.

Prado (1995) states that "the knowledge in question goes beyond investigation and even control of the body as an organism to what might be called the political technology of the body" (p. 26). The aim of this technology is not mere control, as in the effective imposition

of restrictions and prohibitions, but rather pervasive management gained through enabling as well as restrictive conceptions, definitions and descriptions that generate and support behaviour-governing norms (Prado, 1995).

The modern self is one that contains the ground of intentional consciousness as an inherent property; it is the ultimate source of action. Given this conception, it then becomes possible and necessary to shape the self through discipline in a way that it will regularly initiate the right sorts of actions. The way to achieve this end is to imbue the self with the right beliefs and affective states (Prado, 1995).

4.11   Chapter summary - Foucault and Accounting

Foucault illustrates how other institutions are run by describing and analysing the operations of organizations. His studies (Foucault, 1972, 1977, 1979, 1980, 1983) have received a great deal of attention from accounting theorists (Miller & O'Leary, 1987). From Foucault's work an abstract picture relating management control and accounting controls is illustrated by these disciplinary concepts.

Foucault's writings have influence on critical accounting theory and history. There is a significant breakthrough in terms of the "new accounting history" (Miller, Hopper, & Laughlin, 1991), which sees accounting from a completely new angle. Critical accounting scholars are inspired by Foucault to develop the idea that accounting does not just function as a passive instrument of economic efficiency. In other words, accounting practice should not be merely counted as a technical method by which a potential economic reality can be more or less exactly mirrored (Miller & O'Leary, 1987). McKinlay, Carter, Pezet, and Clegg (2010) state that from a critical theory point of view, accounting needs to be interpreted as an intricate network of economic and political occurrences instead of a progressive technical rationality.

Accounting is both constitutive and transformative of social relations (Stewart, 1992). Constitutive means that social relationships are established based on accounting categories; they are measured by accounting ratios and disclosed in terms performance. Transformative means accounting can lead to interventions from management. At the same time, power and knowledge relationships are developed. From the Foucauldian perspective, accounting

practice can be considered as a means of surveillance and control. It functions as a critical role in the establishment and maintenance of the political domains in organizations. Accountability and the discipline of regulations are facilitated by the techniques of accounting in various institutions. The numbers from accounting calculation cannot be only seen as a record of revenue, cost, profitability and so forth, it makes workers and even different levels of managers become visible and comprehensible. Accounting permits recognition, measurement and disclosure.

The concept of self-surveillance derived from the Panopticon can be reflected in accounting practices. By using the accounting as an information system, the supervisors from different hierarchies can conduct a more subtle form of supervision. Accounting contributes to establish a particular field of visibility. Moreover, workers and managers are encompassed by calculative norms and standards through certain spaces in various organizations. The workers can be managed and judged by the economic norms and standards. They are encompassed in a calculus of efficiency based on budgets, key performance indicators, and profit plans, which are the main features of the internal control systems in organizations. The workers and managers are distributed into different spaces based on their productive or symbolic function.

Stewart (1992) argues that the principle that accounting is a "mechanism" for the exercise of disciplinary power is an alternative angle for study; further research could be conducted for achieving a more meaningful interpretation of the role of accounting from this perspective. This research fills a gap in the literature with regard to hotels in China as to how staff are controlled, disciplined and how there has been a shift in performance emphasis towards the symbolic function of staff.

CHAPTER 5: Case Studies in the Literature

5.1　Introduction

After discussing the important features of Foucault's theory of disciplinary power, it is apparent that Foucault's work has significant relevance to internal control and accountability. Some case studies are summarized that employ Foucault's discipline theories in accounting research. In fact, many papers now explore the role of accounting in organizations, and use Foucault's concepts and insights. This thesis will examine the following four illustrative case studies. Carmona et al. (2002)'s study describes an accounting system in a tobacco factory during the eightieth century. This case study illustrates the role of space and its relevance to the creation of visibilities through accounting disciplinary practices. Macintosh's (2002) "Hawthorne" study describes how the principles of surveillance, discipline, and punishment were inserted in the management system of a relay assembly room in an engineering works. With a focus on discourse and enclosure, Hopper and Macintosh (1993) study describe how Harold Geneen broke ITT into decentralized cost center enclosures and how the managers were driven by numerical performance indicators. Knights and Collinson (1987) case study discusses a particular financial accounting regime in a U.K. subsidiary of multinational firm, which serves to facilitate a redundancy program. The power was exercised by the company remotely by individualizing the workplace, thus breaking collective resistance.

5.2　Carmona, Ezzamel & Gutierrez's (2002) study of a tobacco factory

This study describes a tobacco factory that made changes in location and accounting system during the eighteenth century. The factory moved the tobacco production from central Seville to a new location outside the city. The authors mainly focus on the analysis of the snuff production because it was the most obvious difference that the authors found between the old factory and the new factory. From a Foucauldian perspective, the principle of enclosure and how enclosure enables surveillance is the feature of this published case study. By employing Foucault's disciplinary concepts, the study also examines the relationship

between the enclosures and the creation of visibilities in this firm. The accounting system produced the calculable enclosures and created accountable subjects.

There was no formal and detailed accounting practice in the old factory. Thus, there were many problems related to internal control. A scattering of operational buildings made the factory production problematic, also the operational processes lacked a sound accounting system which led to many problems. In terms of Snuff production, there were no clearly differentiated stages, and this resulted in a poor control practices. The accounting system just focused on cash flow movements, and produces reports. There were no partitioned enclosures or cost centers in the old factory, thus, the operation of the snuff factory was seen as one accounting entity. Due to these facts, apparently, it was easy for the staff in the old factory to escape detailed surveillance. Staff in the old factory could not be evaluated based on their specific times and enclosure. That is to say there was no detailed accountability in terms of the productive function in the old factory.

A new factory was constructed and enclosure became possible so that each individual had a specific enclosure and timetable. Foucault (1977) states that the clear division of space can reveal the presence and absence of the workers, and that supervision and control will be enhanced. The space demarcation is promoted by different forms, which are enclosure, partitioning, and rank (Deleuze, 2006). In the snuff factory, a better scope for accounting coding was developed. The accounting practice functioned now in different ways. The performance of staff could be reported and compared; and different activities could be quantified in different cost centers. Detailed information was found in the files of staff including clear names, spatial locations (i.e. enclosure), wages, and their performance. Furthermore, the authors found that the products were classified into good and re-works categories; illustrating accounting coding has the accountability and disciplinary implications. The enclosures became visible and staff became accountable. From a Foucauldian point of view, the staff could be systematized, differentiated and hierarchized (Carmona et al., 2002). It is the accounting techniques which act like a time-space ordering instrument that make it possible to offer the scope for management, and for the surveillance of staff to be enhanced by spatial practice (Sargiacomo, 2008).

Foucault (1977) argues that the reorganization of spatial practice provides a framework through which power relations are exercised. Thus, it could be seen that space may enhance

the power/knowledge of managers (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011). The authors found that several power relations were intertwined for the new factory reconstruction. The motivation of Tobacco Agency was an eagerness to increase the tobacco revenue and Crown's power, and every role in the reorganization involves his/her specific expert knowledge such as those of the architects, and the administrators of Royal Tobacco Factor. New forms of power relations were constituted through enclosure, partitioning and accounting coding practice. The perception of total control and domination were formed through the demarcation of space. To cite Foucault's idea, in Panopticon, discipline could be put in the staff by the supervisor who can watch the staff without being seen. The authors state that the domination of power was strengthened by the wide and detailed mapping of accounting practices on enclosures. These independent accounting centers could be evaluated, and then the Royal Tobacco Factory could get an integrated picture of the whole company (Carmona et al., 2002).

Overall, a lot of studies (Miller et al., 1991; Miller & O'Leary, 1987) have conducted a spatial practice analysis and employed the principle of the disciplinary power and Panopticon. However, as in this case, the resisting subject tends to be neglected (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011). Admittedly, a vivid picture regarding to the spatial practice in the factory and the strengthening of the employee surveillance and overall discipline is revealed. Moreover, Carmona et al. (2002) indicate the potential for resistance by stating that "the human agency may try to convert what is in principle a space amendable to calculation into one that is forbidden and denied to the accounting eye" (p. 244). However, the resisting practices of staff in response to the surveillance and control from the spatial practice are not examined by this study. The limitations of the case study are described by the authors: "we paint a picture of insidious, austere and potent domination of shop-floor employees, without exploring their strategies for resistance" (Carmona et al., 2002, p. 273). The authors admits that due to the limited archival source available for them, further research about the resistance practice of workers in the work places needs to be conducted.

5.3   Macintosh's (2002) study of Hawthorne Works

The Hawthorne Works was a big factory built by Western Electric; the factory started operations in 1905 and stopped operating in 1983. Some 45,000 employees were working

its operations. The factory produced various products such as telephone equipment, refrigerators and electric fans. The National Research Council (Macintosh, 2002) started a series of experiments at Hawthorne Plant in 1924; the aim of the experiments in the beginning was to find out "does better lighting facilitate worker productivity"? Many experiments were conducted in that plant, however, these results were confounding and inconclusive. These experiments include illumination, rest, wages, length of workday, food, humidity, and temperature on labour performance (List & Levitt, 2011).

Macintosh (2002) made the conclusion that staff productivity is increased whenever any variable are adjusted. The "Hawthorne Effect" is used to describe the fact that the observation alone is enough to motivate changes in behavior (Jones, 1992). More specifically, staff productivity increased at the Hawthorne plant due to staff being under constant observation from their employer (Jones, 1992). In the social science literature, these experiments were conducted in the Hawthorne Works and the insights gained from these experiments are identified as influential research. It contributes to developments in the field of industrial psychology and it still makes an influence on the experimental research design today. From a Foucauldian perspective, these experiments also can reflect the principle of the disciplinary power.

The first experiment took place in the relay assembly test room. From a Foucauldian perspective, the principles of surveillance, discipline, and punishment can be vividly applied to the relay assembly test room. The assemblers in this test room are all female. They were working in a separate experimental room and doing their regular jobs. There was an automatic record of production, also, an observer in the room made detailed record about every behavior. After the earlier experiment on illumination; the researchers then conduct a fatigue experiment. The researchers found that many other important factors influence the productivity of staff such as absence of close supervision, the extent of freedom, more outside social contacts between the staff (Macintosh, 2002).

It was noticeable that there was increased confidence in the supervisors. The supervisor was regarded as friendly representative of management rather than a person who was gazing the employee. The assemblers' task was highly repetitive (Macintosh, 2002). Thus, the assemblers and the layout operator were confined to their enclosure in the relay assembly test room. In this enclosure, they were sheltered in a monotonous disciplinary regime. Each

individual did her job in their useful space. Thus, it can be seen that Foucauldian enclosure principle was effectively utilized in the relay assembly room.

Foucault's concept of efficient body can also be seen in the relay assemble room. Macintosh (2002) described that a device was used to record the output of each assembler. The time spent on each relay was paid close attention to by the control system. Moreover, the academic observer made detailed records about every behavior of the staff. At the same time, the layout operator recorded for each assembler the type of relay, the number completed, the time to complete 50 relays, and the time for breaks and repairs (Macintosh, 2002). It can be seen that the staff were under constant surveillance and examinations.

The hierarchical surveillance went from manager to the operators. The relay assembly test room was under the general surveillance of a foreman; his main responsibility was outside the test room. The assembly workers were under the constant surveillance of the academic test room observer. The foreman did not need to be in the assembly room all the time, however, he was responsible for the production rate. Based on the accounting information and the record from the academic test room observer, a system of sanctions was used throughout the experiment. These sanctions included rewards and punishments, such as changes in hours of the working week, rest periods, free lunches, wage payment schemes and so forth. Moreover, there was constant examination of the surveillance. Macintosh (2002) described how the bogey system was used to evaluate the performance of the assembly staff and the operators, so that, a level of performance which could be sustained by a skilled and efficient operator was set by this target bogey (Macintosh, 2002).

All staff performance was recorded on a daily base; staff's performance was evaluated once a week and the results compared with the targets adopted. Thus, the irregular performance could be detected, and exceptional performance identified. The test room was an ideal Panopticon. The room looked like a small theatre; every labour operation was put under constantly surveillance. The investigator, the foreman, and all kinds of supervisors made the operators feel their constant surveillance, and examination. That is to say they were subjected to normalizing judgment based on their output (Macintosh, 2002). The supervisors exercised the sanctions and then they observed the effects closely. The operators became self-policing under constant surveillance.

The Hawthorne effect is that workers at the Hawthorne plant became more efficient when being observed because of the attention from their employer (Jones, 1992). It could be seen that the relay assemble room became an efficient and effective laboratory of a power/knowledge regime. Supervisors have the knowledge of each individual allowing them to exercise disciplinary power, by making constant surveillance, and normalizing sanctions applicable.

One issue arising from the surveillance is that two girls in the assembly room could not stop talking, and were removed from the assembly room in the middle of the experiment. After that, two other girls replaced them and the experiment was conducted satisfactorily. This phenomenon suggests that not every subject can be made self-policing, and resistance did exist in the relay assemble room. Also, the Macintosh (2002) admits that there are other factors that can have effects on the behavior of the assembly staff, such as the take-home pay, group cohesiveness, and the positive attitude to the group incentive scheme.

5.4   Hopper & Macintosh's (1993) study of ITT

In this study, Foucault's concept of disciplinary power is used to analyze the management of International Telephone and Telegraph (ITT) which was a large international firm. The case study argues that Foucault's model can be reflected in the internal control of ITT, especially during the period in which Harold Geneen was the CEO. Hopper and Macintosh (1993) state that the managers and staff of the ITT were constituted as subjects to be docile, efficient bodies through the means of the accounting system. This case shows how management accounting helps to produce enclosures and constant surveillance from a hierarchical center to serve the power/knowledge of the CEO - Harold Geneen.

Hopper and Macintosh (1993) illustrate that self-contained places of confinement within ITT were created by the management control system. The firm was partitioned into different responsibility centers. This case described the company's line operations that included approximately 400,000 staff who were enclosed in 250 responsibility centers (Hopper & Macintosh, 1993). Each manager was responsible and accountable for each enclosure. The authors state that each manager was in an "accounting prison". Management control systems in this company functioned as "walls" which defined managers and staff within particular regulations and rules, calculations and responsibilities. An analytical and

useful enclosure was created by accounting numbers which made all the activities within the enclosure visible and calculable (Hopper & Macintosh, 1998).

The efficient body principle can be reflected by the CEO's financial control system at ITT. For example, the authors described that each profit center manager and the head of division needed to submit their annual budget, business plans regularly to the center, and then these plans and budgets needed to be reviewed and finalized by the CEO. After that, this finalized budget became the benchmark for performance in the coming year. Moreover, the core of the management control system is that each manager from each different responsibility center needed to submit monthly operating reports, which the CEO would personally scrutinize and review. Thus, it can be seen that the management control system in ITT provided the methods for training managers and workers in correct operations. The CEO and his management control system conveyed the signals and standards to require prescribed behavior from managers and staff so that they became efficient bodies.

The CEO's management accounting and control system provided hierarchical surveillance, normalizing sanctions and examination (Macintosh, 2002). The aim of the internal control system was to accumulate all types of information, and then normalize the objects of the "gaze" (Martinez, 2011). The accounting system generated the normalizing gaze from the central office into every profit center throughout the firm; every corner of ITT would be under constant surveillance. Any information about the managers and their performance would be sent back to the Centre through the accounting information system. Managers never knew whether the CEO or any other headquarters' staff were gazing on them at any particular moment through the accounting numbers. Overall, the gaze from the CEO was inserted into every staff level in the hierarchical firm by using management control systems, the managers became self-policing within the accounting system by creating within their minds a concept of what an effective manager entailed.

Furthermore, this study shows the points of resistance from managers and clerks. For example, Hopper and Macintosh (1993) described that a series of Federal investigation into ITT were partly due to the internal leaks from ITT. The CEO's demise was significantly attributable to the resultant political pressures. It can be seen that it is impossible for the CEO to completely control all managers and staff. Moreover, staff resistance played a significant role in the determination of ITT's fate (Hopper & Macintosh, 1993).

The contribution of this study is in the concept outlined by the CEO that numbers make you free. In other words, for managers it is the numbers that matter. But in order to control staff, the CEO employed a discourse both sayable and unsayable. With regards to the latter, the CEO observes that: "the look on a man's face, his tone of voice, his body language made a difference in the decisions I was making" (Hopper & Macintosh, 1993, p. 207). With regard to sayable discourse, "some former employees complain that the big meetings reek of Kafkaesque courts, and of volleys of verbal invective fired at underachievers. Many of us have frankly left the organization for having been spit upon publicly (Hopper & Macintosh, 1993).

With regard to meetings in general, (similar to managerial parades in China) a manager describes the meetings: "the ordeal can be terrifying: there are stories of one man fainting as he walked in, and another rushing out to get blind drunk for two days. For the hardened ITT man it is no more than a routine test of character; "You have to be prepared" said one of them, to have your balls screwed off in public and then joke afterwards as if nothing had happened" (Hopper & Macintosh, 1993, p. 209). The sayable and unsayable discourse as an important component of control and accountability is exemplified in this case study, and is relevant to this thesis.

5.5   Knights & Collinson's (1987) study of US multinational firm

This case was conducted in Slavs, one division of a motor vehicle manufacturing multinational company. This Knights and Collinson (1987) describe the technologies of psychological and financial accounting managerial power and their disciplinary effects; these two different powers were illustrated on the shop floor by manual workers. The main finding of this case is that staff became more suspicious and resistant as management tried to communicate with the shop floor. By contrast, no one challenged the exercise financial accounting power: the redundancy audit presented by the accounting department went unchallenged, and workers accepted the proposed redundancy program.

The case shows that the disciplinary power of accounting is an effective tool especially within management-staff relations (Knights & Collinson, 1987). The authors argue that an 'individualization effect of management policy' was created, enabling financial power to be exercised remotely (Knights & Collinson, 1987, p. 460). It can be seen that financial

justifications had more power over the collective reactions of the shop floor staff. Staff become indifferent due to the power of the accounting discipline, thus, it was impossible for them to collectively resist. They were individualized because of the power-knowledge provided by the accounting practices. Although the practice of surveillance and normalization is embedded into every corner of the organization, the most important factor is that the labor force in this factory was individualized which impaired any possibility for resistance to be collectively mobilized (Knights & Collinson, 1987). Such disciplinary power became much more rigorous, as when accounting techniques divided the work force by, power, class and gender differentiations; such divisions disadvantaged an organized, collective resistance by a process of individualization.

It can be seen accounting practice has significant power to manage and control the company and by being perceived as "objective" obtain for management the results they wanted. The study considered staff' resistance in responding to a redundancy program and found that they were dependent on and finally influenced by accounting figures and calculations. It demonstrates how accounting knowledge by individualizing workers can effect discipline and undermine the threat of collective resistance.

5.6   Conclusion from landmark case studies

The thesis examines accounting knowledge and power within the modern organizations from a Foucauldian perspective. Four case studies were summarized for understanding how management control and accounting system can be mobilized for disciplinary purposes in modern organizations. The thesis rejects the concept that accounting's rules and language achieves value-free and the scientific neutrality. It is argued that Foucault's work informs and advances accounting research by motivating a different angle with which the academic world may explore accounting practices (Stewart, 1992).

The principle that accounting is a mechanism for the exercise of disciplinary power is an alternative angle for study. This thesis shows how the concepts of accounting such as key performance indicators are stretched to cover not only the productive function but also the symbolic functions of labor. Arguably, little research has been focused on how accounting concepts have become useful to measure and control these symbolic functions.

Admittedly, Foucauldian theory does not provide the tools to understand the details of the internal control and accountability in organizations. Moreover, his work does not consider all the factors, which contribute to the formation of the internal control and accounting system in organizations. It may also be argued that some features of organizational practices are not subject to Foucault (1977)'s disciplinary theory. However, Foucault (1977)'s theories are not without empirical foundation as many field studies (McKernan & Kosmala, 2011; McKinlay et al., 2010; McKinlay & Starkey, 1998; Sargiacomo, 2009) and the landmark cases cited have revealed. His use of Panopticon provides a powerful metaphor for understanding the general nature of modern management control. It provides an appropriate theoretical framing for analyzing the ways in which accounting techniques devise controls to reach desired managerial outcomes. Today's management accounting and control systems can reflect the principles of surveillance, discipline, and examination in many aspects. Especially, in recent decades, accounting's power has been further strengthened with great advances that have happened in telecommunications and information processing. Overall, (Foucault, 1972, 1977, 1979, 1980)'s writings provide insights for understanding accounting practice.

CHAPTER 6: Observations in Hotel Industry

6.1   Introduction

This chapter sets out to show how the productive and symbolic functions of staff are employed in a Chinese hotel by adapting techniques of internal control borrowed from the accounting principles of recognition, measurement and disclosure (Miller & O'Leary, 1987). Recognition involves managerial discretion as to what elements of internal control to apply to improve the productive or symbolic function of staff. Once recognized as effective some methods of measurement are useful to allow managers to reward or punish according to the performance achieved. Finally, what is recognized and measured must be disclosed by managers to individual staff; either by way of constant or periodic review. It is how hotel managers have been observed to recognize, measure and disclose the functions of staff that is at the heart of this section. The "how" techniques of internal control are considered under the sub-headings of surveillance, enclosure, discourse and efficient body. More generally, the generic question is: how is power exercised.

6.2   Techniques of internal control- the empirical observations

Knights and Collinson (1987) stress that accounting's negative influence on the labour force could be controlled and managed, because the accounting disciplinary power was "inscribed in disciplinary mechanisms of hierarchical surveillance, enclosure and the discourse" (Foucault, 1977, p. 170). The maintenance of discipline in hotels is by using techniques of surveillance, enclosure, discourse, and the making of an efficient body is disciplined to achieve key performance indicators (KPIs). Such KPIs enable the audit functions of examination and inspection by managers. The techniques of surveillance, enclosure, discourse, and the making of an efficient body in hotels may vary among cultures in their impact and intensity (Gelfand et al., 2004; Hofstede, 1986). The importance of KPIs is underlined by Harrington (1994) who comments: "If you cannot measure something, you cannot understand it. If you cannot understand it, you cannot control it. If you cannot control it, you cannot improve it" (Harrington, 1994, p. 146).

Thus, what is measured tends to get their attention among so many competing demands. It is well known that staff will do what management inspects (measures), not necessarily what management expects (Spitzer, 2007). Generally speaking, staff in the hotel industry tend to do what it takes to obtain rewards or to avoid punishments.

6.2.1 Surveillance

From Foucault's (1980) point of view, power/knowledge comes through observing others. Giddens (1985) considers that there is no need to accept the whole sweep of Foucault's arguments to acknowledge that disciplinary power becomes associated with a range of organisations involving new modes of regularising activities in time and space. Disciplinary power as described by Foucault (1977) depends primarily upon surveillance in the sense of information keeping, especially in the form of personal life-histories held by administrative authorities. But such individualisation also involves surveillance in the sense of direct supervision.

Power/ Knowledge and accountability are made possible by recording (Foucault, 1980). This is from my experience in China, video surveillance is ubiquitous in hotel lobbies, and generally, the whole hotel tends to be under surveillance. This method of internal control improves the outputs and outcomes in terms of both the productive and the symbolic functions.

Deploying video cameras for 24 hour monitoring of staff and guests is now standard procedure (Wines, 2010). Surveillance cameras have improved so greatly that some can even take clear pictures of people inside automobile (Wines, 2010). This study found that camera surveillance monitors the workload of all staff, such as staff in kitchens, receptionists to ensure they are working in their shift time rather than playing or doing nothing. It is easy to inspect staff in their appropriate uniforms, enclosed spaces and observe their attitudes to customers.

However, surveillance would not lead to suitable behaviour without individuals disciplining themselves (Foucault, 1979). Nonetheless, observers can monitor the behaviours they see exhibited. Foucault (1977) states that every person who is subject to disciplinary power and controls is "seen without ever being seen" (p.202). Hence, the knowledge of being seen

produces power in the hotel environment. At the same time, the power and knowledge enhance each other. The lasting effect of being monitored makes staff wary and they discipline their own behaviours as they do not know whether they are observed or not.

The two hotels in this study are workplaces that can be designed for efficient observation and examination of staff. Most of the departments in the hotels are in open areas, such as reception, restaurant etc. Therefore, the workplace is made transparent as there are no walls or bars. Staff's every move is visible by others in that workplace, so that the staff never know when they are being observed. In this way, a few supervisors can maintain surveillance over many receptionists, or waitresses. In fact, observation is usually seen as a tool of surveillance. For front line staff in a hotel, they are always able to be seen as working or not working. They become disciplined individuals (Foucault, 1979).

This study found that there are no cameras in some areas, for example, hotel guest rooms are not monitored by cameras, so there is a risk that housekeeping staff may rest in empty rooms or even enjoy a cigarette, but such resistance is limited by the application of other means of control. In the two hotels, departmental managers keep records on the staff's performance; and supervisors carry out spot checks and measure the time taken to clean rooms. As well as maintaining high cleaning standards in the rooms, the housemaids are expected to clean the rooms in a timely fashion. They are expected to clean a set number of allocated rooms per hour. Failure to achieve the standard number of rooms per hour according to the performance indicator applied will subject the housemaid responsible to further examination and review. This can be seen as measuring the productive function by keeping records and surveillance without cameras.

However, even the best forms of surveillance can be defeated or met with resistance from staff. One incident in my journal records how a guest on a non-smoking floor complained that her room smelled of smoke. The supervisor of the floor sprayed the room with air freshener and thought no more about the complaint. A few days later, another customer on the same floor made the same complaint. The air freshener was again applied and the supervisor reported the two incidents to the departmental manager. Because the cameras carried a record for only 24 hours before rewinding the tape, it was necessary to keep a keen watch on the camera watching that corridor. The result was that one of the male kitchen staff was seem to follow the housemaid into the room she was cleaning and shut the

door. When confronted by the hotel manager, the couple admitted smoking in a guest room during working hours. They were both dismissed. The supervisor was also reprimanded for not keeping a better watch of the staff under her charge. Although it was revealed that the housemaid in question was a very efficient cleaner and was able to complete her quota of rooms, even when indulging in an unauthorised smoking break. The identification of staff breaking the hotel rules was made easier (the reusable camera tape presented grainy pictures) by the fact that the male kitchen worker wore his white uniform - effectively being enclosed everywhere he went. If the male worker had worn a hat and a coat over his uniform, identification would have been difficult as many guests enter rooms where staff are working.

The quantifiable "output", of room cleaning is also easily monitored for performance. Supervisors may examine the rooms that have been cleaned, going into such detail as holding glasses up to the light to look for spots, or running a finger along the window-doorsills checking for dust. Supervisors may be inconsistent about this task because the amount of time they have to inspect rooms varies daily. However, as Sherman (2007) found that room cleaners do not know which rooms will be checked, and clear standards make measurement of performance very simple.

In addition, the housemaids at both hotels must leave the door open when cleaning a room, and closing the door is not permitted. Monitoring facilitates the productive function, and is a means of control (Foucault, 1979). When a guest walks pass a room being cleaned, the efficient work of the housemaids can be seen by them. Thus, housemaids are subject to constant surveillance in different ways. Supervisors may also patrol the floors and corridors peering into the open doors where staff should be busy cleaning. When the rooms are cleaned, they are then inspected by the supervisors. Deficiencies will be noted and the cleaners responsible for the deficiencies are then subject to further examination and possibly performance review.

The open door also represents a symbolic function. When a guest walks pass a room being cleaned, the efficient work of the housemaids can be seen by them, and one of the functions of having housemaids in uniform is so that guests may recognize and appreciate their activity. Moreover, cleaning staff are trained to greet passing guests by saying "ni hao"

[Hello] and in both hotels to bow. Such greetings have a symbolic function rather than productive function but they are important in building good impressions of both hotels.

With regard to the symbolic function performed by the housemaids, apart from having to greet all guests they encounter, they must also look tidy in the identical and their overall appearance must be neat and identical. To ensure uniformity each day they are subject to inspection by their supervisors before they go on duty. Thus, the army of neat, tidy and uniform housemaids who perform the menial cleaning tasks in the two hotels also perform a symbolic function by promoting the hotel as being efficient and disciplined.

Foucault (1980) in his analysis as to how power operates explains the techniques of bodily control: such as insisting on junior staff bowing to managers or guests. In my experience, many Chinese restaurants and hotels train junior female staff to bow as a symbolic function displaying the hotel's hospitality and willingness to meet the guests' wishes. Such activities as bowing become so engrained as to be a natural behavioural reaction. In other words, surveillance focuses on both the "body" and the "soul" (Foucault, 1980). Bowing and greeting are important to create a sense of dignity and warmth in guests.

As the symbolic function becomes more important, the two luxury Chinese hotels pay more to employ foreign staff to create an international environment. By doing so, a foreign guest can talk to them in their native language in a strange country, thereby making them feel the hotel is as a home away from home (Lashley, 2001). For example, Novotel's French restaurant in Beijing stations a trainee manager from France at the entrance to greet its many French customers in French to convey feelings of warmth and trust, warmth such as Vetter, Heiss, McFadden, and Winter (2013) describes in their study.

To ensure work has been done and that appropriate individual behaviour is maintained, the two hotels employ a checklist of specific details. For example, the obligations on staff, that is, what they should do, and what they should not do apply to each staff member. If staff break the rules, there are a number of punishments that would be implemented for them. They may be forbidden to drink, smoke, or leave work without permission. Therefore, every staff member in the hotel industry must conform to the organisation's rules and regulations, contributing both a productive function and a symbolic function. They need to work such hours as may be required. In addition, the front line staff, such as housekeepers,

and receptionists, are under constant surveillance by a higher level of supervisors. Disciplinary techniques are designed for "self-regulation" rather than on the direct physical control. Therefore, the emphasis has shifted from the "body" to the "soul" (McKinlay & Starkey, 1998).

The emphasis of surveillance is to achieve "self-regulation" to the extent of creating confessional situations (McKinlay & Starkey, 1998). Such self-regulation creates a professional identity, which "does not liberate man in his own being; it compels him to face the task of producing himself" (Foucault, 1986, p. 42). All forms of surveillance exist in the Chinese hotels in this study, including direct surveillance and indirect surveillance through accounting records and by performance indicators. By such means, the construction of new forms of inspection and control can be implemented to monitor the efficiency of staff.

Individual staff are also "self-monitoring" and this is necessary to gain promotion. Foucault (1986) elaborates, that the power of writing was constituted as an essential part in the mechanisms of power. He might just have said the power of accounting. What arises from Foucault is the sense that the single person, and more specifically, the deviant, is less successful in keeping personal details hidden from those in control as time progresses. Surveillance works constantly to discover all pertinent information concerning the individual and by documenting the findings, provides longitudinal knowledge readily available for those who have access to it.

A hotel is a workplace that can be designed for the efficient observation and examination of staff. Most of the departments in the two hotels are in open areas, such as reception, restaurant. Therefore, the special workplace is made transparent as there are no walls or bars. Staff's every move is visible by others in that workplace. So the staff never know when they are being observed. Front line staff in a hotel are always able to be seen as working or not working. They become disciplined individuals (Foucault, 1979).

Surveillance must be continuously perpetuated because a lapse in surveillance could mean that an incompetent staff member fault might not be discovered. Foucault (1979) elaborates, "The slightest incompetence, if left unnoticed and therefore repeated each day, may prove fatal to the enterprise to the extent of destroying it in a very short time…" (Foucault, 1979,

p. 71). This dependency on surveillance is further exemplified by the chain of surveillance. For example, even the supervisors are supervised.

In the two hotels, virtually all staff activities can be checked to make sure they are performing their duties correctly. Of course, not every action of hotel staff is actually monitored but there is always that possibility, and it is that sense of being watched that motivates staff to act as if they were being watched. For departmental managers in the two hotels, the aim is to internalize the fear of potential negative consequences into the souls of their staff. Thus, eventually there is no actual need for surveillance since all staff act as if they are always being watched.

Therefore, as Fuller and Smith (1991) observe the actions of individuals can be controlled in time and space through the mechanisms of surveillance. A good system of surveillance means that it helps junior and middle managers to monitor staff effectively and efficiently. Staff under surveillance can discipline themselves, bad behaviours, such as to "cheat" on quality standards, can be reduced through surveillance by junior and middle managers. In the two hotels in China, rewards and punishments are very easy to employ as it is my observation that there is a plentiful supply of labour.

6.2.2 Enclosure

Macintosh (2002) indicates that subjects will become more approachable to intervention due to the fact that they are confined in a relatively permanent disciplinary space. These spaces can be used to analyse the performance of individuals and precisely locate individuals, uncover individuals' presence or absence, build up the communications with and among these people who are under controlled, and furthermore, enclosure will contribute to the supervision and evaluation of staff's performance. It can be seen that enclosure produces the possibility for the functional sites to enforce the rules; every functional site is defined in terms of the specific and regular function to be performed.

The two Chinese hotels in this study are labour intensive, and many of the front line staff are female. Females also represent the bulk of the junior staff being employed as maids, waitresses, and receptionists, while most of the managers are male. In their hospitality roles, junior staff are objectified to conform to disciplinary models. Techniques, such as

enclosure by work space, uniforms and surveillance further enhance objectification by management, and these techniques have become methods of subjectification. Typical of this process is the morning parade of receptionists at both hotels where a ritual of who may speak and who remains silent is played out. The ritual always follows the same pattern of subjectification. For front line staff, it begins at 8:00am with the uniformed receptionists lining up in readiness for the manager's inspection.

The manager stands in front of the uniformed receptionists, whose identical uniforms and hair styles are ordered to fulfil their productive and symbolic function and by way of subjectification produce, what Foucault calls, efficient docile bodies. Throughout the normal morning parade of receptionists, they stand like soldiers, and are not allowed to move around or adopt different postures. Compared to them, managers with greater power and authority possess a distinct lack of enclosure.

Staff, as docile bodies are subjugated by the detailed disciplinary parades. All of the receptionists and waitresses have the obligation to be uniformed, to be smiling, and without coloured nails. Managers inspect their appearance every morning during the parade to ensure staff behave in an expected way. However, some managers have different expectations of staff behaviour. The staff are objectified by different managers in different ways. On the surface, managers treat all staff the same, but in practice, some staff are preferred by managers.

Hopper and Macintosh (1993) maintains that the management accounting reports and practices contribute to the cellular nature of these subsidiaries, which define each partition in terms of its use, serial relationships, and hierarchical ranking. In the two Chinese hotels, there are some rewards and punishments given out during morning parade. The staff who get rewards are normally the females, who are seen as being the most welcoming to guests. Females are objectified by appearance and the more attractive have more opportunities to be rewarded or to be set up as examples. Thus, the ability to convey warmth is viewed as an essential quality and represents performance in terms of the symbolic function.

At the morning parade, staff may be punished due to minor acts of resistance such as poor time keeping, talking, going slow, or by conveying to guests the wrong sense of their symbolic function. Normally, such rewards and punishments are specified within a narrow

range. At this time, managers determine who will be rewarded and who will be punished. Being criticised can mean lost job opportunities, fines, or in some situations being dismissed. It is my observation that young female staff are at risk of dismissal as the supply of hotel labour for the two Chinese hotels is exceeds demand. Therefore, to avoid critical attention, most of the staff choose to stand in the middle of the parade hoping to be part of the "herd" and be passed over. By being as inconspicuous as possible staff may avoid the verbal rewards and punishments. So junior staff act carefully in the morning parade, and avoid speech and eye contact. As in the ITT case study Hopper and Macintosh (1993), such parades and meetings are an opportunity for invective. My journal records show that managers often behaved in a manner similar to that outlined in the ITT study. In particular, staff who were considered to be failing their symbolic function were subjected to public verbal criticism. However, unlike the ITT case, female staff in China tended not to exhibit "sang-froid" that the managers at ITT were at pains to demonstrate, but were inclined to dissolve into tears. Chinese managers at the two hotels were not always objective in their criticisms and often targeted particular members of staff for criticism. With the result that those staff subjected to this kind of regular verbal invective subsequently resigned of their own volition. What may be regarded as constructive dismissal does not, in my experience, apply in China. In this way, discourse can be used by managers as a tool of control.

In China, the two hotels are government owned or part owned. The managers are assigned by government and normally have the authority to deal with any situation in a hotel. So they talk confidently at the morning parades as they are the people who hold the most power and can resolve any situation. For example, managers determine the most essential things for staff, such as salary. No staff member wants to offend them. So those with the least authority in a hotel, always speak in a soft voice and adopt a humble posture. In other words, staff act docile and show their subjugation particularly during morning parades. For managers, their aim is make staff perform their productive and symbolic functions and to do that they must train their bodies to be efficient and docile.

In the two hotels in China, most of the front line staff, such as receptionists, and waitresses, work in an open area where cameras operate to observe staff. From their offices, managers can watch screens to observe staff in all working enclosures. As a result, staff performance can be assessed. Managers may exercise power by sitting in their office to inspect their

staff's performance. There are many ways to manage staff to be productive. The symbolic practices, such as those exhibited by language, dress and posture get more attention in a hotel as staff working at the front line are required to make customers feel respected, and warm; so as to engender customer loyalty and trust (Vetter et al., 2013).

Front line staff in the two hotels are expected to appear smiling, courteous, and display humility. In particular, receptionists who are supposed to be attractive and cheerful. In addition, there are disciplinary controls. For example, receptionists are expected to wear a professional uniform, which shows and shapes them to the hotel ethic. In the two hotels, dress represents an expression of discipline. Uniforms are designed to give a "smart, professional" look. Uniforms also act as a means of suppressing individuality and are a form of enclosure. By their distinctive uniforms staff are identified as belonging to a certain work area within the hotel. Dress and stylised appearance serve to make sure they play their role and fulfil their responsibilities (Freeman, 1993).

In conclusion, dress becomes a form of discipline and enclosure by which the hotel can insist upon a certain look, designed to enhance their symbolic function and by which staff are identified. However, many women willingly consent to the discipline, claiming it as part of their own cultural identity and individual expression (Freeman, 1993). It is as Foucault (1980) observes a feature of the exercise of power that those individuals who as objects of power may find such an exercise a positive experience.

6.2.3 Discourse

Entwhistle (2000) suggests that Foucault has very little to say about fashion, but his work can be utilised to think about how discourses on dress discipline and instil meaning on the body. But we can see from his theories how and why people may dress differently and resist being seen as "normal" in their appearance. It is also important in understanding the ways in which dress can reproduce gendered discourse on the body.

The concept of discourse promotes individual accountability and is a mechanism for controlling people within organisations. Discourse involves what can be said and what cannot be said in the hotel industry; discourse may also not necessarily be spoken, and can refer to physical actions and how a person is portrayed. Moreover, discourses are a means

of control, where the staff are subjected to their managers sometimes arbitrary discretionary power (Andrew, 2007).

In the two Chinese hotels, morning parades are held every day, and managers arrange tasks for departmental managers. After that, departmental managers distribute tasks to a parade of front line staff. During the parade, managers have authority to speak loudly regardless of the responses of staff, who must remain quiet. In some situations, they may be assigned different jobs, which might be unfair to them. However, they will keep silent. Some of the staff may be new, and do not have much experience of some positions. But they are expected to carry out unfair tasks intelligently and willingly. So most of the staff have no role in the morning parade other than that of listening and are reluctant to question their allocated duties, whether unfair or unfamiliar.

However, some of the staff are encouraged to speak. Managers often have favourites among the staff who are aware of their preference. Such favoured staff enjoy a warmer environment rather than rejection and sanction. However, many female staff might think that it would be inappropriate to challenge the authority of managers. They may be worried about losing their job once they speak with their own voice. Therefore, to avoid losing face in front of managers, most of the staff will keep silent in morning parades, and shun resistance. Thus, who may speak and who may not speak, what is said and is unsaid are features of the discipline of discourse.

Using the photos depicted in this thesis, the research explains how observations of what-is-not-said shape behaviour for each individual, their degree of authority expressed, the degree of discipline imposed and the level of accountability. It is not only the case of being "You are what you wear" but also demeanour towards others and deportment in terms of how a person carries themselves in the course of their duties. From the photos of the waitress (Figure 6.1), the concierge (Figure 6.2), the receptionist (Figure 6.3), and the housekeeper (Figure 6.4), and the manager observations of the unsaid in terms of dress, demeanour and deportment are analysed. The analysis includes the signs of obedience and differentiation and shows how subjection and objectification is achieved.

The waitress (Figure 6.1) pictured below wears a uniform that does not fit well to her figure. She knows this and is unhappy about her uniform and how she is perceived by her manager.

The problem is the uniform fits better on more shapely waitresses who attract more attention and approval from guests. Because she is unhappy and looks sad she undermines her own authority as a waitress. The manager too, is observed to be unhappy with her and she is often a target at morning parades and is constantly urged to look more pleasant and efficient. The uniform gives her a role for which her figure and looks subtract authority. As she earns less compliments from guests, and among the waitresses she is look down upon by her colleagues. As a consequence, the manager talks more roughly to her and gives her the least pleasant jobs and shifts. Her demeanour and appearance conspire in an unspoken way to colour the perceptions of her colleagues, manager and guests. In Foucauldian terms, power is exercised upon her and exceptionally she does enjoy subjugation by more powerful others. She is at once objectified by her uniform and subjugated by the perception of others.

Figure 6.1: The Waitress

By contrast, the uniformed concierge (Figure 6.2) enjoys his uniform and his role. His military style uniform confers power and authority and gives him a soldierly uprightness. His confidence earns him the respect of his manager. But such a conspicuous uniform effectively encloses him into his concierge location and provides the marks of differentiation to ascribe his value. His air of authority makes him a popular source of local knowledge for guests unfamiliar with the city. He has acquired the ability to anticipate guest inquiries as he claims most guests want to know the same things: directions, schedules, place of interest and places of entertainment. He even claims to throw in his own recommendations to guests as to the best places to visit. His success is due to his uniform and military deportment. In this way, he becomes objectified while subjected at the same time by being enclosed by his uniform to performing a certain role.

Figure 6.2: The Concierge

The receptionist (Figure 6.3) is pretty and is of humble demeanour. Such demeanour pleases the manager and is a feature of both receptionists as the manager takes a great interest in the reception staff. All the receptionists are selected by the manager for their looks. The manager pays attention to the receptionists and inspects them every morning. The receptionist pictured is his acknowledged favourite and she reveals a cheerful but humble demeanour. Such a demeanour pleases the manager as it is good for guests to be greeted by cheerful, pretty girls who are respectful. The morning parades objectify the girls as a row of uniformed, robot-like docile bodies. But the parade is also used by the manager to distribute rewards and punishments, so that at the same the receptionists are subjugated into obedience. Their uniform encloses them to the reception area as they would be conspicuous in other parts of the hotel. Being the manager's favourite allows this receptionist more authority and small privileges which the others resent. She has acquired these power concessions by her demeanour and deportment and by subjecting herself to the disciplinary techniques to become the desired docile body.

Figure 6.3: The Receptionist

Rewards for frontline staff may involve lighter duties or a better choice of shifts or even a pay rise but all of these are uncommon or reserved for specially favoured staff. Praise at morning parades is not unusual if a staff member is complimented by a satisfied guest. One such guest, a woman of Chinese origin who had lived all her life in the West and spoke no Mandarin, commented to the manager that, "Everyone seems so happy in this hotel and they are always smiling." The receptionists over-hearing these comments laughed because they considered the woman to be a fool to be so deceived by their enforced smiles and seeming warmth. In fact, in this particular hotel, staff were far from happy even though they managed the requisite smiles, as their manager was very authoritarian and used "shame" as an effective method of control. His technique often involved taking staff away from their "enclosed" position. Receptionists caught chatting, not looking busy and efficient, or sufficiently obsequious and smiling would be told to clean the Lobby toilets. This is not their job but protest could result in dismissal. The humiliation came from carrying a bucket and brush across the Lobby, entering the toilets and cleaning each cubicle to the manager's satisfaction. Cleaning the men's toilets is considered worse. But the punishments are cost-effective and so the receptions take care to look alert at all times with smiling happy faces – just as the female guest observed.

The housekeeper has charge of the hotel maids. She is an older woman who was once a red guard during the Cultural Revolution. From that experience she has acquired a strong personality and is hard on the maids in her charge. However, her demeanours can adjust quickly depending on the value of the person she is engaged with. In the photo (Figure 6.4), out of camera the hotel manager is present and thus the housekeeper smiles happily into the camera. Like the other staff, she is objectified and enclosed by her uniform. But as the housekeeper she has authority over many maids, and can exercise power to reward and punish. Her deportment betrays her military past, as she strides the corridors upright and forbidding. When she appears the maids seem to work harder and slow after she has gone. But for the manager she is all smiles and bows, she is a woman who likes authority both imposed on her and for her to impose on others.

Figure 6.4: The Housekeeper

The hotel manager is the most powerful person in the hotel. He can distribute rewards and punishments to staff in the morning parades. The highest degree of authority is held by him and also he imposes the highest level of discipline and accountability. The manager is always confident as the most powerful person in the hotel. He could arrange any positions that are performed by staff, which means most of the staff respect him and please him to get good jobs. In addition, the manager always gives more compliments to pretty female staff who attract attention and approval from him. He exercises power in many ways, such as record keeping, instructions, uniform, body positions and speech tones.

The manager comes from a well-connected family (Guanxi) of officials in the provincial government, and is young to have been appointed to such a powerful position as manager of this government owned hotel. From my observation the manager's demeanour with staff

is cold and authoritarian, usually saying very little to subordinates. By contrast, it is evident from the staff behaviour that he expects them to be of humble demeanour and that the female staff bow with their hands together. He parades the receptionists most mornings when they go through the ritual of repeating his shouts of moral exhortation as is customary in work places in China. The parade allows him to inspect the receptionists' appearance, as he demands an immaculate standard of neatness from his front line staff. Occasionally, a receptionist is selected to help him with "the books" in his office. This is not a command that can be refused and some staff resist being chosen even to the extent of resigning. However, most receptionists compete for the opportunity to get more of the manager's attention. Foucault (1980) points out how one of the positive effects of the exercise of power is that people often cooperate in their own subjection and objectification. They become docile bodies. The manager is the only person in the hotel who is not enclosed as he can go anywhere as everyone is finally accountable to him.

6.2.4 The efficient body

In terms of docile bodies, Foucault (1971) states that body "and everything that touches it…is the domain of (what we are in terms of) Herkunft" (Foucault, 1971, p. 82). The reason of this is that the body "is the inscribed surface of events (traced by language)" (Foucault, 1971, p. 82). Foucault (1979) argues that these techniques of making an efficient body allow the body to become an object to be manipulated and exercised in prescribed movements.

Prado (1995) also maintains that "it is the body that bears and manifests the effects of a regulating discourse in its habits and gestures, in its postures, in its speech…The body supports a self, a subject, which does not recognize itself as emergent but takes itself as prior to the effects of discourse " (p. 36). At the two hotels in this study, the importance of the morning parades is that they allow managers to manifest a regulating discourse. The parades provide opportunities for inscribing on the body correct postures and appropriate speech. Junior staff must stand with their hands clasped in front of them and eyes downcast. They must not clasp their hands behind their backs or on their hips when addressing managers or guests. Speech should be soft, warm but short. Staff should not say too much or engage in conversation, generally agree with managers and never argue.

The two hotels are organizations involving intensive labour input, managers give orders to staff, who are supposed to carry out the tasks and only do what the managers ask them to do, rather than staff deciding what to do. Pointless orders could be part of disciplinary discourse to shape staff behaviours such as polishing the intricate ironwork on a staircase bannister – a tedious task with no obvious result in terms of productivity or real symbolic improvement. But, whatever the task, knowledge and truth is produced by managers while the orders are carried out by staff.

Managers determine the uniforms, the way of speaking to guests, the responsibility to each department, etc. In particularly, he/she could be the designer of appearance-determining realities. Staff in the two hotels tend to act as docile bodies with a prescribed appearance. In other words, they have to wear what managers prescribe rather than what staff prefer to wear, even if they do not like their uniform. Other aspects of staff appearance are also determined, such as hairstyle, nails, body posture and heels.

To illustrate, in one of the hotels the command of staff bodies and the overriding pursuit of the bottom-line as a measure of successful management, the case of refurbishing a hotel night bar is instructive. At the top of this Chinese hotel on Level 29 was an all-night bar, which served the needs of mostly male guests usually in business groups. The hotel managers decided to re-decorate the bar and re-deploy the barmaid who had been with the hotel for several years and was in her fifties. It is an example of ageism in the Chinese hotel industry as the managers perceived that the symbolic function of this bar was better served by younger female. The plan was to make the bar more attractive to guests by more intimate seating, softer lighting, a greater range of drinks and a "happy hour" starting at 10:00pm. It was felt that many more guests could be persuaded to use the bar as drinks were mainly charged to rooms and, thus to business accounts. The target was especially single businessmen who made up a good proportion of the hotels clientele.

The central feature of the plan was to employ two attractive female staff, one to serve as the bar manager and the other to act a waitress. The redeployment of the older woman involved promoting her as an assistant manager in the hotel restaurant, where her new function was to watch the waitresses and for fewer hours receive more pay. However, after three months she was told that the restaurant was not achieving its targets and was made redundant.

Meanwhile, a new bar manager was hired. There were many applicants but appearance and attitude were the main criteria that the female human resources manager was told to look for. The young woman that got the job stood out from the others when it came to a question of uniform. Those short listed were asked to comment on a choice of uniform a short, tight fitting black dress or longer more elegant evening dress. The successful applicant picked the long dress for herself and the short black dress for the waitress who would report to her. It emerged that she showed a good understanding of the need to make the bar "customer friendly". So much so that the short, black dress worn by the waitress was made even shorter at the suggestion of the new bar manageress. As there were a number of employable applicants for the waitress role, two were finally chosen to share the job on a part time basis and, as is not unusual in China, they were required to work the first month unpaid as they were "training".

The result of these changes was as envisaged: more guests used the facility and lone males increasingly frequented the bar with its intimate alcove seating, and where they were served by a welcoming and friendly waitress. The attractive waitress in her very short dress had been conceived in Foucauldian terms to be a docile, efficient body. The changes worked as the bar revenues were quadrupled within a year.

So what can be learned from this example? First, that in spite of such concepts as the balanced scorecard - social responsibility gives way to financial responsibility and shareholding stakeholders are prioritised over staff as stakeholders - at least, in a Chinese hotel. Second, those managers with power/knowledge can manipulate staff with insincere rewards. Third, that friendly, attractive female staff can fulfil some symbolic functions better that older less attractive female staff and that female staff can conspire into creating others as docile, efficient bodies. Fourth, uniforms can be taken for granted and the new waitresses accepted the design without question. Finally, that the exercise power is not necessary repressive and that staff can enjoy being the subjects of power (Foucault, 1980). That is the new cocktail waitresses, although poorly paid, and are in competition and seem happy in their role.

6.3   Chapter summary

By employing Foucault's concepts, this chapter examines how control mechanisms are employed to recognize, measure, and disclose staff performance in terms of their productive and symbolic functions in Chinese hotels. The accounting concept of key performance indicators is used to measure the productive function in hotels: for example, how many rooms a housemaid must clean in the morning. Such measurements are quantitative and can be disclosed as outputs. On the other hand, the symbolic function is more qualitative and performance results in outcomes. Such outcomes being that guests feel welcome and express positive feelings towards the hotel in question. Arguably, the symbolic function is becoming more important in a competitive hotel industry.

The chapter has also shown that Foucault's concepts of control (dressage) are very important in its application to the symbolic function. By the judicious use of control concepts, managers can inculcate into staff behaviour desirable responses to guest expectations. Such control becomes so deeply embedded as to be an automatic response, or, in Foucault's terms, staff have become efficient bodies. By such control mechanisms as surveillance, enclosure, discourse and the efficient body, accountability can be measured in terms of how staff perform productively and symbolically. Chinese hotels provide interesting illustrations of the applicability of Foucauldian control mechanisms because they are arguably, more normatively authoritarian then the hotels in the West and it is my observation that the supply of junior staff outweighs demand.

CHAPTER 7: Conclusion and Discussion

7.1   Introduction

McFadden (2013), the Nobel Prize winning economist argues that the classical theory of choice needs revising. The idea the consumer is rational and wants only goods and services delivered at the most cost efficient price is at the cornerstone of the theory and supports the premise that the productive function and its efficient control is at the heart of good management. McFadden (2013) alternatively suggests that good management requires attention to providing the consumer with goods and services that make the consumer feel warmth, respect and trust. This thesis extends McFadden's argument to the Chinese hotel industry, where in practice, managers aim to make the guest feel, in their hotels, the warmth of a home. A home, where their needs are catered for efficiently by pleasant, smiling and humble staff, who never argue or challenge the guests sense of being wanted and respected. To achieve this effect, managers must control and give weight to what Foucault calls the symbolic function of labour.

It is the argument in this thesis that the symbolic function of staff is most important in Chinese hotels and is demonstrated by a power/knowledge discourse directed to shape staff into efficient bodies, that are enclosed, inspected and under constant surveillance. This is not to say that the productive function is not important: housemaids must still clean 14 rooms in a morning, but it is to say that the symbolic function of staff is of increasing importance in successful hotel chains. The advertising of Singapore Airlines ubiquitous and uniform "Singapore Girl" is the symbolic statement of one of the world's most successful airlines. Uniformity is demanded of staff if they are to fulfil their symbolic function. But, as this thesis makes clear, control of the symbolic function, like that of the productive function, borrows much from the internal control concepts of accounting (Miller et al., 1991). Nonetheless, resistance to their obsequious symbolic function, as shown in the literature (Sherman, 2007), surfaces in the form of staff going-slow, pulling faces after guests, mimicking voices, as much of what passes for symbolic warmth and friendliness is palpably false so that even the guests may not be fooled.

The surveillance, inspection and use of key performance indicators are control features familiar to accountants and auditors, whose function is to impose discipline and to enclose for accountability. By borrowing the disciplinary processes of accounting, managers can separate and enclose staff by function. With regard to the productive function, record keeping and quantifying are necessary elements as are establishing key performance indicators. The symbolic function has grown out of the productive function and the key performance indicators are harder to quantify as the function is more qualitative in application than quantitative. Nonetheless, to establish accountability, staff must be enclosed and made into efficient, uniform bodies aware of being always under the "gaze" of management. But, perhaps, control of the symbolic function owes most to the practices of audit, which relies on inspection, explanations and judgement before arriving at a qualitative evaluation.

The overall contention of this thesis is that while both the productive and symbolic functions of staff are vital to financial performance in hotels, the achieving of financial key performance indicators is the driver for managers; it is the means of the control of the symbolic function in the hotel industry which has received little attention in the literature. McFadden (2013) is right to call for an overhaul of the classical economics as the findings of this thesis support his argument.

With regard to the dressage function, whereby control is exercised over both productive and symbolic functions, the thesis shows that managers may exercise punishments or rewards but it is my observation that in China managers prefer punishments. Rewards necessarily involve some extra cost either in terms of labour hours or additional financial expense. In China where low paid staff are plentiful and hotel jobs are hard to get it is not necessary to reward staff, as the thesis shows staff may be made in efficient bodies by punishments in the form of extra manual labour, extra hours or by a discourse involving humiliation and shame.

This chapter will focus on these questions and significant findings in turn, while drawing on the relevant literature supporting or contradicting such findings as explained in terms of Foucauldian theory applied. Following a discussion of the findings with regard to each particular research question, the chapter will then outline the research contributions and limitations with suggestions for further research into other issues not fully addressed.

7.2   Discussion of findings

The question asked is how is accountability, in the sense of establishing responsibility and liability, determined by measuring the productive and symbolic functions of staff labour in hotels in China. The answer is that in China, lip-service is paid to the ideals of the balanced scorecard, social responsibility and environmental concerns, if these do not serve the interests of the bottom line they are ruled out of the accountability equation. As explained, the productive function of staff is more easily reduced to metrics which can be evaluated in terms of output norms to ensure lowest cost operations. By comparison with the productive function, the symbolic function is hard to measure as the output is not quantitative. In China, managers hold power in hotels and the front line staff are trained as efficient and docile bodies. They follow a discourse of what is said and unsaid and such discourse may employ abusive invective directed at particular staff. In some countries, such discourse might be treated as constructive dismissal but not in China. The authoritarian and hierarchical character of Chinese hotels is augmented by the employment situation where it is my observation that supply exceeds demand. The researcher found that many staff come from rural areas to the cities and fear losing their jobs, which may for staff without city identity cards mean returning in "shame" to the countryside. It is competitive in the job market. Once hotel staff lose their job, it is hard to find another. So based on this situation, staff are docile, and resistance is rare.

With regard to the research questions posed in Chapter 2, the following represent the particular findings relevant to this thesis.

The first research question considers that how are internal control mechanisms exercised by managers in a hotel over staff to determine behaviour and accountability? The thesis shows that control is achieved through surveillance, enclosure, discourse and the making of efficient bodies. Surveillance takes the form of ubiquitous cameras, and accounting records which reveal time-keeping, performance, and ability to meet established metrics. The cameras permit managers to watch front line staff in the dealings with guests. Enclosure by uniform and by space enable managers to identify quickly where staff belong, when they are out of place. Thus, the white uniformed kitchen staff member was easily spotted on the corridor camera as being in the wrong place. In a similar way, the uniformed car park valets would not be expected to be seen in the kitchens. Enclosures also permit cost centres to be

established so that financial metrics can be tracked down to individual departments. Discourse is very important to management control as what he said and what he did not say becomes a way of controlling staff behaviour. Unfortunately, for some staff the discourse of morning parades becomes an opportunity for managers to direct invective at particular staff members who are perceived to be deficient in some respect. Not unconnected with discourse is the making of efficient bodies. That is making staff docile and complicit in their own subjection. Such techniques take the form of requiring subordinate body language such as bowing to guests and managers.

The second research question asks, how do power relationships impact on the productive and symbolic functions of labour in a hotel context? The productive functions are measured by accounting records and key performance indicators. The managers have knowledge of the records and metrics and such knowledge is power. The symbolic functions of staff are achieved by requiring uniforms and by inculcating the correct body language so that guests feel welcome and not forgotten. Managers expect front line staff to bow, smile and never argue with guests. The symbolic function requires subservience.

The third question is that how do managers organize the production of this intangible, self-subordinating relationship between staff and guests? The requirement is for housemaids who meet guests in the corridor or in the room to bow and say "ni hao" [hello]; for as with waitresses and receptionists, they must always look happy and smiling as well as maintaining a subservient body language. Managers can enforce the required behaviour by means of surveillance such that staff never know whether they are being observed or not.

In conclusion, the thesis has used a Foucauldian framework to approach the question of management control in hotels by looking at the question of how power is exercised. Such an approach is different from a textbook analysis of internal control but, it is argued, that the Foucauldian approach supplements and extends the literature on internal control in Chinese hotels.

7.3   Contributions

This research makes significant contribution to the literature, theory and Chinese hotel industry. This section summaries the contribution of this thesis as follows.

7.3.1   Contribution to theory and literature

This thesis makes a contribution to knowledge through the application of Foucauldian theory to the Chinese hotel industry. First, it is perhaps the first application of this theory into the Chinese hotel industry that is a relatively labour intensive industry. By using Foucault's theories, the thesis can better compliment the extant literature in respect of management control techniques in Chinese hotels. It is a finding of this thesis that Foucault's theories as applied in an authoritarian environment can effectively make efficient and docile bodies in a way that would not be possible in other environments (Miller & O'Leary, 1987).

Second, as explained in the summary of background literature in Chapter 3, this thesis has also been concerned to explain how management control is applied in the Chinese hotel industry. As a way of controlling staff using Foucauldian theory, these questions are not addressed in the literature. The concepts of surveillance, enclosure, discourse and examination are explored to augment the literature around management control in Asia. The power dynamics in this thesis brings interesting differences in contrast to other environments, as resistance in China is very covert and quite rare, perhaps, because of the overhanging threat of dismissal. The findings are that a culture and gender relations influence internal control in subtle ways.

7.3.2   Contribution to the Chinese hotel industry

It is clear that Foucault's concepts shed light on modern ways that organisations use information derived from systems of accounting to measure and control individuals. This thesis points out that accounting provides a discourse which uses mechanism of surveillance, enclosure, and examination to facilitate control and accountability of individuals. Whereas, Foucault's theories have been applied to various industrial organisations as cited in the thesis, this thesis makes a unique contribution by applying his concepts to the labour intensive Chinese hotel industry.

The second contribution to Chinese hotel industry is that the findings of this thesis provide an in-depth critical review of the expansion of management control in hotels in China. It seems that culture impacts the internal control behaviours between managers and staff. It is

necessary to recognise who are the guests, and the internal disciplinary models. The thesis has shown that the morning parades, the discourse of the parades and the requirement to show in body language respect to managers are different from practices in Western countries.

Chinese hotels may differ from that of other cultures because, as Hofstede (1986) found, the Chinese have a characteristic of acceptance of an authoritarian structure, and because the supply of low paid hotel staff is plentiful, thus, staff are more likely to be docile. This thesis can explain how managers by exercising power over staff can achieve a high level of guest satisfaction, profit maximisation and accountability?

The third contribution is that for hotel staff there is an emancipatory purpose: to explain how being subjected to power, according to Foucault, "induces pleasure, forms knowledge, produces discourse" (Foucault, 1980, p. 89) while not being necessary repressive - examples have been provided. Nonetheless, experiences of staff resistance are not precluded but staff who resist invariably face dismissal as has been shown.

7.4   Limitations

This section outlines the limitations of the research undertaken. The findings and conclusions of this study should be considered in light of the research limitations. The obvious limitations of this thesis are common to all qualitative research. It is not possible to draw statistical conclusions based on the researcher's empirical experience.

The second limitation occurs because there may be some slightly different internal control methods between big cities and small cities in China. This research is based on the researcher's own working experiences in a big hotel chain in Beijing. Therefore, it represents the behaviours and management control techniques of big cities and famous hotel chains. Hopefully, such sensitivities are overcome by the development of China as the gap between small cities and big cities becomes less obvious.

Third, the empirics of this research rely on the impressions and observations recorded by the researcher. Positive researchers could argue such impressions of observations cannot be replicated by other researchers. Such arguments can be applied to film critics who report their impressions of films to the public. However, while the views of film critics may not

be replicated they are considered to be informative and give valuable insights as to what is worthwhile. This researcher's explanations as to management control in Chinese hotels may not be the only way of looking at the problem of recognising, measuring and disclosing the productive and symbolic functions of staff but it is one of examining this through a Foucauldian lens.

7.5 Recommendations and future research

A much more gendered approach would be another way of researching the symbolic functions in hotels as much of the symbolism relies on the docile bodies of young women. This thesis has not explored the feelings of junior staff especially with regard to being particular targets of invective during morning parades. A further research question could be how do they perceive resistance? What the empirical analysis in this chapter reveals is that further research into gender equity in Chinese hotels can add a further explanatory dimension to understanding accountability, discipline and measurement in this service industry. From this initial study it can be seen that female managers can be as exploitive of junior staff as the largely male managers can be perceived to be. The example of the new bar manager cited in Chapter 6 demonstrates this point.

Another possibility for research is to concentrate on measurement systems in place especially that of the productive functions of staff. That is what are the various recording mechanisms employed to measure staff outputs and how are the normative metrics established as targets to be achieved. Also how performance is evaluated and to what extent is it individualized.

Finally, there is the area of management preferences and arbitrary decision-making effecting staff. During the course of the researcher's time in the hotel industry in China there were many occasions when such practices became apparent forcing junior staff to compete for managerial favour. As a technique of managerial control, the ability to award preferential treatment to particular staff became a means to control and demand more from those seeking such preference.

References

Amaratunga, D., Baldry, D., & Sarshar, M. (2001). Process improvement through performance measurement: The balanced scorecard methodology. *Work Study, 50*(4/5), 179. doi:10.1108/EUM0000000005677

Andrew, J. (2007). Prisons, the profit motive and other challenges to accountability. *Critical Perspectives on Accounting, 18*(8), 877-904. doi:10.1016/j.cpa.2006.08.003

Appelrouth, S., & Edles, L. D. (2011). *Sociological theory in the contemporary era: text and readings*. Thousand Oaks, Calif: Pine Forge Press/SAGE.

Atkinson, P. (1988). Ethnomethodology: A Critical Review. *Annual Review of Sociology, 14*(1), 441-465. doi:10.1146/annurev.so.14.080188.002301

Berente, N., Gal, U., & Yoo, Y. (2010). Dressage, control, and enterprise systems: the case of NASA's Full Cost initiative. *European Journal of Information Systems, 19*(1), 21-34. doi:10.1057/ejis.2009.47

Beresford, A. D. (2003). Foucault's Theory Of Governance And The Deterrence Of Internet Fraud. *Administration & Society, 35*(1), 82-103. doi:10.1177/0095399702250347

Bernauer, J. W., & Carrette, J. R. (2004). Exomologesis and Aesthetic Reflection: Foucault's Response to habermas. In *Michel Foucault and theology: the politics of religious experience* (pp. 87-160). Burlington, VT: Ashgate.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3*(2), 77-101.

Brewer, P. C., & Speh, T. W. (2000). Using the balanced scorecard to measure supply chain performance. *Journal of Business Logistics, 21*(1), 75. doi:10.1108/IJPPM-02-2013-0029

Brexendorf, T. O., & Kernstock, J. (2007). Corporate behaviour vs brand behaviour: Towards an integrated view? *Journal of Brand Management, 15*(1), 32-40. doi:10.1057/palgrave.bm.2550108

Brody, R. G., Lane, S., & Steed, E. (2004). The Development of an Accounting Performance Measure to Minimize Inter-departmental Conflicts in the Hospitality Industry. *International Journal of Management, 21*(3), 324.

Burgess, J., & MacDonald, D. (1990). The labor flexibility imperative. *Journal of Australian Political Economy, 27*, 16-35. doi:10.1007/BF02915934

Carmona, S., Ezzamel, M., & Gutiérrez, F. (2002). The relationship between accounting and spatial practices in the factory *Accounting, Organizations and Society, 27*(3), 239-274. doi:10.1016/S0361-3682(01)00028-9

Chalkiti, K., & Sigala, M. (2010). Staff turnover in the Greek tourism industry: a comparison between insular and peninsular regions. *International journal of contemporary hospitality management, 22*(2/3), 335-359. doi:10.1108/09596111011035945

Covaleski, M. A., Dirsmith, M. W., Heian, J. B., & Samuel, S. (1998). The Calculated and the Avowed: Techniques of Discipline and Struggles Over Identity in Big Six Public Accounting Firms. *Administrative Science Quarterly, 43*(2), 293-327.

Crick.A.P., (2000). *A preliminary investigation into the delivery of sustained personalized service: The case of all-inclusive entertainment coordinators*. ProQuest, UMI Dissertations Publishing.

Crick, A.P.,& Spencer, A. (2011). Hospitality quality: new directions and new challenges. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 23*(4), 463-478. doi:10.1108/09596111111129986

Cusset, Y., Haber, S., Renault, E., & Touboul, H. (2006). *Habermas et Foucault: parcours croises, confrontations, critiques*. Paris: CNRS Editions.

Deleuze, G. (2006). *Foucault*. London: New York: Continuum.

Denton, G. A., & White, B. (2000). Implementing a balanced-scorecard approach to managing hotel operations. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly, 41*(1), 94-107. doi:10.1016/S0010-8804(00)88889-8

Desai, R. (2010). Understanding management control systems in call centers. *The international journal of productivity and performance management, 59*(8), 792-810. doi:10.1108/17410401011089472

Dreyfus, H. L., & Rabinow, P. (1983). *Michel Foucault, beyond structuralism and hermeneutics*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Eisenhardt, K. M., & Graebner, M. E. (2007). Theory Building from Cases: Opportunities and Challenges. *The Academy of Management Journal, 50*(1), 25-32.

Enns, H. G., Huff, S. L., & Golden, B. R. (2002). CIO influence behaviors: the impact of the technical background. *Information and Management, 40*, 467-485. doi:10.1016/S0378-7206(02)00040-X

Entwhistle, J. (2000). *Fashioning the Body* Oxford: Polity Press.

Foucault, M. (1971). *Ordre du discours*. Paris: Gallimard

Foucault, M. (1972). *The Archaeology of Knowledge and the Discourse on Language*. New York: Pantheon Books.

Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and punish: the birth of the prison* (A. Sheridan, Trans.). Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books.

Foucault, M. (1979). *Discipline and punish: the birth of the prison*. New York Vintage Books.

Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/knowledge: selected interviews and other writings, 1972-1977*. Brighton, Sussex: Harvester Press.

Foucault, M. (1983). The Subject and Power. *Critical Inquiry, 8*(4), 777-795. doi:10.1086/448181

Foucault, M. (1986). *The History of Sexuality, vol. 3: The Care of the Self*. New York: Pantheon Books.

Freeman, C. (1993). Designing Women: Corporate Discipline and Barbados's Off-Shore Pink-Collar Sector. *Cultural Anthropology, 8*(2), 169-186. doi:10.1525/can.1993.8.2.02a00030

Fuller, L., & Smith, V. (1991). Consumers' Reports: Management by Customers in a Changing Economy. *Work, Employment & Society, 5*(1), 1-16. doi:10.1177/0950017091005001002

Gaffikin, M. (2010). *The Critique of Accounting Theory*. Retrieved from http://www.studymode.com/essays/The-Critique-Of-Accounting-Theory-492996.html

Galbraith, C., & Schendel, D. (1983). An Empirical Analysis of Strategy Types: Summary. *Strategic Management Journal (pre-1986), 4*(2), 153.

Gautreau, A., & Kleiner, B. H. (2001). Recent trends in performance measurement systems – the balanced scorecard approach. *Management Research News, 24*(3/4), 153-156. doi:10.1108/01409170110782793

Geertz, C. (1973). *The interpretation of cultures: selected essays* (Vol. TB 5043). New York: Basic Books.

Gelfand, M. J., Lim, B.-C., & Raver, J. L. (2004). Culture and accountability in organizations: Variations in forms of social control across cultures. *Human Resource Management Review, 14*(1), 135-160. doi:10.1016/j.hrmr.2004.02.007

Giddens, A. (1985). *The Nation-State and Violence*. Cambridge: Polity.
Giddens, A. (1993). *New rules of sociological method: a positive critique of interpretative sociologies*: Polity

Giddings, L. S., & Grant, B. M. (2002). Making sense of methodologies: a paradigm framework for the novice researcher. *Contemporary Nurse: A Journal for the Australian Nursing Profession, 13*(1), 10-28.

Goldratt, E. M. (1991). *The Haystack Syndrome: Sifting Information Out of the Data Ocean*. Croton-on-Hudson, NY: North River Press.

Gronroos, C. (1984). A service quality model and its marketing implications. *European journal of marketing, 18*(4), 36-44. doi:10.1108/EUM0000000004784

Guerrier, Y. (1999). *Organizational behaviour in hotels and restaurants: an international perspective*. Chichester: Wiley.

Guerrier, Y., & Adib, A. (2003). Work at Leisure and Leisure at Work: A Study of the Emotional Labour of Tour Reps. *Human Relations, 56*(11), 1399-1417. doi:10.1177/00187267035611006

Hammersley, M., & Atkinson, P. (1995). *Ethnography: principles in practice*. New York: Routledge.

Harrington, H. J. (1994). *Total Improvement Management: The Next Generation in Performance Improvement*: McGraw- Hill.

Hochschild, A. R. (1983). *The managed heart: commercialization of human feeling* (0520048008, 9780520048003). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hochschild, A. R. (2003). *The managed heart: commercialization of human feeling*. Berkeley, Calif: University of California Press.

Hofstede, G. (1986). Cultural differences in teaching and learning. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 10*(3), 301-320. doi:10.1016/0147-1767(86)90015-5

Honderich, T. (1995). *The Oxford companion to philosophy*: Oxford University Press. Retrieved from http://aut.summon.serialssolutions.com/2.0.0/link/0/eLvHCXMwY2BQSEtMNgc2pM2AjWOD1BSjFDMjwyRzI2PjVHMTC-MU8NYxxHguUmnuJsTAlJonyiDl5hri7KGbWFoSDx3DiIecA2ZiKMbAmwha-Z1XAt4hlgIAS30a3Q

Hopper, T., & Macintosh, N. (1993). Management accounting as disciplinary practice: the case of ITT under Harold Geneen. *Management Accounting Research, 4*(2). doi:10.1006/mare.1993.1011

Hopper, T., & Macintosh, N. (1998). Management accounting numbers: freedom or prison—Geneen versus Foucault. In A. McKinlay & K. Starkey (Eds.), *Foucault, management and organization theory: from panopticon to technologies of self* (pp. 126-150). London: Sage.

Hoskin. (1998). Examining Accounts and Accounting for Management: Inverting Understandings of 'the Economic'. In A. McKinlay & K. Starkey (Eds.), *Foucault, management and organization theory: from panopticon to technologies of self* (pp. 93-110). London: Sage.

Hoskin, & Macve, R. H. (1986). Accounting and the examination: A genealogy of disciplinary power. *Accounting, Organizations and Society, 11*(2), 105-136. doi:10.1016/0361-3682(86)90027-9

Hull, R. P., & Umansky, P. H. (1997). An examination of gender stereotyping as an explanation for vertical job segregation in public accounting. *Accounting, Organizations and Society, 22*(6), 507-528. doi:10.1016/S0361-3682(96)00028-1

John, B., & Robert, C. F. (2004). What experts say about managing hospitality service delivery systems. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 16*(7), 394-401. doi:10.1108/09596110410559078

Jones, S. R. G. (1992). Was There a Hawthorne Effect? *The American Journal of Sociology, 98*(3), 451-468. doi:10.1086/230046

Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (1992). The balanced scorecard--measures that drive performance. *Harvard business review, 70*(1), 71.

Knights, D. (1992). Changing Spaces: The Disruptive Impact of a New Epistemological Location for the Study of Management. *The Academy of Management Review, 17*(3), 514-536. doi:10.5465/AMR.1992.4281996

Knights, D., & Collinson, D. (1987). Disciplining the shopfloor: A comparison of the disciplinary effects of managerial psychology and financial accounting. *Accounting, Organizations and Society, 12*(5), 457-477. doi:10.1016/0361-3682(87)90031-6

Kohn, A. (1993). *Punished by rewards: the trouble with gold stars, incentive plans, A's, praise, and other bribes*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co.

Korczynski, M. (2002). *Human resource management in service work*. Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Ladhari, R. (2009). Service quality, emotional satisfaction, and behavioural intentions: a study in the hotel industry. *Managing service quality, 19*(3), 308-331. doi:10.1108/09604520910955320

Lashley, C. (2001). Towards a theoretical understanding. In C. Lashley & A. Morrison (Eds.), *In Search of Hospitality* (pp. 1-17). Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Lewis, R. C. (1987). The measurement of gaps in the quality of hotel services. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 6*(2), 83-88. doi:10.1016/0278-4319(87)90020-X

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, Calif: Sage Publications.

List, J. A., & Levitt, S. D. (2011). Was there really a hawthorne effect at the hawthorne plant?: an analysis of the original illumination experiments. *American economic journal, 3*(1), 224-238. doi:10.1257/app.3.1.224

Liu, C., & Chen, K. (2006). Personality Traits as Antecedents of Employee Customer Orientation: A Case Study in the Hospitality Industry. *International Journal of Management, 23*(3), 478. doi:10.7763/IJTEF.2013.V4.288

Lord Kelvin, W. T. (1883). Electrical Units of Measurement. *Nature, 28*(708), 91-92. doi:10.1038/028091a0

Macintosh, N. (2002). *Accounting, accountants and accountability: poststructuralist positions*. New York: Routledge.

Martinez, D. E. (2011). Beyond disciplinary enclosures: management control in the society of control. *Critical Perspectives on Accounting, 22*(2), 200-211. doi:10.1016/j.cpa.2010.06.016

McDowell, L. (2009). *Working bodies: interactive service employment and workplace identities*. Malden, MA U6: Wiley-Blackwell.

McFadden, D. (2013). *The debt to pleasure*. Retrieved from http://www.economist.com/news/finance-and-economics/21576645-nobel-prizewinner-argues-overhaul-theory-consumer-choice

McKernan, J. F., & Kosmala, K. (2011). From care of the self to care for the other: neglected aspects of Foucault's late work. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 24*(3), 377-402. doi:10.1108/09513571111124054

McKinlay, A., Carter, C., Pezet, E., & Clegg, S. (2010). Using Foucault to make strategy. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 23*(8), 1012-1031. doi:10.1108/09513571011092538

McKinlay, A., & Starkey, K. (1998). *Foucault, management and organization theory: from panopticon to technologies of self*. London: Sage.

Miller. D.,(1987). The structural and envrionmental correlates of business strategy *strategic management journal 8*, 55-76. doi:10.1002/smj.4250080106

Miller, D., Hopper, T., & Laughlin, R. (1991). The new accounting history: An introduction. *Accounting, Organizations and Society, 16*(5), 395-403. doi:10.1016/0361-3682(91)90036-E

Miller, D., & O'Leary, T. (1987). Accounting and the construction of the governable person. *Accounting, Organizations and Society, 12*(3), 235-265. doi:10.1016/0361-3682(87)90039-0

Mosley, R. W. (2007). Customer experience, organisational culture and the employer brand. *The journal of brand management, 15*(2), 123-134. doi:10.1057/palgrave.bm.2550124

O'Connor, D. (2005). Towards a new interpretation of "hospitality". *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 17*(3), 267-271. doi:10.1108/09596110510591954

Oliveira, J. (2001). The balanced scorecard: an integrative approach to performance evaluation. *Healthcare financial management : journal of the Healthcare Financial Management Association, 55*(5), 42.

Parmenter, D. (2013). Fixing your KPIs. *The Chartered Accountants Journal, 7*(New Zealand Institute of Chartered Accountants), 46-48.

Phillips, P., & Louvieris, P. (2005). Performance Measurement Systems in Tourism, Hospitality, and Leisure Small Medium-Sized Enterprises: A Balanced Scorecard Perspective. *Journal of Travel Research, 44*(2), 201-211. doi:10.1177/0047287505278992

Pickworth, J. R. (1987). Minding the Ps and Qs: Linking Quality and Productivity. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly, 28*(1), 40-47. doi:10.1177/001088048702800113

Pizam, A., & Shani, A. (2009). The nature of the hospitality industry: present and future managers' perspectives. *Anatolia: An International Journal of Tourism and Hospitality, 20*(1), 134-150. doi:10.1080/13032917.2009.10518900

Podsakoff, P. M. (1987). Research methodology in organizational studies. *Journal of management, 13*(2), 419-441. doi:10.1177/014920638701300213

Prado, C. G. (1995). *Starting With Foucault: An Introduction To Geneaolgy*. Boulder, San Francisco, Oxford: Westview Press.

Presbury, R., Fitzgerald, A., & Chapman, R. (2005). Impediments to improvements in service quality in luxury hotels. *Managing Service Quality, 15*(4), 357-373. doi:10.1108/09604520510606835

Rollins, J., & Armstrong, P. (1988). Between Women: Domestics And Their Employers Review (pp. 311): Canadian Committee on Labour History.

Rossman, G. B., & Rallis, S. F. (2003). *Learning in the field: an introduction to qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage Publications.

Saleh, F., & Ryan, C. (1991). Analysing Service Quality in the Hospitality Industry Using the SERVQUAL Model. *The Service Industries Journal, 11*(3), 324-345. doi:10.1080/02642069100000049

Sargiacomo, M. (2008). Accounting and the "art of government": Margaret of Austria in Abruzzo (1539-86). *European accounting review, 17*(4), 667-695. doi:10.1080/09638180802324401

Sargiacomo, M. (2009). Michel Foucault, Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison: Allen Lane, London, 1977, Trans. by Alan Sheridan. *Journal of Management & Governance, 13*(3), 269-280. doi:10.1007/s10997-008-9080-7

Seifert, A. M., & Messing, K. (2006). Cleaning Up After Globalization: An Ergonomic Analysis of Work Activity of Hotel Cleaners. *Antipode, 38*(3), 557-557. doi:10.1111/j.0066-4812.2006.00595.x

Shamir, B. (1980). Between Service and Servility: Role Conflict in Subordinate Service Roles. *Human Relations, 33*(10), 741-756. doi:10.1177/001872678003301004

Shaw, G., & Williams, A. M. (1998). Entrepreneurship, Small Business Culture And Tourism Development. In *The Economic Geography of the Tourist Industry: A Supply-Side Analysis* (pp. 129-149). London: Routledge.

Shawki, S. (2009). *Surveillance and Foucault: Examining the Validity of Foucualt's Notions Conerning Surveillance through a Study of the United States and the United Kingdom* (Paper 23). Hornors Projects. Retrieved from http://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/socanth_honproj/23

Sherman, R. (2007). *Class Acts: Service and Inquality in Luxury Hotels*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Soltani, E., & Lai, P. C. (2008). Distancing flexibility in the hotel industry: the role of employment agencies as labour suppliers. *The international journal of human resource management, 19*(1), 132-152. doi:10.1080/09585190701764048

Spitzer, D. R. (2007). *Transforming Performance Measurement: Rethinking the Way We Measure and Drive Organizational Success*. New York: NY: American Management Association.

Stake, R. E. (1978). The Case Study Method in Social Inquiry. *Educational Researcher, 7*(2), 5. doi:10.2307/1174340

Stewart, R. E. (1992). Pluralizing Our Past: Foucault in Accounting History. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 5*(2), 57.

Taylor, F. (1975). *Jamaica: The Welcome Society: Myths and Reality*. Kingston: ISER.

The Economist. (2013). A short history of hotels. *The Economist, 46*(8867), 111-113.

Torres, E. N., & Kline, S. (2006). From satisfaction to delight: a model for the hotel industry. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 18*(4), 290-301. doi:10.1108/09596110610665302

Townley, B. (1993). Foucault, Power/Knowledge, and Its Relevance for Human Resource Management. *The Academy of Management Review, 18*(3), 518-545. doi:10.1108/eb028098

Tsang, K., & Ap, J. (2007). Tourists' Perceptions of Relational Quality Service Attributes: A Cross-Cultural Study. *Journal of Travel Research, 45*(3), 355-363. doi:10.1177/0047287506295911

Van Hoof, H. B. (2002). Book Review: Service Quality Management in Hospitality, Tourismand Leisure (Vol. 41, pp. 116-116). Sage CA: Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Van Maanen, J. (1979). The Fact of Fiction in Organizational Ethnography. *Administrative Science Quarterly, 24*(4), 539-550. doi:org/10.4135/9781412986274

Vetter, S., Heiss, F., McFadden, D., & Winter, J. (2013). Risk attitudes and Medicare Part D enrollment decisions. *Economics letters, 119*(2), 128-132. doi:10.1016/j.econlet.2013.01.033

Wines, M. (2010). *In Restive Chinese Area, Cameras Keep Watch*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2010/08/03/world/asia/03china.html?pagewanted=all

Zampoukos, K., & Ioannides, D. (2011). The tourism labour conundrum: agenda for new research in the geography of hospitality workers. *Hospitality & Society, 1*, 25-45. doi:10:1386/hosp.1.1.25_1

Zeithaml, V. A., Bitner, M. J., & Gremler, D. D. (2013). *Services marketing: integrating customer focus across the firm*. New York: McGraw-Hill Irwin.

Ziegenfuss, D. E. (2000). Developing an internal auditing department balanced scorecard. *Managerial Auditing Journal, 15*(1/2), 12-19. doi:10.1108/EUM0000000005305